

*Managing clubroot disease (caused by Plasmodiophora brassicae Wor.) by exploiting the interactions between calcium cyanamide fertilizer and soil microorganisms*

Article

Accepted Version

Dixon, G. R. (2017) Managing clubroot disease (caused by Plasmodiophora brassicae Wor.) by exploiting the interactions between calcium cyanamide fertilizer and soil microorganisms. *Journal of Agricultural Science*, 155 (4). pp. 527-543. ISSN 0021-8596 doi: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0021859616000800> Available at <https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/68509/>

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See [Guidance on citing](#).

To link to this article DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0021859616000800>

Publisher: Cambridge University Press

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the [End User Agreement](#).

[www.reading.ac.uk/centaur](http://www.reading.ac.uk/centaur)

**CentAUR**

Central Archive at the University of Reading

Reading's research outputs online

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23

Managing clubroot disease (caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor.) by exploiting the interactions between calcium cyanamide fertilizer and soil microorganisms

## SUMMARY

Calcium cyanamide is a nitrogenous fertilizer used predominantly for over a century in field and glasshouse vegetable and salad production. This review draws together for the first time knowledge concerning the biological properties of the compound that benefit crop production by encouraging sustainable soil health and quality. This is achieved through the increase of microorganisms antagonistic to plant pathogens. The review also reports on the natural occurrence and degradation of cyanamide. The literature survey provides a perspective of research from the early 1900s to current studies. This identifies that nitrogen is released steadily into the rhizosphere from this fertiliser. Calcium is also readily available for plant roots and promotes the alkaline soil conditions beneficial to benign microorganisms. Consequently, soil suppressiveness towards organisms such as *Plasmodiophora brassicae*, the cause of clubroot disease in brassicas develops. The effects of calcium and accompanying changes in soil pH values are discussed in relation to the life cycle stages of *P.brassicae* and the development of clubroot disease. Formulations of calcium cyanamide contain the dimeric form, dicyandiamide (DCD). This compound slows soil nitrification and subsequent nitrate leaching into ground waters reducing potential pollution. Calcium cyanamide is normally used for specialised fresh produce production and is not available in quantities comparable

24 with ammoniacal fertilizers. It is contended however, that it has properties deserving wider  
25 assessment because of their implications for sustainable cropping.

26

27 **KEYWORDS:** calcium cyanamide, disease suppression, microbial ecology, soil health,  
28 integrated pest management

29

30 Reconciling the need for producing sufficient high-quality, health-enhancing food for the  
31 world's expanding population with conserving biodiversity will be achieved through  
32 scientific and technological advances. Probably, two aspects of biology, breeding improved  
33 cultivars and enhancing the efficiency of nutrient uptake in partnership with soil microbes  
34 (Wissuwa et al. 2009) will be prominent among in these advances. Artificially supplementing  
35 nutrient supplies, especially nitrogen, has previously made major contributions in raising crop  
36 yields. For example, Bell et al. (1995) showed from long-term studies of cereal farming in the  
37 Yaqui Valley of Mexico that breeding improved wheat cultivars accounted for 28 % of the  
38 overall farm yield progress and 48 % came from increased use of nitrogenous fertilisers. This  
39 supports observations by Greenwood (1982) who showed that "in West Europe.....wheat  
40 yields are almost directly proportional to the level of N-fertiliser applied". It is now  
41 appreciated, however, that using nitrogenous fertilisers must not produce undesirable side-  
42 effects such as nitrate pollution into river catchment areas (Sieling & Kage 2010; Roy 2015).  
43 Ideally fertilizers should act in concert with soil-borne microbial populations as part of  
44 sustainable integrated pest management (IPM) strategies. This review suggests that calcium  
45 cyanamide, a specialized fertilizer which until recently has been used predominantly for  
46 intensive horticultural crops, has properties that could contribute to these IPM strategies  
47 including minimizing nitrate release into groundwater and encouraging benign soil-borne

48 microbes (Miranda 1975; Dixon 2012a). In support of that contention this review examines  
49 the background to calcium cyanamide manufacture, the advantages and disadvantages of  
50 practical use, its presence as a natural metabolite, relationships with soil microorganisms and  
51 in particular capabilities for reducing the impact of soil-borne pathogens such as  
52 *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor., which causes clubroot disease.

### 53 THE NITROGEN PROBLEM

54 Sir William Crookes, an eminent chemist in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, highlighted the original  
55 “nitrogen problem”, identifying that “the (artificial) fixation of nitrogen is vital to the  
56 progress of civilised humanity.....” (Crookes 1900). For most of mankind’s history, soil  
57 nitrogen was obtained from two natural sources, rainwater containing nitrous oxides derived  
58 from atmospheric electrical storms forming nitric acid and the activities of soil-borne bacteria  
59 either those in symbiotic relationships with legumes and other plants or those which exist as  
60 freely living forms. Farmers supplemented these sources with animal faeces either deposited  
61 directly onto pastures or as manure collected from farmyards. Other more minor sources  
62 included nitrogen bearing rocks in India and Chile plus deposits of guano, accumulated bird  
63 droppings, and waste materials such as shoddy, from some manufacturing processes. As  
64 Europe’s Agricultural Revolution led on to its Industrial Revolution, finding new supplies of  
65 nitrogen that would boost food supplies became crucially important (this is reviewed in  
66 detail in textbook series by Broughton 1981, 1982, 1983, 1986). Research and industrial  
67 progress particularly in Germany developed at least six processes that artificially fixed  
68 atmospheric di-nitrogen (N<sub>2</sub>) into stable forms in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. Three  
69 processes were economically feasible and commercialised:- the Norwegian Arc, the Haber-  
70 Bosch and Cyanamide (Mellor 1925; Erns, 1928; Leigh 2004). Of these, the Haber-Bosch

71 process has dominated nitrogen fertilizer manufacture for over a century. Production of  
72 calcium cyanamide has, however, continued predominantly for some specialised applications.

### 73 CALCIUM CYANAMIDE

74 From 1895 onwards, Adolph Frank (1834-1916) and Nikodemus Caro (1871-1935)  
75 researched chemical methods of nitrogen fixation as a means for making artificial fertilisers.  
76 Eventually working with, F. Rothe of Beringer Söhne they jointly discovered that calcium  
77 cyanamide could be made by the addition of pure di-nitrogen, prepared by air liquefaction  
78 (Linde 1916), to calcium carbide at temperatures in excess of 1000 °C (Frank 1908). In 1908  
79 Frank and Caro established a factory near Trostberg, Bavaria, powered by hydroelectricity  
80 generated from the river Alz where they produced 30,000 tonnes per annum of calcium  
81 cyanamide by 1912. This is now the most commonly used derivative of the cyanamide group  
82 of organic compounds with the general formula  $CN_2H_2$ . The molecule contains nitrile and  
83 amino groups. Hall (1905) working at Rothamsted Experiment Station, Harpenden (now  
84 Rothamsted Research) recognized calcium cyanamide as "the first attempt on a commercial  
85 scale to bring atmospheric nitrogen into a state of combination, to manufacture in fact an  
86 artificial manure containing N derived from the air". The physical, chemical and industrial  
87 properties of the cyanamide group of compounds are discussed by GÜthner & Mertschenk  
88 (2006).

89

### 90 FERTILIZER VALUE

91

92 Originally this fertilizer was named *Kalkstickstoff* (nitrogen-chalk) and is also referred to as  
93 lime-nitrogen and nitrolime. It is now formulated as a granular dust-free product resulting  
94 from combination with calcium nitrate suspension, calcium carbonate and a surface treatment

95 with wax. Calcium cyanamide (CASE Registry no: 420-02-4) contains approximately 20 %  
96 nitrogen and 50 % calcium (expressed as calcium oxide, CaO). Albert Frank, son of Adolph  
97 Frank, demonstrated that in soil calcium cyanamide is converted into ammonium ions  
98 offering a form of artificial fertilizer nitrogen which plants could utilize (Anon 2008a ; Dixon  
99 2009a). In Great Britain studies at Rothamsted demonstrated that soil microbial activity  
100 increases in the presence of calcium cyanamide (Ashby 1905) and in the USA by Jacob et al.  
101 (1924). Soil microbes slowly change calcium cyanamide in a step-wise process through  
102 cyanamide to urea to ammonia to nitrate (Bjälfe 1957). Alternatively and more rapidly  
103 carbonic acid from the atmosphere converts calcium cyanamide into cyanamide ions and  
104 calcium carbonate. Subsequent hydrolysis of cyanamide forms urea. In moist soils a  
105 proportion of cyanamide (6-11 %) dimerises into dicyandiamide (cyanoguanidin) ( $H_4C_2N_4$ )  
106 (Cornforth 1971; Dixon & Williamson 1985).

107 Dicyandiamide (DCD) is classed by the European Union (EU)-Fertiliser Directive  
108 02003/2003 (Amendment of November 8<sup>th</sup> 2008) as a nitrification inhibitor. The initial DCD  
109 content of calcium cyanamide and additional amounts resulting from the effects of soil  
110 moisture and activities of microbes slows the rate of soil nitrification and reduces the  
111 leaching of nitrates into groundwater (Rathsack 1978; Vilsmeier & Amberger 1978). Recent  
112 Japanese research (Yamamoto et al. 2012; 2013) demonstrated that calcium cyanamide  
113 reduces the emissions of nitrous oxide from soils. It is notable that nitrous oxide is a  
114 greenhouse gas which is estimated to be approximately 300 times more damaging for the  
115 environment than carbon dioxide (Solomon et al. 2007). Recent studies of spring applications  
116 of nitrogen fertilisers to winter wheat crops in eastern England emphasised the value of DCD  
117 in reducing nitrous oxide emissions (Thorman et al. 2014). In Germany, there is official  
118 recognition of DCD's properties (Nömmik 1957; Anon 1996; Günther & Mertschenk 2006).

119 Calcium cyanamide production in the Western world is limited to one factory in  
120 Bavaria, Germany. There are two factories in Japan and several in China. Limits on German  
121 production capacity mean that this fertilizer is available in modest quantities (~100,000t/yr)  
122 for European users compared with the 450Mt/yr of ammoniacal fertilizers produced by the  
123 Harber-Bosch process in factories worldwide (Smil 2004). This author identifies that artificial  
124 nitrogen production uses large amounts of energy. The Haber-Bosch process requires upto  
125 2% of the world's annual energy supply while calcium cyanamide manufacture is one of the  
126 larger users of Germany's annual energy production (personal communication AlzChem,  
127 February 2015). The scale of calcium cyanamide production is also limited by the two-stage  
128 nature of chemical manufacture which initially involves carefully forming calcium carbide.  
129 After manufacture the finely ground product is compacted by a granulation process resulting  
130 in very hard fertilizer granules. Treating the surface of these granules with a wax ensures that  
131 the fertilizer product is a dust-free formulation. In this state the product has an unlimited  
132 storage life (Güthner & Mertschenk 2006) and may be transported without restriction, packed  
133 in polyethylene valve or multilayer paper bags.

134 The relatively modest scale of production means that the cost of calcium cyanamide is  
135 preportionately higher than ammonia-based products. But since this fertilizer combines  
136 nitrogen and calcium, the latter reducing the need for applications of lime and helping to  
137 diminish the impact of soil-borne pathogens eliminating some other resource purchases. The  
138 agronomic value of calcium cyanamide is increased by repeated use over several seasons  
139 which further increases yields and crop health (Crowther & Richardson 1932; Verona 1970).

140 Predominantly, calcium cyanamide has been used as a fertilizer for field vegetable  
141 and salad crops in Europe, Asia and North America. Use in other crops has strengthened  
142 recently because of increased applications on oilseed rape crops in Northern Europe where  
143 clubroot disease (*P. brassicae*) is becoming a limiting factor (Dixon 2009b). Demand in



144 China is also increasing for similar reasons because of their substantial problems with  
145 clubroot disease (*P. brassicae*) on oilseed rape and vegetable brassica (*Brassica rapa*) crops  
146 which are a staple part of the diet (Chai et al. 2014). The properties of calcium cyanamide for  
147 inhibiting seed germination (Sturkie 1937) resulted in earlier recommendations for a 14-day  
148 interval between application and drilling. This restriction is less necessary for transplanted  
149 crops where recommendations, for example in Harling & Oxley (2007) suggest applying split  
150 applications of 500 kg/ha as a base dressing followed by a further 500 kg/ ha 14–21 days  
151 after transplanting modules. Recent technological advances in crop husbandry permitting  
152 between-row, in-row and deep-placement of fertilizers now relaxes these restrictions further  
153 because the volumes of fertilizers applied per unit area are greatly reduced while nutrient-use  
154 efficiency increases (Burns et al. 2010). In Australia Donald et al. (2004) demonstrated the  
155 usefulness of banding techniques for the application of calcium cyanamide which reduced  
156 clubroot incidence and costs. This technique is especially useful in Asian vegetable brassica  
157 crops grown on soils with high organic matter contents where clubroot disease can be  
158 particularly devastating (McDonald et al. 2004).

