

*Managing clubroot disease (caused by Plasmodiophora brassicae Wor.) by exploiting the interactions between calcium cyanamide fertilizer and soil microorganisms*

Article

Accepted Version

Dixon, G. R. (2017) Managing clubroot disease (caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor.) by exploiting the interactions between calcium cyanamide fertilizer and soil microorganisms. *Journal of Agricultural Science*, 155 (4). pp. 527-543. ISSN 0021-8596 doi: 10.1017/S0021859616000800 Available at <https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/68509/>

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See [Guidance on citing](#).

To link to this article DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0021859616000800>

Publisher: Cambridge University Press

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in

the [End User Agreement](#).

[www.reading.ac.uk/centaur](http://www.reading.ac.uk/centaur)

## **CentAUR**

Central Archive at the University of Reading

Reading's research outputs online

Managing clubroot disease (caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor.) by exploiting the interactions between calcium cyanamide fertilizer and soil microorganisms

## SUMMARY

Calcium cyanamide is a nitrogenous fertilizer used predominantly for over a century in field and glasshouse vegetable and salad production. This review draws together for the first time knowledge concerning the biological properties of the compound that benefit crop production by encouraging sustainable soil health and quality. This is achieved through the increase of microorganisms antagonistic to plant pathogens. The review also reports on the natural occurrence and degradation of cyanamide. The literature survey provides a perspective of research from the early 1900s to current studies. This identifies that nitrogen is released steadily into the rhizosphere from this fertiliser. Calcium is also readily available for plant roots and promotes the alkaline soil conditions beneficial to benign microorganisms. Consequently, soil suppressiveness towards organisms such as *Plasmodiophora brassicae*, the cause of clubroot disease in brassicas develops. The effects of calcium and accompanying changes in soil pH values are discussed in relation to the life cycle stages of *P.brassicae* and the development of clubroot disease. Formulations of calcium cyanamide contain the dimeric form, dicyandiamide (DCD). This compound slows soil nitrification and subsequent nitrate leaching into ground waters reducing potential pollution. Calcium cyanamide is normally used for specialised fresh produce production and is not available in quantities comparable

with ammoniacal fertilizers. It is contended however, that it has properties deserving wider assessment because of their implications for sustainable cropping.

**KEYWORDS:** calcium cyanamide, disease suppression, microbial ecology, soil health, integrated pest management

Reconciling the need for producing sufficient high-quality, health-enhancing food for the world's expanding population with conserving biodiversity will be achieved through scientific and technological advances. Probably, two aspects of biology, breeding improved cultivars and enhancing the efficiency of nutrient uptake in partnership with soil microbes (Wissuwa et al. 2009) will be prominent among in these advances. Artificially supplementing nutrient supplies, especially nitrogen, has previously made major contributions in raising crop yields. For example, Bell et al. (1995) showed from long-term studies of cereal farming in the Yaqui Valley of Mexico that breeding improved wheat cultivars accounted for 28 % of the overall farm yield progress and 48 % came from increased use of nitrogenous fertilisers. This supports observations by Greenwood (1982) who showed that "in West Europe.....wheat yields are almost directly proportional to the level of N-fertiliser applied". It is now appreciated, however, that using nitrogenous fertilisers must not produce undesirable side-effects such as nitrate pollution into river catchment areas (Sieling & Kage 2010; Roy 2015). Ideally fertilizers should act in concert with soil-borne microbial populations as part of sustainable integrated pest management (IPM) strategies. This review suggests that calcium cyanamide, a specialized fertilizer which until recently has been used predominantly for intensive horticultural crops, has properties that could contribute to these IPM strategies including minimizing nitrate release into groundwater and encouraging benign soil-borne

microbes (Miranda 1975; Dixon 2012a). In support of that contention this review examines the background to calcium cyanamide manufacture, the advantages and disadvantages of practical use, its presence as a natural metabolite, relationships with soil microorganisms and in particular capabilities for reducing the impact of soil-borne pathogens such as *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor., which causes clubroot disease.

## THE NITROGEN PROBLEM

Sir William Crookes, an eminent chemist in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, highlighted the original “nitrogen problem”, identifying that “the (artificial) fixation of nitrogen is vital to the progress of civilised humanity.....” (Crookes 1900). For most of mankind’s history, soil nitrogen was obtained from two natural sources, rainwater containing nitrous oxides derived from atmospheric electrical storms forming nitric acid and the activities of soil-borne bacteria either those in symbiotic relationships with legumes and other plants or those which exist as freely living forms. Farmers supplemented these sources with animal faeces either deposited directly onto pastures or as manure collected from farmyards. Other more minor sources included nitrogen bearing rocks in India and Chile plus deposits of guano, accumulated bird droppings, and waste materials such as shoddy, from some manufacturing processes. As Europe’s Agricultural Revolution led on to its Industrial Revolution, finding new supplies of nitrogen that would boost food supplies became crucially important (this is reviewed in detail in textbook series by Broughton 1981, 1982, 1983, 1986). Research and industrial progress particularly in Germany developed at least six processes that artificially fixed atmospheric di-nitrogen (N<sub>2</sub>) into stable forms in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. Three processes were economically feasible and commercialised:- the Norwegian Arc, the Haber-Bosch and Cyanamide (Mellor 1925; Erns, 1928; Leigh 2004). Of these, the Haber-Bosch

process has dominated nitrogen fertilizer manufacture for over a century. Production of calcium cyanamide has, however, continued predominantly for some specialised applications.

## CALCIUM CYANAMIDE

From 1895 onwards, Adolph Frank (1834-1916) and Nikodemus Caro (1871-1935) researched chemical methods of nitrogen fixation as a means for making artificial fertilisers. Eventually working with, F. Rothe of Beringer Söhne they jointly discovered that calcium cyanamide could be made by the addition of pure di-nitrogen, prepared by air liquefaction (Linde 1916), to calcium carbide at temperatures in excess of 1000 °C (Frank 1908). In 1908 Frank and Caro established a factory near Trostberg, Bavaria, powered by hydroelectricity generated from the river Alz where they produced 30,000 tonnes per annum of calcium cyanamide by 1912. This is now the most commonly used derivative of the cyanamide group of organic compounds with the general formula  $\text{CN}_2\text{H}_2$ . The molecule contains nitrile and amino groups. Hall (1905) working at Rothamsted Experiment Station, Harpenden (now Rothamsted Research) recognized calcium cyanamide as "the first attempt on a commercial scale to bring atmospheric nitrogen into a state of combination, to manufacture in fact an artificial manure containing N derived from the air". The physical, chemical and industrial properties of the cyanamide group of compounds are discussed by Güthner & Mertschenk (2006).

## FERTILIZER VALUE

Originally this fertilizer was named *Kalkstickstoff* (nitrogen-chalk) and is also referred to as lime-nitrogen and nitrolime. It is now formulated as a granular dust-free product resulting from combination with calcium nitrate suspension, calcium carbonate and a surface treatment

with wax. Calcium cyanamide (CASE Registry no: 420-02-4) contains approximately 20 % nitrogen and 50 % calcium (expressed as calcium oxide, CaO). Albert Frank, son of Adolph Frank, demonstrated that in soil calcium cyanamide is converted into ammonium ions offering a form of artificial fertilizer nitrogen which plants could utilize (Anon 2008a ; Dixon 2009a). In Great Britain studies at Rothamsted demonstrated that soil microbial activity increases in the presence of calcium cyanamide (Ashby 1905) and in the USA by Jacob et al. (1924). Soil microbes slowly change calcium cyanamide in a step-wise process through cyanamide to urea to ammonia to nitrate (Bjälfe 1957). Alternatively and more rapidly carbonic acid from the atmosphere converts calcium cyanamide into cyanamide ions and calcium carbonate. Subsequent hydrolysis of cyanamide forms urea. In moist soils a proportion of cyanamide (6-11 %) dimerises into dicyandiamide (cyanoguanidin) ( $\text{H}_4\text{C}_2\text{N}_4$ ) (Cornforth 1971; Dixon & Williamson 1985).

Dicyandiamide (DCD) is classed by the European Union (EU)-Fertiliser Directive 02003/2003 (Amendment of November 8<sup>th</sup> 2008) as a nitrification inhibitor. The initial DCD content of calcium cyanamide and additional amounts resulting from the effects of soil moisture and activities of microbes slows the rate of soil nitrification and reduces the leaching of nitrates into groundwater (Rathsack 1978; Vilsmeier & Amberger 1978). Recent Japanese research (Yamamoto et al. 2012; 2013) demonstrated that calcium cyanamide reduces the emissions of nitrous oxide from soils. It is notable that nitrous oxide is a greenhouse gas which is estimated to be approximately 300 times more damaging for the environment than carbon dioxide (Solomon et al. 2007). Recent studies of spring applications of nitrogen fertilisers to winter wheat crops in eastern England emphasised the value of DCD in reducing nitrous oxide emissions (Thorman et al. 2014). In Germany, there is official recognition of DCD's properties (Nömmik 1957; Anon 1996; Günther & Mertschenk 2006).

Calcium cyanamide production in the Western world is limited to one factory in Bavaria, Germany. There are two factories in Japan and several in China. Limits on German production capacity mean that this fertilizer is available in modest quantities (~100,000t/yr) for European users compared with the 450Mt/yr of ammoniacal fertilizers produced by the Harber-Bosch process in factories worldwide (Smil 2004). This author identifies that artificial nitrogen production uses large amounts of energy. The Haber-Bosch process requires upto 2% of the world's annual energy supply while calcium cyanamide manufacture is one of the larger users of Germany's annual energy production (personal communication AlzChem, February 2015). The scale of calcium cyanamide production is also limited by the two-stage nature of chemical manufacture which initially involves carefully forming calcium carbide. After manufacture the finely ground product is compacted by a granulation process resulting in very hard fertilizer granules. Treating the surface of these granules with a wax ensures that the fertilizer product is a dust-free formulation. In this state the product has an unlimited storage life (Güthner & Mertschenk 2006) and may be transported without restriction, packed in polyethylene valve or multilayer paper bags.

The relatively modest scale of production means that the cost of calcium cyanamide is preportionately higher than ammonia-based products. But since this fertilizer combines nitrogen and calcium, the latter reducing the need for applications of lime and helping to diminish the impact of soil-borne pathogens eliminating some other resource purchases. The agronomic value of calcium cyanamide is increased by repeated use over several seasons which further increases yields and crop health (Crowther & Richardson 1932; Verona 1970).

