

Lay Spirituality in the high Middle Ages: how the Layman became a Match for the Saint

Carol Sibson

Queen Mary, University of London

The traditional promotion of sanctity emphasised the exclusive nature of sainthood as the preserve of men and women who devoted themselves to religion: those, for instance, who led enclosed lives or were priests, hermits or martyrs. The tales and legends of these holy men and women inspired a widespread and diverse public but they also intimated that saints were different from ordinary lay men and women, who were of lower spiritual status and could not, therefore, emulate their pious lives. The Western Church had focused its attention on monastic spirituality in the earlier medieval period but a profound shift took place in its priorities between the twelfth and fifteenth centuries, with a new emphasis on lay potential: what André Vauchez has termed 'l'émergence du laïcat' [the emergence of the laity].¹ The Church acknowledged that lay men and women might lead lives of outstanding virtue and piety while performing the tasks and duties required of them in the world.

This paper addresses questions raised by these developments: what did the medieval layman have to do to be considered virtuous? What were the qualities and attributes considered essential in the formation of the pious lay identity? The enquiry begins with a brief historical account of the Church's attempts to communicate with the laity and bridge the gulf between monastic and lay piety - the issue at the heart of this study. The main section moves on to the textual study of a specific paradigm of lay piety formulated in Nicholas Bozon's early fourteenth-century hagiographic poem *{La vie} de seynt Panuce [/The Life] of Saint Paphnutius*, found in British Library Manuscript

Additional 70513 which belonged to the female Augustinian convent at Campsey Ash (founded in 1195), the Campsey Manuscript.²

The narrative concerns Paphnutius, a desert father of the antique Church, who asks God to reveal if any man equals him in piety. The Angel, God's messenger, directs him to the city to meet a minstrel who is later persuaded to seek a life of poverty with the saint in the desert. When the minstrel dies, the narrative is re-enacted but with a wealthy lord now cast in the role of the exemplary layman. Although the title of the poem indicates a focus on the saint, the text deals extensively with the spiritual qualities of the two lay protagonists, equal to the saint 'en merite e en louher' [in merit and honour] (l.102). The poem articulates the virtues of a model layman – such as sexual purity, willingness to embrace a life of poverty and obedience in the service of God – which derive from the traditional vows of the monastic life and are modified to meet secular requirements. The poem also acknowledges the importance of ethical codes of conduct and validates a pragmatic approach to the needs of society.

The Church's undertaking to communicate with the laity was not, of course, entirely unprecedented; the relationship had clearly fluctuated over time. Rachel Stone, for instance, describes earlier efforts to encourage the nobility to lead inspirational Christian lives and she highlights attempts to create a moral elite laity in ninth-century Francia, supported by the dissemination of popular 'lay mirrors' such as Alcuin's *De virtutibus et vitiis* (c. 800).³ Early cults of lay saints were established but they were often local or regional in nature, as in the case of the noble Gerald of Aurillac (c.855-909).⁴ These early endeavours to reflect the growing social and economic importance of the laity did not, however, lead to long-term change. It was not until the twelfth century that, facing political and religious challenges, the Western Church engaged in radical debate and reform which established new priorities, including the promotion of the spiritual life of lay men and women. This emphasis was formally expressed in the first canon of the Fourth Lateran Council (1215) which concludes:

Non solum autem virgines et continentes, verum etiam coniugati, per fidem rectam et operationem bonam placentes Deo, ad aeternam merentur beatitudinem pervenire.⁵

[Not only virgins and those practising chastity, but also married men and women, who find favour with God through their true faith and good works, are worthy of attaining eternal salvation].

The Council's forthright statement reflects an awareness of the potential of lay men and women which it compares with those who lead lives devoted to their religion. The canon affirms the growing importance of the spiritual status, beliefs and religious practices of the laity - most famously articulated in the formal requirement for annual lay confession in the twenty-first canon of the Council.