### 159 Stability in soil

160 Long-term studies in Portugal (1958-1974) compared the effects of applying ammonium  
161 nitrate, ammonium sulphate, calcium cyanamide, calcium nitrate and urea to land in a warm  
162 temperate region with an annual average rainfall exceeding 1,100 mm (Miranda 1975). The  
163 pH of calcium cyanamide treated plots increased slightly in alkalinity while the other  
164 treatments raised soil acidity. Additionally, the use of calcium cyanamide resulted in greater  
165 retention of exchangeable calcium while other fertilizers reduced it. The phosphate and  
166 potash content of soil treated with calcium cyanamide remained stable with increased  
167 availability of these nutrients.

168

169           Subsequent research in a tropical environment subjected coarse textured kaolinitic  
170 ultisol placed in soil columns and treated with calcium cyanamide, urea or calcium  
171 ammonium nitrate to the equivalent of 2,420 mm rainfall over 42 days (Pleysier et al. 1987).  
172 Lowest leaching losses (3 % of the nitrogen applied) were recorded where calcium  
173 cyanamide was used, highest losses were found with calcium ammonium nitrate while urea  
174 produced intermediate effects. These results indicated that calcium cyanamide is retained in  
175 soils and is not leached even where rainfall or irrigation is substantial. These are valuable  
176 properties in relation to the use of irrigation and spread of plant pathogens (Dixon 2015).

177           The nitrate content of soils treated with calcium cyanamide was lower than those of  
178 untreated controls (Nõmmik 1958). This research showed that conversion to nitrate took  
179 longer where calcium cyanamide was used compared with ammonium sulphate. Soil texture  
180 influenced the rate of conversion, with coarse sandy soils retaining nitrate longer. In soil  
181 samples incubated for 3 months, more than 90 % of the nitrogen was retained in the calcium  
182 cyanamide treatments. Lowering the temperature slowed nitrification still further. The  
183 conversion of calcium cyanamide to ammonia was stopped in sterilized soil, indicating that  
184 this process requires microbially derived enzymes. Earlier research by Jacob et al. (1924)  
185 produced broadly comparable results.

186           The fertilizer properties of calcium cyanamide were reviewed by Rieder (1981) and  
187 more recently by Dixon (2009a; 2012a). These workers identified that granulating calcium  
188 cyanamide increased its stability and environmental value. Granulation of calcium cyanamide  
189 improved its fertilizer-use-efficiency and availability for roots (Vilsmeier & Amberger 1978).  
190 Amberger (1986; 1989) also demonstrated that when DCD inhibits the initial step in  
191 nitrification, this conserves nitrogen as ammonium ( $\text{NH}_4^+$ ) ions. Dicyandiamide ultimately is

192 decomposed by biotic and abiotic processes in soils into ammonium ions, carbon dioxide and  
193 water, while nitrogen is slowly released.

194

## 195 NATURAL OCCURRENCE AND UTILISATION OF CYANAMIDE

196

197 Hairy vetch (*Vicia villosa*), which originates from Europe and Western Asia, is used as a  
198 cover crop in the USA as a means of protecting land from wind and water erosion during  
199 fallow periods (Hartwig & Ammon 2002). This legume adds nitrogen into the soil and is also  
200 antagonistic to weed growth, suggesting that it may produce naturally growth-inhibitory  
201 compounds. Analyses by Kamo et al. (2003) showed that hairy vetch produces cyanamide,  
202 which has allelo-chemical activity against lettuce (*Lactuca sativa*) seedlings used as test  
203 plants. Germinated seedlings of hairy vetch contained 40-fold greater concentrations of  
204 cyanamide compared with the content of dry seed, illustrating that this plant generates  
205 cyanamide during its early growth. In hairy vetch seedlings, concentrations of cyanamide as  
206 high as 130 µg /g fresh weight were found. This illustrates that cyanamide, which was  
207 previously considered solely as a product of industrial manufacturing, is also a naturally  
208 occurring metabolite. Later studies by Kamo et al. (2006; 2012) indicated that young leaves  
209 of *V. villosa*, *V. cracca*, *V. benghalensis* and *Robinia pseudo-acacia* contained cyanamide  
210 (NH<sub>2</sub>CN) in the range of 190 to 645 µg/g fresh weight determined by gas chromatography-  
211 mass spectrometry (GC-MS).

212         Some *Aspergillus* and *Penicillium* spp can utilise the cyanamide molecule as a source  
213 of nitrogen for decomposing cellulose (Klasse 2002). Consequently, calcium cyanamide is  
214 considered as “an environmentally benign product as it is broken down to harmless products  
215 by microbes” (Harling & Oxley 2007). The soil-borne fungus *Myrothecium verrucaria* is  
216 capable of degrading fertilizer calcium cyanamide by the action of a single soluble enzyme

217 that hydrolyses cyanamide to urea (Stransky & Amberger 1973). Cyanamide hydratase is  
218 produced by this fungus in combination with an urease (Maier-Greiner et al. 1991; Lehtovirk-  
219 Morley et al. 2011; Tourna et al. 2011). The discovery of this highly substrate-specific  
220 cyanamide hydratase, the elucidation of its structure as a homo-hexameric polypeptide, and  
221 the isolation of its gene (*cah*) offers the possibility that transformed plants could carry out  
222 these reactions. That would allow calcium cyanamide fertilizer to be applied before sowing  
223 without risking seedling growth inhibition. This could reduce the amount of fertilizer calcium  
224 cyanamide required while retaining its effectiveness as a source of nitrogen. Other  
225 suggestions (Wood 1998) that would improve the efficacy of calcium cyanamide fertilizer  
226 applications have been the incorporation of the *cah* gene into crop plants so that they could  
227 directly utilize cyanamide as opposed to requiring its initial conversion to urea.

228

## 229 SOIL HEALTH AND FERTILISER VALUE

230

231 Sustainable agriculture aims at developing healthy soils, as discussed by Lehmann & Kleber  
232 (2015) and Wall et al. (2015). Healthy soils are stable systems in which there are high levels  
233 of biological diversity, activity, internal nutrient cycling and resilience to disturbance (Doran  
234 et al. 1996; Doran & Zeiss 2000; Eveillard 2005; Bruggen et al. 2006). Soil health is defined  
235 in detail by Pankhurst et al. (1997) and by the United Nations Food and Agriculture  
236 Organisation (Anon 2008b). Retaining the diversity of microbes in soil is critical for  
237 maintaining soil health and quality and the wide range of microbes involved in soil  
238 functioning (Liesach et al. 1997; Garbeva et al. 2004). This preserves the huge genotypic and  
239 phenotypic diversity, heterogeneity and crypticity in soil microbial populations. The top layer  
240 of soil may contain up to  $10^9$  microbe cells per gram (Torsvik & Ovreas 2002). As yet  
241 knowledge concerning many of these organisms and their interactions is limited. The fraction

242 of cells making up the general microbial biomass that have been cultured and studied is very  
243 small, probably less than 5 % (Torsvik et al. 1990; Borneman & Triplett 1997). An added  
244 difficulty is that microbe populations may change quite rapidly during cropping especially,  
245 where soluble nutrients such as ammonium-nitrogen are used and soil acidity increases  
246 (Kirkby 1968). Consequently, where possible practical fertilizer strategies should aim at  
247 encouraging beneficial microbes especially those that are antagonists against soil-borne  
248 pathogens (such as *P. brassicae*) (Lahlali & Peng 2014; Zhao et al. 2015).

249 Müller (1955) was one of the first pathologists who associated calcium cyanamide  
250 with reductions in diseases caused by soil-borne microbes. She also recorded its effects  
251 stimulating the growth of non-pathogenic microbes. Earlier interactions between calcium  
252 cyanamide and soil microbe populations had been reported by Allison (1924), Kuen &  
253 Drecksell (1928), Wolfe & Wolfe (1930) and Haenseler & Moyer (1937). The detailed studies  
254 by Haenseler & Moyer (1937) demonstrated that bacteria and actinomyces populations in soil  
255 initially decreased and then rapidly accelerated for about 30 days after applications of  
256 calcium cyanamide. Thereafter numbers dropped returning to the values present before the  
257 fertilizer was applied. At their peak, however, the numbers of microbes in these two groups  
258 were 90-fold greater compared with normal soil content. Similar results are reported more  
259 recently by Klasse (1996). Applications of calcium cyanamide are associated with increased  
260 extracellular enzyme activity in soil, which is indicative of enhanced microbial activity  
261 (Bosch & Amberger 1983). These included increases in: biomass, amylase, protease, alkaline  
262 phosphatase and dehydrogenase activities, exceeding that achieved by applications of  
263 farmyard manure and ammonium sulphate. This implies that for organic husbandry systems,  
264 the use of calcium cyanamide is superior in its effects to those obtained from animal manure  
265 (Zhu et al. 2001).

266           The practical advantages of calcium cyanamide in relation to disease suppression  
267 were highlighted by Cornforth (1971), Rieder (1981) and Klasse (1999). Evidence for the  
268 benefits of fertilisers like calcium cyanamide in developing healthy soils is accumulating. In  
269 China, for example, large areas of land are now devoted to the production of protected  
270 vegetables, especially cucumbers, tomatoes and aubergines. This has led to a rise in crop  
271 losses caused by soil-borne pathogens, especially fungi such as *Verticillium* spp. Calcium  
272 cyanamide applications increased the biological health of these soils and resulted in improved  
273 crop growth by inducing shifts in the composition of microbial communities (Tian et al.  
274 2009). This reduced the damage from *Verticillium* spp. Calcium cyanamide increased mineral  
275 nitrogen, followed by increased microbial biomass, especially in the autumn periods. Similar  
276 findings are reported by Shi et al. (2009) where calcium cyanamide applications increased  
277 soil bacterial populations and decreased the pathogen *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *cucurbitae*  
278 (cucurbit wilt). Subsequently, reductions of activity by the soil pathogen *F. solani* f. sp.  
279 *cucurbitae* (stem rot) affecting cucumber was ascribed by Bourbos et al. (1997) to soil  
280 enrichment with nitrogen and calcium. Bletos (2006) suggested that calcium cyanamide can  
281 form an effective component of an integrated management system, which eliminates the need  
282 for using the environmentally damaging sterilant methyl bromide.

283           Recent research reported by Junwei et al. (2013) demonstrated that the numbers of  
284 bacteria increased in soil treated with calcium cyanamide, while those of fungi decreased in  
285 the 30 days after application. This, they claim restored the microbial community balance to a  
286 healthy status favorable for vegetable cropping. Use of polymerase chain reaction–denaturing  
287 gradient gel electrophoresis (PCR-DGGE) fingerprinting indicated that the bacterial  
288 populations following calcium cyanamide application changed with the appearance of new  
289 species and increased biodiversity. The diversity and richness indices 20 days after calcium  
290 cyanamide was applied increased substantially. The dimer product dicyandiamide (DCD)

291 produced similar effects, improving diversity and richness in bacterial populations. These  
292 authors suggested that such effects are principal mechanisms by which the cyanamide  
293 fertiliser reduced the impact of soil-borne pathogens. Greater knowledge of the interaction  
294 of fertilizers and microbes might also solve some of the problems highlighted by Walters et  
295 al. (2013) regarding the use of induced resistance as an ingredient in integrated disease  
296 management strategies. Since calcium cyanamide provides a readily available source of  
297 calcium for plants, potentially this may help up-regulate aspects of general and specific  
298 resistance, as suggested by Takahashi et al. (2002). In these studies an influx of calcium into  
299 turnip cells increased the formation of phenylalanine ammonia-lyase (PAL) activity, which  
300 appeared necessary for the expression of resistance to *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. As Dixon  
301 & Tilston (2010), suggest knowledge of the properties of fertilizers such as calcium  
302 cyanamide might help redirect agronomists towards enhancing soil and plant health.