Predominantly, calcium cyanamide has been used as a fertilizer for field vegetable and salad crops in Europe, Asia and North America. Use in other crops has strengthened recently because of increased applications on oilseed rape crops in Northern Europe where clubroot disease (*P. brassicae*) is becoming a limiting factor (Dixon 2009b). Demand in



China is also increasing for similar reasons because of their substantial problems with clubroot disease (*P. brassicae*) on oilseed rape and vegetable brassica (*Brassica rapa*) crops which are a staple part of the diet (Chai et al. 2014). The properties of calcium cyanamide for inhibiting seed germination (Sturkie 1937) resulted in earlier recommendations for a 14-day interval between application and drilling. This restriction is less necessary for transplanted crops where recommendations, for example in Harling & Oxley (2007) suggest applying split applications of 500 kg/ha as a base dressing followed by a further 500 kg/ ha 14–21 days after transplanting modules. Recent technological advances in crop husbandry permitting between-row, in-row and deep-placement of fertilizers now relaxes these restrictions further because the volumes of fertilizers applied per unit area are greatly reduced while nutrient-use efficiency increases (Burns et al. 2010). In Australia Donald et al. (2004) demonstrated the usefulness of banding techniques for the application of calcium cyanamide which reduced clubroot incidence and costs. This technique is especially useful in Asian vegetable brassica crops grown on soils with high organic matter contents where clubroot disease can be particularly devastating (McDonald et al. 2004).

## Stability in soil

Long-term studies in Portugal (1958-1974) compared the effects of applying ammonium nitrate, ammonium sulphate, calcium cyanamide, calcium nitrate and urea to land in a warm temperate region with an annual average rainfall exceeding 1,100 mm (Miranda 1975). The pH of calcium cyanamide treated plots increased slightly in alkalinity while the other treatments raised soil acidity. Additionally, the use of calcium cyanamide resulted in greater retention of exchangeable calcium while other fertilizers reduced it. The phosphate and potash content of soil treated with calcium cyanamide remained stable with increased availability of these nutrients.

168

169           Subsequent research in a tropical environment subjected coarse textured kaolinitic  
170 ultisol placed in soil columns and treated with calcium cyanamide, urea or calcium  
171 ammonium nitrate to the equivalent of 2,420 mm rainfall over 42 days (Pleysier et al. 1987).  
172 Lowest leaching losses (3 % of the nitrogen applied) were recorded where calcium  
173 cyanamide was used, highest losses were found with calcium ammonium nitrate while urea  
174 produced intermediate effects. These results indicated that calcium cyanamide is retained in  
175 soils and is not leached even where rainfall or irrigation is substantial. These are valuable  
176 properties in relation to the use of irrigation and spread of plant pathogens (Dixon 2015).

177           The nitrate content of soils treated with calcium cyanamide was lower than those of  
178 untreated controls (Nõmmik 1958). This research showed that conversion to nitrate took  
179 longer where calcium cyanamide was used compared with ammonium sulphate. Soil texture  
180 influenced the rate of conversion, with coarse sandy soils retaining nitrate longer. In soil  
181 samples incubated for 3 months, more than 90 % of the nitrogen was retained in the calcium  
182 cyanamide treatments. Lowering the temperature slowed nitrification still further. The  
183 conversion of calcium cyanamide to ammonia was stopped in sterilized soil, indicating that  
184 this process requires microbially derived enzymes. Earlier research by Jacob et al. (1924)  
185 produced broadly comparable results.

186           The fertilizer properties of calcium cyanamide were reviewed by Rieder (1981) and  
187 more recently by Dixon (2009a; 2012a). These workers identified that granulating calcium  
188 cyanamide increased its stability and environmental value. Granulation of calcium cyanamide  
189 improved its fertilizer-use-efficiency and availability for roots (Vilsmeier & Amberger 1978).  
190 Amberger (1986; 1989) also demonstrated that when DCD inhibits the initial step in  
191 nitrification, this conserves nitrogen as ammonium ( $\text{NH}_4^+$ ) ions. Dicyandiamide ultimately is

decomposed by biotic and abiotic processes in soils into ammonium ions, carbon dioxide and water, while nitrogen is slowly released.

## NATURAL OCCURRENCE AND UTILISATION OF CYANAMIDE

Hairy vetch (*Vicia villosa*), which originates from Europe and Western Asia, is used as a cover crop in the USA as a means of protecting land from wind and water erosion during fallow periods (Hartwig & Ammon 2002). This legume adds nitrogen into the soil and is also antagonistic to weed growth, suggesting that it may produce naturally growth-inhibitory compounds. Analyses by Kamo et al. (2003) showed that hairy vetch produces cyanamide, which has allelo-chemical activity against lettuce (*Lactuca sativa*) seedlings used as test plants. Germinated seedlings of hairy vetch contained 40-fold greater concentrations of cyanamide compared with the content of dry seed, illustrating that this plant generates cyanamide during its early growth. In hairy vetch seedlings, concentrations of cyanamide as high as 130 µg /g fresh weight were found. This illustrates that cyanamide, which was previously considered solely as a product of industrial manufacturing, is also a naturally occurring metabolite. Later studies by Kamo et al. (2006; 2012) indicated that young leaves of *V. villosa*, *V. cracca*, *V. benghalensis* and *Robinia pseudo-acacia* contained cyanamide (NH<sub>2</sub>CN) in the range of 190 to 645 µg/g fresh weight determined by gas chromatography-mass spectrometry (GC-MS).

Some *Aspergillus* and *Penicillium* spp can utilise the cyanamide molecule as a source of nitrogen for decomposing cellulose (Klasse 2002). Consequently, calcium cyanamide is considered as “an environmentally benign product as it is broken down to harmless products by microbes” (Harling & Oxley 2007). The soil-borne fungus *Myrothecium verrucaria* is capable of degrading fertilizer calcium cyanamide by the action of a single soluble enzyme

that hydrolyses cyanamide to urea (Stransky & Amberger 1973). Cyanamide hydratase is produced by this fungus in combination with an urease (Maier-Greiner et al. 1991; Lehtovirk-Morley et al. 2011; Tourna et al. 2011). The discovery of this highly substrate-specific cyanamide hydratase, the elucidation of its structure as a homo-hexameric polypeptide, and the isolation of its gene (*cah*) offers the possibility that transformed plants could carry out these reactions. That would allow calcium cyanamide fertilizer to be applied before sowing without risking seedling growth inhibition. This could reduce the amount of fertilizer calcium cyanamide required while retaining its effectiveness as a source of nitrogen. Other suggestions (Wood 1998) that would improve the efficacy of calcium cyanamide fertilizer applications have been the incorporation of the *cah* gene into crop plants so that they could directly utilize cyanamide as opposed to requiring its initial conversion to urea.

## SOIL HEALTH AND FERTILISER VALUE

Sustainable agriculture aims at developing healthy soils, as discussed by Lehmann & Kleber (2015) and Wall et al. (2015). Healthy soils are stable systems in which there are high levels of biological diversity, activity, internal nutrient cycling and resilience to disturbance (Doran et al. 1996; Doran & Zeiss 2000; Eveillard 2005; Bruggen et al. 2006). Soil health is defined in detail by Pankhurst et al. (1997) and by the United Nations Food and Agriculture Organisation (Anon 2008b). Retaining the diversity of microbes in soil is critical for maintaining soil health and quality and the wide range of microbes involved in soil functioning (Liesach et al. 1997; Garbeva et al. 2004). This preserves the huge genotypic and phenotypic diversity, heterogeneity and crypticity in soil microbial populations. The top layer of soil may contain up to  $10^9$  microbe cells per gram (Torsvik & Ovreas 2002). As yet knowledge concerning many of these organisms and their interactions is limited. The fraction

of cells making up the general microbial biomass that have been cultured and studied is very small, probably less than 5 % (Torsvik et al. 1990; Borneman & Triplett 1997). An added difficulty is that microbe populations may change quite rapidly during cropping especially, where soluble nutrients such as ammonium-nitrogen are used and soil acidity increases (Kirkby 1968). Consequently, where possible practical fertilizer strategies should aim at encouraging beneficial microbes especially those that are antagonists against soil-borne pathogens (such as *P. brassicae*) (Lahlali & Peng 2014; Zhao et al. 2015).

Müller (1955) was one of the first pathologists who associated calcium cyanamide with reductions in diseases caused by soil-borne microbes. She also recorded its effects stimulating the growth of non-pathogenic microbes. Earlier interactions between calcium cyanamide and soil microbe populations had been reported by Allison (1924), Kuen & Drecksel (1928), Wolfe & Wolfe (1930) and Haenseler & Moyer (1937). The detailed studies by Haenseler & Moyer (1937) demonstrated that bacteria and actinomyces populations in soil initially decreased and then rapidly accelerated for about 30 days after applications of calcium cyanamide. Thereafter numbers dropped returning to the values present before the fertilizer was applied. At their peak, however, the numbers of microbes in these two groups were 90-fold greater compared with normal soil content. Similar results are reported more recently by Klasse (1996). Applications of calcium cyanamide are associated with increased extracellular enzyme activity in soil, which is indicative of enhanced microbial activity (Bosch & Amberger 1983). These included increases in: biomass, amylase, protease, alkaline phosphatase and dehydrogenase activities, exceeding that achieved by applications of farmyard manure and ammonium sulphate. This implies that for organic husbandry systems, the use of calcium cyanamide is superior in its effects to those obtained from animal manure (Zhu et al. 2001).

The practical advantages of calcium cyanamide in relation to disease suppression were highlighted by Cornforth (1971), Rieder (1981) and Klasse (1999). Evidence for the benefits of fertilisers like calcium cyanamide in developing healthy soils is accumulating. In China, for example, large areas of land are now devoted to the production of protected vegetables, especially cucumbers, tomatoes and aubergines. This has led to a rise in crop losses caused by soil-borne pathogens, especially fungi such as *Verticillium* spp. Calcium cyanamide applications increased the biological health of these soils and resulted in improved crop growth by inducing shifts in the composition of microbial communities (Tian et al. 2009). This reduced the damage from *Verticillium* spp. Calcium cyanamide increased mineral nitrogen, followed by increased microbial biomass, especially in the autumn periods. Similar findings are reported by Shi et al. (2009) where calcium cyanamide applications increased soil bacterial populations and decreased the pathogen *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *cucurbitae* (cucurbit wilt). Subsequently, reductions of activity by the soil pathogen *F. solani* f. sp. *cucurbitae* (stem rot) affecting cucumber was ascribed by Bourbos et al. (1997) to soil enrichment with nitrogen and calcium. Bletos (2006) suggested that calcium cyanamide can form an effective component of an integrated management system, which eliminates the need for using the environmentally damaging sterilant methyl bromide.

Recent research reported by Junwei et al. (2013) demonstrated that the numbers of bacteria increased in soil treated with calcium cyanamide, while those of fungi decreased in the 30 days after application. This, they claim restored the microbial community balance to a healthy status favorable for vegetable cropping. Use of polymerase chain reaction–denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis (PCR-DGGE) fingerprinting indicated that the bacterial populations following calcium cyanamide application changed with the appearance of new species and increased biodiversity. The diversity and richness indices 20 days after calcium cyanamide was applied increased substantially. The dimer product dicyandiamide (DCD)

produced similar effects, improving diversity and richness in bacterial populations. These authors suggested that such effects are principal mechanisms by which the cyanamide fertiliser reduced the impact of soil-borne pathogens. Greater knowledge of the interaction of fertilizers and microbes might also solve some of the problems highlighted by Walters et al. (2013) regarding the use of induced resistance as an ingredient in integrated disease management strategies. Since calcium cyanamide provides a readily available source of calcium for plants, potentially this may help up-regulate aspects of general and specific resistance, as suggested by Takahashi et al. (2002). In these studies an influx of calcium into turnip cells increased the formation of phenylalanine ammonia-lyase (PAL) activity, which appeared necessary for the expression of resistance to *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. As Dixon & Tilston (2010), suggest knowledge of the properties of fertilizers such as calcium cyanamide might help redirect agronomists towards enhancing soil and plant health.