Churchmen's attempts to link monastic spirituality with that of the laity were supported by a wide range of reforms and innovations such as the creation of the mendicant Third Orders in the thirteenth century. The papal canonisation of the draper Homobonus of Cremona in 1199 represents, possibly, an attempt by Innocent III to provide a contemporary model of lay sanctity.⁶ The laity, too, reached out to strengthen and legitimise lay religious identity during the twelfth and thirteen centuries, in the Flagellant and *Conversi* movements, for example, and the creation of fraternities like the *Humiliati* in the city states of Northern Italy.⁷

The greatest challenge, however, was to provide religious instruction for the laity - an undertaking embraced by dynamic thirteenth-century bishops throughout Western Europe. The prolific body of their statutes and treatises shaped the pastoral life of the medieval parish and continued to do so for many years to come. Responsibility was delegated to the priest to deliver a syllabus of lay instruction to his parishioners, based on schematic outlines such as John Pecham's draft in the ninth constitution of the Council of the Province of Canterbury at Lambeth (1281).⁸ More detailed programmes of lay instruction were developed by other churchmen like Peter Quivil in his Exeter Statutes and *Sunmula* (1287).⁹ The scale of this ambitious project may be judged by the legacy of the huge corpus of *pastoralia*, texts which supported religious instruction: in Latin to assist the teaching of the clergy; and in the vernacular to supplement and enhance the religious belief and practice of the laity.¹⁰ The efficacy of these endeavours is acknowledged by William Pantin:

The programme of religious instruction planned by the reforming bishops of the thirteenth century did succeed in teaching and indoctrinating certain sections of the laity.¹¹

Whilst the Church's interest in the cure of souls provided instruction on penitential and sacramental practices in particular, it gave little direction to a layman as to how he might lead an ethical life in society, based on essentially practical principles of judgement of right and wrong. Church teaching, of course, asserted that the temporal was but a symbolic reflection of the spiritual and that the two could not be separated: the transcendently moral and the socially ethical were one and the same. Guidance on the latter was, however, often limited to the negative strictures of the Ten Commandments and the Seven Deadly Sins. Whilst the canons of the Fourth Lateran Council, like other Church directives, attempted to control the conduct, habits and dress of those who led enclosed or otherwise circumscribed lives – monks, nuns, mendicants and secular priests¹² – they were relatively silent on the day-to-day conduct of the laity, although important areas of lay existence were increasingly coming under scrutiny. Instruction on specific elite conduct was available elsewhere: in books of courtesy, like *The Book of Chivalry* depicting the ideal knight,¹³ or in texts such as *Corset* which detailed the appropriate conduct of a noble lord.¹⁴ These exemplars expounded and promulgated the refined values of the elite Christian male in medieval oral and written culture.

Lower socio-economic groups, on the other hand, had few models of exemplary lay figures they might emulate, since pious folk usually made only brief appearances in textual culture. The public might be inspired by the popular collections of hagiographic texts, promoting the lives and legends of well-known saints, but the exceptional actions of these often remote and exotic figures defied imitation in real life. *De seynt Panuce* portrays a different type of lay saint living modestly in circumstances which are familiar to the audience: an agent of instruction, rather than of inspiration. The text focuses on the virtues of the ideal layman, at a time when the Church's interest in the daily life of lay men and women was growing, particularly in regard to their sexual *mores*.

At the same time, rapid urbanisation was giving rise to a range of ethical and social problems which are recurring themes in the works of

medieval writers like the Franciscan, Nicholas Bozon, active between the late-thirteenth and the early-fourteenth centuries.¹⁵ Bozon's francophone poems and treatises - the best known being the prose collection, *Les contes moralisés*¹⁶ - often comment on the changes he perceives in society and provide practical advice and edifying exempla in handbooks used by itinerant preachers.¹⁷ His works engage with wide-ranging questions concerning ethical conduct in different social groups: the changing requirements and rewards of work and commerce, the influence of education, family relationships, the role of women, attitudes to money, and, in particular, how these issues impact on the maintenance of good social order. His humour can be scathing towards minor social transgressions, committed, for example, by youths who rise late in the morning, ignore proper mealtimes and fuss over their hair to please the opposite sex.¹⁸ Evidence suggests that Bozon was a popular writer whose works were copied, turned into song and translated into English.¹⁹ It is generally assumed that he wrote for an audience of predominantly lay men and women as indicated by the frequent presence of his works in friars' handbooks and the internal evidence of several texts.

