

Delving deeper: metabolic processes in the metalimnion of stratified lakes

Article

Accepted Version

Giling, D. P., Staehr, P. A., Grossart, H. P., Andersen, M. R., Boehrer, B., Escot, C., Evrendilek, F., Gómez-Gener, L., Honti, M., Jones, I. D., Karakaya, N., Laas, A., Moreno-Ostos, E., Rinke, K., Scharfenberger, U., Schmidt, S. R., Weber, M., Woolway, R. I. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0498-7968>, Zwart, J. A. and Obrador, B. (2017) Delving deeper: metabolic processes in the metalimnion of stratified lakes. *Limnology and Oceanography*, 62 (3). pp. 1288-1306. ISSN 0024-3590 doi: 10.1002/lno.10504 Available at <https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/70399/>

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See [Guidance on citing](#).

Published version at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/lno.10504>

To link to this article DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/lno.10504>

Publisher: Wiley

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the [End User Agreement](#).

www.reading.ac.uk/centaur

CentAUR

Central Archive at the University of Reading

Reading's research outputs online

1 **Delving deeper: Metabolic processes in the metalimnion of stratified lakes**

2 Darren P. Giling^{1,*}, Peter A. Staehr², Hans Peter Grossart^{1,3}, Mikkel René Andersen⁴, Bertram
3 Boehrer⁵, Carmelo Escot⁶, Fatih Evrendilek⁷, Lluís Gómez-Gener⁸, Mark Honti⁹, Ian D
4 Jones¹⁰, Nusret Karakaya⁷, Alo Laas¹¹, Enrique Moreno-Ostos¹², Karsten Rinke⁵, Ulrike
5 Scharfenberger^{13,14}, Silke R. Schmidt^{13,15}, Michael Weber⁵, R. Iestyn Woolway¹⁶, Jacob A.
6 Zwart¹⁷, Biel Obrador⁸

7

8 ¹ Department of Experimental Limnology, Leibniz-Institute of Freshwater Ecology and
9 Inland Fisheries (IGB), Alte Fischerhütte 2, 16775 Stechlin, Germany

10 ² Aarhus University, Department of Bioscience, Frederiksborgvej 399, Box 358, 4000
11 Roskilde, Denmark

12 ³ Institute of Biochemistry and Biology, Potsdam University, Maulbeerallee 2, 14469
13 Potsdam, Germany

14 ⁴ Freshwater Biological Laboratory, Faculty of Science, University of Copenhagen,
15 Universitetsparken 4, 2100 Copenhagen, Denmark

16 ⁵ Helmholtz-Centre for Environmental Research, Department of Lake Research,
17 Brueckstrasse 3a, 39114 Magdeburg, Germany.

18 ⁶ Empresa Metropolitana de Abastecimiento y Saneamiento de Aguas de Sevilla, S.A.
19 EMASESA. C/ Escuelas Pías 1. 41003. Sevilla, Spain

20 ⁷ Department of Environmental Engineering, Abant Izzet Baysal University, 14280 Bolu,
21 Turkey

22 ⁸ Department of Ecology, University of Barcelona, Diagonal 643, 08028 Barcelona, Spain

23 ⁹ MTA-BME Water Research Group, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, 1111
24 Budapest, Hungary

25 ¹⁰ Lake Ecosystems Group, Centre for Ecology & Hydrology, Lancaster Environment Centre,
26 Library Avenue, Bailrigg, Lancaster, LA1 4AP, UK

27 ¹¹ Estonian University of Life Sciences, Centre for Limnology, Kreutzwaldi 5, Tartu, Estonia

28 ¹² Department of Ecology, Marine Ecology and Limnology Research Group, University of
29 Málaga, Campus Universitario de Teatinos S/N. 29071 Málaga, Spain.

30 ¹³ Leibniz-Institute of Freshwater Ecology and Inland Fisheries (IGB), Department of
31 Ecosystem Research, Müggelseedamm 301, 12587 Berlin, Germany

32 ¹⁴ Freie Universität Berlin, Department of Biology, Chemistry and Pharmacy, Takustraße 3,
33 14195 Berlin, Germany

34 ¹⁵ University of Potsdam, Institute of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Karl-Liebknecht-
35 Str. 24-25, 14476 Potsdam, Germany

36 ¹⁶ Department of Meteorology, University of Reading, Reading, RG6 6BB, UK.

37 ¹⁷ Department of Biological Sciences, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, Indiana,
38 46556 USA

39

40 * Corresponding author. Present address: German Centre for Integrative Biodiversity
41 Research (iDiv) Halle-Jena-Leipzig, Deutscher Platz 5e, 04103 Leipzig, Germany, and
42 Institute of Biology, Leipzig University, Johannisallee 21, 04103 Leipzig, Germany
43 Phone: +49 34197 33122, E-mail: darren.giling@idiv.de

44

45 **Running title:** Metabolism in stratified lakes

46 **Key-words:** lake metabolism, gross primary production, ecosystem respiration, ecosystem
47 processes, ecosystem function, organic matter, lake monitoring, high-frequency, buoy data

48

49 **Authorship statement:** PAS, BO, DPG, JAZ, LGG, IDJ, RIW, MRA, MH, US, AL & HPG
50 contributed to the conception of the study; PAS, BO, DPG, NK, FE, JAZ, KR, MW, BB, EM-
51 O, CE, US & SRS acquired the data; DPG analyzed the data and wrote the first draft; all
52 contributed substantially to revisions of and approved the final manuscript.

53 **Abstract**

54 Many lakes exhibit seasonal stratification with strong thermal and chemical gradients. An
55 expansion of depth-integrated monitoring programs has provided insight into the importance
56 of organic carbon processing that occurs below the upper mixed layer. However, the chemical
57 and physical drivers of metabolism and metabolic coupling in the metalimnion remain
58 unresolved. Sharp gradients in key resources such as light and temperature co-occur in the
59 metalimnion with dynamic physical conditions that influence metabolic processes directly and
60 simultaneously hamper the accurate tracing of biological activity. We evaluated the drivers of
61 metalimnetic metabolism and its associated uncertainty across ten stratified lakes in Europe
62 and North America. We hypothesized that the metalimnion would contribute highly to whole-
63 lake functioning in clear oligotrophic lakes, and that rates would be highly variable in
64 unstable polymictic lakes. Depth-integrated rates of gross primary production (GPP) and
65 ecosystem respiration (ER) were modelled from diel dissolved oxygen curves using a
66 Bayesian approach. Metabolic estimates were more uncertain below the epilimnion, but
67 uncertainty was not consistently related to lake morphology or mixing regime. Metalimnetic
68 rates exhibited high day-to-day variability in all trophic states, with metalimnetic contribution
69 to daily whole-lake GPP and ER ranging from 0 to 87% and <1 to 92%, respectively.
70 Nonetheless, the metalimnion of oligotrophic lakes contributed highly to whole-lake
71 metabolism, driven by a collinear combination of light, phosphorous concentration and
72 metalimnetic volume. Further, higher background respiration was observed in the
73 metalimnion of eutrophic lakes. We show that a single-sensor approach does not necessarily
74 reflect whole-ecosystem carbon dynamics in stratified lakes.

75

76 **Introduction**

77 Globally, many lakes exhibit thermal stratification for a substantial portion of the year,
78 developing marked vertical gradients in physical and chemical properties (Boehrer and
79 Schultze 2008). These gradients influence biological communities and biogeochemical
80 processes such organic and inorganic matter cycling (Coloso et al. 2008; Van de Bogert et al.
81 2012), altering energy flow through lake food webs (Wilkinson et al. 2014). Consequently,
82 patterns of stratification affect the important contribution that inland waters make to global
83 carbon fluxes (Cole et al. 2007; Coloso et al. 2008; Staehr et al. 2012b). Vertical patterns of
84 ecosystem metabolism vary among chemically and morphologically diverse lakes (Obrador et
85 al. 2014), but information on the drivers of metabolism in the metalimnion is currently
86 limited. However, a recent expansion of high-frequency and depth-integrated monitoring of
87 lakes provides an opportunity to extend our understanding of lake metabolism below the
88 upper mixed layer (epilimnion) (Meinson et al. 2015; Obrador et al. 2014; Staehr et al. 2010).

89 Light availability is a key driver of gross primary production (GPP) below the upper
90 mixed layer (Obrador et al. 2014; Sadro et al. 2011a; Staehr et al. 2012b). Light availability in
91 the metalimnion is determined by two physical factors; the thickness of the epilimnion (Z_{mix})
92 and light attenuation through the water column (K_D). These characteristics vary distinctly
93 among lakes with different chemical characteristics, potentially exerting strong control on
94 metalimnetic processes. Nutrient availability in surface waters controls phytoplankton
95 biomass, so that trophic state and light availability at depth are correlated. Planktonic
96 communities below the epilimnion in eutrophic lakes may be shaded by high plankton
97 densities in upper layers, while stratification reinforces nutrient limitation and relative clarity
98 of surface waters of oligotrophic lakes (Obrador et al. 2014). Nutrient availability may
99 additionally induce induces physiological responses in phytoplankton (e.g. cell size and
100 stoichiometry) that affect their activity rates (Finkel et al. 2010). The chemical influences on
101 GPP propagate to other ecosystem functions. Metabolic coupling between GPP and

102 ecosystem respiration (ER) is pronounced under oligotrophic conditions where heterotrophs
103 are substrate-limited and depend on labile photosynthetic exudates (Sadro et al. 2014; Sadro
104 et al. 2011b; Solomon et al. 2013).

105 In addition to distinct variation among lakes, day-to-day variation in ecosystem
106 metabolism within lakes is substantial (Solomon et al. 2013). The variability differs in
107 magnitude among lakes, and may be related to physical processes determined by lake
108 morphology and mixing regime (Solomon et al. 2013). Periods of stable stratification may
109 facilitate the development of metalimnetic algal communities (Pannard et al. 2015), while
110 unstable and short-term stratification patterns could alter nutrients and OM fluxes, affecting
111 temporal and spatial patterns of metabolic activity. However, attributing biological activity at
112 a specific place and time to physical processes in the metalimnion poses a considerable
113 challenge (Coloso et al. 2011; Staehr et al. 2012a). Biological signals on diel timescales are
114 dampened in the metalimnion, which is a zone characterized by sharp vertical gradients in
115 physical conditions. Therefore, hydrologic processes caused by external forcing (e.g. internal
116 waves and advection; Boegman et al. 2003; Sadro et al. 2011a) need only be minor to
117 contribute substantial noise to diel patterns. Such physical processes alter the spatiotemporal
118 footprint of sensors used to measure the free-water dissolved oxygen (DO) concentrations that
119 are used to estimate metabolic rates (Odum 1956). Thus, physical processes in the
120 metalimnion may simultaneously influence on metabolic processes biologically and affect our
121 ability to accurately trace them with high-frequency measurements.