## CALCIUM CYANAMIDE AND THE SUPPRESSION OF CLUBROOT DISEASE

Clubroot disease is caused by the protist member of the Rhizaria (Burki et al. 2010; Neuhauser et al. 2011; Schwelm et al. 2015) *Plasmodiophora brassicae*, a microbe which attacks members of the Brassicaceae family. Clubroot is an intractable disease affecting this group of crops, which are vitally important sources of fresh and processed vegetables and oil seeds. These crops contain chemicals that are associated with significant improvements in human health. They also provide cooking oils and fats, industrial lubricants, lighting fuels, condiments and flavourings, animal fodder and forage, improved soil fertility and bio-control, while also including ornamental decorative annuals and perennials. *Arabidopsis thaliana* (thale cress) which is the molecular biologists' main model species and the first plant whose

genome was sequenced, is also included in this family (Dixon 2007) and suffers from clubroot disease making it a valuable source of information on host-parasite relationships and potentially increasing the pool of resistance genes (Alix et al. 2007). Advances in understanding the biology of this host-pathogen relationship were described by Dixon (2006 2014). The economic significance, impact and biology of this pathogen are reviewed by Dixon (2009b,c; 2014).

## Disease incidence

It is evident from the very earliest scientific studies of clubroot and its causal organism *P. brassicae* in the 19<sup>th</sup> century by Woronin (1878 translated by Chupp 1934) that there were associations between fertilizer-use and the incidence and suppression of disease. Woronin, however, could not verify these assertions scientifically. Calcium cyanamide has gained an association for reducing the impact of clubroot disease over the past 100 years. The early studies of the relationship between soil borne pathogenic microbes and calcium cyanamide showed that regular applications of the fertilizer were associated with reductions in the occurrence and severity of clubroot. Research by Martin (1933) reported considerable reductions in clubroot disease following applications of calcium cyanamide. Subsequently, Walker & Larson (1935) emphasised the influence of soil conditions in moderating its efficacy, but demonstrated that weight-for-weight, the effect of calcium cyanamide exceeded that of lime (calcium carbonate) by a factor of two. Haensler & Moyer (1937) showed in both field and laboratory studies that applications of calcium cyanamide were associated with reductions in the incidence of clubroot disease. Calcium cyanamide was shown by them to have 2.5-fold greater impact in reducing clubroot compared with hydrated lime. Importantly, these researchers identified that the effects of calcium cyanamide were affected by the soil



environment. Small changes in pH values, soil moisture content, structure and texture affected the level of disease reduction. This served to underline the importance of Crowther and Richardson's (1932) findings that hydrogen-ion concentration in soil regulated the breakdown reactions of calcium cyanamide. The importance of interactions between soil environments, modes of application and the incidence of clubroot disease and its severity are discussed by Colhoun (1958) and Karling (1968) in their respective monographs. In farming practice, calcium cyanamide was used regularly for vegetable crops in Great Britain during the 1920s and 1930s (Smith 1961 and personal communication from Dr Elizabeth Gray 12<sup>th</sup> August 1985).

Following the World War II scientific interest in interactions between fertilizers and the reduced severity of soil-borne diseases was largely overtaken by the invention of numerous synthetic agrochemical molecules. These eliminated specific pathogens by inhibiting single enzyme-driven reactions. Attempts at control of clubroot followed this route with reports of extensive testing of synthetic chemicals for example Buczacki & Cadd (1976). More environmentally sensitive approaches returned in the 1980s. Researchers, farmers and growers began recognising that reducing clubroot disease would be achieved only by integrated pest management (IPM). This combined genetic resistance with the manipulation of soil environments, host nutritional status and where possible use of synthetic agrochemicals. In the period between 1945 and the early 1980s, practical use of calcium cyanamide as a specialized fertilizer in horticulture continued, particularly in north-western Europe. Here it was associated with higher crop health status and increased soil fertility (Rieder 1981). Studies restarted in Great Britain in the early 1980s when it was demonstrated that calcium cyanamide is associated with reductions in the severity of clubroot disease (Dixon & Brokenshire 1981; Dixon & Wilson 1983; Dixon 2009a; 2012a).

An evaluation of calcium cyanamide by Williamson & Dyce (1989) studied its effects in swede (*B. napus*) cultivars of differing resistance to *P. brassicae*. Disease severity was progressively reduced when increasing amounts of calcium cyanamide were applied. Disease threshold was related to the viable inoculum density, cultivar resistance and the use of calcium cyanamide. The integrated use of calcium cyanamide with boron and forms of nitrogen resulted in the lessening of clubroot severity (Dixon et al. 1987). Calcium cyanamide is reported by Horiuchi et al. (1983) as a useful component when integrated with solarisation as a means of reducing inoculum load in *P. brassicae* infested land. Similarly, Dixon & Wilson (1983) reported on the successful use of calcium cyanamide in reducing the impact of clubroot on cabbage and Brussels sprouts. This was followed by detailed multi-site and -seasonal studies that estimated the reduction in clubroot disease following the use of calcium cyanamide fertiliser achieving a minimum of 30 % improvement in yields (Humpherson-Jones et al. 1992). At the same time calcium cyanamide was associated by Naiki & Dixon (1987) with the diminution of disease severity caused by *P. brassicae* when examined in controlled environment and glasshouse experiments. Reductions in disease severity were related to the interval between application of the fertilizer and planting of susceptible Chinese cabbage (*B. rapa* spp. *pekinensis* cv. Granaat) seedlings in pathogen infested soil. Calcium cyanamide also stimulated host growth at all the treatment concentrations used. Subsequently, associations between the use of calcium cyanamide and reductions in the incidence of clubroot disease (*P. brassicae*) of brassicas is reviewed by Dixon (2009a; 2010; 2012a)

Clubroot developed in the late 1980s and into the 1990s as a significant disease of Australian vegetable brassica industry, most notably cauliflower and calabrese (green broccoli) crops in Victoria and Western Australia. A system of integrated control was developed which included the use of calcium cyanamide. Applying the fertilizer by banded

applications directed into the crop rows planted on raised beds significantly reduced cost by cutting application rates by 66 % and reduced the level of disease incidence. The marketable yield of calabrese receiving calcium cyanamide was double that of untreated controls in both 1996 and 1997 in Victoria indicating that crop growth was improved. This followed earlier work which studied the particle size and application methods for calcium cyanamide used in Australian vegetable production (Donald et al. 2004). These studies showed that calcium cyanamide used with other treatments, especially rapidly acting forms of lime successfully reduced the intensity of clubroot disease in the field (Donald et al. 2006). Subsequent British studies (Harling et al. 2007; Stewart 2007) indicated that combining calcium cyanamide with other bio-fertilizers and formulations of calcium was associated with reductions in clubroot disease on several sites over four seasons.

The Australian workers also developed a real-time polymerase chain reaction (PCR) test that quantified inoculum loads and allowed predictions of yield losses (Donald et al. 2006). There is a minimum viable spore density of between  $10^3$  and  $10^4$  spores per gm of dry soil before root hair infection by *P. brassicae* leads to consistent disease expression suggested Naiki et al. (1978). This result agrees with Garrett's (1958) theories of minimal inoculum potential being required before there is successful disease development caused by soil-borne pathogens.

Integrated use of calcium cyanamide with lime is advocated by Belec et al. (2004) in Canada and with the addition of resistant cultivars into an integrated system was recommended for vegetable brassicas (Anon 2012). Similar reports come from other centres in Canada (McDonald 2002). Working on highly organic muck soils in Ontario, she found that calcium cyanamide applications were strongly associated with reductions in clubroot severity especially when used in combination with applications of boron. The need for coherent means for controlling clubroot disease is highlighted by information now coming

from China. Reportedly 70 to 80 % of land used for brassica crops, which are of major culinary and industrial significance in the provinces of Guangdong, Shandong, Zhejiang, Jiangsu, Hangzhou, Jinhua, and Ningbo district of Zhejiang province, is infested with *P. brassicae* (Chai et al. 2014). This poses a problem of great urgency for Chinese agriculture. Lime-nitrogen (calcium cyanamide) applications were associated with substantial reductions of clubroot disease in Chinese cabbage, increased yield and grower's income (Benyue 1995)

Clubroot severely limits brassica crop production worldwide and has now gained major footholds in the oilseed rape crops of Canada, China and northern Europe, threatening the viability of one of the world's most significant internationally-traded crops (Strelkov & Dixon 2014). Management of *P. brassicae* is limited by the factors discussed by Dixon (2014). The distribution of this pathogen seems to be increasing since disease reports are now coming from countries which previously had no or very limited occurrence of clubroot such as Turkey (Apaydin et al. 2010).

## Mode of action

The association of calcium, in the form of lime, with the suppression of clubroot (finger and toe) disease was well established even before the causal organism was identified (Anon 1853). Thereafter calcium as limes or to a lesser extent fertilizers such as calcium cyanamide were recommended as practical means for reducing the progress of clubroot disease (Colhoun 1958; Karling 1968). The mode of action of calcium and associated effects on soil pH has, however, been elucidated only relatively recently. Fletcher et al. (1982) recognised that although pH influenced the progress of clubroot disease, this was affected by the concentrations of calcium ions in the soil solution. In California, USA., Campbell et al. (1985) concluded that there was an interaction between pH, extractable calcium and

440 magnesium, which must exceed approximately 14 meq/100mg of soil from native minerals or  
441 with fertilizers, such as calcium cyanamide or lime treatments. These relationships were  
442 studied by Dixon & Webster (1988) and by Webster and Dixon (1991 a, b) who  
443 demonstrated details of the stages in the life-cycle of *P. brassicae* and the associated  
444 development of pathogenesis that are regulated by calcium ions, pH values and host factors.  
445 Each of these components, while affected by the others, has independent effects. These  
446 operate throughout the pathogen life-cycle from the germination of motile primary zoospores,  
447 penetration and colonisation of root hairs through the formation of primary plasmodia,  
448 sporangia and then onto the infection of cortical cells and the secondary stages of  
449 pathogenesis which culminate in gall formation. Increasing soil calcium or alkalinity reduces  
450 the rate of maturation of *P. brassicae* in root hairs retarding its the speed and the quantities of  
451 plasmodia which formed sporangia. But as Myers & Campbell (1985) demonstrated, calcium  
452 has little impact on the dormant resting spores. Previously, Macfarlane (1958) had  
453 demonstrated that in controlled experiments pH values of 5 to 6 had little influence on the  
454 level of successful infection by primary zoospores penetrating root hairs. Successful infection  
455 diminished greatly as pH increased and reached 8.0. This effect was further explained by  
456 Donald & Porter (2004) who showed that at acidic pH values the progress of infection into  
457 root hairs was only delayed by the presence of significant amounts of calcium (20 mM). As  
458 pH became increasingly alkaline, the amount of calcium required to reduce root hair infection  
459 lessened. Subsequently Takahashi et al. (2006) found that when *P. brassicae* encounters  
460 resistant cultivars, there is an alkalisiation of the environment in the rhizosphere which retards  
461 the capacity of the pathogen for invasion. He found that cell death in *Arabidopsis thaliana*  
462 resistant to *P. brassicae* was associated with increasing alkalisiation of the root environment  
463 and that this did not occur in cultures of susceptible plants. These suggestions were taken  
464 further by Niwa et al. (2007) who emphasised the role of pH in moderating the development

of clubroot disease in field experiments. Soils which were suppressive of *P. brassicae* had elevated calcium contents and alkaline pH and considerable microbial activity. Webster (1986) found that nitrate-nitrogen could also be associated with reduced root hair invasion by *P. brassicae*. At least in part this might be explained by findings that on root surfaces there is a localised increase in pH associated with nitrate-nitrogen and a decline in pH around root hairs when ammonium is the source of nitrogen (Marschner et al. 1986).