Bozon also wrote the *Vies* of nine female saints²⁰ and two male saints: Paphnutius the Ascetic (early-fourth century) and Paul the Hermit (born circa 227), holy men who lived in the Egyptian desert. The male *Vies* and that of St Elizabeth appear in the first quire of the Campsey Manuscript: *La Vie de seynte Elizabeth* (folios 1ra-4ra), *De seynt Panuce* (folios 4ra-5vb), *La Vie de saint Paule le hermite* (folios 6ra-8rb).²¹ The scribal hand of quire 1 (folios 1-8) containing Bozon's texts has been dated as early fourteenth century and it has been suggested that the section was added to a late thirteenth-century manuscript (folios 9-269), a compilation of francophone *Vies* of both male and female saints which have been attributed to various authors, several of them women.²² The bookhand of the first quire of the manuscript is also responsible for two notes on folios 1r and 265v designating ownership to the Campsey convent, the second note stating that the manuscript was to be read aloud at meal-times, a common practice in conventional refectories.²³

Although *La vie de seynte Elizabeth* provides an obvious example of inspiration to a female audience, there is no evidence that Bozon's

three *Vies* were written expressly for the nuns of Campsey. It might even be claimed that *De seynt Panuce* and *La vie de saint Paule le hermite* provide incongruous reading material for the enclosed women of Campsey Ash since the two poems portray male protagonists, explore themes of masculine sexuality and promote distinctly male-gendered piety. Yet the question of gender appears to have created no bar to the inclusion of other male saints in the main section of the manuscript, clearly judged suitable for a female readership.²⁴ The Campsey community was not, of course, a group of unworldly recluses but included sophisticated women of aristocratic rank, described by Jocelyn Wogan-Browne as a ‘a prestigious female community of canonesses and vowesses’,²⁵ often with significant funds at their disposal. An example of the many noble women associated with the convent may be found in Maud, Countess of Ulster, and daughter of the Earl of Lancaster, who entered Campsey in 1347 after the death of her second husband. It has also been argued that a lay patron of similarly aristocratic background to members of the Campsey community was responsible for the commissioning of the main section of the Campsey codex. Evidence points to the likely patronage of Isabella, Countess of Arundel (died 1279) who is shown in visual representation in the manuscript and figures in two of the *Vies*.²⁶ Isabella combined her keen involvement in promoting the writing of religious texts with the maintenance of social and aristocratic networks and, in all probability, the enclosed women of Campsey had similar interests, both in the exploration of uplifting reading material and in their links with the wider world.

The original ten *Vies* of the Campsey Manuscript form a collection which reflects the rich literary culture of female convents throughout the medieval period.²⁷ Each *Vie* is long and would require hours of reading. Their length stands in stark contrast to the brevity of Bozon’s three texts: *De seynt Panuce*, for instance, comprises 214 lines of verse, whereas the *Vie* of Thomas Becket contains over 6000 lines and that of St Modwenna some 8700 lines. Bozon’s poems may well have been added to provide variety in the length of refectory readings. Delbert Russell suggests that a mixture of long and short *Vitae* is not unusual in hagiographic compilations and that the brevity of Bozon’s works may be linked to the mid thirteenth-century fashion for legends containing shortened versions of *Lives* which the reader might expand

with individual comment.²⁸ This is a valid, practical consideration but these shorter works may have other qualities which might complement or enhance the earlier Campsey *Vies*.