122 Understanding the chemical and physical drivers of metalimnetic metabolism and its
123 uncertainty among a diverse lake ecosystems would allow for a more accurate classification
124 of stratified lakes as carbon sources or sinks at the ecosystem scale. We investigated vertical
125 patterns of lake metabolism, photosynthetic light-use efficiency, and the coupling relationship
126 between ER and GPP using high-frequency and depth-specific data from ten lakes and
127 reservoirs that ranged in nutrient concentration and thermal stratification patterns. We used a

128 modelling technique that accounted for uncertainty in the estimation of metabolic parameters
129 (following e.g. Batt and Carpenter 2012; Cremona et al. 2014b; Grace et al. 2015; Hanson et
130 al. 2008). This approach offers several advantages; overcoming sources of error present in
131 earlier ‘book keeping’ methods (McNair et al. 2013), and allowing for the quantification of
132 variation in diel DO that is not explained by the model. We assumed that unexplained
133 variation in diel DO was predominantly attributable to process errors caused by lateral
134 movements of water that are not incorporated in the depth-integrated framework.

135 We hypothesized that light availability, as described by the ratio of the mixing depth
136 (Z_{mix}) to the photic depth (Z_{eu} ; determined by K_D) (i.e. $Z_{\text{mix}} : Z_{\text{eu}}$), would control biological
137 processes in the metalimnion (Obrador et al. 2014; Sadro et al. 2011a; Staehr et al. 2012b).
138 The relative contribution of the metalimnion to whole-lake metabolism was expected to be
139 greatest in clear, oligotrophic lakes (i.e. low $Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$). We sought to identify the conditions
140 where depth-integrated estimates are useful to accurately estimate whole-lake NEP. It was
141 expected that polymictic lakes with a more dynamic thermal structure would exhibit higher
142 temporal variation explained by physical processes. Finally we utilized the depth specific
143 metabolic estimates to investigate vertical patterns in the coupling between GPP and ER. Here
144 we expected a tighter relation in the photic zone, especially in oligotrophic lakes, and ER to
145 be more reliant on recalcitrant OM under low light conditions (Solomon et al. 2013; Obrador
146 et al. 2014).

147

148 **Methods**

149 *Study sites*

150 We modelled open-water lake metabolism from high-frequency, depth-specific measurements
151 of DO and water temperature (T) in ten lakes and reservoirs across Europe and North
152 America. The dataset included monomictic, dimictic, and polymictic lakes with a range of
153 morphological characteristics and chemical composition (Table 2). Concentration of nutrients,

154 dissolved organic carbon (DOC) and chlorophyll *a* (chl *a*) were determined from samples
155 taken on 1-11 days at each lake during the stratified period (see Supplemental Text 1 for
156 sampling and analytical methods). In addition, Chl-*a* concentration was estimated from high-
157 frequency *in-situ* measurement using a fluorometer at some sites. Data from each lake
158 represented a single year, for a period ranging from several weeks to many months. Only days
159 when the water-column was thermally stratified (as described below) were included in
160 analyses (17 to 69 days per lake).

161 The profiling systems or sensor chains recorded high-frequency measurements (10-60
162 min intervals) at 3 to 35 layers in each lake, with at least one measurement point in each depth
163 zone (i.e. epi-, meta- and hypolimnion; Fig. 1; Table S1). We assumed that each measurement
164 represented a horizontal layer of water centred on the measurement depth and having a
165 thickness equal to the vertical resolution of measurements. Therefore, the deepest point of the
166 profile was the depth of the deepest measurement plus half the vertical resolution of that
167 layer. Meteorological data including photosynthetically active radiation (PAR), wind speed
168 and barometric pressure were recorded at the same frequency as sub-surface measurements.
169 Radiation measurements recorded as irradiance (E ; $W\ m^{-2}$) were converted to photon flux in
170 the 400-700 nm range (PAR; $\mu mol\ m^{-2}\ s^{-1}$) as follows (Kirk 1994; McCree 1981):

$$171 \quad PAR = E \times 4.6 \times 0.45. \quad (1)$$

172

173 *Vertical stratification and underwater light regime*

174 High vertical resolution (0.1 m) temperature profiles were modelled from available T data to
175 determine if a lake was stratified on a given day and to delineate the metalimnion. T at each
176 depth z was modelled as (Rimmer et al. 2005):

$$177 \quad T(z) = T_h + (T_e - T_h) \left(\frac{1}{1 + (\alpha \times z)^n} \right)^{1 - \left(\frac{1}{n} \right)}, \quad (2)$$

178 where T_e and T_h are the maximum temperature in the epilimnion and hypolimnion,
179 respectively, and α and n are model-estimated constants. Temperature curves were fitted in a
180 Bayesian framework with JAGS (Plummer 2003) using normally distributed, maximum-
181 entropy priors. The metalimnion extent (i.e. Z_{mix} to the top of the hypolimnion) was defined
182 using water density (ρ), calculated as:

$$183 \quad \rho = 1 - 6.63 \times 10^{-6}(T - 4)^2. \quad (3)$$

184 The gradient in density between adjacent points that defined Z_{mix} was selected by visual
185 inspection (Fig. S1) for each lake individually, and ranged between 0.03 and 0.18 kg m⁻³ m⁻¹
186 (Read et al. 2011). The bottom of the metalimnion was similarly the deepest point with that
187 density gradient. The sensitivity of metalimnetic volume and depth-zone specific metabolic
188 rates to this gradient was examined at a subset of sites (Lake Ontario, Vedsted and Müggel;
189 see Supplemental Text 2 and Table S2). The thermocline was defined between the points with
190 the greatest density gradient (Read et al. 2011). Mean daily Z_{mix} and the bottom of the
191 metalimnion were calculated as the mean values from all profiles on each day, and each layer
192 was assigned to one depth zone (i.e. epi-, meta- or hypolimnion) for each day.

193 Water-column light attenuation (K_D) at each site was calculated from either
194 measurements of underwater PAR at multiple depths, Secchi depth or other existing site-
195 specific relationships (Table S1). Estimates of K_D were made from daily to biweekly intervals
196 and were linearly interpolated between measurement days when necessary. Where underwater
197 PAR measurements were available, K_D was estimated as the slope of the linear regression
198 between $\log(\text{PAR})$ and depth z . A mean daily K_D was calculated from the K_D of each profile
199 during daylight ($\text{PAR}_0 > 5 \mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$) that had a linear regression fit with $r^2 > 0.80$
200 (Obrador et al. 2014; Staehr et al. 2012b). Where Secchi depth was available, K_D was
201 calculated as $1.7/\text{Secchi depth}$ (Poole and Atkins 1929). The mean daily photic depth (Z_{eu})
202 was calculated as $4.6/K_D$. Following the determination of daily K_D at each site, PAR for each

203 time interval and depth z (PAR_z) was calculated from incident PAR (PAR_0) using the Beer-
204 Lambert law:

$$205 \quad PAR_z = PAR_0 \times e^{-K_D \times z}. \quad (4)$$

206

207 *Model of depth-dependent metabolism*

208 Gaps in the data series of up to 1 h were linearly interpolated before we applied a 4-h simple
209 moving average smoothing to DO, PAR and wind speed measurements (following Giling et
210 al. 2016; Obrador et al. 2014). To estimate mean rates of ecosystem metabolism at a daily
211 scale, we used a Bayesian model with non-linear sub-models for GPP and ER (Giling et al.
212 2016). Changes in DO concentration between successive measurement times t for each depth
213 were partitioned into the contribution by biotic and physical processes using a depth-specific
214 diel oxygen model (Staeher et al. 2012b):

$$215 \quad DO(t + 1) = DO(t) + NEP(t) - D_s(t) - D_v(t) + D_z(t); \quad (5)$$

216 where NEP is the rate of net ecosystem production ($\text{mg O}_2 \text{ L}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$), D_s is air-water exchange,
217 D_v is diffusive vertical exchange between adjacent depths and D_z is metalimnetic exchange
218 due to mixed-layer deepening. Atmospheric exchange (D_s) was applied only to layers in the
219 epilimnion, and calculated as:

$$220 \quad D_s(t) = K_s(t) \frac{DO_{mod}(t) - DO_{sat}(t)}{Z_{mix}(t)}. \quad (6)$$

221 The gas transfer velocity (K_s) was calculated at a Schmidt number of 600 (K_{600}) from wind
222 speed standardized to 10 m height (U_{10}) according to Cole and Caraco (1998). In Equation 6,
223 DO_{mod} is the modelled DO concentration following Song et al. (2016) and DO_{sat} is DO
224 concentration at atmospheric equilibrium (calculated from temperature and barometric
225 pressure). Vertical exchange between each depth and the adjacent depths due to turbulent
226 diffusivity (D_v) was estimated using the Brunt-Väisälä buoyancy frequency ($N^2 [\text{s}^{-2}]$, a
227 measure of local stability; Bohrer and Schultze 2010) to calculate the vertical eddy

228 diffusivity coefficient (K_v) according to Hondzo and Stefan (1993). Lake Ontario was an
 229 exception due to its surface area exceeding the applicable range of the Hondzo and Stefan
 230 (1993) model. The metalimnetic K_v for Ontario was set as $6 \times 10^{-6} \text{ m}^2 \text{ s}^{-1}$ based on
 231 measurements and theoretical work from Lakes Ontario and Erie (Bouffard et al. 2014;
 232 Sweers 1970). Epilimnetic and hypolimnetic K_v were expected to be higher than the
 233 metalimnetic estimate, so were set at Lake Ontario using a factor determined from the average
 234 relative difference between depth zones in the other nine lakes. The influence of K_v on
 235 metabolic rates at Ontario and two other lakes (Vedsted and Müggel) was assessed with a
 236 sensitivity analysis (for details see Supplemental Text 2 and Table S2). The flux D_z was
 237 calculated as proportional to the Z_{mix} deepening rate ($\Delta Z_{\text{mix}}/\Delta t$) and was applied to
 238 measurement points within the metalimnion and 1 m above or below (Obrador et al. 2014). At
 239 some sites, we set a threshold limiting the deepening rate to a maximum of 5 m h^{-1} to prevent
 240 short-term surface-water microstratification inaccurately affecting D_z in the metalimnion. For
 241 a full description of the model, see Staehr et al. (2012b).