As the interaction of calcium with *P. brassicae* and clubroot disease is increasingly understood. Yano et al. (1991) investigated by quantitative analysis the relationships between calcium in spore suspension and effects of inoculation in culture solutions with resting spores. Their results suggested that the presence of calcium (as  $\text{Ca}^{2+}$  ions) promoted the germination of *P. brassicae* resting spores. That exposes the resultant delicate primary zoospores to predation by soil-borne bacteria and may also reduce their motility. By analogy with the water moulds (Oomyces), that also rely on flagella for motility, calcium ions in solution adversely affect the movement of zoospores (Donaldson & Deacon 1993). Yano's research offered a clue to the manner by which microbial populations antagonistic towards *P. brassicae* might be stimulated by the presence of calcium.

## Suppressive soils

The volume of soil where *P. brassicae* most probably encounters greatest numbers of antagonistic microorganisms is the rhizosphere. This is because the primary zoospores are less than 1.5µm diameter (Cook 1933) and hence will have limited supplies of energy and not be capable of moving far in soil moisture films from the resting spore to the host root surface (Dixon 2014) in response to host root exudates (Mattey & Dixon 2015). It is the suppressive or conducive environment in the rhizosphere which *P. brassicae* zoospores encounter as they

attempt penetration of the root hairs which determines the success or failure of subsequent invasion and disease development. A generalised description of the rhizosphere was provided by Hinsinger et al. (2005). This emphasised its complexity since it is occupied by beneficial as well as pathogenic organisms and plant root systems. Further, the rhizoplane (root surface) and surrounding rhizosphere were noted by Newton et al. (2010) as “support(ing) complex microbial communities that can influence nutrient availability and the ability of pathogens to colonise roots”. This complexity in the microbial community and resultant suppressivity or conduciveness is influenced by agricultural practices as discussed by Raaijmakers et al. (2009) and Raaijmaaker & Mazzola (2016). This encourages beneficial rhizosphere microorganisms such as the bacteria *Pseudomonas*, *Burkholderia* and *Bacillus* which adversely affect the population density, dynamics and metabolic activities of soil-borne pathogens (Raaijmakers et al. 2009). Increasing the activities of microorganisms capable of suppressing pathogens is a route by which sustainable husbandry may be achieved as advocated by Mazzola (2004) particularly in relation to take-all disease of cereals (*Gaeumannomyces graminis*). Research with various soil amendments indicates that stimulation of soil microbial populations encourages chitinolytic bacteria which are capable of degrading the resting spores of *P. brassicae* because they contain chitin in the cell wall (Buczacki & Moxham 1983). The stimulation of chitinolytic bacteria resulting in the inhibition of diseases caused by soil-borne pathogens is discussed by Dixon & Walsh (1998)

The indirect effects of calcium cyanamide, of stimulating antagonistic microbe populations, which then results in reduced incidence of soil-borne pathogens and the diseases that they incite was identified for *Verticillium albo-atrum*, *Pythium ultimum* and *Thielaviopsis basicola* by Verona (1970). Applications of calcium cyanamide were demonstrated by Huang & Sun (1991) to be associated with encouraging bacterial populations in treated soil and in reductions in populations of some other plant pathogenic

fungi such as *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* a cause of white rot in a wide range of crops (Jones & Gray 1973). Applying calcium cyanamide to soil also encouraged suppressiveness towards *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *cucumerinum* (cucumber wilt) (Shi et al. 2009). It was suggested by Horiuchi et al. (1983) that calcium cyanamide enhanced the suppression of clubroot in association with the use of soil solarisation.

Studies of soil-borne bacteria such as *Bacillus subtilis* established that they are antagonists of *P. brassicae* (Einhorn et al. 1991). In the 1980s in Taiwan Hsieh & Wang (1986) examined the components of clubroot suppressive soils. They concluded that while calcium and pH were important factors the stimulation of populations of antagonistic microbes was also essential. In Taiwan, clubroot suppressive soils were associated with pH values >7.4 and with a calcium content of >1210 ppm. The local irrigation water was found by Hsieh & Wang (1986) to be highly calcareous but they contended that suppressivity was partially related to soil physico-chemical factors such as texture, pH, organic matter content and exchangeable potassium, sodium, magnesium and calcium. But acidifying soils, which is a means of removing bacteria was shown by Wang & Hsieh (1986) to reduce their suppressive properties.

Applications of calcium cyanamide were associated with increased numbers of microbes in soil (Allison 1924; Mukerji 1932). Soil biological health as measured by the amount of amylase and protease activity increased where calcium cyanamide was used, whereas the opposite effects were obtained with applications of ammonium sulphate (Bosch & Amberger 1983). Calcium hydroxide may be released from calcium cyanamide, which then raises alkaline soil pH, further encouraging microbial activity and benefiting soil fertility (Verona 1970). The subsequent release of nitrogen via DCD encourages populations of heterotrophic microbes (Nõmmik 1958). Overall, the breakdown of calcium cyanamide increases the heterogeneity of soil microbe populations and in turn this raises fertility. This



finding supports the early results of Crowther & Richardson (1932) showing that calcium cyanamide is most effective when applied as routine annual applications thereby maintaining environments conducive for increased microbial activity.

More recently studies in Brittany by Rouxel et al. (1985) of conducive and suppressive soils established a relationship between pH values, soil moisture, inoculum load and clubroot disease. He also speculated on the role which microbial biological control agents might play and their interaction with physical characteristics of soil. Page (2001) clearly demonstrated that applications of calcium in various forms of lime could be associated with the development of soil suppressivity towards *P. brassicae*. Her Scottish field studies identified the development of soil suppressiveness towards *P. brassicae* resulting from the interactions between calcium and benign soil microbes. This relationship was explored further by Murakami et al. (2002) identifying the effects of reducing inoculum load as suppressiveness increased resulting in reduced disease expression associated with exchangeable soil calcium. A link between calcium and increased microbial activity was developed by Niwa et al. (2007; 2008) in relation to suppressive and conducive soils. They demonstrated that calcium is associated with increased microbial activity and reduced germination of *P. brassicae* resting spores and in turn this suppresses the development of clubroot disease. They demonstrated that soil borne microbes may change their metabolic activities when calcium cyanamide is present. The diversity and species richness of soil populations of beneficial bacteria was enhanced by calcium cyanamide as Niwa et al. (2008) demonstrated by increasing amounts of rRNA fragments. Subsequently, (Junwei et al. 2013) reported that applications of calcium cyanamide encourages soil bacterial community diversity and richness. Potentially that could increase soil suppressiveness and probably result in a decline in soil-borne plant pathogens. If suppressiveness is accepted as a component of soil health then that also implies promoting a broader spectrum of soil inhabitants such as

earthworms. The report by Bauchhenß (1994) then becomes relevant. This work demonstrated that applications of calcium cyanamide caused no adverse effects on populations of several earthworm species and ultimately resulted in increased numbers of these animals. It is also noted that beneficial bacteria such as nitrogen-fixing bradyrhizobia are increased by the presence of calcium cyanamide. Nitrogen fixation, for example, was 50 % greater in soybean crops receiving this fertilizer (Tewari et al. 2004).

## DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

Immense challenges will face scientists, farmers and growers over the next 50 years in ensuring food security as human populations expand, land areas for cropping diminish and water supplies for irrigation are becoming restricted (Dixon 2009d; 2012b). Confronting these challenges requires larger crop yields without accelerating climate change, soil degradation, water shortages or the further impoverishment of natural biodiversity. Currently, agricultural productivity increases by about 2 % annually as a result of scientific improvements, this must rise to 3 % if food security worldwide is to be maximised (Braun 2010; Dixon 2009d; 2012b). Raising the intensity of production should be linked with the protection of the environment (Tollefson 2010) in which soil management will be of particular importance (Schutter et al. 2001; Bronick & Lal 2005). Consequently, the potentialities of currently relatively minor husbandry tools such as specialised sources of crop nutrients like calcium cyanamide should be assessed. Research of this nature is called for by Frank & Groffman (2009) in their challenges asking for more information concerning the movement and uptake of nitrogen from the rhizosphere into roots. It is also highlighted by Paustian et al. (2016) specifically in relation to improved fertiliser-use-efficiency.

Calcium cyanamide fertilizer was the first commercialised source of artificial nitrogen. While the quantities currently produced are far less than those made using the Harber-Bosch process it has retained a market presence for over a century. During that time the uses of calcium cyanamide have mainly centred on specialised applications for high-value field and glasshouse vegetable and salad crops. Here it has been associated the promotion of soil health and quality, and reducing the impact of soil-borne pathogens such as *P. brassicae*, (Dixon et al. 1987) or species of *Sclerotinia*. Additionally, the presence of the dimer DCD in the commercially formulated fertilizer and its formation in soils treated with calcium cyanamide reduces nitrification and slows nitrate pollution. Properties of this fertilizer for slowly releasing nitrogen into the rhizosphere linked with the ready availability of calcium encourage the development of microbial diversity and suppressiveness towards soil-borne pathogens. The latter property in particular, is encouraging interest in calcium cyanamide for application in oilseed rape crops which are now increasingly damaged by clubroot disease (Dixon 2010; Diederichsen et al. 2014). Consequently, there is wider recognition of calcium cyanamide as a potentially valuable component of environmentally sustainable integrated pest management (IPM) strategies for this destructive disease worldwide as suggested by Tremblay et al. (2005) and Donald & Porter. (2014). This strategy involves encouraging suppressive soils containing microorganisms that are antagonistic towards soil-borne pathogens. (Dixon & Tilston 2010). Developing soil suppressiveness towards *P. brassicae* is an established technique following studies such as those of Arie et al. (1998), Einhorn et al. (1991) and Lahlali et al. (2014 a,b). Increasingly, accurate means for targetting such fertilizers into the root zone are becoming available following the development of automated robotic sensing of varying fertilizer requirements across crops through changes in foliar nitrogen status (Gianquinto et al. 2003) combined with increased efficiency in granule

distribution into the canopy (Antille et al. 2015). With potential increases in efficacy and cost savings. As a result the cost is likely to be reduced and efficacy increased.