A brief overview of Bozon's three *Vies* demonstrates that each poem is quite distinct in subject matter and treatment. *La vie de seynte Elizabeth* recounts the life of the lay saint, canonised in 1235 and famed for her humility and self-abasement as she dedicates her life to works of charity, especially amongst the sick. Bozon presents his public with a popular European narrative – Elizabeth's life had already been treated by several Continental writers, such as Rutebeuf (between 1258 and 1270)²⁹ – which celebrates Elizabeth as the 'novele rose' [new rose] (*Elizabeth*, l. 2), the contemporary ideal of a female saint who may also be a wife and mother. The representation of this new typography of female sanctity would no doubt be very appealing to the Campsey women. The two male *Vies*, however, treat saints of the antique Church. *La vie de seint Paule le hermite*, first composed in Latin by Saint Jerome (circa 375), follows closely Jacques de Voragine's tale in the *Golden Legend*.³⁰ This colourful narrative, filled with miraculous events and creatures, recounts St Anthony's search for Paul in the Egyptian desert and his recognition of the greater piety of the hermit. *De seynt Panuce*, the focus of this paper, concerns the eponymous desert father of whom very little is known, although he is credited with having written the *Life of St Onuphrius* in the *Vitae Patrum*. Bozon's *Vie* purports to be an account of the saint's life but the narrative focuses on lengthy expositions by the two laymen describing their past experiences. *De seynt Panuce* is based on the exemplum, *The Hermit and the Saint*, which has a long history from its roots in early Indian story-telling to its appearance in the literature of medieval Islamic, Jewish and Christian cultures.³¹ Several versions are listed in the *Index Exemplorum*³² including the exemplum in *Handlyng Synne* comparing the piety of St Macarius with that of two married women who are praised for not arguing with their husbands.³³ Whilst several versions of the tale include a third worthy man, a merchant, Bozon offers just two exemplars of lay piety – the poor minstrel contrasting with the wealthy lord.³⁴

Despite the distinctive nature of each *Vie*, the texts are linked by a common motif: the exploration of the nature of true humility, an essential element of piety. Whilst Elizabeth is the embodiment of the

virtue, saintly men in *De seynt Panuce* and *La vie de saint Paule le hermite* acknowledge that apparently less worthy men demonstrate greater humility than themselves and are, therefore, their spiritual equals or superiors. The poems suggest that piety originates in humble striving for God's grace, thereby appealing directly to lay aspiration.

The narrative of *De seynt Panuce* unfolds in the distant past of the Egyptian desert, the antique setting adding authority to the text and suggesting that the poem's medieval ideals are linked through cultural continuity with the values of the early Church. This far-distant background may seem remote from the interests of the audience but it does not, in fact, impinge on the narrative stream and the tale develops in a recognisably medieval setting that contains familiar structures, such as a nunnery.

Paphnutius is introduced simply as a holy man of religion who 'mout se enforza de Deu servir' [struggled greatly to serve God] (l.3) – the poem later explains that his struggle involves ascetic practices. Highly conscious of his personal sanctity and spiritual status, the saint asks:

De saver moun ky fut soun peer,
Par deserte de aver louher. (ll. 5, 6)
[to learn which man was his equal through his well-earned
merit]

Paphnutius is thus susceptible to the sin of pride, as will be emphasised at the very end of the poem.

The saint has sought religious fulfilment in the desert, the traditional *locus* of spiritual renewal, the meeting-point of the human and divine. Yet God's messenger, the Angel, directs him to the city to find the man whose piety is equal to his (l.10). This is not the usual saintly trajectory in a landscape filled with symbolic resonance – as a rule, holy men flee the corruption of the city for the protection of the desert. *De seynt Panuce* proposes that virtue may be nurtured in an urban setting as laymen go about their everyday business. The symbolic significance of location is manipulated throughout the poem and is unstable – sometimes meeting customary expectation but, at other times, challenging it.

Paphnutius meets his spiritual match, a minstrel who begs for a living by playing his flute and singing in the street. The man thus lives on the margins of society and is probably scorned by the townsfolk.³⁵ He describes his life ‘houmblement’ [humbly] (l.25) and explains that he renounced his life as a thief for the love of God. His music reminds him of true happiness and the vanity of worldly pleasure (ll.34, 5): comments that reflect the Franciscan approval of music.