303

## 304 CALCIUM CYANAMIDE AND THE SUPPRESSION OF CLUBROOT 305 DISEASE

306

307 Clubroot disease is caused by the protist member of the Rhizaria (Burki et al. 2010;  
308 Neuhauser et al. 2011; Schwelm et al. 2015) *Plasmodiophora brassicae*, a microbe which  
309 attacks members of the Brassicaceae family. Clubroot is an intractable disease affecting this  
310 group of crops, which are vitally important sources of fresh and processed vegetables and oil  
311 seeds. These crops contain chemicals that are associated with significant improvements in  
312 human health. They also provide cooking oils and fats, industrial lubricants, lighting fuels,  
313 condiments and flavourings, animal fodder and forage, improved soil fertility and bio-control,  
314 while also including ornamental decorative annuals and perennials. *Arabidopsis thaliana*  
315 (thale cress) which is the molecular biologists' main model species and the first plant whose

316 genome was sequenced, is also included in this family (Dixon 2007) and suffers from  
317 clubroot disease making it a valuable source of information on host-parasite relationships and  
318 potentially increasing the pool of resistance genes (Alix et al. 2007). Advances in  
319 understanding the biology of this host-pathogen relationship were described by Dixon (2006  
320 2014). The economic significance, impact and biology of this pathogen are reviewed by  
321 Dixon (2009b,c; 2014).

322

### 323 Disease incidence

324

325 It is evident from the very earliest scientific studies of clubroot and its causal organism *P.*  
326 *brassicae* in the 19<sup>th</sup> century by Woronin (1878 translated by Chupp 1934) that there were  
327 associations between fertilizer-use and the incidence and suppression of disease. Woronin,  
328 however, could not verify these assertions scientifically. Calcium cyanamide has gained an  
329 association for reducing the impact of clubroot disease over the past 100 years. The early  
330 studies of the relationship between soil borne pathogenic microbes and calcium cyanamide  
331 showed that regular applications of the fertilizer were associated with reductions in the  
332 occurrence and severity of clubroot. Research by Martin (1933) reported considerable  
333 reductions in clubroot disease following applications of calcium cyanamide. Subsequently,  
334 Walker & Larson (1935) emphasised the influence of soil conditions in moderating its  
335 efficacy, but demonstrated that weight-for-weight, the effect of calcium cyanamide exceeded  
336 that of lime (calcium carbonate) by a factor of two. Haensler & Moyer (1937) showed in both  
337 field and laboratory studies that applications of calcium cyanamide were associated with  
338 reductions in the incidence of clubroot disease. Calcium cyanamide was shown by them to  
339 have 2.5-fold greater impact in reducing clubroot compared with hydrated lime. Importantly,  
340 these researchers identified that the effects of calcium cyanamide were affected by the soil



341 environment. Small changes in pH values, soil moisture content, structure and texture  
342 affected the level of disease reduction. This served to underline the importance of Crowther  
343 and Richardson's (1932) findings that hydrogen-ion concentration in soil regulated the  
344 breakdown reactions of calcium cyanamide. The importance of interactions between soil  
345 environments, modes of application and the incidence of clubroot disease and its severity are  
346 discussed by Colhoun (1958) and Karling (1968) in their respective monographs. In farming  
347 practice, calcium cyanamide was used regularly for vegetable crops in Great Britain during  
348 the 1920s and 1930s (Smith 1961 and personal communication from Dr Elizabeth Gray 12<sup>th</sup>  
349 August 1985).

350         Following the World War II scientific interest in interactions between fertilizers and  
351 the reduced severity of soil-borne diseases was largely overtaken by the invention of  
352 numerous synthetic agrochemical molecules. These eliminated specific pathogens by  
353 inhibiting single enzyme-driven reactions. Attempts at control of clubroot followed this route  
354 with reports of extensive testing of synthetic chemicals for example Buczacki & Cadd (1976).  
355 More environmentally sensitive approaches returned in the 1980s. Researchers, farmers and  
356 growers began recognising that reducing clubroot disease would be achieved only by  
357 integrated pest management (IPM). This combined genetic resistance with the manipulation  
358 of soil environments, host nutritional status and where possible use of synthetic  
359 agrochemicals. In the period between 1945 and the early 1980s, practical use of calcium  
360 cyanamide as a specialized fertilizer in horticulture continued, particularly in north-western  
361 Europe. Here it was associated with higher crop health status and increased soil fertility  
362 (Rieder 1981). Studies restarted in Great Britain in the early 1980s when it was demonstrated  
363 that calcium cyanamide is associated with reductions in the severity of clubroot disease  
364 (Dixon & Brokenshire 1981; Dixon & Wilson 1983; Dixon 2009a; 2012a).

365 An evaluation of calcium cyanamide by Williamson & Dyce (1989) studied its effects  
366 in swede (*B. napus*) cultivars of differing resistance to *P. brassicae*. Disease severity was  
367 progressively reduced when increasing amounts of calcium cyanamide were applied. Disease  
368 threshold was related to the viable inoculum density, cultivar resistance and the use of  
369 calcium cyanamide. The integrated use of calcium cyanamide with boron and forms of  
370 nitrogen resulted in the lessening of clubroot severity (Dixon et al. 1987). Calcium  
371 cyanamide is reported by Horiuchi et al. (1983) as a useful component when integrated with  
372 solarisation as a means of reducing inoculum load in *P. brassicae* infested land. Similarly,  
373 Dixon & Wilson (1983) reported on the successful use of calcium cyanamide in reducing the  
374 impact of clubroot on cabbage and Brussels sprouts. This was followed by detailed multi-site  
375 and -seasonal studies that estimated the reduction in clubroot disease following the use of  
376 calcium cyanamide fertiliser achieving a minimum of 30 % improvement in yields  
377 (Humpherson-Jones et al. 1992). At the same time calcium cyanamide was associated by  
378 Naiki & Dixon (1987) with the diminution of disease severity caused by *P. brassicae* when  
379 examined in controlled environment and glasshouse experiments. Reductions in disease  
380 severity were related to the interval between application of the fertilizer and planting of  
381 susceptible Chinese cabbage (*B. rapa* spp. *pekinensis* cv. Granaat) seedlings in pathogen  
382 infested soil. Calcium cyanamide also stimulated host growth at all the treatment  
383 concentrations used. Subsequently, associations between the use of calcium cyanamide and  
384 reductions in the incidence of clubroot disease (*P. brassicae*) of brassicas is reviewed by  
385 Dixon (2009a; 2010; 2012a)

386 Clubroot developed in the late 1980s and into the 1990s as a significant disease of  
387 Australian vegetable brassica industry, most notably cauliflower and calabrese (green  
388 broccoli) crops in Victoria and Western Australia. A system of integrated control was  
389 developed which included the use of calcium cyanamide. Applying the fertilizer by banded

390 applications directed into the crop rows planted on raised beds significantly reduced cost by  
391 cutting application rates by 66 % and reduced the level of disease incidence. The marketable  
392 yield of calabrese receiving calcium cyanamide was double that of untreated controls in both  
393 1996 and 1997 in Victoria indicating that crop growth was improved. This followed earlier  
394 work which studied the particle size and application methods for calcium cyanamide used in  
395 Australian vegetable production (Donald et al. 2004). These studies showed that calcium  
396 cyanamide used with other treatments, especially rapidly acting forms of lime successfully  
397 reduced the intensity of clubroot disease in the field (Donald et al. 2006). Subsequent British  
398 studies (Harling et al. 2007; Stewart 2007) indicated that combining calcium cyanamide with  
399 other bio-fertilizers and formulations of calcium was associated with reductions in clubroot  
400 disease on several sites over four seasons.

401 The Australian workers also developed a real-time polymerase chain reaction (PCR)  
402 test that quantified inoculum loads and allowed predictions of yield losses (Donald et al.  
403 2006). There is a minimum viable spore density of between  $10^3$  and  $10^4$  spores per gm of dry  
404 soil before root hair infection by *P. brassicae* leads to consistent disease expression suggested  
405 Naiki et al. (1978). This result agrees with Garrett's (1958) theories of minimal inoculum  
406 potential being required before there is successful disease development caused by soil-borne  
407 pathogens.

408 Integrated use of calcium cyanamide with lime is advocated by Belec et al. (2004) in  
409 Canada and with the addition of resistant cultivars into an integrated system was  
410 recommended for vegetable brassicas (Anon 2012). Similar reports come from other centres  
411 in Canada (McDonald 2002). Working on highly organic muck soils in Ontario, she found  
412 that calcium cyanamide applications were strongly associated with reductions in clubroot  
413 severity especially when used in combination with applications of boron. The need for  
414 coherent means for controlling clubroot disease is highlighted by information now coming

415 from China. Reportedly 70 to 80 % of land used for brassica crops, which are of major  
416 culinary and industrial significance in the provinces of Guangdong, Shandong, Zhejiang,  
417 Jiangsu, Hangzhou, Jinhua, and Nongbo district of Zhejiang province, is infested with *P.*  
418 *brassicae* (Chai et al. 2014). This poses a problem of great urgency for Chinese agriculture.  
419 Lime-nitrogen (calcium cyanamide) applications were associated with substantial reductions  
420 of clubroot disease in Chinese cabbage, increased yield and grower's income (Benyue 1995)

421 Clubroot severely limits brassica crop production worldwide and has now gained  
422 major footholds in the oilseed rape crops of Canada, China and northern Europe, threatening  
423 the viability of one of the world's most significant internationally-traded crops (Strelkov &  
424 Dixon 2014). Management of *P. brassicae* is limited by the factors discussed by Dixon  
425 (2014). The distribution of this pathogen seems to be increasing since disease reports are now  
426 coming from countries which previously had no or very limited occurrence of clubroot such  
427 as Turkey (Apaydin et al. 2010).

428

## 429 Mode of action

430

431 The association of calcium, in the form of lime, with the suppression of clubroot (finger and  
432 toe) disease was well established even before the causal organism was identified (Anon  
433 1853). Thereafter calcium as limes or to a lesser extent fertilizers such as calcium cyanamide  
434 were recommended as practical means for reducing the progress of clubroot disease (Colhoun  
435 1958; Karling 1968). The mode of action of calcium and associated effects on soil pH has,  
436 however, been elucidated only relatively recently. Fletcher et al. (1982) recognised that  
437 although pH influenced the progress of clubroot disease, this was affected by the  
438 concentrations of calcium ions in the soil solution. In California, USA., Campbell et al.  
439 (1985) concluded that there was an interaction between pH, extractable calcium and

440 magnesium, which must exceed approximately 14 meq/100mg of soil from native minerals or  
441 with fertilizers, such as calcium cyanamide or lime treatments. These relationships were  
442 studied by Dixon & Webster (1988) and by Webster and Dixon (1991 a, b) who  
443 demonstrated details of the stages in the life-cycle of *P. brassicae* and the associated  
444 development of pathogenesis that are regulated by calcium ions, pH values and host factors.  
445 Each of these components, while affected by the others, has independent effects. These  
446 operate throughout the pathogen life-cycle from the germination of motile primary zoospores,  
447 penetration and colonisation of root hairs through the formation of primary plasmodia,  
448 sporangia and then onto the infection of cortical cells and the secondary stages of  
449 pathogenesis which culminate in gall formation. Increasing soil calcium or alkalinity reduces  
450 the rate of maturation of *P. brassicae* in root hairs retarding its the speed and the quantities of  
451 plasmodia which formed sporangia. But as Myers & Campbell (1985) demonstrated, calcium  
452 has little impact on the dormant resting spores. Previously, Macfarlane (1958) had  
453 demonstrated that in controlled experiments pH values of 5 to 6 had little influence on the  
454 level of successful infection by primary zoospores penetrating root hairs. Successful infection  
455 diminished greatly as pH increased and reached 8.0. This effect was further explained by  
456 Donald & Porter (2004) who showed that at acidic pH values the progress of infection into  
457 root hairs was only delayed by the presence of significant amounts of calcium (20 mM). As  
458 pH became increasingly alkaline, the amount of calcium required to reduce root hair infection  
459 lessened. Subsequently Takahashi et al. (2006) found that when *P. brassicae* encounters  
460 resistant cultivars, there is an alkalisation of the environment in the rhizosphere which retards  
461 the capacity of the pathogen for invasion. He found that cell death in *Arabidopsis thaliana*  
462 resistant to *P. brassicae* was associated with increasing alkalisation of the root environment  
463 and that this did not occur in cultures of susceptible plants. These suggestions were taken  
464 further by Niwa et al. (2007) who emphasised the role of pH in moderating the development

465 of clubroot disease in field experiments. Soils which were suppressive of *P. brassicae* had  
466 elevated calcium contents and alkaline pH and considerable microbial activity. Webster  
467 (1986) found that nitrate-nitrogen could also be associated with reduced root hair invasion by  
468 *P. brassicae*. At least in part this might be explained by findings that on root surfaces there is  
469 a localised increase in pH associated with nitrate-nitrogen and a decline in pH around root  
470 hairs when ammonium is the source of nitrogen (Marschner et al. 1986).