242 Sub-models for the production and respiration components of *NEP* in Equation 5 were
 243 parameterized according to Grace et al. (2015). At each depth, GPP was modelled as a
 244 saturating function of PAR_z , while respiration was non-linearly dependent on T for each
 245 timestep t :

$$246 \quad \text{NEP}(t) = A \times \text{PAR}(t)^p - R_{\bar{T}}(\theta^{(T(t)-\bar{T})}); \quad (7)$$

247 where the first component describes GPP ($\text{mg O}_2 \text{ L}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$), and A is a constant indicating
 248 production per unit light (i.e. photosynthetic efficiency), PAR is the depth-specific PAR
 249 (PAR_z), and p is an estimated exponent that represents the ability of producers to use light and
 250 accounts for saturating photosynthesis (when $p < 1$). The second component indicates DO
 251 consumption by ER ($\text{mg O}_2 \text{ L}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$); $R_{\bar{T}}$ is the respiration rate at \bar{T} , θ describes the
 252 temperature dependence of respiration (set to 1.072, corresponding to Q_{10} of 2; Wilcock et al.
 253 1998), T is the water temperature at each timestep and \bar{T} is the mean daily temperature in that

254 layer. Respiration was estimated at \bar{T} and not standardized because we were interested in
 255 vertical patterns among the lakes at *in situ* conditions. Modelled rates were standardized to a
 256 temperature of 20°C (GPP₂₀ and ER₂₀; for results see Fig. S2) only for analysis of coupling of
 257 ER₂₀ to GPP₂₀ (Holtgrieve et al. 2010; Solomon et al. 2013). We estimated the parameters A ,
 258 p and $R_{\bar{T}}$ in Equation 7 for each depth with a Bayesian approach in JAGS (Plummer 2003)
 259 using R code (R Development Core Team 2014) modified from Grace *et al.* (2015) following
 260 the rationale of Song et al. (2016). Prior distributions for the estimated parameters were
 261 uniformly distributed within known physical constraints as described by Grace *et al.* (2015).
 262 Mean daily metabolic estimates (and their propagated uncertainty) for each depth layer were
 263 calculated from estimated parameters as:

$$264 \quad GPP = \sum_{t=1}^{measurements} A \times PAR(t)^p \quad (8)$$

$$265 \quad ER = 86400 \times \frac{R_{\bar{T}}}{\Delta t} \quad (9)$$

266 where GPP is daily gross primary production (mg O₂ L⁻¹ d⁻¹), ER is daily ecosystem
 267 respiration at daily average temperature (mg O₂ L⁻¹ d⁻¹) and 86400 converts from seconds to
 268 days. Convergence and stationarity of Markov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) values were
 269 assessed with the Gelman-Rubin convergence statistic \hat{R} (Brooks and Gelman 1997). Models
 270 with $\hat{R} > 1.1$ (indicating unconverged chains) as well as poor fitting models ($r^2 < 0.40$) were
 271 excluded from further analyses. Excluding poor fitting models did not substantially alter
 272 vertical patterns of ecosystem metabolism or their uncertainty (Fig. S3). Example model fits
 273 for each lake are available in the supplementary material (Figs S7-S16) and example code for
 274 estimating depth-integrated metabolic rates is available online (github.com/dgiling).

275

276 *Aggregating layer-specific metabolic rates*

277 Mean daily rates in each depth zone (i.e. epi-, meta- and hypolimnion) were calculated by
 278 aggregating the appropriate daily estimates layer from each layer i . The standard deviation of

279 the aggregated depth zone rate (σ_{zone}) was propagated from the modelled uncertainties in
280 layer i as follows:

$$281 \quad \sigma_{zone} = \sqrt{\sum_i^n \sigma_i^2}, \quad (10)$$

282 where i to n are the layers belonging to that depth zone. The aggregated depth-zone estimates
283 were used for further analysis of metabolic rates. Due to high day-to-day variability, only
284 days when there was at least one adequate metabolic model fit (i.e. $\hat{R} < 1.1$ and $r^2 > 0.40$)
285 from layers in each depth zone (epi-, meta- and hypolimnion when present) were considered
286 to calculate the relative contribution of the metalimnion to whole-lake metabolism (total of
287 178 days; Table 2).

288

289 *Whole-lake metabolism estimates*

290 Whole-lake volume-weighted estimates (WLVW; Sadro et al. 2011a) were calculated by
291 multiplying the daily depth-zone volumetric rates ($\text{g O}_2 \text{ m}^{-3} \text{ d}^{-1}$) by the total volume (m^3) of
292 each depth zone before summing the three zones. Metalimnetic volume was calculated using
293 surface areas from hypsographic data and mean daily thickness from high-resolution
294 temperature profiles. Whole-lake areal estimates were then obtained by dividing the WLVW
295 estimate by the lake surface area (m^2). Hypolimnetic volume and thus metabolic contribution
296 will be underestimated in the small number of lakes that were considerably deeper than the
297 available profile measurements (e.g. Lake Ontario; Table 2). The proportional contribution of
298 the metalimnion to whole-lake metabolism was calculated as the metalimnetic volumetric rate
299 divided by the WLVW estimate (termed ‘Prop_{metab}’). We also assessed whether the
300 metalimnion disproportionately contributed metabolic activity for its size (volume) for each
301 day in each lake. We did this by calculating the ratio between the proportion of WLVW
302 metabolism attributable to the metalimnetic (Prop_{metab}) and the metalimnetic contribution to

303 whole-lake volume (termed 'Prop_{vol}'). Thus, the metalimnion contributed more to the whole
304 lake metabolically than it did volumetrically when the ratio Prop_{metab}:Prop_{vol} was >1.

305 We assessed how the traditional metabolism estimates based on single sensors in the
306 epilimnion compared to depth-integrated estimates. 'Single-sensor estimates' were calculated
307 by taking the sensor placed at 1 m depth, the most widespread DO sensor deployment depth
308 (Solomon et al. 2013), and calculating whole-lake areal metabolism as above assuming that
309 this rate was constant over depth. The shallowest available probe was used when no sensor
310 was available at 1 m depth.

311 The 'background respiration' of OM not recently fixed can be inferred from the
312 intercept of the relationship between daily ER₂₀ and daily GPP₂₀, i.e. ER₂₀ when GPP₂₀ = 0
313 (del Giorgio and Williams 2005; Solomon et al. 2013). The slope of the relationship between
314 daily ER₂₀ and GPP₂₀ describes the metabolic coupling, where a slope of 1 indicates a unit
315 increase in ER₂₀ for each unit increase in GPP₂₀. The coefficient of determination (r^2)
316 indicates the strength of the coupling (Obrador et al. 2014). We used estimates from layers
317 where there were >5 days with successful fits to estimate coupling regression parameters.
318 Models were excluded where the layer was nearly always dark (so that GPP₂₀ was zero or
319 mean < 0.01 mg O₂ L⁻¹ d⁻¹) because the slope was either vertical (and therefore undefined) or
320 highly outlying (20-40 times the mean slope) and not conceptually meaningful. Coupling
321 estimates for depth zone were calculated as the mean of all intercept and slope estimates from
322 layers belonging to that depth zone.

323

324 *Statistical analyses*

325 Comparisons among depth zones, correlations with ancillary variables, and ER₂₀-GPP₂₀
326 regressions were analyzed by fitting linear models or linear mixed models (LMMs) in R (R
327 Development Core Team 2014). The LMMs included a random effect for site and layer and
328 AR1 autocorrelation structure (nested within site) to account for repeated daily measurements

329 where appropriate. We compared a range of autocorrelation structures (including AR2 and
330 AR3) with Akaike Information Criterion (AIC) values and found AR1 provided equivalent or
331 better support for the models. Reported r^2 values refer to the variation explained by the fixed
332 effects only. Variables were log-transformed when necessary. Principal components analysis
333 (PCA) was used to reduce the number of collinear explanatory variables, and the resulting
334 components were used as explanatory variables in LMMs to assess potential drivers of
335 metalimnetic contribution.

336

337 **Results**

338 *Uncertainty in model estimates and contribution of physical processes*

339 The depth-integrated metabolic model provided a better description of diurnal changes in DO
340 in the epilimnion (74% of models converged with adequate fit) than in the metalimnion (43%)
341 or hypolimnion (32%; Fig. 2a). Furthermore, modelled metabolic estimates were on average
342 more precise in the epilimnion (mean coefficient of variation [CV] for GPP and ER estimates
343 = 0.14 and 0.23, respectively) than in the metalimnion (mean GPP and ER CV = 0.25 and
344 0.33, respectively) or hypolimnion (mean GPP and ER CV = 0.35 and 0.51, respectively)
345 (Fig. 2b, c). There was high variability in model fit (R^2) and estimate certainty (CV) among
346 days and depth zones (Fig. 2). In the metalimnion, R^2 was unrelated to water-column stability
347 (assessed with the buoyancy frequency N^2 ; $F_{1,470} = 1.99$, $p = 0.159$; Fig. S4a). Accordingly, N^2
348 in successful models did not differ from N^2 in poor-fitting models (paired t-test, $t = -0.004$, p
349 = 0.997; Fig. S4b). Variation in mean R^2 across all lakes and depth zones was also not
350 explained by measurement frequency ($F_{2,25} = 0.445$, $p = 0.646$), the vertical resolution of
351 measurements ($F_{1,26} = 0.000$, $p = 0.999$), Z_{\max} ($F_{1,26} = 2.11$, $p = 0.159$) or surface area ($F_{1,26} =$
352 0.441 , $p = 0.513$; Fig. S5). CV for GPP and ER was also unaffected or only marginally
353 affected by measurement frequency ($F_{2,24} = 1.71$, $p = 0.202$ and $F_{2,25} = 3.377$, $p = 0.050$) and
354 the vertical resolution of measurements ($F_{1,26} = 0.105$, $p = 0.749$ and $F_{1,26} = 0.167$, $p = 0.898$).

355 The physical fluxes of DO (i.e. D_s , D_v and D_z) contributed a substantial proportion ($32 \pm$
356 24% across all estimates) of the total DO fluxes (i.e. sum of absolute NEP, D_s , D_v and D_z)
357 (Table S3). In the epilimnion, a mean of 45% of DO changes were attributable to the diffusive
358 components, mostly atmospheric exchange (D_s) with a small contribution from D_v and D_z .
359 Transfer due to mixed layer deepening (D_z) contributed strongly to the metalimnion (mean
360 29% attributable to diffusive fluxes), and both D_z and D_v estimates were important in the
361 hypolimnion (mean 16%; Table S3). The average magnitude of physical fluxes was unrelated
362 to mean model R^2 ($F_{1,8} = 1.216$, $p = 0.302$) and CV of GPP and ER estimates among the ten
363 lakes ($F_{1,8} = 3.499$, $p = 0.098$ and $F_{1,8} = 2.727$, $p = 0.173$). Further, we did not detect that the
364 physical processes were not strongly affected by lake morphology. In the metalimnion, log-
365 transformed lake area did not affect the balance between D_z , D_v and NEP with ($F_{1,8} = 1.218$,
366 $p = 0.301$) or without ($F_{1,7} = 1.892$, $p = 0.211$) outlying Lake Ontario (Fig. S5). Sensitivity
367 analysis demonstrated that the value of K_v did not strongly affect metabolic estimates, except
368 for rates in the metalimnion and hypolimnion of polymictic Lake Müggel (Supplemental Text
369 2 and Table S2).