When pressed for further details of his former life, this simple man recalls only two occasions when he behaved honourably (l.41). First, when the band of thieves to which he belonged abducted a nun during a robbery and he saved her from rape, returning her: ‘Sauvement, saunz corupcioun’ [safely and intact] (l. 48) to the convent. Second, he helped a woman he encountered in a wood who was lamenting the imprisonment of her husband and two sons for debt. The creditors were still hunting her and the robber gave her twenty-two marks to pay the men (ll. 61-3). Paphnutius explains that God extends grace and forgiveness to those who demonstrate pity for others, even if their money has been acquired through criminal activities:

‘Veez la douzour Jhesu Crist:
Mes ke rayne ly desplet,
Un quer pitous mout ly plet.
Pur ke aumoygne de rayne,
Deu vers homme taunt encline,
Ben dut aumoygne de leu purchaz
Heyder homme de trover graz’. (ll. 72-8)

[See how kind Jesus Christ is. In spite of the fact that he is displeased by robbery, he is very pleased by a heart full of pity. If anyone uses stolen money for a good cause, God is so warmly disposed towards man that a good deed paid from rapacious plunder should help a man win {God’s} grace]³⁶

The saint’s claim is morally ambiguous or, at the very least, highly pragmatic, suggesting that good may come from evil and that the line between them is blurred. Charitable acts are, the poem insists, essential elements in shaping the Christian identity of both the minstrel and the

lord and it adopts a practical view of the useful function of money, whatever the source. The potential of money to generate good will link with the later account of the lord's generous use of his wealth and possessions. Paphnutius now calls the minstrel to the life of poverty and they leave for the desert, the *locus* of spiritual life. Three years later, the minstrel dies and is accompanied to heaven by angels.

The minstrel appears to have little to commend him – his only pious actions were his protection of a nun during a robbery and the succour he gave to a woman in distress. These episodes appear relatively insignificant although, the minstrel intimates, they offered sexual opportunities which he resisted. In the first case, he played his part in the robbery, although he attempts to distance himself from the plan to rape the nun (the verb changes from first person singular to third plural, l.45). Might this be understood as a change of heart on his part in favour of self-restraint? The distraught woman encountered in the wood is described as 'assez plesaunte' [good-looking] (l.51) and, since she was weak, not having eaten for three days, she told him: 'Ke feyse de ly ma volentee' [that I might do as I pleased with her] (l.57). The *topos* of the unprotected woman, particularly a nun, who is saved from rape, is frequently used by medieval writers and certainly reflects the reality of warfare.³⁷ On the other hand, there is very limited evidence available about the frequency of the crime of rape in everyday medieval life.³⁸ The minstrel states firmly that he refused to exploit the opportunity to abuse or violate female victims; he thus epitomises manly self-control which overcomes illicit urges. Bozon promotes sexual restraint as a crucial element of the exemplary lay identity, an ideal that originates in the monastic vow of chastity.³⁹

The minstrel's self-control places him in the long tradition of holy men who endure sexual torments: from the saints like Benedict, Bernard of Clairvaux and Thomas Aquinas with his mystical chastity belt; to lesser monks visited by succubi in the night. Whilst the temptation *topos* frequently targets the innate evil of woman's sexuality, as it does in *La vie de sainte Paule*, there is no question of deliberate enticement in *De seynt Panuce*: the nun is in danger and the woman in distress is herself the pitiful victim of circumstances – masculine restraint is associated with protection of the weak. The poem will later suggest how married men may deal with their sexuality and attain a similar level of purity.

After the minstrel's death, Paphnutius renews his efforts to reach the highest levels of holiness, believing that he can re-invent himself through the transformative powers of ascetic practice. The saint attempts to purge his soul trapped in its fleshly body which he punishes with increasing severity:

Seynt Panuce dounk s'aforceit,
Plus ke avaunt ne feseit,
De soun corps mettre en destresce (ll.93-5)

[So St Paphnutius forced himself more than he had done before to torture his body]

The external manifestations of his endurance demonstrate an inner process of rejection of self, described by Michel Foucault as:

'a certain renunciation of the self and of reality because most of the time your self is a part of the reality you have to renounce to get access to another level of reality'.⁴⁰

In attempting to realise his goal of serving God 'par penaunce e abstinence' [through penance and abstinence] (l. 96), Paphnutius trusts in the power of his own will-power and exertion.⁴¹ In contrast, the laymen he encounters establish their piety through their humble faith that God's mercy will forgive their sins: the minstrel, for instance, fully acknowledges his past life as a sinner. Paphnutius, however, is certain of the superiority of his personal sanctity, despite the failure of his first challenge to God, and his pride leads him to demand a second time: 'hou il put trover soun peer' [where he might find his equal] (l. 101).