471 As the interaction of calcium with *P. brassicae* and clubroot disease is increasingly  
472 understood. Yano et al. (1991) investigated by quantitative analysis the relationships between  
473 calcium in spore suspension and effects of inoculation in culture solutions with resting  
474 spores. Their results suggested that the presence of calcium (as  $\text{Ca}^{2+}$  ions) promoted the  
475 germination of *P. brassicae* resting spores. That exposes the resultant delicate primary  
476 zoospores to predation by soil-borne bacteria and may also reduce their motility. By analogy  
477 with the water moulds (Oomyces), that also rely on flagella for motility, calcium ions in  
478 solution adversely affect the movement of zoospores (Donaldson & Deacon 1993). Yano's  
479 research offered a clue to the manner by which microbial populations antagonistic towards *P.*  
480 *brassicae* might be stimulated by the presence of calcium.

481

## 482 Suppressive soils

483

484 The volume of soil where *P. brassicae* most probably encounters greatest numbers of  
485 antagonistic microorganisms is the rhizosphere. This is because the primary zoospores are  
486 less than 1.5µm diameter (Cook 1933) and hence will have limited supplies of energy and not  
487 be capable of moving far in soil moisture films from the resting spore to the host root surface  
488 (Dixon 2014) in response to host root exudates (Mattey & Dixon 2015). It is the suppressive  
489 or conducive environment in the rhizosphere which *P. brassicae* zoospores encounter as they

490 attempt penetration of the root hairs which determines the success or failure of subsequent  
491 invasion and disease development. A generalised description of the rhizosphere was provided  
492 by Hinsinger et al. (2005). This emphasised its complexity since it is occupied by beneficial  
493 as well as pathogenic organisms and plant root systems. Further, the rhizoplane (root surface)  
494 and surrounding rhizosphere were noted by Newton et al. (2010) as “support(ing) complex  
495 microbial communities that can influence nutrient availability and the ability of pathogens to  
496 colonise roots”. This complexity in the microbial community and resultant suppressivity or  
497 conduciveness is influenced by agricultural practices as discussed by Raaijmakers et al.  
498 (2009) and Raaijmaaker & Mazzola (2016). This encourages beneficial rhizosphere  
499 microorganisms such as the bacteria *Pseudomonas*, *Burkholderia* and *Bacillus* which  
500 adversely affect the population density, dynamics and metabolic activities of soil-borne  
501 pathogens (Raaijmakers et al. 2009). Increasing the activities of microorganisms capable of  
502 suppressing pathogens is a route by which sustainable husbandry may be achieved as  
503 advocated by Mazzola (2004) particularly in relation to take-all disease of cereals  
504 (*Gaeumannomyces graminis*). Research with various soil amendments indicates that  
505 stimulation of soil microbial populations encourages chitinolytic bacteria which are capable  
506 of degrading the resting spores of *P. brassicae* because they contain chitin in the cell wall  
507 (Buczacki & Moxham 1983). The stimulation of chitinolytic bacteria resulting in the  
508 inhibition of diseases caused by soil-borne pathogens is discussed by Dixon & Walsh (1998)

509         The indirect effects of calcium cyanamide, of stimulating antagonistic microbe  
510 populations, which then results in reduced incidence of soil-borne pathogens and the diseases  
511 that they incite was identified for *Verticillium albo-atrum*, *Pythium ultimum* and  
512 *Thielaviopsis basicola* by Verona (1970). Applications of calcium cyanamide were  
513 demonstrated by Huang & Sun (1991) to be associated with encouraging bacterial  
514 populations in treated soil and in reductions in populations of some other plant pathogenic

515 fungi such as *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* a cause of white rot in a wide range of crops (Jones &  
516 Gray 1973). Applying calcium cyanamide to soil also encouraged suppressiveness towards *F.*  
517 *oxysporum* f. sp. *cucumerinum* (cucumber wilt) (Shi et al. 2009). It was suggested by  
518 Horiuchi et al. (1983) that calcium cyanamide enhanced the suppression of clubroot in  
519 association with the use of soil solarisation.

520 Studies of soil-borne bacteria such as *Bacillus subtilis* established that they are  
521 antagonists of *P. brassicae* (Einhorn et al. 1991). In the 1980s in Taiwan Hsieh & Wang  
522 (1986) examined the components of clubroot suppressive soils. They concluded that while  
523 calcium and pH were important factors the stimulation of populations of antagonistic  
524 microbes was also essential. In Taiwan, clubroot suppressive soils were associated with pH  
525 values >7.4 and with a calcium content of >1210 ppm. The local irrigation water was found  
526 by Hsieh & Wang (1986) to be highly calcareous but they contended that suppressivity was  
527 partially related to soil physico-chemical factors such as texture, pH, organic matter content  
528 and exchangeable potassium, sodium, magnesium and calcium. But acidifying soils, which is  
529 a means of removing bacteria was shown by Wang & Hsieh (1986) to reduce their  
530 suppressive properties.

531 Applications of calcium cyanamide were associated with increased numbers of  
532 microbes in soil (Allison 1924; Mukerji 1932). Soil biological health as measured by the  
533 amount of amylase and protease activity increased where calcium cyanamide was used,  
534 whereas the opposite effects were obtained with applications of ammonium sulphate (Bosch  
535 & Amberger 1983). Calcium hydroxide may be released from calcium cyanamide, which  
536 then raises alkaline soil pH, further encouraging microbial activity and benefiting soil fertility  
537 (Verona 1970). The subsequent release of nitrogen via DCD encourages populations of  
538 heterotrophic microbes (Nõmmik 1958). Overall, the breakdown of calcium cyanamide  
539 increases the heterogeneity of soil microbe populations and in turn this raises fertility. This



540 finding supports the early results of Crowther & Richardson (1932) showing that calcium  
541 cyanamide is most effective when applied as routine annual applications thereby maintaining  
542 environments conducive for increased microbial activity.

543 More recently studies in Brittany by Rouxel et al. (1985) of conducive and  
544 suppressive soils established a relationship between pH values, soil moisture, inoculum load  
545 and clubroot disease. He also speculated on the role which microbial biological control agents  
546 might play and their interaction with physical characteristics of soil. Page (2001) clearly  
547 demonstrated that applications of calcium in various forms of lime could be associated with  
548 the development of soil suppressivity towards *P. brassicae*. Her Scottish field studies  
549 identified the development of soil suppressiveness towards *P. brassicae* resulting from the  
550 interactions between calcium and benign soil microbes. This relationship was explored  
551 further by Murakami et al. (2002) identifying the effects of reducing inoculum load as  
552 suppressiveness increased resulting in reduced disease expression associated with  
553 exchangeable soil calcium. A link between calcium and increased microbial activity was  
554 developed by Niwa et al. (2007; 2008) in relation to suppressive and conducive soils. They  
555 demonstrated that calcium is associated with increased microbial activity and reduced  
556 germination of *P. brassicae* resting spores and in turn this suppresses the development of  
557 clubroot disease. They demonstrated that soil borne microbes may change their metabolic  
558 activities when calcium cyanamide is present. The diversity and species richness of soil  
559 populations of beneficial bacteria was enhanced by calcium cyanamide as Niwa et al. (2008)  
560 demonstrated by increasing amounts of rRNA fragments. Subsequently, (Junwei et al. 2013)  
561 reported that applications of calcium cyanamide encourages soil bacterial community  
562 diversity and richness. Potentially that could increase soil suppressiveness and probably result  
563 in a decline in soil-borne plant pathogens. If suppressiveness is accepted as a component of  
564 soil health then that also implies promoting a broader spectrum of soil inhabitants such as

565 earthworms. The report by Bauchhenß (1994) then becomes relevant. This work  
566 demonstrated that applications of calcium cyanamide caused no adverse effects on  
567 populations of several earthworm species and ultimately resulted in increased numbers of  
568 these animals. It is also noted that beneficial bacteria such as nitrogen-fixing bradyrhizobia  
569 are increased by the presence of calcium cyanamide. Nitrogen fixation, for example, was 50  
570 % greater in soybean crops receiving this fertilizer (Tewari et al. 2004).

571

## 572 DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

573

574 Immense challenges will face scientists, farmers and growers over the next 50 years in  
575 ensuring food security as human populations expand, land areas for cropping diminish and  
576 water supplies for irrigation are becoming restricted (Dixon 2009d; 2012b). Confronting  
577 these challenges requires larger crop yields without accelerating climate change, soil  
578 degradation, water shortages or the further impoverishment of natural biodiversity. Currently,  
579 agricultural productivity increases by about 2 % annually as a result of scientific  
580 improvements, this must rise to 3 % if food security worldwide is to be maximised (Braun  
581 2010; Dixon 2009d; 2012b). Raising the intensity of production should be linked with the  
582 protection of the environment (Tollefson 2010) in which soil management will be of  
583 particular importance (Schutter et al. 2001; Bronick & Lal 2005). Consequently, the  
584 potentialities of currently relatively minor husbandry tools such as specialised sources of crop  
585 nutrients like calcium cyanamide should be assessed. Research of this nature is called for by  
586 Frank & Groffman (2009) in their challenges asking for more information concerning the  
587 movement and uptake of nitrogen from the rhizosphere into roots. It is also highlighted by  
588 Paustian et al. (2016) specifically in relation to improved fertiliser-use-efficiency.

589 Calcium cyanamide fertilizer was the first commercialised source of artificial  
590 nitrogen. While the quantities currently produced are far less than those made using the  
591 Harber-Bosch process it has retained a market presence for over a century. During that time  
592 the uses of calcium cyanamide have mainly centred on specialised applications for high-value  
593 field and glasshouse vegetable and salad crops. Here it has been associated the promotion of  
594 soil health and quality, and reducing the impact of soil-borne pathogens such as *P. brassicae*,  
595 (Dixon et al. 1987) or species of *Sclerotinia*. Additionally, the presence of the dimer DCD in  
596 the commercially formulated fertilizer and its formation in soils treated with calcium  
597 cyanamide reduces nitrification and slows nitrate pollution. Properties of this fertilizer for  
598 slowly releasing nitrogen into the rhizosphere linked with the ready availability of calcium  
599 encourage the development of microbial diversity and suppressiveness towards soil-borne  
600 pathogens. The latter property in particular, is encouraging interest in calcium cyanamide for  
601 application in oilseed rape crops which are now increasingly damaged by clubroot disease  
602 (Dixon 2010; Diederichsen et al. 2014). Consequently, there is wider recognition of calcium  
603 cyanamide as a potentially valuable component of environmentally sustainable integrated  
604 pest management (IPM) strategies for this destructive disease worldwide as suggested by  
605 Tremblay et al. (2005) and Donald & Porter. (2014). This strategy involves encouraging  
606 suppressive soils containing microorganisms that are antagonistic towards soil-borne  
607 pathogens. (Dixon & Tilston 2010). Developing soil suppressiveness towards *P. brassicae* is  
608 an established technique following studies such as those of Arie et al. (1998), Einhorn et al.  
609 (1991) and Lahlali et al. (2014 a,b). Increasingly, accurate means for targetting such  
610 fertilizers into the root zone are becoming available following the development of automated  
611 robotic sensing of varying fertilizer requirements across crops through changes in foliar  
612 nitrogen status (Gianquinto et al. 2003) combined with increased efficiency in granule

613 distribution into the canopy (Antille et al. 2015). With potential increases in efficacy and cost  
614 savings. As a result the cost is likely to be reduced and efficacy increased.