Artificial nitrogenous fertilisers have made incalculable contributions to human welfare for over a century. This role in crop husbandry is likely to continue, but the manner by which this is achieved will be modified as needs for sustaining environmental security, biodiversity and human health increase. There are already requirements for protecting Nitrate Vulnerable Zones (NVZs) and the dangers of raised nitrate concentrations in crops (Pimpini et al. 1970) have been long recognised. Consideration should be given to using nitrogen fertiliser formulations that are not accompanied by these problems (Sieling & Kage 2010) and which encourage beneficial microorganisms (Yao et al. 2000) . That improves soil health and quality which is internationally recognised as means for increasing agricultural productivity and conserving and sustaining biological diversity. Increasingly multi-disciplinary research is providing knowledge which will enable improved exploitation of the benefits offered by benign soil inhabiting microbes in the repair and maintenance of soil health.

Agriculture is the sector of human activity which is most likely to be affected by climate change (Rosenzweig et al. 2014). This assessment is based on a globally consistent protocol-based, multi-model which indicates strong negative effects of climate change particularly where there are high levels of warming at low latitudes where developing countries are concentrated. The urgency of this situation is further emphasised by the large scale meta-analysis by Challinor et al. (2014) showing the relationship between rising temperatures and declining crop yields in coming decades. The use of nitrogen fertilization will have particular relevance in mitigating some of these effects. In this process, compounds such as calcium cyanamide, which encourage natural soil microbial antagonisms towards

plant pathogenic organisms and have limited environmental impact could offer considerable benefits for crop husbandry.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Grateful thanks are given to the referees and editors for their helpful and constructive comments which have improved this review. Thanks are also given to Mr Paul Corfield and Dr Hans-Juergen Klasse for supplying information.

## REFERENCES

- ALIX, K., LARIAGON, C., DELOURME, R. & MANZANARES-DAULEUX, M. J. (2007). Exploiting natural genetic diversity and mutant resources of *Arabidopsis thaliana* to study the *A. thaliana*-*Plasmodiophora brassicae* interaction. *Plant Breeding* **126**, 218-221.
- ALLISON, F. E. (1924). The effect of Cyanamid and related compounds on the numbers of microorganisms in soil. *Journal of Agricultural Research* **28**, 1159-1166.
- ALVAREZ-SOLIS, J. D. & ANZUETTO-MARTINEZ, M. de J. (2004). Soil microbial activity under different corn cropping systems in the Highlands of Chiapas, Mexico. *Agrociencia (Montecillo)* **38**, 13-22.
- AMBERGER, A. (1986). Potential of nitrification inhibitors in modern fertiliser management. *Zeitschrift Pflanzenernähr Bodenkd* **149**, 469-484.
- AMBERGER, A. (1989). Research on dicyandiamide as a nitrification inhibitor and future outlook. *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis*. **20**, 1933-1955.
- ANON (1853). The disease of finger and toe in turnips. *Transactions of the Highland and Agricultural Society of Scotland* **3**, 118-140.
- ANON (1996) Federal Government position paper on the decision of the Bundesrat on the decree amending fertiliser regulations. Berlin: *Federal Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Forestry, Berlin letter of March 25<sup>th</sup> 1996, reference: 312-3132/23*.
- ANON (2008a). 100 years of calcium cyanamide from Trostberg. *Monatschrift Magazin für den Gartenbau-Profi (Magazine for Professional Horticulture)*. August issue, pages 296-297.
- ANON (2008b) United Nations Food & Agriculture Organisation (FAO) Rome Italy <http://www.fao.org/agriculture/crops/thematic-sitemap/theme/spi/soil-biodiversity/the-nature-of-soil/what-is-a-healthy-soil/en/> website checked 24 March 2016.
- ANON (2012) Brassica Research News no 1. Stoneleigh, Warwickshire: *Horticultural Development Company (HDC, now Agriculture & Horticulture Development Board*

- 673 *AHDB – Horticulture) and Brassica (now British) Growers Association (BGA). June 3*  
674 *pages.*
- 675 ANTILLE, D. L., GALLAR, L., MILLER., P. C. H. & GODWIN, R. J. (2015). An investigation  
676 into the fertiliser particle dynamics off-the-disc. *Applied Engineering in Agriculture* **31**,  
677 49-60.
- 678 APAYDIN, A., DELIGÖZ, I., KAR, H., KIBAR, B. & KARAAGAC, O. (2010). An investigation on  
679 clubroot disease (*Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor.) races in the Black Sea Region of  
680 Turkey. *Zirat Fabrikasi Dergisi* **28**, 57-60.
- 681 ARIE, T., KOBAYASHI, G., OKADA, G., KONO, Y. & YAMAGUCHI, I. (1998). Control of soil  
682 borne clubroot disease of cruciferous plants by epoxydon from *Phoma glomerata*. *Plant*  
683 *Pathology* **47**, 741-748;
- 684 ASHBY, S. F. (1905). Note on the fate of calcium cyanamide in the soil. *Journal of*  
685 *Agricultural Science* **1**, 358-360.
- 686 BAUCHHENB, J. (1994). Influence of Alzodef and Perlka on earthworms (Einfluß von Alzodef  
687 und Perlka auf Regenwürmer). Freising, Germany: *Report KA-187, Bayerische*  
688 *Landesanstalt für Bodenkultur.und Pflanzenbau.*
- 689 BELEC, C., TREMBALY, N. & COULOMBE, J. (2004). Liming and calcium cyanamid for  
690 clubroot control in cauliflower. *Acta Horticulturae* **635**, 41-46.
- 691 BELL, M. A., FISCHER, R. A., BYERLEE, D. & SAYRE, K. (1995). Genetic and agronomic  
692 contributions to yield gains: a case study for wheat. *Field Crops Research* **44**, 55-65.
- 693 BENYUE, Z. (1995). Research on efficacy of LN fertiliser with chemical function of  
694 controlling Chinese cabbage clubroot. *Journal of Agricultural Science of Zhejiang*  
695 *University* **6**, 300-301.
- 696 BJÄLFVE, G. (1957). The nitrification of calcium cyanamide and its effects on the soil  
697 microflora. *Annals of the Agricultural College of Sweden (Kungliga*  
698 *Lantbrukshögskolans Annaler)* **23**, 423-456.
- 699 BLETOS, F. A. (2006). Grafting and calcium cyanamide as alternatives to methyl bromide for  
700 greenhouse eggplant production. *Scientia Horticulturae* **107**, 325-331.
- 701 BOLLAG, J. M., SENESI, N., HUANG, P.M. (1992). *Interactions between soil minerals and*  
702 *microorganisms: impact on the terrestrial ecosystem.* New York: Marcel Dekker pages  
703 307-379.
- 704 BORNEMAN, J. & TRIPLETT, E. W. (1997). Molecular microbial diversity in soil from Eastern  
705 Amazonia: evidence of unusual micro-organisms and microbial population shifts  
706 associated with deforestation. *Applied Environmental Microbiology* **63**, 2647-2653.
- 707 BOSCH, M & AMBERGER, A. (1983). Influence of long-term fertilising with different forms of  
708 nitrogen fertiliser on pH, humic fractions, biological activity and dynamics of nitrogen of  
709 an arable brown earth (Einfluß langjähriger Düngung mit verschiedenen N- formen auf  
710 pH-Wert, Humusfraktionen, biologische Aktivität und Stickstoffdynamik einer Acker-  
711 Braunerde). *Zeitschrift. Pflanzenernähr Bodenkde* **146**, 714-724.
- 712 BOURBOS, V. A., SKOUDRIDAKIS, M. T., DARAKIS, G. A. & KOULLIZAKIS, M. (1997).  
713 Calcium cyanamide and soil solarisation for the control *Fusarium solani* f. sp. *cucurbitae*  
714 in greenhouse cucumber. *Crop Protection* **16** , 383-386.

- BRAUN, J. von (2010). Strategic body needed to beat food crisis. *Nature (London)* **465**, 548-549.
- BRONICK, C. J. & LAL, R. (2005). Soil structure and management: a review. *Geoderma* **124**, 3-22.
- BROUGHTON, W. J. (editor). *Nitrogen Fixation* vol 1 *Ecology* (1981); vol 2 *Rhizobium* (1982); vol 3 *Legumes* (1983); Broughton, W. J. & Pühler, S. *Nitrogen Fixation* vol 4 *Molecular Biology* (1986). Oxford: The Clarendon Press.
- BRUGGEN, A. H. C van, SEMENOV, A. M., DIEPENINGEN, A. D. van, VOS, O. J. De. & BLOK, W. J. (2006). Relation between soil health, wave-like fluctuations in microbial populations and soil-borne plant disease management. *European Journal of Plant Pathology* **115**, 105-122.
- BUCZACKI, S.T & CADD, S. E. (1976). Glasshouse evaluation of systemic compounds, derivatives of dithiocarbamic acid and other fungicides for the control of clubroot. *Annals Applied Biology* **84**, 43-50.
- BUCZACKI, S. T. & MOXHAM, S. E. (1983). Structure of the resting spore wall of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* revealed by electron microscopy and chemical digestion. *Mycological Research* (formerly the *Transactions of the British Mycological Society*) **81**, 221-231.
- BURKI, F., KUDRYAVTSEV, A., MATZ, M. V., AGLYAMOVA, G. V., BULMAN, S., FIER, M., KEELING, P. J. & PAWLOWSKI, J. (2010). Evolution of Rhizaria: new insights from phylogenomic analysis of uncultivated protists. *BioMed Central Evolutionary Biology*, **10** no 377, 1-18.
- BURNS, I. G., HAMMOND, J. P. & WHITE, P. J. (2010). Precision placement of fertiliser for optimising the early nutrition of vegetable crops – a review of the implications for the yield and quality of crops and their nutrient use efficiency. *Acta Horticulturae* **852**, 177-187.
- CAMPBELL, R. N. GREATHEAD, A. S. MYERS, D. F. & BOER, G. J. de (1985). Factors related to control of clubroot of crucifers in the Salinas Valley of California. *Phytopathology* **75**, 665-670.
- CHAI, A. L., XIE, X. W., SHI, Y. X. & LI, B. J. (2014). Research status of clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*) on cruciferous crops in China. *Canadian Journal Plant Pathology* **36** (S1), 142-153.
- CHALLINOR, A. J., WATSON, J., LOBELL, D. B., HOWDEN, S. M., SMITH, D. R. & CHETRI, N. (2014). A meta-analysis of crop yields under climate change and adaptation. *Nature Climate Change* **4**, 287-291.
- COLHOUN, J. (1958). Club root disease of crucifers caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Woron.–a monograph. *Phytopathological Paper* no 3, Kew, Surrey: The Commonwealth Mycological Institute.
- COOK, W. R. I. (1933). A monograph of the Plasmodiophorales. *Archive für Protistenkunde* Editors Max Hartmann & Adolf Pascher Band 80 Heft 2 S 179-356, Verlag von Gustav Fischer, Jena, Germany.
- CORNFORTH, I. S. (1971). Calcium cyanamide in agriculture. *Soils and Fertilisers* **34**, 463-468.
- CROOKES, W. (1900). *The wheat problem*. London: John Murray.