370 Metabolic estimates were characterized by high day-to-day variability in some lakes and
371 layers (Fig. 1). For contiguous days with adequate model fits among the ten lakes, between 8-
372 52%, 0-78% and 11-100% of epi-, meta- and hypolimnetic GPP estimates were within 2
373 standard deviations (SD) of the estimate from the previous day. Similarly, between 13-53%,
374 0-88% and 11-96% of epi-, meta- and hypolimnetic ER estimates were within 2 SD of the
375 previous days' estimate. In the metalimnion, this did not appear to be strongly driven by PAR;
376 the day-to-day shift in PAR_z did not consistently differ between consecutive days that had
377 similar or disparate metabolic estimates. The proportion of days with estimates similar to the
378 previous day was also not related to lake area (Fig. S5). Day-to-day variability in
379 metalimnetic thickness as a proportion of Z_{max} was slightly higher in polymictic (SD in
380 relative thickness = 0.08 ± 0.02 , $n = 4$ lakes) than in mono-/dimictic lakes (SD = 0.04 ± 0.02 ,

381 $n = 6$ lakes, $F_{1,8} = 6.33$, $p = 0.04$). However, metalimnetic local water-column stability did not
382 differ among mixing regimes ($F_{1,8} = 3.26$, $p = 0.109$). The variability daily estimates of GPP
383 and ER in the metalimnion (Table S3) was not related to lake mixing regime ($F_{2,7} = 0.753$, $p =$
384 0.505 and $F_{2,7} = 0.044$, $p = 0.957$) or trophic status ($F_{2,7} = 1.337$, $p = 0.223$ and $F_{2,7} = 0.178$, p
385 $= 0.841$). We assessed whether process errors (e.g. lateral water movements) were responsible
386 for high day-to-day variability by testing whether the SD among daily estimates differed when
387 depth-zone means were aggregated from converged models with good ($R^2 > 0.4$) or poor fits
388 ($R^2 < 0.4$). We found was no difference in propagated SD for metalimnetic GPP (paired t-test;
389 $t_9 = 1.42$, $p = 0.190$) or ER ($t_9 = 0.772$, $p = 0.460$).

390

391 *Depth-specific metabolic rates and photosynthetic efficiency*

392 Vertical patterns of metabolism varied distinctly among the lakes, with mean GPP ranging
393 from 0.00 to 5.98 mg O₂ L⁻¹ d⁻¹ and ER from 0.00 to 3.74 mg O₂ L⁻¹ d⁻¹ across all depth zones
394 (Fig. 1; Table S3). Surface layers were most often autotrophic, whilst balanced to net
395 heterotrophic conditions were prevalent in the metalimnion. Mean NEP was < 0 mg O₂ L⁻¹ d⁻¹
396 for 60% of the daily metalimnetic estimates across all the lakes and layers. Mean daily GPP in
397 the epilimnion was positively correlated with mean epilimnetic TP concentration ($F_{1,7} = 8.75$,
398 $p = 0.021$, $r^2 = 0.56$), as was epilimnetic ER ($F_{1,7} = 10.59$, $p = 0.014$, $r^2 = 0.60$). In the
399 metalimnion, mean GPP and ER were not linearly correlated to epilimnetic TP concentration
400 ($F_{1,7} = 2.04$, $p = 0.196$, $r^2 = 0.22$ and $F_{1,7} = 0.10$, $p = 0.404$, $r^2 = 0.10$, respectively; Fig. 3a,b).

401 We found evidence of photosynthetic activity down to *ca.* 0.1% of surface light.

402 Increasing GPP with depth in some lakes was due to higher daily photosynthetic efficiency
403 (i.e. parameter A from Equation 7; $\text{GPP} [\text{mg O}_2 \text{ L}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}] / \text{PAR} [\mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{ sec}^{-1}]$) in low-light
404 conditions ($F_{1,792} = 105.17$, $p < 0.001$; Fig. S6). Correspondingly, photosynthetic efficiency
405 varied by depth ($F_{2,809} = 58.55$, $p < 0.001$), and was lower in the epilimnion than in the
406 metalimnion or hypolimnion ($p < 0.01$ in post-hoc pairwise comparisons), which did not

407 differ ($p = 0.905$). Photosynthetic efficiency was reduced in low nutrient conditions ($F_{2,23} =$
408 $25.72, p < 0.001$). Efficiency was significantly lower in oligotrophic lakes than in
409 mesotrophic lakes (post-hoc comparison; $z = -4.54, p < 0.001$), which were lower again than
410 eutrophic lakes ($z = -3.17, p = 0.004$).

411

412 *Metalimnetic contribution to whole-lake metabolism*

413 Across all sites, the proportional contribution of the metalimnion to WLWV metabolic
414 estimates (i.e. $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$) varied between 0 and 87% for daily GPP and between <1 and 92%
415 for daily ER (Fig. 4a,b). The metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ was negatively correlated to epilimnetic
416 TP concentration for GPP ($F_{1,7} = 6.09, p = 0.042, r^2 = 0.47$) and for ER ($F_{1,7} = 8.69, p = 0.021,$
417 $r^2 = 0.55$), but these relationships were driven by Lake Castle (Fig. 3c,d). The proportion of
418 whole-lake volume made up of the metalimnion (i.e. Prop_{vol}) was between 3 and 60% (mean
419 32%). The metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ was positively correlated with metalimnetic Prop_{vol} for both
420 GPP (slope = $0.88 \pm 0.12, F_{1,175} = 58.46, p < 0.001, r^2 = 0.25$) and ER (slope = $0.94 \pm 0.14,$
421 $F_{1,175} = 43.74, p < 0.001, r^2 = 0.20$). The metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$ was a mean $0.95 \pm$
422 0.67 SD for GPP and 1.06 ± 0.87 SD for ER. The ratio $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$ showed that the
423 metalimnion disproportionately contributed metabolic activity for its size (i.e. had high
424 $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$) in oligotrophic lakes (Fig. 3e,f). This was evidenced by a negative
425 relationship between metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$ and mean epilimnetic TP concentration
426 for GPP ($F_{1,7} = 15.31, p = 0.006, r^2 = 0.68$; Fig. 3e) and ER ($F_{1,7} = 12.46, p = 0.010, r^2 = 0.64$;
427 Fig. 3f).

428 We observed a negative linear correlation between metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ and log-
429 transformed $Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$ for GPP ($F_{1,166} = 12.39, p < 0.001$; Fig. 4a). However, this trend was not
430 robust to the exclusion of Lake Castle ($F_{1,151} = 2.47, p = 0.118$). A similar negative
431 relationship was observed for metalimnetic ER $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ (Fig. 4b), with ($F_{1,166} = 18.58, p <$
432 0.001) or without ($F_{1,151} = 12.10, p < 0.001$) Lake Castle. Comparable trends were observed

433 for the effect of log-transformed $Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$ on $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$, with a negative relationship for
434 GPP ($F_{1,166} = 15.22$, $p < 0.001$; Fig. 4c), which was again not significant when Castle Lake
435 was removed from the analysis ($F_{1,151} = 2.08$, $p = 0.151$). In contrast, the negative effect of
436 log-transformed $Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$ on $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$ for ER ($F_{1,166} = 12.46$, $p < 0.001$; Fig. 4d) was
437 robust to the exclusion of Castle Lake ($F_{1,151} = 8.31$, $p = 0.005$). Metalimnetic Prop_{vol} tended
438 to be high when Z_{mix} was shallow, meaning that $\log Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$ and Prop_{vol} were negatively
439 correlated ($F_{1,166} = 13.20$, $p < 0.001$, $r^2 = 0.11$). Hence, we used PCA to examine the collinear
440 drivers of metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$. Principal components (PCs) were derived from four
441 variables representing abiotic resource availability and physical conditions (PAR_z ,
442 temperature, Prop_{vol} and N^2). The PC explaining the majority of variation (PC1) did not
443 reduce the collinearity, as it was characterized by lower temperature, Prop_{vol} and N^2 (Table 3).
444 Metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ for GPP and ER was negatively correlated to PC1 in linear mixed
445 models (Table 3), suggesting a combined importance of these factors. A second component
446 (PC2) was characterized mainly by low light and high local stability N^2 in the metalimnion,
447 and was negatively correlated with $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ for GPP and ER (Table 3).

448

449 *Depth-specific metabolic coupling*

450 Coupling between ER_{20} and GPP_{20} varied among the lakes and depth zones. Background
451 respiration (intercept) ranged from -0.16 to $2.70 \text{ mg O}_2 \text{ L}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$, mean coupling slope ranged
452 from -0.07 to 1.26 and mean r^2 varied between 0.05 and 0.94 (Table S4). There was an
453 interaction between the effect of depth zone and epilimnetic TP concentration on mean
454 background respiration ($F_{2,17} = 7.19$, $p = 0.005$). Mean epilimnetic TP did not affect mean
455 background respiration in the epilimnion ($F_{1,7} = 4.64$, $p = 0.068$; Fig. 5a), but there was a
456 positive linear correlation in both the metalimnion ($F_{1,7} = 26.21$, $p = 0.002$; Fig. 5b) and
457 hypolimnion ($F_{1,7} = 19.19$, $p = 0.012$; Fig. 5c). The positive relationship in the hypolimnion
458 was driven predominantly by Lake Müggel (Fig. 5c). Across all TP levels, background

459 respiration did not differ among depth zones ($F_{2,22} = 1.13, p = 0.340$). There was no
460 interaction between the effect of epilimnetic TP and depth zone on the coupling slope ($F_{2,17} =$
461 $1.20, p = 0.324$), and no significant difference among depth zones ($F_{2,17} = 0.44, p = 0.653$).
462 Across all depth zones, the coupling slope decreased with increasing epilimnetic TP
463 concentration ($F_{1,17} = 6.48, p = 0.021$), but this relationship was not evident in any one depth
464 zone individually ($p > 0.117$; Fig. 5d-f). For the strength of the coupling relationship (r^2) there
465 was also no interaction between the effect of depth zone and mean epilimnetic TP ($F_{2,17} =$
466 $0.885, p = 0.431$), and no effect of depth zone ($F_{2,17} = 0.023, p = 0.977$). The strength of the
467 coupling relationship decreased with increasing TP concentration ($F_{1,17} = 7.97, p = 0.012$)
468 across all depth zones combined (Fig. 5g-i).

469

470 *Effect of depth-integration on whole-lake areal NEP estimate*

471 We assessed how WLWV estimates of GPP, ER and NEP made from a single epilimnetic
472 sensor compared to the depth-integrated estimates. For mean GPP, the single-sensor approach
473 over-estimated whole-lake metabolism at 9 of 10 sites, but the average difference from
474 integrated estimates was variable (mean difference $3.17 \pm 4.58 \text{ g O}_2 \text{ m}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$; Fig. 6a). In
475 contrast, single-sensor estimates of ER did not consistently vary from integrated estimates
476 (mean difference $-0.37 \pm 3.40 \text{ g O}_2 \text{ m}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$; Fig. 6b). Correspondingly, single-sensor estimates
477 of whole-lake NEP generally were slight overestimates, but there was considerable variation
478 both among lakes and among days within lakes (mean difference $3.55 \pm 6.65 \text{ g O}_2 \text{ m}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$; Fig.
479 6c).