615 Artificial nitrogenous fertilisers have made incalculable contributions to human  
616 welfare for over a century. This role in crop husbandry is likely to continue, but the manner  
617 by which this is achieved will be modified as needs for sustaining environmental security,  
618 biodiversity and human health increase. There are already requirements for protecting  
619 Nitrate Vulnerable Zones (NVZs) and the dangers of raised nitrate concentrations in crops  
620 (Pimpini et al. 1970) have been long recognised. Consideration should be given to using  
621 nitrogen fertiliser formulations that are not accompanied by these problems (Sieling & Kage  
622 2010) and which encourage beneficial microorganisms (Yao et al. 2000) . That improves soil  
623 health and quality which is internationally recognised as means for increasing agricultural  
624 productivity and conserving and sustaining biological diversity. Increasingly multi-  
625 disciplinary research is providing knowledge which will enable improved exploitation of the  
626 benefits offered by benign soil inhabiting microbes in the repair and maintenance of soil  
627 health.

628 Agriculture is the sector of human activity which is most likely to be affected by  
629 climate change (Rosenzweig et al. 2014). This assessment is based on a globally consistent  
630 protocol-based, multi-model which indicates strong negative effects of climate change  
631 particularly where there are high levels of warming at low latitudes where developing  
632 countries are concentrated. The urgency of this situation is further emphasised by the large  
633 scale meta-analysis by Challinor et al. (2014) showing the relationship between rising  
634 temperatures and declining crop yields in coming decades. The use of nitrogen fertilization  
635 will have particular relevance in mitigating some of these effects. In this process, compounds  
636 such as calcium cyanamide, which encourage natural soil microbial antagonisms towards

637 plant pathogenic organisms and have limited environmental impact could offer considerable  
638 benefits for crop husbandry.

639

## 640 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

641

642 Grateful thanks are given to the referees and editors for their helpful and constructive  
643 comments which have improved this review. Thanks are also given to Mr Paul Corfield and  
644 Dr Hans-Juergen Klasse for supplying information.

645

## 646 REFERENCES

647

- 648 ALIX, K., LARIAGON, C., DELOURME, R. & MANZANARES-DAULEUX, M. J. (2007). Exploiting  
649 natural genetic diversity and mutant resources of *Arabidopsis thaliana* to study the *A.*  
650 *thaliana-Plasmodiophora brassicae* interaction. *Plant Breeding* **126**, 218-221.
- 651 ALLISON, F. E. (1924). The effect of Cyanamid and related compounds on the numbers of  
652 microorganisms in soil. *Journal of Agricultural Research* **28**, 1159-1166.
- 653 ALVAREZ-SOLIS, J. D. & ANZUETTO-MARTINEZ, M. de J. (2004). Soil microbial activity  
654 under different corn cropping systems in the Highlands of Chiapas, Mexico. *Agrociencia*  
655 (*Montecillo*) **38**, 13-22.
- 656 AMBERGER, A. (1986). Potential of nitrification inhibitors in modern fertiliser management.  
657 *Zeitschrift Pflanzenernähr Bodenkd* **149**, 469-484.
- 658 AMBERGER, A. (1989). Research on dicyandiamide as a nitrification inhibitor and future  
659 outlook. *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis*. **20**, 1933-1955.
- 660 ANON (1853). The disease of finger and toe in turnips. *Transactions of the Highland and*  
661 *Agricultural Society of Scotland* **3**, 118-140.
- 662 ANON (1996) Federal Government position paper on the decision of the Bundesrat on the  
663 decree amending fertiliser regulations. Berlin: *Federal Ministry of Food, Agriculture and*  
664 *Forestry, Berlin letter of March 25<sup>th</sup> 1996, reference: 312-3132/23*.
- 665 ANON (2008a). 100 years of calcium cyanamide from Trostberg. *Monatschrift Magazin für*  
666 *den Gartenbau-Profi (Magazine for Professional Horticulture)*. August issue, pages 296-  
667 297.
- 668 ANON (2008b) United Nations Food & Agriculture Organisation (FAO) Rome Italy  
669 [http://www.fao.org/agriculture/crops/thematic-sitemap/theme/spi/soil-biodiversity/the-](http://www.fao.org/agriculture/crops/thematic-sitemap/theme/spi/soil-biodiversity/the-nature-of-soil/what-is-a-healthy-soil/en/)  
670 [nature-of-soil/what-is-a-healthy-soil/en/](http://www.fao.org/agriculture/crops/thematic-sitemap/theme/spi/soil-biodiversity/the-nature-of-soil/what-is-a-healthy-soil/en/) website checked 24 March 2016.
- 671 ANON (2012) Brassica Research News no 1. Stoneleigh, Warwickshire: *Horticultural*  
672 *Development Company (HDC, now Agriculture & Horticulture Development Board*

- 673 *AHDB – Horticulture) and Brassica (now British) Growers Association (BGA)*. June 3  
674 pages.
- 675 ANTILLE, D. L., GALLAR, L., MILLER., P. C. H. & GODWIN, R. J. (2015). An investigation  
676 into the fertiliser particle dynamics off-the-disc. *Applied Engineering in Agriculture* **31**,  
677 49-60.
- 678 APAYDIN, A., DELIGÖZ, I., KAR, H., KIBAR, B. & KARAAGAC, O. (2010). An investigation on  
679 clubroot disease (*Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor.) races in the Black Sea Region of  
680 Turkey. *Zirat Fabrikasi Dergisi* **28**, 57-60.
- 681 ARIE, T., KOBAYASHI, G., OKADA, G., KONO, Y. & YAMAGUCHI, I. (1998). Control of soil  
682 borne clubroot disease of cruciferous plants by epoxydon from *Phoma glomerata*. *Plant*  
683 *Pathology* **47**, 741-748;
- 684 ASHBY, S. F. (1905). Note on the fate of calcium cyanamide in the soil. *Journal of*  
685 *Agricultural Science* **1**, 358-360.
- 686 BAUCHHENB, J. (1994). Influence of Alzodef and Perlka on earthworms (Einfluß von Alzodef  
687 und Perlka auf Regenwürmer). Freising, Germany: *Report KA-187, Bayerische*  
688 *Landesanstalt für Bodenkultur.und Pflanzenbau*.
- 689 BELEC, C., TREMBALY, N. & COULOMBE, J. (2004). Liming and calcium cyanamid for  
690 clubroot control in cauliflower. *Acta Horticulturae* **635**, 41-46.
- 691 BELL, M. A., FISCHER, R. A., BYERLEE, D. & SAYRE, K. (1995). Genetic and agronomic  
692 contributions to yield gains: a case study for wheat. *Field Crops Research* **44**, 55-65.
- 693 BENYUE, Z. (1995). Research on efficacy of LN fertiliser with chemical function of  
694 controlling Chinese cabbage clubroot. *Journal of Agricultural Science of Zhejiang*  
695 *University* **6**, 300-301.
- 696 BJÄLFVE, G. (1957). The nitrification of calcium cyanamide and its effects on the soil  
697 microflora. *Annals of the Agricultural College of Sweden (Kungliga*  
698 *Lantbrukshögskolans Annaler)* **23**, 423-456.
- 699 BLETOS, F. A. (2006). Grafting and calcium cyanamide as alternatives to methyl bromide for  
700 greenhouse eggplant production. *Scientia Horticulturae* **107**, 325-331.
- 701 BOLLAG, J. M., SENESI, N., HUANG, P.M. (1992). *Interactions between soil minerals and*  
702 *microorganisms: impact on the terrestrial ecosystem*. New York: Marcel Dekker pages  
703 307-379.
- 704 BORNEMAN, J. & TRIPLETT, E. W. (1997). Molecular microbial diversity in soil from Eastern  
705 Amazonia: evidence of unusual micro-organisms and microbial population shifts  
706 associated with deforestation. *Applied Environmental Microbiology* **63**, 2647-2653.
- 707 BOSCH, M & AMBERGER, A. (1983). Influence of long-term fertilising with different forms of  
708 nitrogen fertiliser on pH, humic fractions, biological activity and dynamics of nitrogen of  
709 an arable brown earth (Einfluß langjähriger Düngung mit verschiedenen N- formen auf  
710 pH-Wert, Humusfraktionen, biologische Aktivität und Stickstoffdynamik einer Acker-  
711 Braunerde). *Zeitschrift. Pflanzenernähr Bodenkde* **146**, 714-724.
- 712 BOURBOS, V. A., SKOUDRIDAKIS, M. T., DARAKIS, G. A. & KOULLIZAKIS, M. (1997).  
713 Calcium cyanamide and soil solarisation for the control *Fusarium solani* f. sp. *cucurbitae*  
714 in greenhouse cucumber. *Crop Protection* **16** , 383-386.

- 715 BRAUN, J. von (2010). Strategic body needed to beat food crisis. *Nature (London)* **465**, 548-  
716 549.
- 717 BRONICK, C. J. & LAL, R. (2005). Soil structure and management: a review. *Geoderma* **124**,  
718 3-22.
- 719 BROUGHTON, W. J. (editor). *Nitrogen Fixation* vol 1 *Ecology* (1981); vol 2 *Rhizobium*  
720 (1982); vol 3 *Legumes* (1983); Broughton, W. J. & Pühler, S. *Nitrogen Fixation* vol 4  
721 *Molecular Biology* (1986). Oxford: The Clarendon Press.
- 722 BRUGGEN, A. H. C van, SEMENOV, A. M., DIEPENINGEN, A. D. van, VOS, O. J. De. & BLOK,  
723 W. J. (2006). Relation between soil health, wave-like fluctuations in microbial  
724 populations and soil-borne plant disease management. *European Journal of Plant*  
725 *Pathology* **115**, 105-122.
- 726 BUCZACKI, S.T & CADD, S. E. (1976). Glasshouse evaluation of systemic compounds,  
727 derivatives of dithiocarbamic acid and other fungicides for the control of clubroot.  
728 *Annals Applied Biology* **84**, 43-50.
- 729 BUCZACKI, S. T. & MOXHAM, S. E. (1983). Structure of the resting spore wall of  
730 *Plasmodiophora brassicae* revealed by electron microscopy and chemical digestion.  
731 *Mycological Research* (formerly the *Transactions of the British Mycological Society*) **81**,  
732 221-231.
- 733 BURKI, F., KUDRYAVTSEV, A., MATZ, M. V., AGLYAMOVA, G. V., BULMAN, S., FIERS, M.,  
734 KEELING, P. J. & PAWLOWSKI, J. (2010). Evolution of Rhizaria: new insights from  
735 phylogenomic analysis of uncultivated protists. *BioMed Central Evolutionary Biology*,  
736 **10** no 377, 1-18.
- 737 BURNS, I. G., HAMMOND, J. P. & WHITE, P. J. (2010). Precision placement of fertiliser for  
738 optimising the early nutrition of vegetable crops – a review of the implications for the  
739 yield and quality of crops and their nutrient use efficiency. *Acta Horticulturae* **852**, 177-  
740 187.
- 741 CAMPBELL, R. N. GREATHEAD, A. S. MYERS, D. F. & BOER, G. J. de (1985). Factors  
742 related to control of clubroot of crucifers in the Salinas Valley of California.  
743 *Phytopathology* **75**, 665-670.
- 744 CHAI, A. L., XIE, X. W., SHI, Y. X. & LI, B. J. (2014). Research status of clubroot  
745 (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*) on cruciferous crops in China. *Canadian Journal Plant*  
746 *Pathology* **36** (S1), 142-153.
- 747 CHALLINOR, A. J., WATSON, J., LOBELL, D. B., HOWDEN, S. M., SMITH, D. R. & CHETRI, N.  
748 (2014). A meta-analysis of crop yields under climate change and adaptation. *Nature*  
749 *Climate Change* **4**, 287-291.
- 750 COLHOUN, J. (1958). Club root disease of crucifers caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*  
751 Woron.–a monograph. *Phytopathological Paper* no 3, Kew, Surrey: The Commonwealth  
752 Mycological Institute.
- 753 COOK, W. R. I. (1933). A monograph of the Plasmodiophorales. *Archive für Protistenkunde*  
754 Editors Max Hartmann & Adolf Pascher Bond 80 Heft 2 S 179-356, Verlag von Gustav  
755 Fischer, Jena, Germany.
- 756 CORNFORTH, I. S. (1971). Calcium cyanamide in agriculture. *Soils and Fertilisers* **34**, 463-  
757 468.
- 758 CROOKES, W. (1900). *The wheat problem*. London: John Murray.