This time the Angel sends him to meet a 'graunt seyngnour' [great lord] (l.105) in the town. At Paphnutius' insistence, the lord gives an account of his life, starting with his sexual history:

La vie ke ay menee si est teel:
Afere de femme unke ne aveye,
Fors de cele ke est la meye;
E cele ne voley unke aprocher,

Fors en entente de enfaunt aver;
 Kaunt jeo entendi ke out conceu,
 Jeo la desportay, cum resoun fu;
 Aprés deux enfaunz ke avounms,
 Par un assent chaste vivounms;
 Ja trente aunz sount passee
 Ke ren n'y out for nettetee (ll.120-30)

[The life I have led is thus: I had no dealings with any woman except with the one who is my wife. I never tried to go near her except in order to conceive a child. When I heard that she was pregnant, I kept away from her, as is reasonable. After having two children, we agreed to live chastely. Now thirty years have passed and during this time our relationship has been utterly pure.]

Manly piety is again articulated through the lord's self-control and restraint encapsulated in the three stages of his life: chastity when single; marital celibacy, in the medieval sense of appropriate and monogamous behaviour with procreation as the sole purpose of intercourse; and, finally, thirty years of a non-sexual relationship with his wife. The exemplification of masculine purity in the married lord aims to instruct other men and the delineation of the stages of his life corresponds with John Arnold's outline of the process by which the medieval male might achieve chastity: 'by following a disciplinary programme'.⁴²

The lord's account raises two subjects of great debate during the high medieval period: first, the purpose of marriage and, second, the concept of marital celibacy as a way of life.

The lord complies with teaching established by the early Church that the true function of marriage, as of sexual intercourse, was to create children. Gratification of sexual desire was to be avoided or, at the very least, greatly controlled within marriage and the lord insists that the only reason he had had sexual relations with his wife was to produce offspring.⁴³ The couple have also observed instructions which banned intercourse during pregnancy, on the grounds that further impregnation was impossible. It was also feared that intercourse with a pregnant woman might lead to miscarriage, as Robert the Chaplain threatens in *Corset*.⁴⁴ Robert even claims that intercourse with a nursing mother

reduces the amount of milk for the infant who may starve or die because of the couple's lecherous behaviour.⁴⁵

Despite the persistence of writers like Bozon in promoting these traditional ideas on marriage, new perceptions and thoughts were surfacing by the end of the thirteenth century. Some theological writers placed less emphasis on the importance of procreation as the true purpose of marriage: even Robert the Chaplain admits that marriage was also created to provide an outlet for 'charnel desire'.⁴⁶ The Church's paradigm of marriage was evolving and acknowledging that sexual activity, legitimised by the sacrament, offered a certain degree of protection against sins such as lechery. Bishop Quivil, for example, begins the section *De matrimonio* of the Exeter statutes with the statement that the purpose of marriage is 'ad vitandum ergo huiusmodi concupiscentie malum' [to avoid thus the evil of lechery of this kind] and at no point does he mention its procreative function.⁴⁷ This is not to suggest that medieval theologians approved of unbridled sexual activity within marriage - Thomas Aquinas maintained that a man who sought solely enjoyment in the marriage bed treated his wife like a whore.⁴⁸ Church precepts attempted to impose many constraints on sexual activity - when it might take place, under what circumstances and in what form - but they were often ignored by the laity and Bozon's reiteration of established ideals may be due, in part, to a perception of widespread non-compliance which requires correction. Certain instructions may have been particularly unpopular: such as the requirement that newly-married couples should spend two days praying and performing acts of charity before intercourse might take place.⁴⁹ Modern commentators have claimed that there were often sound social or economic reasons for disregard of Church rulings. Ruth Mazo Karras, for example, describes the practice of 'resource polygyny' in which elite men fathered illegitimate sons in order to create a group of men who would act in support of their half-siblings, their father's legitimate offspring.⁵⁰