- CROWTHER, E. M. & RICHARDSON, H. L. (1932). Studies on calcium cyanamide. 1. The decomposition of calcium cyanamide in the soil and its effects on germination, nitrification and soil reaction. *Journal of Agricultural Science* **22**, 300-334.
- DIEDERICHSEN, E. FRAUEN, M. & LUDWIG-MULLER, J. (2014). Clubroot disease management challenges from a German perspective. (Special Issue: Clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*) on canola and other brassica species: disease development, epidemiology and management.) *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **36**(Suppl. 1), 85-98.
- DIXON, G. R. (2006). The biology of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor. – a review of recent advances. *Acta Horticulturae* **706**, 271-282.
- DIXON, G. R. (2007). *Vegetable brassicas and related crucifers*. Crop Production Science in Horticulture no 14. Wallingford, Oxon CAB International.
- DIXON, G. R. (2009a). Calcium cyanamide -100 years of successful integrated control. *Plant Protection Science* **45**, 37-38.
- DIXON, G. R. (2009b). The occurrence and impact of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* and clubroot disease. *Journal of Plant Growth Regulation* **28**, 194-202.
- DIXON, G. R. (2009c). *Plasmodiophora brassicae* in its environment. Chapter 3 In; *Plasmodiophora brassicae* (Clubroot)–a plant pathogen that alters host growth and productivity. (Ed. G. R. Dixon). *Journal of Plant Growth Regulation* **28**, 193-303.
- DIXON, G. R. (2009d). The impact of climate and global change on crop production. Chapter 17 pages 307-324 In: *Climate Change: Observed Impacts on Planet Earth*. (Editor T. M. Letcher). Oxford: Elsevier.
- DIXON, G. R. (2010). Calcium and pH as parts of a coherent control strategy for clubroot disease (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*). *Acta Horticulturae* **867**, 151-156.
- DIXON, G R (2012a). Calcium cyanamide-a synoptic review of an environmentally benign fertiliser which enhances soil health. *Acta Horticulturae* **938**, 211-217.
- DIXON, G. R. (2012b). The impact of global climate change on plant disease and world food production. *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **34**, 362-379..
- DIXON, G. R. (2014). Clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae* Woronin) – an agricultural and biological challenge worldwide. *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **36** (S1), 5-18.
- DIXON, G R (2015). Water Irrigation and plant disease. *CAB Reviews: Perspectives in Agriculture, Veterinary Science, Nutrition and Natural Resources*. CAB Reviews 2015, **10**, 009, pages 1-18.
- DIXON, G. R. Brokenshire, T. (1981). Chemical control of clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*). *Crop protection in Northern Britain. Proceedings of a conference held at Dundee University 17-19 March 1981*. 325-329. Farnham: The British Crop Protection Council.
- DIXON, G. R. & TILSTON, E. L. (2010). Soil-borne pathogens and their interaction with the soil environment. Chapter 6 pages 197-272 In: *Soil Microbiology and Sustainable Crop Production* (Editors G. R. Dixon & E. L. Tilston), Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer Publications.
- DIXON, G. R. & WALSH, U. F. (1998). Suppression of plant pathogens by organic extracts – a review. *Acta Horticulturae* **469**, 383-390.



- DIXON, G. R. & WEBSTER, M. A. (1988). Antagonistic effects of boron, calcium and pH on pathogenesis caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Woronin (clubroot)—a review of recent work. *Crop Research* **28**, 83-95.
- DIXON, G.R. & WILLIAMSON, C.J. (1985). Factors affecting the use of calcium cyanamide for control of *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Proceedings Better Brassicas 1984 Conference, St. Andrews*. Dundee: Scottish Crop Research Institute, (now the James Hutton Institute), 238-244.
- DIXON, G. R. & WILSON, F. (1983). Evaluation of calcium cyanamide for control of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* (clubroot). *Annals of Applied Biology* **102**(Suppl.), 50-51.
- DIXON, G. R. NAIKI, T. WEBSTER, A. & WILSON, F. (1987). Integrated use of boron, calcium cyanamide and nitrogen for control of clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*). *Crop Protection in Northern Britain* 399-404. Farnham: The British Crop Protection Council.
- DONALD, E. C. LAWRENCE, J. M. & PORTER, I. J. (2004). Influence of particle size and application method on the efficacy of calcium cyanamide for control of clubroot of vegetable brassicas. *Crop Protection* **23**, 297-303.
- DONALD, E. C. & PORTER, I.J. (2014). Clubroot in Australia: the history and impact of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* in brassica crops and research efforts directed towards its control. *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **36** (S1) 66.84.
- DONALD, E. C. & PORTER, I. J. (2004). A sand-culture technique used to observe the effect of calcium and pH on root hair and cortical stages of infection by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Australasian Plant Pathology* **33**, 585-589.
- DONALD, E. C., PORTER, I. J., FAGGIAN, R. & LANCASTER, R. A. (2006). An integrated approach to the control of clubroot in vegetable brassica crops. *Acta Horticulturae* **706**, 283-300.
- DONALDSON, S P. & DEACON, J. W. (1993). Changes in motility of *Pythium* zoospores induced by calcium and calcium-modulating drugs. *Mycological Research* **97**, 877-883.
- DORAN, J. W., SARRANTONIO, M. & LIEBIG, M. A. (1996). Soil health and sustainability. *Advances in Agronomy* **56**, 2-54.
- DORAN, J. W. & ZEISS, M. R. (2000). Soil health and sustainability: managing the biotic component of soil quality. *Applied Soil Ecology* **15**, 3-11.
- EINHORN, G., BOCHOW, H., HUBER, J. & KREBS, B. (1991). Methodological studies on the detection of antagonists of the clubroot pathogen *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor. *Archive für Phytopathologie und Pflanzenschutz* **27**, 205-208.
- ERNST, F A (1928). *Fixation of atmospheric nitrogen*. London: Chapman & Hall, New York: van Norstrand Inc.
- EVEILLARD, E. (2005). Improve mineral N efficiency to protect the environment : the French experience. *UNIFA union des Industries de la Fertilisation*. 92909 Paris La Défense Cedex.
- FLETCHER, J. T., HIMS, M. J., ARCHER, F. C. & BROWN, A. (1982). Effects of adding calcium and sodium salts to field soils on the incidence of clubroot. *Annals of Applied Biology* **100**, 245-251.

844 FRANK, A. (1908). Chemical industry in relation to agriculture. *Journal of the. Society for*  
845 *Chemical Industry* **27**, 1093-1100.

846 FRANK, D. A. & GROFFMAN, P. M. (2009). Plant rhizospheric N processes: what we don't  
847 know and why we should care. *Ecology* **90**, 1512-1519.

848 GARBEVA, P., VEEN, J. A. van, & ELSAS, J. D. van (2004). Microbial diversity in soil:  
849 selection of microbial populations by plant and soil type and implications for disease  
850 suppression. *Annual Review of Phytopathology* **42**, 243-270.

851 GARRETT, D (1958). *The biology of root invading fungi*. Cambridge & London: Cambridge  
852 University Press.

853 GREENWOOD, D. J. (1982). Nitrogen supply and crop yield: the global scene. *Plant and Soil*  
854 **67**; 45-59.

855 GIANQUINTO, G., SAMBO, P. & BONA, S. (2003). The use of SPAD-502 chlorophyll meter for  
856 dynamically optimising the nitrogen supply in potato crop: a methodological approach.  
857 *Acta Horticulturae* **627**, 217-224.

858 GÜTHNER, T. & MERTSCHENK, B. (2006). Cyanamides. In: *Ullman's Encyclopedia of*  
859 *Industrial Chemistry (100 Years)*. Wiley on line Library published 15th July 2006. DOI:  
860 10.1002/14356007.a08\_139.pub2 (tested 4th November 2015) Wiley-VCH Verlag  
861 GmbH & Co, KgaA.

862 HAENSELER, C. M. & MOYER, T. R. (1937). Effect of calcium cyanamide on the soil  
863 microflora with special reference to certain plant parasites. *Soil Science* **43**, 133-152.

864 HALL, A. D. (1905). Calcium cyanamide. *Journal of Agricultural Science, Cambridge* **1**, 146-  
865 148.

866 HARLING, R & OXLEY, S. (2007). Clubroot disease of oilseed rape and other brassica crops.  
867 *Technical Note TN 602*, Edinburgh: Scottish Agricultural College.

868 HARLING, R., STEWART, K. & GLADDERS, P. (2007). Clubroot control using novel and  
869 sustainable methods. *Project report (HH322TFV)*, London: Department for the  
870 Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Defra).

871 HARTWIG, N. L. & AMOON, H. V. (2002). Cover crops and living mulches. *Weed Science* **50**,  
872 688-699

873 HINSINGER, P., GOBRAN, G. R., GREGORY, P. J. & WENZEL, W. W. (2005). Rhizosphere  
874 geometry and heterogeneity arising from root-mediated physical and chemical processes.  
875 *New Phytologist* **168**, 293-303.

876 HORIUCHI, S. HORI, M. TAKASHI, S. SHIMIZU, K. (1983). Factors responsible for the  
877 development of clubroot-suppressing effect in soil solarization. *Bulletin of the Chugoku*  
878 *National Agricultural Experiment Station*, **E 20**, 25-48. .

879 HSEIH, W-H. & WANG J-F. (1986). Investigations on suppressive soils of clubroot of  
880 crucifers in Taiwan. *Plant Protection Bulletin (Taiwan R.O.C.)* **28**, 353-362.

881 HUANG, H. C. & SUN, S.K. (1991). Effects of S-H mixture or Perlka™ on carpogenic  
882 germination and survival of sclerotia of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. *Soil Biology and*  
883 *Biochemistry* **23**, 809-813.

884 HUMPHERSON-JONES, F. M. DIXON, G. R. CRAIG, M. A. & ANN, D. M. (1992). Control of  
885 clubroot using calcium cyanamide - a review. *Brighton Crop Protection Conference,*  
886 *Pests and Diseases* **3**, 1147-1154.