- 759 CROWTHER, E. M. & RICHARDSON, H. L. (1932). Studies on calcium cyanamide. 1. The  
760 decomposition of calcium cyanamide in the soil and its effects on germination,  
761 nitrification and soil reaction. *Journal of Agricultural Science* **22**, 300-334.
- 762 DIEDERICHSEN, E. FRAUEN, M. & LUDWIG-MULLER, J. (2014). Clubroot disease  
763 management challenges from a German perspective. (Special Issue: Clubroot  
764 (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*) on canola and other brassica species: disease development,  
765 epidemiology and management.) *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **36**(Suppl. 1), 85-  
766 98.
- 767 DIXON, G. R. (2006). The biology of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor. – a review of recent  
768 advances. *Acta Horticulturae* **706**, 271-282.
- 769 DIXON, G. R. (2007). *Vegetable brassicas and related crucifers*. Crop Production Science in  
770 Horticulture no 14. Wallingford, Oxon CAB International.
- 771 DIXON, G. R. (2009a). Calcium cyanamide -100 years of successful integrated control. *Plant*  
772 *Protection Science* **45**, 37-38.
- 773 DIXON, G. R. (2009b). The occurrence and impact of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* and clubroot  
774 disease. *Journal of Plant Growth Regulation* **28**, 194-202.
- 775 DIXON, G. R. (2009c). *Plasmodiophora brassicae* in its environment. Chapter 3 In;  
776 *Plasmodiophora brassicae* (Clubroot)—a plant pathogen that alters host growth and  
777 productivity. (Ed. G. R. Dixon). *Journal of Plant Growth Regulation* **28**, 193-303.
- 778 DIXON, G. R. (2009d). The impact of climate and global change on crop production. Chapter  
779 17 pages 307-324 In: *Climate Change: Observed Impacts on Planet Earth*. (Editor T. M.  
780 Letcher). Oxford: Elsevier.
- 781 DIXON, G. R. (2010). Calcium and pH as parts of a coherent control strategy for clubroot  
782 disease (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*). *Acta Horticulturae* **867**,151-156.
- 783 DIXON, G R (2012a). Calcium cyanamide—a synoptic review of an environmentally benign  
784 fertiliser which enhances soil health. *Acta Horticulturae* **938**, 211-217.
- 785 DIXON, G. R. (2012b). The impact of global climate change on plant disease and world food  
786 production. *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **34**, 362-379..
- 787 DIXON, G. R. (2014). Clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae* Woronin) – an agricultural and  
788 biological challenge worldwide. *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **36** (S1), 5-18.
- 789 DIXON, G R (2015). Water Irrigation and plant disease. *CAB Reviews: Perspectives in*  
790 *Agriculture, Veterinary Science, Nutrition and Natural Resources*. CAB Reviews 2015,  
791 **10**, 009, pages 1-18.
- 792 DIXON, G. R. Brokenshire, T. (1981). Chemical control of clubroot (*Plasmodiophora*  
793 *brassicae*). *Crop protection in Northern Britain. Proceedings of a conference held at*  
794 *Dundee University 17-19 March 1981*. 325-329. Farnham: The British Crop Protection  
795 Council.
- 796 DIXON, G. R. & TILSTON, E. L. (2010). Soil-borne pathogens and their interaction with the  
797 soil environment. Chapter 6 pages 197-272 In: *Soil Microbiology and Sustainable Crop*  
798 *Production* (Editors G. R. Dixon & E. L. Tilston), Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer  
799 Publications.
- 800 DIXON, G. R. & WALSH, U. F. (1998). Suppression of plant pathogens by organic extracts – a  
801 review. *Acta Horticulturae* **469**, 383-390.



802 DIXON, G. R. & WEBSTER, M. A. (1988). Antagonistic effects of boron, calcium and pH on  
803 pathogenesis caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Woronin (clubroot)—a review of  
804 recent work. *Crop Research* **28**, 83-95.

805 DIXON, G.R. & WILLIAMSON, C.J. (1985). Factors affecting the use of calcium cyanamide  
806 for control of *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Proceedings Better Brassicas 1984*  
807 *Conference, St. Andrews*. Dundee: Scottish Crop Research Institute, (now the James  
808 Hutton Institute), 238-244.

809 DIXON, G. R. & WILSON, F. (1983). Evaluation of calcium cyanamide for control of  
810 *Plasmodiophora brassicae* (clubroot). *Annals of Applied Biology* **102**(Suppl.), 50-51.

811 DIXON, G. R. NAIKI, T. WEBSTER, A. & WILSON, F. (1987). Integrated use of boron,  
812 calcium cyanamide and nitrogen for control of clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*).  
813 *Crop Protection in Northern Britain* 399-404. Farnham: The British Crop Protection  
814 Council.

815 DONALD, E. C. LAWRENCE, J. M. & PORTER, I. J. (2004). Influence of particle size and  
816 application method on the efficacy of calcium cyanamide for control of clubroot of  
817 vegetable brassicas. *Crop Protection* **23**, 297-303.

818 DONALD, E. C. & PORTER, I.J. (2014). Clubroot in Australia: the history and impact of  
819 *Plasmodiophora brassicae* in brassica crops and research efforts directed towards its  
820 control. *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **36** (S1) 66.84.

821 DONALD, E. C. & PORTER, I. J. (2004). A sand-culture technique used to observe the effect of  
822 calcium and pH on root hair and cortical stages of infection by *Plasmodiophora*  
823 *brassicae*. *Australasian Plant Pathology* **33**, 585-589.

824 DONALD, E. C., PORTER, I. J., FAGGIAN, R. & LANCASTER, R. A. (2006). An integrated  
825 approach to the control of clubroot in vegetable brassica crops. *Acta Horticulturae* **706**,  
826 283-300.

827 DONALDSON, S P. & DEACON, J. W. (1993). Changes in motility of *Pythium* zoospores  
828 induced by calcium and calcium-modulating drugs. *Mycological Research* **97**, 877-883.

829 DORAN, J. W., SARRANTONIO, M. & LIEBIG, M. A. (1996). Soil health and sustainability.  
830 *Advances in Agronomy* **56**, 2-54.

831 DORAN, J. W. & ZEISS, M. R. (2000). Soil health and sustainability: managing the biotic  
832 component of soil quality. *Applied Soil Ecology* **15**, 3-11.

833 EINHORN, G., BOCHOW, H., HUBER, J. & KREBS, B. (1991). Methodological studies on the  
834 detection of antagonists of the clubroot pathogen *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor.  
835 *Archive für Phytopathologie und Pflanzenschutz* **27**, 205-208.

836 ERNST, F A (1928). *Fixation of atmospheric nitrogen*. London: Chapman & Hall, New York:  
837 van Norstrand Inc.

838 EVEILLARD, E. (2005). Improve mineral N efficiency to protect the environment : the French  
839 experience. *UNIFA union des Industries de la Fertilisation*. 92909 Paris La Défense  
840 Cedex.

841 FLETCHER, J. T., HIMS, M. J., ARCHER, F. C. & BROWN, A. (1982). Effects of adding  
842 calcium and sodium salts to field soils on the incidence of clubroot. *Annals of Applied*  
843 *Biology* **100**, 245-251.

- 844 FRANK, A. (1908). Chemical industry in relation to agriculture. *Journal of the Society for*  
845 *Chemical Industry* **27**, 1093-1100.
- 846 FRANK, D. A. & GROFFMAN, P. M. (2009). Plant rhizospheric N processes: what we don't  
847 know and why we should care. *Ecology* **90**, 1512-1519.
- 848 GARBEVA, P., VEEN, J. A. van, & ELSAS, J. D. van (2004). Microbial diversity in soil:  
849 selection of microbial populations by plant and soil type and implications for disease  
850 suppression. *Annual Review of Phytopathology* **42**, 243-270.
- 851 GARRETT, D (1958). *The biology of root invading fungi*. Cambridge & London: Cambridge  
852 University Press.
- 853 GREENWOOD, D. J. (1982). Nitrogen supply and crop yield: the global scene. *Plant and Soil*  
854 **67**; 45-59.
- 855 GIANQUINTO, G., SAMBO, P. & BONA, S. (2003). The use of SPAD-502 chlorophyll meter for  
856 dynamically optimising the nitrogen supply in potato crop: a methodological approach.  
857 *Acta Horticulturae* **627**, 217-224.
- 858 GÜTHNER, T. & MERTSCHENK, B. (2006). Cyanamides. In: *Ullman's Encyclopedia of*  
859 *Industrial Chemistry (100 Years)*. Wiley on line Library published 15th July 2006. DOI:  
860 10.1002/14356007.a08\_139.pub2 (tested 4th November 2015) Wiley-VCH Verlag  
861 GmbH & Co, KgaA.
- 862 HAENSELER, C. M. & MOYER, T. R. (1937). Effect of calcium cyanamide on the soil  
863 microflora with special reference to certain plant parasites. *Soil Science* **43**, 133-152.
- 864 HALL, A. D. (1905). Calcium cyanamide. *Journal of Agricultural Science, Cambridge* **1**, 146-  
865 148.
- 866 HARLING, R & OXLEY, S. (2007). Clubroot disease of oilseed rape and other brassica crops.  
867 *Technical Note TN 602*, Edinburgh: Scottish Agricultural College.
- 868 HARLING, R., STEWART, K. & GLADDERS, P. (2007). Clubroot control using novel and  
869 sustainable methods. *Project report (HH322TFV)*, London: Department for the  
870 Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Defra).
- 871 HARTWIG, N. L. & AMOON, H. V. (2002). Cover crops and living mulches. *Weed Science* **50**,  
872 688-699
- 873 HINSINGER, P., GOBRAN, G. R., GREGORY, P. J. & WENZEL, W. W. (2005). Rhizosphere  
874 geometry and heterogeneity arising from root-mediated physical and chemical processes.  
875 *New Phytologist* **168**, 293-303.
- 876 HORIUCHI, S. HORI, M. TAKASHI, S. SHIMIZU, K. (1983). Factors responsible for the  
877 development of clubroot-suppressing effect in soil solarization. *Bulletin of the Chugoku*  
878 *National Agricultural Experiment Station*, **E 20**, 25-48. .
- 879 HSEIH, W-H. & WANG J-F. (1986). Investigations on suppressive soils of clubroot of  
880 crucifers in Taiwan. *Plant Protection Bulletin (Taiwan R.O.C.)* **28**, 353-362.
- 881 HUANG, H. C. & SUN, S.K. (1991). Effects of S-H mixture or Perlka™ on carpogenic  
882 germination and survival of sclerotia of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. *Soil Biology and*  
883 *Biochemistry* **23**, 809-813.
- 884 HUMPHERSON-JONES, F. M. DIXON, G. R. CRAIG, M. A. & ANN, D. M. (1992). Control of  
885 clubroot using calcium cyanamide - a review. *Brighton Crop Protection Conference,*  
886 *Pests and Diseases* **3**, 1147-1154.