480

481 **Discussion**

482 We found contrasting patterns in the vertical structure of metabolic rates among the stratified
483 lakes using a large depth-integrated and high frequency buoy dataset (Fig. 1). In clearer lakes,
484 mean daily rates of GPP and ER were weakly associated with depth (e.g. Lake Bure) or

485 peaked in the metalimnion (e.g. Lakes Ontario, Stechlin), as reported before (Sadro et al.
486 2011a). In contrast, metabolic rates of some mesotrophic and eutrophic lakes were strongly
487 depth-dependent (e.g. Lake Castle; Fig. 1). In lakes with high vertical variation in rates,
488 single-sensor estimates of whole-lake metabolism deviated considerably from depth-
489 integrated estimates on some days (Fig. 6). Despite dissimilar vertical profiles, we found that
490 the metalimnion can contribute substantially to daily whole-lake metabolism across a broad
491 range of lakes, with the exception of highly eutrophic conditions (Figs. 3 & 4). However, the
492 relative contribution of the metalimnion varied substantially among days regardless of lake
493 stratification pattern, and metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ was only moderately explained by changes in
494 light availability (as indicated by $Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$). Nonetheless, the metalimnion of oligotrophic
495 lakes, with more light available at depth, contributed more on average to lake metabolism
496 than expected from their metalimnetic volume ($\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}} > 1$; Fig. 3e,f).

497

498 *Importance of physical processes to model uncertainty and day-to-day variability*

499 Our depth-integrated analysis extends current understanding of the role that physical
500 processes play in obtaining accurate metabolic estimates (Coloso et al. 2008; Staehr et al.
501 2012b; Van de Bogert et al. 2007). Combined with previous sensitivity analyses (Obrador et
502 al. 2014), we show that daily estimates of metabolic rates are robust to uncertainties in
503 vertical diffusive fluxes (D_v) under many circumstances, but there were exceptions in the
504 deeper layers of a polymictic lake (Table S2). This increased sensitivity was likely due to the
505 higher contribution of D_v and D_z to DO fluxes in deeper layers and corresponding decrease in
506 the diel signal of DO, water temperature and PAR (Figs S7-S16), as well as model fit (Fig. 2).
507 We expected that high variation in patterns of stratification or low water-column stability
508 would be associated with poor fitting models and uncertainty in parameter estimates.
509 However, within the metalimnion we found no evidence that polymictic lakes, or days and
510 layers with low stability were associated with poor model convergence or fit. Furthermore,

511 model fit and uncertainty were similar among lakes and unrelated to mixing regime (Fig. 2).
512 Hence, while the accuracy of K_v can influence metabolic results, it does not appear that the
513 magnitude or accuracy of estimated diffusive fluxes are important factors in our ability to
514 accurately describe diel variation in DO. This was supported by total diffusive fluxes
515 (including D_s) being high in the epilimnion where model fits were often very good.

516 There are a range of physical processes that were not accounted for by the free-water
517 framework utilized here, including horizontal advection, metalimnetic intrusions and internal
518 seiches caused by wind forcing (Solomon et al. 2013; Van de Bogert et al. 2007). These
519 process errors bring water masses influenced by heterogeneous chemical conditions and
520 biological communities (Solomon et al. 2013; Van de Bogert et al. 2012; Van de Bogert et al.
521 2007). For example, Sadro *et al.* (2011a) found that pelagic rates were commonly influenced
522 by littoral habitats due to advection and water-column stability. The patterns of model fits
523 found among depth zones suggested physical process errors were a considerable issue in the
524 meta- and hypolimnion. Because physical processes are a function of lake morphology, we
525 expected the degree of uncertainty to vary among lakes. However, we did not observe any
526 consistent trends in parameters of model fit or importance of diffusive fluxes across our
527 gradient of lake areas (Fig S6), suggesting process areas did not systematically bias our
528 interpretations. However, lake area is confounded by other variables in our dataset including
529 measurement frequency (Table S1).

530 Physical processes in addition to diffusion may have contributed to the high day-to-day
531 variability in the metabolic estimates because we found little evidence that variability in
532 metalimnetic rates was driven by biological responses (e.g. due to differences in PAR).
533 Conversely, high day-to-day variability is typical even of surface-water metabolic rates that
534 are estimated with higher certainty and better model fits (Solomon et al. 2013; current study).
535 Furthermore, selecting models with good or poor fit did not affect among-day variability or
536 vertical patterns in metabolism (Fig S3). This suggested either that R^2 was a poor predictor of

537 the importance of process errors, or that process errors did not contribute highly to among-day
538 variability. Quantifying the effect of physical processes on metabolic estimates using free-
539 water measurements remains a considerable challenge and priority for future research.
540 Ecological inferences made using free-water methods should remain coupled to this
541 consideration (Sadro et al. 2011a) and be interpreted in the context of model fit and
542 uncertainty (Cremona et al. 2014b).

543 Our results suggest we should remain cautious that patterns in metabolic activity are
544 attributable to biological activity occurring at a certain place and time, especially when
545 stratification periods are not prolonged. However, we employed a number of methods to assist
546 in providing useful information on metabolic processes in the deeper layers of stratified lakes.
547 These included analyzing weeks to months of data for each lake, and using methods such as
548 temporal smoothing and calculating stratification and diffusive fluxes on sub-daily timescales
549 (Coloso et al. 2011) was expected to. Further, where depth-integrated measures of chl-*a*
550 concentration were available (Table S1), vertical patterns in metabolism generally matched
551 algal biomass. In our study, the vertical resolution of measurements did not affect estimate
552 certainty, but maintaining a high resolution will increase the accuracy of temperature profiles
553 and stratification patterns. This is important for calculating the contribution of specific lake
554 habitats, because metalimnetic contribution was sensitive to its thickness (Supplemental Text
555 2 and Table S2). Vertical resolution will also assist in cases such as Lake Castle where the
556 development of hypolimnetic hypoxia (Fig. S9) could produce unrealistically sharp diffusive
557 gradients if too few sensors are used.

558

559 *Vertical patterns in efficiency of light utilization and metabolic coupling*

560 The increase in light utilization efficiency in deeper depth zones explained the higher GPP
561 rates in the metalimnion despite lower light availability. However, the mechanisms
562 responsible for this pattern may vary among lakes. Chl-*a* concentration available at multiple

563 depths from subset of lakes showed that increases in metalimnetic photosynthetic efficiency at
564 Lakes Hampen, Vedsted, Castle (Obrador et al. 2014) and El Gergal (Table 2) were not
565 caused by higher algal biomass in the metalimnion. This suggests that the phytoplankton
566 communities at depth were physiologically acclimated to the low-light conditions or benefited
567 from the potentially higher nutrient availability and lower temperatures that reduce metabolic
568 costs. In other lakes, such as oligotrophic Lakes Abant and Stechlin, and mesotrophic Lake
569 Bure, chl-*a* concentration peaked in the metalimnion. Deep chlorophyll maxima (DCM) are a
570 common occurrence in many lakes (e.g. Brentrup et al. in press; Hamilton et al. 2010), and
571 their development will have a strong impact on vertical patterns of metabolism and metabolic
572 coupling. Photosynthetic efficiency may also reflect the physiology of the species comprising
573 the phytoplankton community. Rates of GPP and ER above Z_{eu} were conspicuously low at El
574 Gergal for a mesotrophic system, potentially attributable to the dominance by a large,
575 inefficient and slow-growing cyanobacterium (*Aphanizomenon flos-aquae*; Moreno-Ostos et
576 al. 2016).

577 Our estimates corroborate with previous findings that heterotrophic to balanced
578 conditions generally prevail in the metalimnion (e.g. Sadro et al. 2011a), even when it was
579 presumably well lit (Fig. 4e). This has been previously ascribed to ER being less depth-
580 dependent than GPP (Coloso et al. 2008). However, vertical patterns in ER were similar to
581 GPP at many sites, at both *in situ* temperature and when standardized to 20°C (Figs. 1 & S2).
582 Days of autotrophy in the metalimnion of lakes from all trophic states and mixing regimes
583 interspersed the predominant state of heterotrophy (Wilkinson et al. 2015). Despite high
584 variability in GPP and ER rates among sites, metalimnetic NEP was relatively stable (Fig. 4e),
585 with a mean of -0.08 ± 0.26 mg O₂ L⁻¹ d⁻¹ among lakes when excluding Lake Müggel, which
586 had outstandingly high autotrophy in the metalimnion (Fig. 1). This relative stability was
587 likely due to the metalimnetic ER₂₀-to-GPP₂₀ coupling gradient being close to 1 at many sites
588 (Fig. 5e). Substrate limitation of heterotrophs is hypothesized to drive strong metabolic

589 coupling (Sadro et al. 2011b; Solomon et al. 2013), and may be pronounced at depth because
590 the OM in deeper layers typically contains a greater proportion of recalcitrant molecules with
591 low biodegradability (Ostrom et al. 1998). A small number of mean coupling slope estimates
592 > 1 were observed in the meta- and hypolimnion (Fig. 5e, f), suggesting greater than unit
593 increases in ER for each unit increase in GPP. Priming of recalcitrant OM (Guenet et al.
594 2010) could produce such a pattern but evidence for this process in freshwater systems is
595 inconclusive (Catalán et al. 2015). As these high slope estimates all occurred at low GPP it is
596 more likely that these estimates were artificially inflated by statistically influential data points
597 with low GPP relative to ER.

598 Elevated background respiration in the meta- and hypolimnion of some mesotrophic and
599 eutrophic sites suggests respiration of OM that was not recently or locally produced (Solomon
600 et al. 2013). The metalimnion may be a zone with high degradation of particles that
601 accumulate near the thermocline through a number of co-occurring mechanisms (Staehr et al.
602 2012b). This includes recently-produced organic material sinking from the epilimnion,
603 combined with large pools of recalcitrant dissolved organic matter (DOM). Other particles
604 such as zooplankton carcasses may be highly available in the metalimnion because they have
605 higher residence times in stratified water columns and move slowly through the thermocline
606 (Kirillin et al. 2012). Particulate organic matter (POM) accumulating below the mixed layer
607 could also originate from resuspension of benthic material by internal seiches during
608 stratification (Weyhenmeyer 1996) or external stream- and groundwater inputs that do not
609 mix with the epilimnion. Higher nutrient availability below the epilimnion may also facilitate
610 greater decomposition rates. For mean heterotrophic conditions, there must be a net subsidy of
611 carbon to the metalimnion and hypolimnion. In addition to accumulating particles, diel
612 vertical migrations could play a role in linking surface and deeper waters, which has been
613 relatively unexplored compared to physical mechanisms. Daily rates of microbial background
614 respiration in the metalimnion could be spatially subsidized by zooplankton that migrate to

615 surface waters at night and return to excrete epilimnion-derived DOM and POM at depth
616 (Watras et al. 2015). Furthermore, some motile autotrophs and mixotrophs vertically migrate
617 to the surface to photosynthesize during the day (Salonen et al. 1984), and so respire carbon in
618 deeper waters that was fixed in the surface waters.