The second subject raised in the lord's account is the agreement the couple have reached to live together in 'matrimonial chastity' or 'spiritual marriage', concepts which had been embedded in the clerical ideologies of conjugal behaviour since the early Christian era. As theologians like Augustine and Peter Lombard had affirmed over the

centuries, the theory of marriage was defined not by sexual relations but by the couple's mutual consent. Church insistence on this contractual requirement upheld an individual's right to a degree of self-determination, although it was frequently contested by the powerful agencies of a patriarchal society. Consent created a valid marriage and was quite separate from the consummation of a sexual union, as Gratian makes clear:

‘Matrimonium enim non facit coitus, sed voluntas ...
Coniugalis pactio, non virginitatis defloratio facit
matrimonium’.⁵¹

[Intercourse does not make a marriage, assent does ... the contract of betrothal, not the deflowering of virginity, makes a marriage].

There were, however, challenges to the efficacy of consent alone and conflicting views were reflected in the differences between the French Church, which merely required words of assent, and the Italian Church, which considered that physical consummation was also necessary. Bishop Quivil attempts a compromise - there are stages in the completion of the union:

per sponsalia de futuro initiatur, per mutuum consensum de
presenti ratificatur, per carnalem copulam consummatur.⁵²

[is initiated with betrothal for future marriage, is ratified by mutual consent concerning the present and is consummated by sexual intercourse].

The lord and his wife have followed Church instruction in their marital relationship and they have produced children; that stage was completed thirty years ago and the couple have agreed to live celibate lives within a spiritual union, a practice which appears to have become prominent during the medieval period when marriage became an important issue for the Church. The couple's relationship typifies what Dyan Elliott designates as ‘the late and relatively unspectacular transitional model of spiritual marriage’, as opposed to a marital union

in which a couple vow from the beginning to preserve their virginity.⁵³ The latter arrangement was often compared to the marriage of Mary and Joseph, an unconsummated union which canonists had great difficulty in categorizing as a marriage.⁵⁴

The lord is careful to affirm that the move to chastity has been agreed by his wife, since both spouses had to take the vow which was deemed inviolable. Indeed the lady may have welcomed certain advantages of spiritual marriage which were particularly appealing to some married women. This pious way of life offered the possibility of social and financial autonomy, of escape from male authority as well as the certainty of no further pregnancies. Although there is little firm evidence that many couples actually made the formal vow, the ideal retained its interest and importance, as demonstrated in the relationship between the noble Elzéar and Delphine.⁵⁵ The benefits of spiritual marriage may well have resonated at Campsey amongst a group of widows and women living separately from their husbands. Freedom from the domination of a husband might, however, prove to be ephemeral: a matron such as St Elizabeth might be required to submit to the will of another dominant male, often a man of religion like her confessor, Conrad. Amongst these arguments, spiritual marriage became, in Elliott's words: 'a protected, but uncomfortable, middle ground between celibacy and marriage in Christian practice'.⁵⁶

The lord humbly accepts the duties and responsibilities he owes to those around him; his piety is based on his social position and obligations as a landowner and judge with a conscience regarding his civic duty. He tells Paphnutius of his ethical and generous treatment of other people: he has given hospitality to strangers (ll.133, 4) and money to the poor (ll.135, 6); he has behaved correctly in his dispensation of justice (ll.137-42) and has never allowed his servants to threaten others (ll.143-6). The lord has not let his animals trespass on neighbouring property (ll. 147, 8) but has permitted the poor to grow cereals on parts of his land (ll.149-52); he has made peace between neighbours in disputes (ll.153,4) - all because he aims to please and serve God (ll.155, 6). The poem emphasises the significance of ethical principles in guiding the lord's life summed up as 'dreyture' [righteousness] (l.158), as the lord's spiritual values are incorporated into his secular life and temporal duties. This highly gendered virtue is created by the day-to-

day activities of the lord as a leading member of the lay community, and underlines the importance of civic piety demonstrated in medieval wills, for instance, by contributions towards the upkeep or building of roads and bridges. The tropes of space have been manipulated and normalised so that virtue is nurtured in the neutral urban environment as successfully as in the remote *loci* of traditional spirituality.