- 887 JACOB, K. D., ALLISON, F. E. & BRAHAM, J. M. (1924). Chemical and biological studies with  
888 Cyanmid and some of its transformation products. *Journal of Agricultural Research* **28**,  
889 37-69.
- 890 JONES, D. & GRAY, E. G. (1973). Factors affecting the germination of sclerotia of *Sclerotinia*  
891 *sclerotiorum* from peas. *Mycological Research (formerly Transactions of the British*  
892 *Mycological Society)* **60**, 495-500.
- 893 JUNWEI, M. A., WANCHUN, S. U. N., QIAOGANG, Y. U., QIANG, F. U. & JIANRONG, F. U.  
894 (2013). Effects of cyanamide fertiliser on microbial community structure of continuous  
895 cropping soil. *Journal of Zhejiang University (Agriculture & Life Sciences)* **39**, 281-290.
- 896 KAMO, T., HIRADATE, S. & FUJII, Y. (2003). First isolation of natural cyanamide as a possible  
897 allelochemical from hairy vetch (*Vicia villosa*). *Journal of Chemical Ecology* **29**, 275-  
898 283.
- 899 KAMO, T., SATO, M., KATO, K., HIRADATE, S., NAKAJIMA, E., FUJII, Y. & HIROTA, M.  
900 (2006). Quantification of cyanamide contents in herbaceous plants. *Bioscience*  
901 *Biotechnology and Biochemistry* **70**, 2310-2312.
- 902 KAMO, T., TAKEMURA, T., WASANO, N., FUJII, Y. & HIRADATE, S. (2012). Quantification of  
903 cyanamide in young seedlings of *Vicia* species, *Lens culinaris* and *Robinia pseudo-*  
904 *acacia* by gas chromatography-mass spectrometry. *Bioscience Biotechnology and*  
905 *Biochemistry* **76**, 1416-1418.
- 906 KARLING, J. S. (1968). *The Plasmodiophorales – including a complete host index,*  
907 *bibliography and a description of diseases caused by species of this order.* New York  
908 and London: Hafner Publishing Company.
- 909 KIRKBY, E. A. (1968). Influence of ammonia and nitrate nutrition on the cation-anion balance  
910 and nitrogen and carbohydrate metabolism of white mustard plants grown in dilute  
911 nutrient solutions. *Soil Science* **105**, 133-141.
- 912 KLASSE, H. J. (1996). Calcium cyanamide—an effective tool to control clubroot—a review.  
913 *Acta Horticulturae* **407**, 403-409.
- 914 KLASSE, H. J. (1999). Calcium cyanamide—a unique source of nitrogen promoting healthy  
915 growth and improving crop quality of vegetables. *Improved crop quality by nutrient*  
916 *management* 233-235. .
- 917 KLASSE, H.J. (2002). *Calcium cyanamide—an important tool in methyl bromide replacement*  
918 *strategies.* Germany: Sud-deutsch Kalkstickstoorf Werke (SKW) Trostberg AG.
- 919 KUEN, J. & DRECKSEL, O. (1928). Der Einfluss der Kalkstickstorf auf des Bacterienleben in  
920 Boden. *Zietschrift für Pflansenernähr Düngung und Bodenkde* **7**, 105-118.
- 921 LAHLALI, R. & PENG, G. (2014a). Suppression of clubroot by *Clondrostachys rosea* via  
922 antibiosis and induced host resistance. *Plant Pathology* **63**, 447-455.
- 923 LAHLALI, R. L., MCGREGOR, L., SONG, T., GOSSEN, B. D., NARISAWA, K. & PENG, G.  
924 (2014b). *Heteroconium chaetospora* suppresses clubroot by inducing host resistance via  
925 ethylene, jasmonic acid and auxin pathway signalling. *PLoSONE* **P4: e94144**, 1-9.
- 926 LEHMANN, J. & KLEBER, M. (2015). The contentious nature of soil organic matter. *Nature*  
927 (*London*) **528**, 60-68.

- 928 LEHTOVIRTA-MORLEY, L. E., STOECKER, K., VIKINSKAS, A., PROSSER, J. I. & NICOL, G. W.  
 929 (2011). Cultivation of an obligate acidophilic ammonia oxidiser from a nitrifying soil.  
 930 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science (PANS)* **108** (380), 15892-15897.
- 931 LEIGH, G. J. (2004). The World's Greatest Fix—a history of nitrogen and agriculture, chapter  
 932 5. In: *The Triumph of Industrial Chemistry*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- 933 LIESACH, W., JANSSEN, P. H., RAINEY, F. A., WARD-RAINEY, N. L. & STACKEBRANDT, E.  
 934 (1997). Microbial diversity in soil: the need for a combined approach using molecular  
 935 and cultivation techniques. In: *Modern Soil Microbiology*, (Editors J. D. van Elsas & J. T.  
 936 Trevors) New York USA: Marcel Dekker.
- 937 LINDE, C. P. (1916) *Aus meinem Leben und von meiner Arbeit*. Munich: R. Oldenbourg.
- 938 Macfarlane, I. (1958). A solution-culture technique for obtaining root-hair or primary,  
 939 infection by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Journal of General Microbiology* **18**, 720-732.
- 940 MAIER-GREINER, U. H., OBERMAIER-SKROBRANER, M. M., ESTERMAIER, L. M.,  
 941 KAMMERLOHER, W., FREUND, C., WÜLFING, C., BURKERT, U. I., MATTERN, D. H.,  
 942 BREUER, M., EULITZ, M., KÜFREVIOLU, O. F. & HARTMANN, G. R. (1991). Isolation  
 943 and properties of a nitrile hydratase from the soil fungus *Myrothecium verrucaria* that is  
 944 highly specific for the fertiliser cyanamide and cloning of its gene. *Proceedings of the*  
 945 *National Academy of Science* **88**, 4260-4264.
- 946 MARSCHNER, J., RÖMHELD, V., HORST, W. J. & MARTIN, P. (1986). Root-induced changes in  
 947 the rhizosphere: importance for mineral nutrition of plants. *Zeitschrift für Pflanzenernähr*  
 948 **149**, 441-456.
- 949 MARTIN, W. H. (1933). Plant Pathology. *Report of New Jersey Agricultural Experimental*  
 950 *Station for the 2-year period ending June 30 1933*, 57-66.
- 951 MATTEY, M. & DIXON, G. R. (2015). Premature germination of resting spores as a means of  
 952 protecting brassica crops from *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor., (Clubroot). *Crop*  
 953 *Protection* **77**, 27-30.
- 954 MAZZOLA, M. (2004). Assessment and management of soil microbial community structure  
 955 for disease suppression. *Annual Review of Phytopathology* **42**, 35-59.
- 956 McDONALD, M. R. KORNATOWSKA, B. & MCKEOWN, A. W. (2004). Management of  
 957 clubroot of Asian Brassica crops grown on organic soils. *Acta Horticulturae* **635**, 25-  
 958 30.
- 959 McDONALD, M. R. (2002). *Improved management of clubroot in crucifer crops – Report*  
 960 *2002*. University of Guelph, Muck Crops Research Station, Ontario L7B 0E9.  
 961 <http://www.uoguelph.ca/muckcrop/> (url checked 15 March 2016).
- 962 MELLOR, J. W. (1925). *A comprehensive treatise on inorganic and theoretical chemistry*. In  
 963 16 volumes published 1922-1937 of which volume 5 deals with nitrogen fixation.  
 964 London: Longmans.
- 965 MIRANDA, V. H. B. (1975). Influence of nitrogenous fertilisers upon some soil  
 966 characteristics. *Landwirtschaftliche Forschung* **29**, 21-27.
- 967 MÜLLER, H. (1955). Untersuchungen über die Wirkung des Cyanamids im Kalkstickstoff auf  
 968 pathogene und nichpathogene Mikroorganismen des Bodens. *Archive für Mikrobiologie*  
 969 **22**, 285-306.

- 970 MUKERJI, B. K. (1932). Studies on calcium cyanamide. II. Microbiological aspects of  
971 nitrification in soils under varied environmental conditions. *Journal of Agricultural*  
972 *Science* **22**, 335-347.
- 973 MURAKAMI, H. TSUSHIMA, S. KUROYANAGI, Y. & SHISHIDO, Y. (2002). Reduction of  
974 resting spore density of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* and clubroot disease severity by  
975 liming. *Soil Science and Plant Nutrition* **48**, 685-691.
- 976 MYERS, D. C. & CAMPBELL, R.N. (1985). Lime and the control of clubroot of crucifers:  
977 effects of pH, calcium, magnesium, and their interaction. *Phytopathology* **75**, 670-673.
- 978 NAIKI, T. & DIXON, G. R. (1987). The effects of chemicals on developmental stages of  
979 *Plasmodiophora brassicae* (clubroot). *Plant Pathology* **36**; 316-327.
- 980 NAIKI, T., KAGEYAMA, K. & IKEGAMI, H. (1978). The relation of spore density of  
981 *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor., to root hair infection and club formation in Chinese  
982 cabbage (Studies on the clubroot of cruciferous plant II). *Annals of the Phytopathology*  
983 *Society of Japan* **53**, 432-439.
- 984 NEUHAUSER, S., KIRCHMAIR, M. & GLEASON, F. H. (2011). The ecological potential of  
985 Phytomyxea (plasmodiophorids) in aquatic food webs. *Hydrobiologia* **659**, 23-35.
- 986 NEWTON, A. C., FITT, B. D. L., ATKINS, S. D., WALTERS, D. R. & DANIELL, T. J. (2010).  
987 Pathogenesis, parasitism and mutualism in the trophic space of microbe-plant  
988 interactions. *Trends in Microbiology* **18**, 365-373.
- 989 NIWA, R., KUMEI, T., NOMURA, Y., YOSHIDA, S., OSAKI, M. & EZAWA, T. (2007). Increase in  
990 soil pH due to Ca-rich organic matter application causes suppression of the clubroot  
991 disease of crucifers. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry* **39**, 778-785.
- 992 NIWA, R., NOMURA, Y., OSAKI, M. & EZAWA, T. (2008). Suppression of clubroot disease  
993 under neutral pH caused by inhibition of spore germination of *Plasmodiophora*  
994 *brassicae* in the rhizosphere. *Plant Pathology* **57**, 443-452.
- 995 NÖMMIK, H. (1958). On decomposition of calcium cyanamide in the soil. *Acta Agriculturae*  
996 *Scandinavica* **8**, 404-440.
- 997 PAGE, L. V. (2001). *Studies of components for a potential integrated control system for*  
998 *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. Ph. D, thesis, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow;
- 999 PANKHURST, C., DOUBE, B. M. & GUPTA, V. V. S. R. (1997). *Biological Indicators of Soil*  
1000 *Health: synthesis*. In Pankhurst, C. E., Doube, B. M. & Gupta, V. V. S. R. (editors.)  
1001 pages 419-435. *Biological indicators of soil health* Oxford: CAB International.
- 1002 PAUSTIAN, K., LEHMANN, J., OGLE, S., REAY, D., ROBERTSON, G. P. & SMITH, P. (2016).  
1003 Climate-smart soils. *Nature* **532**, 49-57.
- 1004 PIMPINI, F., VENTER, F. & WÜNSCH, A. (1970). The influence of different nitrogen forms and  
1005 increasing nitrogen doses on the content of total nitrogen and of nitrate in cauliflower  
1006 plants. *Landwirtschaftliche Forschung* **23**, 363-370.
- 1007 PLEYSIER, L., ARORA, Y. & JUO, A. S. R. (1987). Nitrogen leaching and uptake from calcium  
1008 cyanamide in comparison to urea and calcium ammonium nitrate in an ultisol from  
1009 humid tropics. *Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems* **12**, 193-199.
- 1010 RAAIJMAKERS, J. M. & MAZZOLA, M. (2016). Soil immune responses. *Science* **352**, 1392-  
1011 1393.
- 1012 RAAIJMAKERS, J. M., PAULITZ, T. C., STEINBERG, C., ALABOUVETTE, C. & MOËMME-  
1013 LOCCOZ, Y. (2009). The rhizosphere: a playground and battlefield for soilborne