- JACOB, K. D., ALLISON, F. E. & BRAHAM, J. M. (1924). Chemical and biological studies with Cyanmid and some of its transformation products. *Journal of Agricultural Research* **28**, 37-69.
- JONES, D. & GRAY, E. G. (1973). Factors affecting the germination of sclerotia of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* from peas. *Mycological Research (formerly Transactions of the British Mycological Society)* **60**, 495-500.
- JUNWEI, M. A., WANCHUN, S. U. N., QIAOGANG, Y. U., QIANG, F. U. & JIANRONG, F. U. (2013). Effects of cyanamide fertiliser on microbial community structure of continuous cropping soil. *Journal of Zhejiang University (Agriculture & Life Sciences)* **39**, 281-290.
- KAMO, T., HIRADATE, S. & FUJII, Y. (2003). First isolation of natural cyanamide as a possible allelochemical from hairy vetch (*Vicia villosa*). *Journal of Chemical Ecology* **29**, 275-283.
- KAMO, T., SATO, M., KATO, K., HIRADATE, S., NAKAJIMA, E., FUJII, Y. & HIROTA, M. (2006). Quantification of cyanamide contents in herbaceous plants. *Bioscience Biotechnology and Biochemistry* **70**, 2310-2312.
- KAMO, T., TAKEMURA, T., WASANO, N., FUJII, Y. & HIRADATE, S. (2012). Quantification of cyanamide in young seedlings of *Vicia* species, *Lens culinaris* and *Robinia pseudo-acacia* by gas chromatography-mass spectrometry. *Bioscience Biotechnology and Biochemistry* **76**, 1416-1418.
- KARLING, J. S. (1968). *The Plasmodiophorales – including a complete host index, bibliography and a description of diseases caused by species of this order*. New York and London: Hafner Publishing Company.
- KIRKBY, E. A. (1968). Influence of ammonia and nitrate nutrition on the cation-anion balance and nitrogen and carbohydrate metabolism of white mustard plants grown in dilute nutrient solutions. *Soil Science* **105**, 133-141.
- KLASSE, H. J. (1996). Calcium cyanamide—an effective tool to control clubroot—a review. *Acta Horticulturae* **407**, 403-409.
- KLASSE, H. J. (1999). Calcium cyanamide-a unique source of nitrogen promoting healthy growth and improving crop quality of vegetables. *Improved crop quality by nutrient management* 233-235. .
- KLASSE, H.J. (2002). *Calcium cyanamide—an important tool in methyl bromide replacement strategies*. Germany: Sud-deutsch Kalkstickstoorf Werke (SKW) Trostberg AG.
- KUEN, J. & DRECKSEL, O. (1928). Der Einfluss der Kalkstickstorf auf des Bacterienleben in Boden. *Zietschrift für Pflansenernähr Düngung und Bodenkde* **7**, 105-118.
- LAHLALI, R. & PENG, G. (2014a). Suppression of clubroot by *Clondrostachys rosea* via antibiosis and induced host resistance. *Plant Pathology* **63**, 447-455.
- LAHLALI, R. L., MCGREGOR, L., SONG, T., GOSSEN, B. D., NARISAWA, K. & PENG, G. (2014b). *Heteroconium chaetospora* suppresses clubroot by inducing host resistance via ethylene, jasmonic acid and auxin pathway signalling. *PLoSONE* **P4: e94144**, 1-9.
- LEHMANN, J. & KLEBER, M. (2015). The contentious nature of soil organic matter. *Nature (London)* **528** , 60-68.

928 LEHTOVIRTA-MORLEY, L. E., STOECKER, K., VIKINSKAS, A., PROSSER, J. I. & NICOL, G. W.  
 929 (2011). Cultivation of an obligate acidophilic ammonia oxidiser from a nitrifying soil.  
 930 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science (PANS)* **108** (380), 15892-15897.  
 931 LEIGH, G. J. (2004). The World's Greatest Fix—a history of nitrogen and agriculture, chapter  
 932 5. In: *The Triumph of Industrial Chemistry*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.  
 933 LIESACH, W., JANSSEN, P. H., RAINEY, F. A., WARD-RAINEY, N. L. & STACKEBRANDT, E.  
 934 (1997). Microbial diversity in soil: the need for a combined approach using molecular  
 935 and cultivation techniques. In: *Modern Soil Microbiology*, (Editors J. D. van Elsas & J. T.  
 936 Trevors) New York USA: Marcel Dekker.  
 937 LINDE, C. P. (1916) *Aus meinem Leben und von meiner Arbeit*. Munich: R. Oldenbourg.  
 938 Macfarlane, I. (1958). A solution-culture technique for obtaining root-hair or primary,  
 939 infection by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Journal of General Microbiology* **18**, 720-732.  
 940 MAIER-GREINER, U. H., OBERMAIER-SKROBRANER, M. M., ESTERMAIER, L. M.,  
 941 KAMMERLOHER, W., FREUND, C., WÜLFING, C., BURKERT, U. I., MATTERN, D. H.,  
 942 BREUER, M., EULITZ, M., KÜFREVIÖGLU, O. F. & HARTMANN, G. R. (1991). Isolation  
 943 and properties of a nitrile hydratase from the soil fungus *Myrothecium verrucaria* that is  
 944 highly specific for the fertiliser cyanamide and cloning of its gene. *Proceedings of the*  
 945 *National Academy of Science* **88**, 4260-4264.  
 946 MARSCHNER, J., RÖMHELD, V., HORST, W. J. & MARTIN, P. (1986). Root-induced changes in  
 947 the rhizosphere: importance for mineral nutrition of plants. *Zeitschrift für Pflanzenernähr*  
 948 **149**, 441-456.  
 949 MARTIN, W. H. (1933). Plant Pathology. *Report of New Jersey Agricultural Experimental*  
 950 *Station for the 2-year period ending June 30 1933*, 57-66.  
 951 MATTEY, M. & DIXON, G. R. (2015). Premature germination of resting spores as a means of  
 952 protecting brassica crops from *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor., (Clubroot). *Crop*  
 953 *Protection* **77**, 27-30.  
 954 MAZZOLA, M. (2004). Assessment and management of soil microbial community structure  
 955 for disease suppression. *Annual Review of Phytopathology* **42**, 35-59.  
 956 McDONALD, M. R. KORNATOWSKA, B. & McKEOWN, A. W. (2004). Management of  
 957 clubroot of Asian Brassica crops grown on organic soils. *Acta Horticulturae* **635**, 25-  
 958 30.  
 959 McDONALD, M. R. (2002). *Improved management of clubroot in crucifer crops* – Report  
 960 2002. University of Guelph, Muck Crops Research Station, Ontario L7B 0E9.  
 961 <http://www.uoguelph.ca/muckcrop/> (url checked 15 March 2016).  
 962 MELLOR, J. W. (1925). *A comprehensive treatise on inorganic and theoretical chemistry*. In  
 963 16 volumes published 1922-1937 of which volume 5 deals with nitrogen fixation.  
 964 London: Longmans.  
 965 MIRANDA, V. H. B. (1975). Influence of nitrogenous fertilisers upon some soil  
 966 characteristics. *Landwirtschaftliche Forschung* **29**, 21-27.  
 967 MÜLLER, H. (1955). Untersuchungen über die Wirkung des Cyanamids im Kalkstickstoff auf  
 968 pathogene und nichpathogene Mikroorganismen des Bodens. *Archive für Mikrobiologie*  
 969 **22**, 285-306.

- MUKERJI, B. K. (1932). Studies on calcium cyanamide. II. Microbiological aspects of nitrification in soils under varied environmental conditions. *Journal of Agricultural Science* **22**, 335-347.
- MURAKAMI, H., TSUSHIMA, S., KUROYANAGI, Y. & SHISHIDO, Y. (2002). Reduction of resting spore density of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* and clubroot disease severity by liming. *Soil Science and Plant Nutrition* **48**, 685-691.
- MYERS, D. C. & CAMPBELL, R.N. (1985). Lime and the control of clubroot of crucifers: effects of pH, calcium, magnesium, and their interaction. *Phytopathology* **75**, 670-673.
- NAIKI, T. & DIXON, G. R. (1987). The effects of chemicals on developmental stages of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* (clubroot). *Plant Pathology* **36**, 316-327.
- NAIKI, T., KAGEYAMA, K. & Ikegami, H. (1978). The relation of spore density of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Wor., to root hair infection and club formation in Chinese cabbage (Studies on the clubroot of cruciferous plant II). *Annals of the Phytopathology Society of Japan* **53**, 432-439.
- NEUHAUSER, S., KIRCHMAIR, M. & GLEASON, F. H. (2011). The ecological potential of Phytomyxa (plasmodiophorids) in aquatic food webs. *Hydrobiologia* **659**, 23-35.
- NEWTON, A. C., FITT, B. D. L., ATKINS, S. D., WALTERS, D. R. & DANIELL, T. J. (2010). Pathogenesis, parasitism and mutualism in the trophic space of microbe-plant interactions. *Trends in Microbiology* **18**, 365-373.
- NIWA, R., KUMEI, T., NOMURA, Y., YOSHIDA, S., OSAKI, M. & EZAWA, T. (2007). Increase in soil pH due to Ca-rich organic matter application causes suppression of the clubroot disease of crucifers. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry* **39**, 778-785.
- NIWA, R., NOMURA, Y., OSAKI, M. & EZAWA, T. (2008). Suppression of clubroot disease under neutral pH caused by inhibition of spore germination of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* in the rhizosphere. *Plant Pathology* **57**, 443-452.
- NÖRMMIK, H. (1958). On decomposition of calcium cyanamide in the soil. *Acta Agriculturae Scandinavica* **8**, 404-440.
- PAGE, L. V. (2001). *Studies of components for a potential integrated control system for Plasmodiophora brassicae*. Ph. D, thesis, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow;
- PANKHURST, C., DOUBE, B. M. & GUPTA, V. V. S. R. (1997). *Biological Indicators of Soil Health*: synthesis. In Pankhurst, C. E., Doube, B. M. & Gupta, V. V. S. R. (editors.) pages 419-435. *Biological indicators of soil health* Oxford: CAB International.
- PAUSTIAN, K., LEHMANN, J., OGLE, S., REAY, D., ROBERTSON, G. P. & SMITH, P. (2016). Climate-smart soils. *Nature* **532**, 49-57.
- PIMPINI, F., VENTER, F. & WÜNSCH, A. (1970). The influence of different nitrogen forms and increasing nitrogen doses on the content of total nitrogen and of nitrate in cauliflower plants. *Landwirtschaftliche Forschung* **23**, 363-370.
- PLEYSIER, L., ARORA, Y. & JUO, A. S. R. (1987). Nitrogen leaching and uptake from calcium cyanamide in comparison to urea and calcium ammonium nitrate in an ultisol from humid tropics. *Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems* **12**, 193-199.
- RAAIJMAKERS, J. M. & MAZZOLA, M. (2016). Soil immune responses. *Science* **352**, 1392-1393.
- RAAIJMAKERS, J. M., PAULITZ, T. C., STEINBERG, C., ALABOUVETTE, C. & MOËMME-LOCCOZ, Y. (2009). The rhizosphere: a playground and battlefield for soilborne