619

620 *Drivers of metalimnetic contribution to whole-lake metabolism*

621 Contrary to expectations, light conditions in the metalimnion, as measured by the relation
622 between mixing depth and photic zone ($Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$), did not explain a large portion of the
623 variation in metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ or $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$ alone (Fig. 4). Instead, our results
624 suggested a collinear combination of physical and chemical variables, including light, nutrient
625 concentration, temperature, water-column stability and metalimnetic volume drives
626 metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$ (Figs. 3 & 4, Table 3). We did not find a strong association between
627 mixing regime and metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$, but the contribution will naturally be more
628 temporally dynamic in polymictic lakes that have interspersed periods of mixed water
629 columns. Concentration of TP in the epilimnion was negatively correlated with metalimnetic
630 $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$, likely due to stimulating epilimnetic production that shades metalimnetic
631 organisms (e.g. Laas et al. 2012). However, trends for GPP were highly influenced by the
632 most eutrophic lakes, so that additional sites are required to confirm these patterns. Despite
633 the decreasing metalimnetic $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}$, absolute rates in the metalimnion increased slowly with
634 TP concentration, until a threshold where the metalimnion was shaded (Castle Lake; Fig.
635 3a,b). These results imply that eutrophication of lake ecosystems may shift primary
636 production from the metalimnion to the epilimnion, as observed for coastal systems
637 (Lyngsgaard et al. 2014).

638 The variability in metalimnetic contribution to whole-lake metabolism was highly
639 evident in the range of 0.5 to 1.0 $Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$ (Fig. 4). While interpolating K_D could introduce
640 error, such variability was evident even at sites with sub-daily determination of K_D (e.g. Lake

641 Stechlin). The dynamic nature of metalimnetic volume on both daily and seasonal bases
642 (Coloso et al. 2011) is likely to affect its contribution to the depth-integrated areal rates
643 (Staeher et al. 2012b). Fluctuations in thermal structure represent not only shifts in light
644 availability, but also potentially important fluxes of OM, nutrients and biota among layers or
645 between sediments and the water column. These fluxes may partly account for the high
646 variability in metabolic estimates at polymictic Lake Müggel, where the longest run of
647 consecutive stratified days was seven. In addition, mixing caused by wind or rain might
648 stimulate metabolism by providing a nutrient or OM subsidy (Giling et al. 2016; Johengen et
649 al. 2008), or depress GPP by suspending OM (Sadro and Melack 2012; Tsai et al. 2008). A
650 key priority to further understand the chemical and physical drivers of variability in the
651 metabolism of stratified lakes is obtaining a greater vertical and temporal resolution of data on
652 nutrient concentration and OM composition (e.g. Watras et al. 2015; Wilkinson et al. 2014).

653 The multiple interacting factors that influence processes below the upper mixed layer
654 suggest that metabolic rates and metalimnetic contribution to whole-lake metabolism may be
655 sensitive to a range of human influences. Anthropogenic changes pervasively affect patterns
656 of thermal stratification and light attenuation in a multitude of ways (Adrian et al. 2009;
657 Carpenter et al. 2011; Tanentzap et al. 2008). For example, climate change may reinforce the
658 thermal stratification and gradually shift mixing regimes (Butcher et al. 2015; Kirillin 2010;
659 Kraemer et al. 2015; Livingstone 2008), while extreme events will disrupt stratification
660 (Jennings et al. 2012). Widespread brownification and cyanobacterial blooms will both shade
661 the water column and alter food-web dynamics (Cremona et al. 2014a; Paerl and Paul 2012;
662 Solomon et al. 2015). In some cases these shifts need only be minor to have a large impact on
663 vertical patterns of metabolism. In particular, biological processes in the metalimnion of lakes
664 with $Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$ close to unity may have little resistance to altered light attenuation or thermal
665 structure. These changes have implications for carbon efflux or storage at regional and even
666 global scales (Tranvik et al. 2009).

667 In conclusion, we found that the metalimnion can contribute substantially whole-lake
668 metabolism in many lakes using a depth-integrated approach. However, high variability in
669 rates and collinearity among predictors meant that generalisations about the widespread
670 importance of the metalimnion to water-column processes could not be made with broad lake
671 categories such as trophic status, except for hypereutrophic lakes. Single sensors placed in the
672 epilimnion sensors retain value, especially for investigating the drivers of day-to-day variation
673 in long term records due to high reliability of estimates and relative freedom from process
674 errors. However, single-sensor estimates may not necessarily reflect whole-lake functioning;
675 and deviate from systematically from depth-integrated estimates of GPP. A depth-integrated
676 approach enables enhanced understanding of how physical and biogeochemical processes
677 influence functioning of lake ecosystems as a whole.

678

679 **References**

- 680 Adrian, R. and others 2009. Lakes as sentinels of climate change. *Limnol Oceanogr* **54**: 2283-
681 2297.
- 682 Batt, R. D., and S. R. Carpenter. 2012. Free-water lake metabolism: addressing noisy time
683 series with a Kalman filter. *Limnol. Oceanogr. Methods* **10**: 20-30.
- 684 Boegman, L., J. Imberger, G. N. Ivey, and J. P. Antenucci. 2003. High-frequency internal
685 waves in large stratified lakes. *Limnol Oceanogr* **48**: 895-919.
- 686 Boehrer, B., and M. Schultze. 2008. Stratification of lakes. *Rev. Geophys.* **46**: RG2005.
- 687 Boehrer, B., and M. Schultze. 2010. Density Stratification and Stability. *In* G. E. Likens [ed.],
688 *Lake Ecosystem Ecology: A Global Perspective*. Academic Press.
- 689 Bouffard, D., L. Boegman, J. D. Ackerman, R. Valipour, and Y. R. Rao. 2014. Near-inertial
690 wave driven dissolved oxygen transfer through the thermocline of a large lake. *J Gt*
691 *Lakes Res* **40**: 300-307.
- 692 Brentrup, J. A. and others in press. Extending the Plankton Ecology Group (PEG) model: The
693 potential of high-frequency profiling to assess vertical and seasonal patterns of
694 phytoplankton dynamics in lakes. *Inland Waters*.
- 695 Brooks, S. P., and A. Gelman. 1997. General methods for monitoring convergence of iterative
696 simulations. *Journal of Computational and Graphical Statistics* **7**: 434-455.
- 697 Butcher, J. B., D. Nover, T. E. Johnson, and C. M. Clark. 2015. Sensitivity of lake thermal
698 and mixing dynamics to climate change. *Clim Change* **129**: 295-305.
- 699 Carpenter, S. R., E. H. Stanley, and M. J. Vander Zanden. 2011. State of the world's
700 freshwater ecosystems: Physical, chemical, and biological changes. *Annual Review of*
701 *Environment and Resources* **36**: 75-99.
- 702 Catalán, N., A. M. Kellerman, H. Peter, F. Carmona, and L. J. Tranvik. 2015. Absence of a
703 priming effect on dissolved organic carbon degradation in lake water. *Limnol*
704 *Oceanogr* **60**: 159-168.

705 Cole, J. and others 2007. Plumbing the global carbon cycle: Integrating inland waters into the
706 terrestrial carbon budget. *Ecosystems* **10**: 172-185.

707 Cole, J. J., and N. F. Caraco. 1998. Atmospheric exchange of carbon dioxide in a low-wind
708 oligotrophic lake measured by the addition of SF₆. *Limnol Oceanogr* **43**: 647-656.

709 Coloso, J., J. Cole, and M. Pace. 2011. Short-term variation in thermal stratification
710 complicates estimation of lake metabolism. *Aquat Sci* **73**: 305-315.

711 Coloso, J. J., J. J. Cole, P. C. Hanson, and M. L. Pace. 2008. Depth-integrated, continuous
712 estimates of metabolism in a clear-water lake. *Can J Fish Aquat Sci* **65**: 712-722.

713 Cremona, F. and others 2014a. From bacteria to piscivorous fish: estimates of whole-lake and
714 component-specific metabolism with an ecosystem approach. *PLoS ONE* **9**: e101845.

715 Cremona, F., A. Laas, P. Nõges, and T. Nõges. 2014b. High-frequency data within a
716 modeling framework: On the benefit of assessing uncertainties of lake metabolism.
717 *Ecol Modell* **294**: 27-35.

718 Del Giorgio, P. A., and P. J. L. B. Williams. 2005. The global significance of respiration in
719 aquatic ecosystems: From single cells to the biosphere. *In* P. A. del Giorgio and P. J.
720 L. B. Williams [eds.], *Respiration in aquatic ecosystems*. Oxford University Press.

721 Finkel, Z. V., J. Beardall, K. J. Flynn, A. Quigg, T. a. V. Rees, and J. A. Raven. 2010.
722 Phytoplankton in a changing world: cell size and elemental stoichiometry. *J Plankton*
723 *Res* **32**: 119-137.

724 Giling, D. P. and others 2016. Thermocline deepening boosts ecosystem metabolism:
725 Evidence from a large-scale lake enclosure experiment simulating a summer storm.
726 *Glob Change Biol* **in press**.

727 Grace, M. R., D. P. Giling, S. Hladyz, V. Caron, R. M. Thompson, and R. Mac Nally. 2015.
728 Fast processing of diel oxygen curves: estimating stream metabolism with BASE
729 (BAYesian Single-station Estimation). *Limnol. Oceanogr. Methods* **13**: 103-114.

730 Guenet, B., M. Danger, L. Abbadie, and G. Lacroix. 2010. Priming effect: bridging the gap
731 between terrestrial and aquatic ecology. *Ecology* **91**: 2850-2861.

732 Hamilton, D. P., K. R. O'brien, M. A. Burford, J. D. Brookes, and C. G. McBride. 2010.
733 Vertical distributions of chlorophyll in deep, warm monomictic lakes. *Aquat Sci* **72**:
734 295-307.

735 Hanson, P. C., S. R. Carpenter, N. Kimura, C. Wu, S. P. Cornelius, and T. K. Kratz. 2008.
736 Evaluation of metabolism models for free-water dissolved oxygen methods in lakes.
737 *Limnol. Oceanogr. Methods* **6**: 454-465.

738 Holtgrieve, G. W., D. E. Schindler, T. A. Branch, and Z. T. A'mar. 2010. Simultaneous
739 quantification of aquatic ecosystem metabolism and reaeration using a Bayesian
740 statistical model of oxygen dynamics. *Limnol Oceanogr* **55**: 1047-1063.

741 Hondzo, M., and H. G. Stefan. 1993. Lake water temperature simulation model. *Journal of*
742 *Hydraulic Engineering* **119**: 1251-1273.