- 1014 pathogens and beneficial organisms. 341-361 In: *Rhizosphere: achievements and*  
 1015 *challenges*, (Eds Y. Dessaux, P. Hinsinger & P. Lemanceau). *Plant and Soil* **321** (1 &2),  
 1016 1-535.
- 1017 RATHSACK, K. (1978). Die nitrificide Wirkung des Dicyanamides. *Landwirtschaftliche*  
 1018 *Forschung* **31**, 347-358.
- 1019 RIEDER, G. (1981) Calcium cyanamide–fertiliser or pesticide? *World Crops*, January issue.
- 1020 ROSENZWEIG, C., ELLIOTT, J., DERYNG, D., RUANE, A. C., MÜLLER, C., ARNETH, A., BOOTE,  
 1021 K. J., FOLBETH, C., GLOTTER, M., KHABAROV, N., NEUMANN, K., PIONTEK, F., PUGH, T.  
 1022 A. M., SCHMID, E., STEHFEST, E., YANG, H. & JONES, J. W. (2014). Assessing  
 1023 agricultural risks of climate change in the 21<sup>st</sup> century in a global gridded crop model  
 1024 intercomparison. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences (PNAS)*. **111**, 3268-  
 1025 3273.
- 1026 ROUXEL, F., BRIARD, M. & LEJEUNE, B. (1985). Studies of soil receptiveness to clubroot  
 1027 caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*: experiments on reponses of a series of vegetable  
 1028 soils in Brittany. Progress on pest management of field vegetables. *Proceedings of the*  
 1029 *CEC/IOBC Experts' Group, Rennes, France 20-22 November 1985*. (Editors R  
 1030 Cavallorao & C J Pelereants). Pages 145-152. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: A A Balkema.
- 1031 ROY, A. H. (2015). Global fertiliser industry: transitioning from volume to value.  
 1032 *Proceedings of the International Fertiliser Society*, booklet no **769**, 1-24.
- 1033 SCHUTTER, M., SANDENO, J. M., & DICK, R. P. (2001). Seasonal, soil type, alternative  
 1034 management influences on microbial communities of vegetable cropping systems.  
 1035 *Biology and Fertility of Soils* **34**, 397-410.
- 1036 SCHWELM, A., FOGELQVIST, J., KNAUST, A., JÜLKE, S., LIJA, T., BONILLA-ROSSO, G.,  
 1037 KARLSSON, M., SHEVCHENKO, A., DHANDAPANI, V., CHOI, S. R., KIM, H. G., PARK, J.  
 1038 Y., LIM, Y. P., LUDWIG-MÜLLER, J & DIXELIUS, C. (2015). The *Plasmodiophora*  
 1039 *brassicae* genome reveals insights in its life cycle and ancestry of chitin synthases.  
 1040 *Nature Scientific Reports* Srep **5**, no 11153, 1-12.  
 1041 <http://www.nature.com/scientificreports> . (url checked 26 July 2016).
- 1042 SHI, K., WANG, L., ZHOU, Y-H., YU, Y-L. & YU, J-Q. (2009). Effects of calcium cyanamide  
 1043 on soil microbial communities and *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *cucumnerinum*.  
 1044 *Chemosphere* **75**, 872-877.
- 1045 SIELING, K. & KAGE, H. (2010). Efficient N management using winter oilseed rape: A  
 1046 review. *Agronomy and Sustainable Development*. **30**, 271-279.
- 1047 SMITH, A. M. (1961). Calcium cyanamide. *Manures and Fertilisers* pages 115-117. London:  
 1048 Thomas Nelson & Sons Ltd.
- 1049 SMIL, V. (2004). *Enriching the Earth: Fritz Harber, Carl Bosch, and the transformation of*  
 1050 *world food production*. Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) Press, Cambridge  
 1051 Massachusetts.
- 1052 SOLOMON, S., QIN, D., MANNING, M., MARQUIS, M., AVERY, T. K., TIGNOR, M. M. B.,  
 1053 MILLER, Jr H. L. & CHEN, Z. (2007). *The physical science basis: contributions of*  
 1054 *Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on*  
 1055 *Climate Change*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- 1056 STEWART, K. (2007). *Clubroot control in Brassicas using novel and sustainable methods*.  
 1057 PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh.

- 1058 STRANSKY, H. & AMBERGER, A. (1973). Isolation and properties of a cyanamide hydratase  
1059 (EC 4.2.1) from *Myrothecium verrucaria*. *Zeitschrift Pflanzenphysiologie* **70**, 174-187.
- 1060 STRELKOV, S. E. & DIXON, G. R. (2014). Clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*) on canola  
1061 and other brassica species – disease development, epidemiology and management.  
1062 *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **36** (S1), 1-4.
- 1063 STURKIE, D. G. (1937). Control of weeds in lawns with calcium cyanamide. *Journal*  
1064 *American Society of Agronomy*, **29**, 802-807.
- 1065 TAKAHASHI, H., ISHIKAWA, T., KAIDO, M., TAKITA, K., HAYAKAWA, T., OKAZAKI, K., ITOH,  
1066 K., MITSUI, T. & HORI, H. (2006). *Plasmodiophora brassicae*-induced cell death and  
1067 medium alkalinisation in clubroot-resistant cultured roots of *Brassica rapa*. *Journal of*  
1068 *Phytopathology* **154**, 156-162.
- 1069 TAKAHASHI, H., TAKITA, K., KISHIMOTO, T., MITSUI, T. & HORI, H. (2002). Ca<sup>2+</sup> is required  
1070 by clubroot resistant turnip cells for transient increases in PAL activity that follows  
1071 inoculation with *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Journal of Phytopathology* **150**, 529-535.
- 1072 TEWARI, K., SUGANUMA, T., FUJIKAKE, H., OHTAKE, N., SUEYOSHI, K., TAKAHASHI, Y. &  
1073 OHYAMA, T. (2004). Effect of deep placement of N fertilisers and different inoculation  
1074 methods on bradyrhizobia on growth, N-fixation activity and N-absorption rate of field-  
1075 grown soybean plants. *Journal of Agronomy and Crop Science* **190**, 46-58.
- 1076 THORMAN, R. E., WILLIAMS, J. R., MUSSELBROOK, T. H., ROLLETT, A. J., BOWDEN, A.,  
1077 DHROSBREE, A. & CHAMBERS, B. J. (2014). Nitrification inhibitor and nitrogen fertiliser  
1078 application timing strategies to reduce nitrous oxide emissions from winter wheat land.  
1079 *The Proceedings of the 18th Nitrogen Workshop – The nitrogen challenge: building a*  
1080 *blueprint for nitrogen use and efficiency and food supply*, Lisbon, Portugal 30th June to  
1081 3rd July 2014, ppages 521-523. pdf available from CAB Abstracts, Wallingford, Oxon.
- 1082 TIAN, Y., ZHANG, X., LIU, J., CHEN, Q. & GAO, L. (2009). Microbial properties of  
1083 rhizosphere soils as affected by rotation, grafting and soil sterilisation in intensive  
1084 vegetable production. *Scientia Horticulturae* **123**, 139-147.
- 1085 TOLLEFSON, J. (2010). Intensive farming may ease climate change. *Nature (London)* **465**,  
1086 853.
- 1087 TOORSVIK, V., GOKSOYR, J. & DANE, F. D. (1990). High diversity in DNA of soil bacteria.  
1088 *Applied Environmental Microbiology* **56**, 782-787.
- 1089 TOURNA, M., STEIGLMEIER, M., SPRANG, A., KÖNNEKE, M., SCHINTIMEISTER, A., ULRICH,  
1090 T., ENGEL, M., SCHLOTER, M., WAGNER, M., RICHTER, A. & SCHLEPER, C. (2011).  
1091 *Nitrososphaera viennensis*, an ammonia oxidising archaeon from soil. *Proceedings of the*  
1092 *National Academy of Sciences (PNAS)* **108**, 8420-8425
- 1093 TREMBLAY, N. BELEC, C. COULOMBE, J. & GODIN, C. (2005). Evaluation of calcium  
1094 cyanamide and liming for control of clubroot disease in cauliflower. *Crop Protection*  
1095 **24**, 798-803.
- 1096 VALLAD, G. E. & GOODMAN, R. M. (2004). Systemic acquired resistance and induced  
1097 systemic resistance in conventional agriculture. *Crop Science* **44**, 1920-1934.
- 1098 VERONA, O. (1970). The effect of calcium cyanamide on some groups of lower fungi [Der  
1099 Einfluss des Kalkstickstoffs auf einige Gruppen von niederen Pilzen].  
1100 *Landwirtschaftliche Forschung* **23**, 36-50.

- 1101 VILSMEIER, K. & AMBERGER, A. (1978). Model experiments concerning the breakdown of  
1102 powdered and granulated calcium cyanamide fertilisers. *Journal of Agronomy and Crop*  
1103 *Science* **147**, 68-77.
- 1104 WALKER, J. C. & LARSON, R. H. (1935). Calcium cyanamide in relation to control of clubroot  
1105 of cabbage. *Journal of Agricultural Research* **51**, 183-189.
- 1106 WALL, D. H., NIELSEN, U. N. & SIX, J. (2015). Soil biodiversity and human health. *Nature*  
1107 *(London)* **528**, 69-76.
- 1108 WALTERS, D. R., RATSEP, J. & HAVIS, N. D. (2013). Controlling crop diseases using induced  
1109 resistance: challenges for the future. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **64**, 1263-1280.
- 1110 WANG, J-F. & HSIEH, W-H. (1986). Studies of suppressive factors and characteristics of  
1111 suppressive soils of clubroot in crucifers. *Plant Protection Bulletin (Taiwan ROC)* **28**,  
1112 363-370.
- 1113 WEBSTER, M. A. (1986). *pH and nutritional effects on infection by Plasmodiophora*  
1114 *brassicae* Wor. and clubroot symptoms. Ph. D. thesis, University of Aberdeen;
- 1115 WEBSTER M. A. & DIXON, G. R. (1991a). Calcium, pH and inoculum concentration  
1116 influencing colonisation by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Mycological Research* . **95**, 64-  
1117 73.
- 1118 WEBSTER, M. A. & DIXON, G. R. (1991 b). Boron, pH and inoculum concentration  
1119 influencing colonisation by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Mycological Research* **95**, 74-  
1120 79.
- 1121 WILLIAMSON, C. J. & DYCE, P. E. (1989). The effect of calcium cyanamide on the reaction of  
1122 swede cultivars to populations of *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Plant Pathology* **38**, 230-  
1123 238.
- 1124 WISSUWA, M., MAZZOLA, M. & PICARD, C. (2009). Novel approaches in plant breeding for  
1125 rhizosphere-related traits. *Plant and Soil* **321**, 409-430.
- 1126 WOLFE, A. & WOLFE, G (1930). Ueber den Einfluss des Kalkstickstoffs auf die Mikroflora  
1127 des Bödens. *Centblatt Bakteriologie*. (II). **81**, 221-230.
- 1128 WOOD, M. (1998). *Cah* marker gene aids plant transformations. *Agricultural Research* July  
1129 issue, 12-13. Swindon: Biotechnology and Biological Research Council.
- 1130 WORONIN, M. S. (1878) *Plasmodiophora brassicae*—the cause of cabbage hernia, published in  
1131 *Jarbücher für Wissenschaftliche Botanik* vol 11 (in German) translated by C. Chupp,  
1132 published as *Phytopathological Classics no 4*. St Paul, Minnesota USA: American  
1133 Phytopathological Society (see page 28).
- 1134 YAMAMOTO, A., AKIYAMA, H., Naokawa, T. & YAGI, K. (2012). Effect of lime-nitrogen  
1135 application on N<sub>2</sub>O emission from an andosol vegetable field. *Soil Science and Plant*  
1136 *Nutrition*, **58**, 245-254.
- 1137 YAMAMOTO, A., AKIYAMA, H., NAOKAWA, T. & YAGI, K. (2013). Lime-nitrogen application  
1138 reduces N<sub>2</sub>O emission from a vegetable field with imperfectly-drained sandy clay-loam  
1139 soil. *Soil Science and Plant Nutrition* **59**, 442-449.
- 1140 YANO, S., TANAKA, S., KAMEYA-IWAKI, M. & KATUMOTO, K. (1991). Relation of Ca<sup>2+</sup>  
1141 efflux to germination of resting spores of clubroot fungus. *Bulletin of the Faculty of*  
1142 *Agriculture, Yamaguchi University* **39**, 105-112.



- 1143 YAO, H., HE, Z., WILSON, M. J., & CAMPBELL, C. D. (2000). Microbial biomass and  
1144 community structure in a sequence of soils with increasing fertility and changing land  
1145 use. *Microbial Ecology* **40**, 223-237.
- 1146 ZHAO, Y. X-X., CHENG, Y. T. & WEI, J. W. (2015). Biocontrol effect of *Trichoderma*  
1147 *harzianum* T4 on brassica clubroot and analysis of rhizosphere microbial communities  
1148 based on T-RFLP. *Biocontrol Science and Technology* **25**, 1493-1505.
- 1149 ZHU, B. L., MA, J. W., YE, X. Z., & XIA, Z. M. (2001). Effects of lime-nitrogen on soil  
1150 amelioration and vegetable production (Chinese). *Journal of Zhejiang University* **27**,  
1151 339-342.
- 1152