- pathogens and beneficial organisms. 341-361 In: *Rhizosphere: achievements and challenges*, (Eds Y. Dessaux, P. Hinsinger & P. Lemanceau). *Plant and Soil* **321** (1 &2), 1-535.
- RATHSACK, K. (1978). Die nitrificide Wirkung des Dicyanamides. *Landwirtschaftliche Forschung* **31**, 347-358.
- RIEDER, G. (1981) Calcium cyanamide–fertiliser or pesticide? *World Crops*, January issue.
- ROSENZWEIG, C., ELLIOTT, J., DERYNG, D., RUANE, A. C., MÜLLER, C., ARNETH, A., BOOTE, K. J., FOLBETH, C., GLOTTER, M., KHABAROV, N., NEUMANN, K., PIONTEK, F., PUGH, T. A. M., SCHMID, E., STEHFEST, E., YANG, H. & JONES, J. W. (2014). Assessing agricultural risks of climate change in the 21<sup>st</sup> century in a global gridded crop model intercomparison. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences (PNAS)*. **111**, 3268-3273.
- ROUXEL, F., BRIARD, M. & LEJEUNE, B. (1985). Studies of soil receptiveness to clubroot caused by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*: experiments on reponses of a series of vegetable soils in Brittany. Progress on pest management of field vegetables. *Proceedings of the CEC/IOBC Experts' Group, Rennes, France 20-22 November 1985*. (Editors R Cavallorao & C J Pelarents). Pages 145-152. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: A A Balkema.
- ROY, A. H. (2015). Global fertiliser industry: transitioning from volume to value. *Proceedings of the International Fertiliser Society*, booklet no **769**, 1-24.
- SCHUTTER, M., SANDENO, J. M., & DICK, R. P. (2001). Seasonal, soil type, alternative management influences on microbial communities of vegetable cropping systems. *Biology and Fertility of Soils* **34**, 397-410.
- SCHWELM, A., FOGELQVIST, J., KNAUST, A., JÜLKE, S., LIJA, T., BONILLA-ROSSO, G., KARLSSON, M., SHEVCHENKO, A., DHANDAPANI, V., CHOI, S. R., KIM, H. G., PARK, J. Y., LIM, Y. P., LUDWIG-MÜLLER, J & DIXELIUS, C. (2015). The *Plasmodiophora brassicae* genome reveals insights in its life cycle and ancestry of chitin synthases. *Nature Scientific Reports* Srep **5**, no 11153, 1-12. <http://www.nature.com/scientificreports> . (url checked 26 July 2016).
- SHI, K., WANG, L., ZHOU, Y-H., YU, Y-L. & YU, J-Q. (2009). Effects of calcium cyanamide on soil microbial communities and *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *cucumnerinum*. *Chemosphere* **75**, 872-877.
- SIELING, K. & KAGE, H. (2010). Efficient N management using winter oilseed rape: A review. *Agronomy and Sustainable Development*. **30**, 271-279.
- SMITH, A. M. (1961). Calcium cyanamide. *Manures and Fertilisers* pages 115-117. London: Thomas Nelson & Sons Ltd.
- SMIL, V. (2004). *Enriching the Earth: Fritz Harber, Carl Bosch, and the transformation of world food production*. Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) Press, Cambridge Massachusetts.
- SOLOMON, S., QIN, D., MANNING, M., MARQUIS, M., AVERY, T. K., TIGNOR, M. M. B., MILLER, Jr H. L. & CHEN, Z. (2007). *The physical science basis: contributions of Working Group 1 to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- STEWART, K. (2007). *Clubroot control in Brassicas using novel and sustainable methods*. PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh.

- STRANSKY, H. & AMBERGER, A. (1973). Isolation and properties of a cyanamide hydratase (EC 4.2.1) from *Myrothecium verrucaria*. *Zeitschrift Pflanzenphysiologie* **70**, 174-187.
- STRELKOV, S. E. & DIXON, G. R. (2014). Clubroot (*Plasmodiophora brassicae*) on canola and other brassica species – disease development, epidemiology and management. *Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology* **36** (S1), 1-4.
- STURKIE, D. G. (1937). Control of weeds in lawns with calcium cyanamide. *Journal American Society of Agronomy*, **29**, 802-807.
- TAKAHASHI, H., ISHIKAWA, T., KAIIDO, M., TAKITA, K., HAYAKAWA, T., OKAZAKI, K., ITOH, K., MITSUI, T. & HORI, H. (2006). *Plasmodiophora brassicae*-induced cell death and medium alkalisation in clubroot-resistant cultured roots of *Brassica rapa*. *Journal of Phytopathology* **154**, 156-162.
- TAKAHASHI, H., TAKITA, K., KISHIMOTO, T., MITSUI, T. & HORI, H. (2002). Ca<sup>2+</sup> is required by clubroot resistant turnip cells for transient increases in PAL activity that follows inoculation with *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Journal of Phytopathology* **150**, 529-535.
- TEWARI, K., SUGANUMA, T., FUJIKAKE, H., OHTAKE, N., SUEYOSHI, K., TAKAHASHI, Y. & OHYAMA, T. (2004). Effect of deep placement of N fertilisers and different inoculation methods on bradyrhizobia on growth, N-fixation activity and N-absorption rate of field-grown soybean plants. *Journal of Agronomy and Crop Science* **190**, 46-58.
- THORMAN, R. E., WILLIAMS, J. R., MUSSELBROOK, T. H., ROLLETT, A. J., BOWDEN, A., DHROSBREE, A. & CHAMBERS, B. J. (2014). Nitrification inhibitor and nitrogen fertiliser application timing strategies to reduce nitrous oxide emissions from winter wheat land. *The Proceedings of the 18th Nitrogen Workshop – The nitrogen challenge: building a blueprint for nitrogen use and efficiency and food supply*, Lisbon, Portugal 30th June to 3rd July 2014, ppages 521-523. pdf available from CAB Abstracts, Wallingford, Oxon.
- TIAN, Y., ZHANG, X., LIU, J., CHEN, Q. & GAO, L. (2009). Microbial properties of rhizosphere soils as affected by rotation, grafting and soil sterilisation in intensive vegetable production. *Scientia Horticulturae* **123**, 139-147.
- TOLLEFSON, J. (2010). Intensive farming may ease climate change. *Nature (London)* **465**, 853.
- TOORSVIK, V., GOKSOYR, J. & DANE, F. D. (1990). High diversity in DNA of soil bacteria. *Applied Environmental Microbiology* **56**, 782-787.
- TOURNA, M., STEIGLMEIER, M., SPRANG, A., KÖNNEKE, M., SCHINTIMEISTER, A., ULRICH, T., ENGEL, M., SCHLOTER, M., WAGNER, M., RICHTER, A. & SCHLEPER, C. (2011). *Nitrososphaera viennensis*, an ammonia oxidising archaeon from soil. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences (PNAS)* **108**, 8420-8425
- TREMBLAY, N., BELEC, C., COULOMBE, J. & GODIN, C. (2005). Evaluation of calcium cyanamide and liming for control of clubroot disease in cauliflower. *Crop Protection* **24**, 798-803.
- VALLAD, G. E. & GOODMAN, R. M. (2004). Systemic acquired resistance and induced systemic resistance in conventional agriculture. *Crop Science* **44**, 1920-1934.
- VERONA, O. (1970). The effect of calcium cyanamide on some groups of lower fungi [Der Einfluss des Kalkstickstoffs auf einige Gruppen von niederen Pilzen]. *Landwirtschaftliche Forschung* **23**, 36-50.

- 1101 VILSMEIER, K. & AMBERGER, A. (1978). Model experiments concerning the breakdown of  
1102 powdered and granulated calcium cyanamide fertilisers. *Journal of Agronomy and Crop*  
1103 *Science* **147**, 68-77.
- 1104 WALKER, J. C. & LARSON, R. H. (1935). Calcium cyanamide in relation to control of clubroot  
1105 of cabbage. *Journal of Agricultural Research* **51**, 183-189.
- 1106 WALL, D. H., NIELSEN, U. N. & SIX, J. (2015). Soil biodiversity and human health. *Nature*  
1107 *(London)* **528**, 69-76.
- 1108 WALTERS, D. R., RATSEP, J. & HAVIS, N. D. (2013). Controlling crop diseases using induced  
1109 resistance: challenges for the future. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **64**, 1263-1280.
- 1110 WANG, J-F. & HSIEH, W-H. (1986). Studies of suppressive factors and characteristics of  
1111 suppressive soils of clubroot in crucifers. *Plant Protection Bulletin (Taiwan ROC)* **28**,  
1112 363-370.
- 1113 WEBSTER, M. A. (1986). *pH and nutritional effects on infection by Plasmodiophora*  
1114 *brassicae* Wor. and clubroot symptoms. Ph. D. thesis, University of Aberdeen;
- 1115 WEBSTER M. A. & DIXON, G. R. (1991a). Calcium, pH and inoculum concentration  
1116 influencing colonisation by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Mycological Research* . **95**, 64-  
1117 73.
- 1118 WEBSTER, M. A. & DIXON, G. R. (1991 b). Boron, pH and inoculum concentration  
1119 influencing colonisation by *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Mycological Research* **95**, 74-  
1120 79.
- 1121 WILLIAMSON, C. J. & DYCE, P. E. (1989). The effect of calcium cyanamide on the reaction of  
1122 swede cultivars to populations of *Plasmodiophora brassicae*. *Plant Pathology* **38**, 230-  
1123 238.
- 1124 WISSUWA, M., MAZZOLA, M. & PICARD, C. (2009). Novel approaches in plant breeding for  
1125 rhizosphere-related traits. *Plant and Soil* **321**, 409-430.
- 1126 WOLFE, A. & WOLFE, G (1930). Ueber den Einfluss des Kalkstickstoffs auf die Mikroflora  
1127 des Bödens. *Centblatt Bakteriologie*. (II). **81**, 221-230.
- 1128 WOOD, M. (1998). *Cah* marker gene aids plant transformations. *Agricultural Research* July  
1129 issue, 12-13. Swindon: Biotechnology and Biological Research Council.
- 1130 WORONIN, M. S. (1878) *Plasmodiophora brassicae*—the cause of cabbage hernia, published in  
1131 *Jarbücher für Wissenschaftliche Botanik* vol 11 (in German) translated by C. Chupp,  
1132 published as *Phytopathological Classics no 4*. St Paul, Minnesota USA: American  
1133 Phytopathological Society (see page 28).
- 1134 YAMAMOTO, A., AKIYAMA, H., Naokawa, T. & YAGI, K. (2012). Effect of lime-nitrogen  
1135 application on N<sub>2</sub>O emission from an andosol vegetable field. *Soil Science and Plant*  
1136 *Nutrition*, **58**, 245-254.
- 1137 YAMAMOTO, A., AKIYAMA, H., NAOKAWA, T. & YAGI, K. (2013). Lime-nitrogen application  
1138 reduces N<sub>2</sub>O emission from a vegetable field with imperfectly-drained sandy clay-loam  
1139 soil. *Soil Science and Plant Nutrition* **59**, 442-449.
- 1140 YANO, S., TANAKA, S., KAMEYA-IWAKI, M. & KATUMOTO, K. (1991). Relation of Ca<sup>2+</sup>  
1141 efflux to germination of resting spores of clubroot fungus. *Bulletin of the Faculty of*  
1142 *Agriculture, Yamaguchi University* **39**, 105-112.



1143 YAO, H., HE, Z., WILSON, M. J., & CAMPBELL, C. D. (2000). Microbial biomass and  
 1144 community structure in a sequence of soils with increasing fertility and changing land  
 1145 use. *Microbial Ecology* **40**, 223-237.

1146 ZHAO, Y. X-X., CHENG, Y. T. & WEI, J. W. (2015). Biocontrol effect of *Trichoderma*  
 1147 *harzianum* T4 on brassica clubroot and analysis of rhizosphere microbial communities  
 1148 based on T-RFLP. *Biocontrol Science and Technology* **25**, 1493-1505.

1149 ZHU, B. L., MA, J. W., YE, X. Z., & XIA, Z. M. (2001). Effects of lime-nitrogen on soil  
 1150 amelioration and vegetable production (Chinese). *Journal of Zhejiang University* **27**,  
 1151 339-342.  
 1152