743 Jennings, E. and others 2012. Effects of weather-related episodic events in lakes: an analysis
744 based on high-frequency data. *Freshwater Biol* **57**: 589-601.

745 Johengen, T. H., B. A. Biddanda, and J. B. Cotner. 2008. Stimulation of Lake Michigan
746 plankton metabolism by sediment resuspension and river runoff. *J Gt Lakes Res* **34**:
747 213-227.

748 Kirillin, G. 2010. Modeling the impact of global warming on water temperature and seasonal
749 mixing regimes in small temperate lakes. *Boreal Environ Res* **15**: 279-293.

750 Kirillin, G., H.-P. Grossart, and K. W. Tang. 2012. Modeling sinking rate of zooplankton
751 carcasses: Effects of stratification and mixing. *Limnol Oceanogr* **57**: 881-894.

752 Kirk, J. T. 1994. *Light and photosynthesis in aquatic ecosystems*. Cambridge University
753 Press.

754 Kraemer, B. M. and others 2015. Morphometry and average temperature affect lake
755 stratification responses to climate change. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **42**: 2015GL064097.

756 Laas, A., P. Nõges, T. Kõiv, and T. Nõges. 2012. High-frequency metabolism study in a large
757 and shallow temperate lake reveals seasonal switching between net autotrophy and net
758 heterotrophy. *Hydrobiologia* **694**: 57-74.

759 Livingstone, D. M. 2008. A Change of Climate Provokes a Change of Paradigm: Taking
760 Leave of Two Tacit Assumptions about Physical Lake Forcing. *Int Rev Hydrobiol* **93**:
761 404-414.

762 Lyngsgaard, M. M., S. Markager, and K. Richardson. 2014. Changes in the vertical
763 distribution of primary production in response to land-based nitrogen loading. *Limnol*
764 *Oceanogr* **59**: 1679-1690.

765 Mccree, K. J. 1981. Photosynthetically active radiation. *In* O. L. Lang, P. Novel, B. Osmond
766 and H. Ziegler [eds.], *Physiological plant ecology*. Encyclopedia of plant physiology
767 (new series). Springer-Verlag.

768 McNair, J. N., L. C. Gereaux, A. D. Weinke, M. R. Sesselmann, S. T. Kendall, and B. A.
769 Biddanda. 2013. New methods for estimating components of lake metabolism based
770 on free-water dissolved-oxygen dynamics. *Ecol Modell* **263**: 251-263.

771 Meinson, P., A. Idrizaj, P. Nõges, T. Nõges, and A. Laas. 2015. Continuous and high-
772 frequency measurements in limnology: history, applications, and future challenges.
773 *Environ Rev* **24**: 52-62.

774 Moreno-Ostos, E., R. L. Palomino-Torres, C. Escot, and J. M. Blanco. 2016. Planktonic
775 metabolism in a Mediterranean reservoir during a near-surface cyanobacterial bloom.
776 *Limnetica* **35**: 117-130.

777 Obrador, B., P. A. Staehr, and J. P. C. Christensen. 2014. Vertical patterns of metabolism in
778 three contrasting stratified lakes. *Limnol Oceanogr* **59**: 1228-1240.

779 Odum, H. T. 1956. Primary production in flowing waters. *Limnol Oceanogr* **1**: 102-117.

780 Ostrom, N. E., D. T. Long, E. M. Bell, and T. Beals. 1998. The origin and cycling of
781 particulate and sedimentary organic matter and nitrate in Lake Superior. *Chemical*
782 *Geology* **152**: 13-28.

783 Paerl, H. W., and V. J. Paul. 2012. Climate change: Links to global expansion of harmful
784 cyanobacteria. *Water Res.* **46**: 1349-1363.

785 Pannard, A., D. Planas, and B. E. Beisner. 2015. Macrozooplankton and the persistence of the
786 deep chlorophyll maximum in a stratified lake. *Freshwater Biol* **60**: 1717-1733.

787 Plummer, M. 2003. JAGS: A program for analysis of Bayesian graphical models using Gibbs
788 sampling. Proceedings of the 3rd International Workshop on Distributed Statistical
789 Computing (DSC 2003).

790 Poole, H. H., and W. R. G. Atkins. 1929. Photoelectric measurements of submarine
791 illumination throughout the year. *J Mar Biol Assoc U K* **16**: 297–324.

792 R Development Core Team. 2014. R: A language and environment for statistical computing.
793 R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. ISBN 3-900051-07-0, URL
794 <http://www.R-project.org>.

795 Read, J. S. and others 2011. Derivation of lake mixing and stratification indices from high-
796 resolution lake buoy data. *Environmental Modelling and Software* **26**: 1325-1336.

797 Rimmer, A., Y. Aota, M. Kumagai, and W. Eckert. 2005. Chemical stratification in thermally
798 stratified lakes: A chloride mass balance model. *Limnol Oceanogr* **50**: 147-157.

799 Sadro, S., G. W. Holtgrieve, C. T. Solomon, and G. R. Koch. 2014. Widespread variability in
800 overnight patterns of ecosystem respiration linked to gradients in dissolved organic
801 matter, residence time, and productivity in a global set of lakes. *Limnol Oceanogr* **59**:
802 1666-1678.

803 Sadro, S., and J. Melack. 2012. The effect of an extreme rain event on the biogeochemistry
804 and ecosystem metabolism of an oligotrophic high-elevation lake. *Arct. Antarct. Alp.*
805 *Res.* **44**: 222-231.

806 Sadro, S., J. M. Melack, and S. Macintyre. 2011a. Depth-integrated estimates of ecosystem
807 metabolism in a high-elevation lake (Emerald Lake, Sierra Nevada, California).
808 *Limnol Oceanogr* **56**: 1764-1780.

809 Sadro, S., C. E. Nelson, and J. M. Melack. 2011b. Linking diel patterns in community
810 respiration to bacterioplankton in an oligotrophic high-elevation lake. *Limnol Oceanogr*
811 **56**: 540-550.

812 Salonen, K., R. I. Jones, and L. Arvola. 1984. Hypolimnetic phosphorus retrieval by diel
813 vertical migrations of lake phytoplankton. *Freshwater Biol* **14**: 431-438.

814 Solomon, C. and others 2015. Ecosystem consequences of changing inputs of terrestrial
815 dissolved organic matter to lakes: Current knowledge and future challenges.
816 *Ecosystems* **18**: 376-389.

817 Solomon, C. T. and others 2013. Ecosystem respiration: Drivers of daily variability and
818 background respiration in lakes around the globe. *Limnol Oceanogr* **58**: 849-866.

819 Song, C., W. K. Dodds, M. T. Trentman, J. Rüegg, and F. Ballantyne. 2016. Methods of
820 approximation influence aquatic ecosystem metabolism estimates. *Limnol. Oceanogr.*
821 *Methods* **14**: 557–569.

822 Staehr, P., J. Testa, W. Kemp, J. Cole, K. Sand-Jensen, and S. Smith. 2012a. The metabolism
823 of aquatic ecosystems: history, applications, and future challenges. *Aquat Sci* **74**: 15-
824 29.

825 Staehr, P. A. and others 2010. Lake metabolism and the diel oxygen technique: State of the
826 science. *Limnol. Oceanogr. Methods* **8**: 628-644.

827 Staehr, P. A., J. P. A. Christensen, R. D. Batt, and J. S. Read. 2012b. Ecosystem metabolism
828 in a stratified lake. *Limnol Oceanogr* **57**: 1317-1330.

829 Sweers, H. E. 1970. Vertical diffusivity coefficient in a thermocline. *Limnol Oceanogr* **15**:
830 273-280.

831 Tanentzap, A. J. and others 2008. Cooling lakes while the world warms: Effects of forest
832 regrowth and increased dissolved organic matter on the thermal regime of a temperate,
833 urban lake. *Limnol Oceanogr* **53**: 404-410.

834 Tranvik, L. J. and others 2009. Lakes and reservoirs as regulators of carbon cycling and
835 climate. *Limnol Oceanogr* **54**: 2298-2314.

836 Tsai, J.-W. and others 2008. Seasonal dynamics, typhoons and the regulation of lake
837 metabolism in a subtropical humic lake. *Freshwater Biol* **53**: 1929-1941.

838 Van De Bogert, M. C. and others 2012. Spatial heterogeneity strongly affects estimates of
839 ecosystem metabolism in two north temperate lakes. *Limnol Oceanogr* **57**: 1689-1700.

840 Van De Bogert, M. C., S. R. Carpenter, J. J. Cole, and M. L. Pace. 2007. Assessing pelagic
841 and benthic metabolism using free water measurements. *Limnol. Oceanogr. Methods*
842 **5**: 145-155.

843 Watras, C. J., K. A. Morrison, J. T. Crawford, C. P. McDonald, S. K. Oliver, and P. C.
844 Hanson. 2015. Diel cycles in the fluorescence of dissolved organic matter in
845 dystrophic Wisconsin seepage lakes: Implications for carbon turnover. *Limnol*
846 *Oceanogr* **60**: 482-496.

847 Weyhenmeyer, G. A. 1996. The influence of stratification on the amount and distribution of
848 different settling particles in Lake Erken. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic*
849 *Sciences* **53**: 1254-1262.

850 Wilcock, R. J. J. W. N., G. B. McBride, K. J. Collier, B. T. Wilson, and B. A. Huser. 1998.
851 Characterisation of lowland streams using a single-station diel curve analysis model
852 with continuous monitoring data for dissolved oxygen. *New Zealand Journal of Marine*
853 *and Freshwater Research* **32**: 67-79.

854 Wilkinson, G. M., S. R. Carpenter, J. J. Cole, and M. L. Pace. 2014. Use of deep
855 autochthonous resources by zooplankton: Results of a metalimnetic addition of ¹³C to
856 a small lake. *Limnol Oceanogr* **59**: 986-996.

857 Wilkinson, G. M., J. J. Cole, M. L. Pace, R. A. Johnson, and M. J. Kleinhans. 2015. Physical
858 and biological contributions to metalimnetic oxygen maxima in lakes. *Limnol*
859 *Oceanogr* **60**: 242-251.
860

861 **Acknowledgements**

862 The collaboration was made possible by the activities of Networking Lake Observations in
863 Europe (NETLAKE), funded by the European Corporation in Science and Technology
864 (COST) action ES1201. Ideas for this manuscript were initiated at a NETLAKE workshop
865 organized by PAS, BO and E. Jennings in Roskilde, Denmark. Acquisition of Lake Stechlin
866 data was facilitated by grants from the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research
867 (BMBF; no. 033L041B) and the German Research Foundation (DFG Core Facility; no. GE
868 1775/2-1) to M.O. Gessner, and from the Leibniz Association (project ‘TemBi’; SAW-2011-
869 IGB-2) to P. Casper and HPG. We thank S. A. Berger, C. Engelhardt, M.O. Gessner, M.
870 Lentz, J. C. Nejtgaard and A. Penske for acquisition of ancillary data from Lake Stechlin.
871 Data from Danish lakes were supported by the Danish Centre for Lake Restoration (CLEAR).
872 Data collection from Lake Abant was funded by the Scientific and Technological Research
873 Council of Turkey (TUBITAK) (Grant No: 111Y059). Data collection for El Gergal
874 Reservoir was supported by EMASESA and projects EU- ENV/UK/000604 and CGL2005-
875 04070. Lake Ontario data was provided by B. Weidel and M. Paufve and funding for data
876 collection at Lake Ontario came from the Great Lakes Restoration Initiative, Great Lakes
877 Fishery Commission, and New York State Department of Conservation. Two anonymous
878 reviewers provided comments that greatly improved this manuscript.

879

881 Table 1. Description of acronyms and terms

Parameter or acronym	Description	Unit
OM	Organic Matter	
GPP	Gross Primary Production at in situ temperature	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹
GPP ₂₀	Gross Primary Production standardized to 20°C	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹
ER	Ecosystem Respiration at in situ temperature	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹
ER ₂₀	Ecosystem Respiration standardized to 20°C	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹
Background respiration	Respiration of OM not recently or locally fixed; the intercept of the correlation between ER ₂₀ and GPP ₂₀	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹
NEP	Net Ecosystem Production (GPP-ER); describes whether the layer or lake is net autotrophic or net heterotrophic	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹
TP	Total Phosphorous	µg L ⁻¹
TN	Total Nitrogen	µg L ⁻¹
DO	µg L ⁻¹	mg L ⁻¹
Z _{mix}	Mixing depth; bottom of the epilimnion and top of the metalimnion	m
Z _{eu}	Photic depth; equal to depth with 1% of surface light	m
Z _{mix} : Z _{eu}	Ratio of mixing to photic depth. Describes light availability in the metalimnion	
T	Temperature	°C
DOC	Dissolved Organic Carbon	mg L ⁻¹
Chl <i>a</i>	Chlorophyll- <i>a</i> concentration	µg L ⁻¹
DCM	Deep Chlorophyll Maximum	
PAR ₀	Incoming surface Photosynthetic Active Radiation	µmol m ⁻² s ⁻¹
PAR _z	Photosynthetic Active Radiation at depth z	µmol m ⁻² s ⁻¹
K _D	Light attenuation coefficient	m ⁻¹
U ₁₀	Wind speed at 10 m above surface of lake	m s ⁻¹
D _s	Atmospheric	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ h ⁻¹
D _v	Vertical exchange between each depth and the adjacent depths due to turbulent diffusivity	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ h ⁻¹
N ²	Brunt-Väisälä buoyancy frequency	s ⁻²
K _v	Vertical eddy diffusivity coefficient	
D _z	Exchange due to mixed-layer deepening	mg O ₂ L ⁻¹ h ⁻¹
WLWV	Whole-lake volume-weighted estimate of metabolism (Sadro et al. 2011a)	g O ₂ m ⁻³ d ⁻¹
Prop _{metab}	Proportion of WLWV metabolism occurring in a certain depth zone	
Prop _{vol}	Proportion of whole lake volume occurring in a certain depth zone	
Prop _{metab} : Prop _{vol}	Ratio of proportion metabolism to proportion volume; ratio is >1 when a depth zone contributes more metabolically than it does volumetrically	

882

883

884

885 Table 2. Site information and ancillary data for the ten study lakes. Chemical and biological data are mean measurements from 1-11 samples among
886 sites during the period of stratification at each lake (Supplemental Text 1). ‘Epi.’ denotes the epilimnion (metalimnion and hypolimnion
887 measurements are presented in Table S1). The column ‘# days (total)’ shows the total number of stratified days with metabolic estimates in each
888 lake, with the number of days with at least one successful model fit in each depth zone (epi-, meta- and hypolimnion) in brackets.

Lake	Location	# days	Trophic status	Mixing regime	Max. depth (lake) m	Max. depth (profile) m	Mean Z_{mix} m	Mean Z_{eu} m	Mean meta. thickness m	Epi. TP $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$	Epi. TN $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$	Epi. DOC $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$	Epi. Chl <i>a</i> $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$
Abant	Turkey	17 (2)	oligo.	mono.	18	12.75	5.6	11.9	2.6	14.0	1.5		1.5
Ontario	United States	69 (17)	oligo.	mono.	244	35	10.3	23.2	10.3	6.4			0.7
Stechlin	Germany	41 (32)	oligo.	di.	69.5	17.25	6.8	12.7	5.1	12.2	0.4	5.0	1.9
Rappbode pre-dam	Germany	48 (19)	meso.	di.	17	15.75	2.6	4.7	4.7	25.2	0.7	4.8	9.4
Bure	Denmark	58 (29)	meso.	poly.	11	9.5	4.3	7.5	3.3	22.9	0.7		5.5
Hampen	Denmark	56 (15)	meso.	poly.	13	9.5	4.4	6.3	3.1	23.6	0.6	3.0	8.7
El Gergal	Spain	21 (17)	meso.	mono.	37	19.75	5.3	6.5	6.1				24.1
Vedsted	Denmark	60 (14)	eu.	di.	11	9.5	3.5	4.0	3.8	27.3	0.5	4.9	41.4
Müggel	Germany	28 (17)	eu.	poly.	7.7	5.25	1.5	3.0	2.0	63.5	0.8	7.2	35.3
Castle	Denmark	32 (16)	hypereu.	poly.	9	8.5	4.4	2.3	2.6	94.1	1.6	3.4	46.3

889

890 Table 3. Results of principal components analysis (PCA). ‘Linear mixed models’ rows indicate the results of linear models using the components as
 891 explanatory variables to explain metalimnetic contribution to whole-lake areal GPP and ER (Prop_{metab}). ‘ β ’ indicates the estimated slope of the
 892 linear model.

Principal component	PC1	PC2
% variation explained	36	32
Axis rotation		
Metalimnetic Prop _{vol}	-0.52	-0.42
Mean metalimnetic log PAR _z	-0.26	-0.65
Mean metalimnetic layer temperature	-0.68	0.19
Mean metalimnetic buoyancy frequency (N ²)	-0.43	0.60
Linear mixed models		
Prop _{metab} for GPP	$\beta = -0.11 \pm 0.01$ $p < 0.001, r^2 = 0.26$	$\beta = -0.02 \pm 0.02$ $p = 0.200, r^2 = 0.08$
Prop _{metab} for ER	$\beta = -0.07 \pm 0.02$ $p < 0.001, r^2 = 0.09$	$\beta = -0.10 \pm 0.02$ $p < 0.001, r^2 = 0.15$

893 **Figure captions**

894 Figure 1. Mean (\pm SD among days) depth-specific volumetric estimates of daily GPP (open
895 white points) and ER (closed grey points) of adequately fit models over stratified days at each
896 lake. The grey rectangle indicates the mean extent of metalimnion and the dashed black line
897 indicates the mean daily Z_{eu} .

898

899 Figure 2. Scatterplots of mean (\pm SD) (a) R^2 , (b) coefficient of variation (CV) of GPP
900 estimates, and (c) CV of ER estimates from all models across the study lakes and depth zones.
901 White, grey and black points show epi-, meta- and hypolimnetic zones respectively. Value
902 above the dashed horizontal line at $R^2 = 0.40$ in panel (a) were considered to have adequate
903 model fit.

904

905 Figure 3. Scatterplots showing the correlation between mean (\pm SD) epilimnetic total
906 phosphorus (TP) and metalimnetic GPP (left) and ER (right). Plots show mean (\pm SD)
907 metalimnetic volumetric rates (a, b), mean relative contribution of the metalimnion to WLWV
908 metabolic estimates (i.e. $Prop_{metab}$; c,d); and the ratio between $Prop_{metab}$ and the relative
909 contribution of the metalimnetic volume to whole-lake volume ($Prop_{metab} : Prop_{vol}$; e,f). Solid
910 black lines indicate significant linear relationships in linear mixed models. White, grey and
911 black points indicate oligotrophic, mesotrophic and eutrophic lakes, respectively. Circles,
912 squares/diamonds and triangles represent monomictic, dimictic and polymictic lakes,
913 respectively.

914

915 Figure 4. Scatterplots showing the correlation between $Z_{mix}:Z_{eu}$ and metalimnetic metabolism.
916 The top row shows the proportional contribution of the metalimnion to WLWV metabolic
917 estimates ($Prop_{metab}$) for (a) GPP and (b) ER. The middle row shows the effect of $Z_{mix}:Z_{eu}$ on
918 the ratio between $Prop_{metab}$ and the proportion contribution of the metalimnetic volume to

919 whole-lake volume ($\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}}$) for (c) GPP and (d) ER. At values higher than the
920 dashed horizontal line at $\text{Prop}_{\text{metab}}:\text{Prop}_{\text{vol}} = 1$ the metalimnion contributes more to the whole
921 lake metabolically than it does volumetrically. Panel (e) shows the volumetric rate of NEP as
922 a function of mean daily $Z_{\text{mix}}:Z_{\text{eu}}$. Each point represents one day, with a point only for days
923 with at least one appropriate model fit in each depth-zone shown for plots a-d. White, grey
924 and black points indicate oligotrophic, mesotrophic and eutrophic lakes, respectively. Circles,
925 squares and triangles represent monomictic, dimictic and polymictic lakes, respectively. In
926 plots c and d some outlying high points at Lake Ontario were excluded to assist interpretation.
927

928 Figure 5. Scatterplots of the correlation between and nutrient concentration on $\text{ER}_{20\text{-to-GPP}_{20}}$
929 coupling in the epi- (left), meta- (centre) and hypolimnion (right). The top row shows the
930 effect of mean ($\pm\text{SD}$) epilimnetic TP on mean ($\pm\text{SD}$) background respiration (i.e. intercept of
931 correlation; $\text{mg O}_2 \text{ L}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$) in all depth zones. The dashed horizontal line indicate a
932 background respiration of zero (conceptually no ER independent of GPP), and the solid lines
933 show significant relationships in LMMs. The centre row shows the relationship of TP with
934 coupling slope ($\text{mg O}_2 \text{ L}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$), with the dashed line at a slope of unity (representing a unit
935 increase in ER for each in GPP). The bottom row shows the correction of mean TP with
936 coupling strength (r^2). White, grey and black points indicate oligotrophic, mesotrophic and
937 eutrophic lakes, respectively. Circles, squares and triangles represent monomictic, dimictic
938 and polymictic lakes, respectively.

939
940 Figure 6. Comparison of mean ($\pm\text{SD}$) daily whole-lake volume weighted (WLVW)
941 metabolism between depth-integrated and single-sensor estimates of (a) GPP, (b) ER and (c)
942 NEP. The dashed line indicates the 1:1 relationship. White, grey and black points indicate
943 oligotrophic, mesotrophic and eutrophic lakes, respectively. Circles, squares and triangles
944 represent monomictic, dimictic and polymictic lakes, respectively.