Paphnutius now invites the lord to the desert to experience the life of poverty which, the saint insists, offers a final step towards union with God:

Un degré uncore vous faut;
Plus est haut[e]l poverté amée,
Ke nule richesse ben use (ll.160-2)

[You must move to a higher stage; poverty is more greatly valued than any fortune {even when} put to good use]

Despite the prevalence of misery and destitution in medieval society, numerous men and women, both lay and religious, shared Paphnutius' views and adopted a life of voluntary poverty as part of a spiritual discipline. This mode of life was interpreted as a new form of religious and social agency which mirrored the lives of the Apostles and was supported by scriptural references such as the narrative of Christ and the rich young man (Matthew XIX: 16-24). The ideal of poverty remained a prominent theme of both lay and clerical religiosity for many years.

Paphnutius explains that the lord should:

Refuser tut ke a mound apent,
Honour, richesce e tenement;
A poverté vous donez e penaunce (ll.169-71)

[Reject all worldly things, honour, riches and property; give yourself to poverty and penance]

Although the rejection of wealth and property is deemed vital, there is a subtle disparity between the construct of voluntary poverty depicted in *De seynt Panuce* and the customary ideal of an existence

stripped of all material goods and comforts. The poem envisions an association between poverty and the qualities of humility and submission, highlighting the rejection of the individual will and the acceptance of obedience to God: ‘obedience’ is mentioned twice (ll. 163,188); the text suggests it is better to be guided by God ‘ke user propre volente’ [than follow your own will] (l.166); and the order is given, ‘fetes ceo ke Deu vous dit’ [do what God tells you] (l.168). This version of voluntary poverty demands humility, not absolute poverty, nor, presumably, ascetic practices which, the poem suggests, may be driven by pride. Humble obedience is crucial to Bozon’s vision of the ideal life of poverty but this does not, necessarily, indicate a life of penury.

The treatment of issues of money and possessions elsewhere in the poem also reveals inconsistencies and ambiguities. On the one hand, for example, Paphnutius extols the rejection of all worldly goods but, on the other, he commends the use of wealth for appropriate purposes such as giving charity to the poor. Like other Franciscans,⁵⁷ Bozon was concerned with the realities of a money-based economy and on occasion his work reveals a good understanding of financial transactions.⁵⁸ By the mid-fourteenth century, mendicant friars were no longer credible as ‘pauperes Christi’ but were frequently censured for having abandoned the apostolic ideal to embrace lives that were more worldly and materialistic.⁵⁹ Barbara H. Rosenwein and Lester K. Little demonstrate how developments in mendicant spirituality simultaneously rejected monetary wealth but also reflected the growing justification of the moral function of money:

The social achievement of the friars consisted in their confronting and eventually de-mystifying the taboo of monetary commercial transactions, starting by outright rejection, then by incorporating elements of commercial practice into their spirituality, and finally by helping to justify worldly commerce in a modified and carefully circumscribed form.⁶⁰

This ambiguity is reflected in *De seynt Panuce* which recognises money not as a source of evil but as a potential force for good, provided

it is used properly as demonstrated in the generous charity of the lord and the compassionate gift of the robber.

God approves of the decision of Paphnutius and the lord to return to the desert, intervening when their boat is not fully prepared for the voyage they must make (ll. 178-81). Thanks to divine aid, the poem relates, the two men pass through the waters and arrive safely on the far shore, 'tut sek' [completely dry] (l.181). This episode provides the only instance of a miracle in *De seynt Panuce*, unlike the marvellous events and visions which proliferate in *La vie de saint Paule le hermite* and reveal the customary association between medieval saints and miracles. Moreover, the modest miracle in *De seynt Panuce* is the result of God's direct intervention, not the agency of the saint. Church thinking had evolved on matters relating to miraculous and supernatural activity since the scholarly debates of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries and greater emphasis was now placed on the powers of observation, rationality and hard evidence. Catherine Rider, for example, notes the caution of theologians and canon lawyers in commenting on accusations of bewitchment in marital disputes involving sexual impotence and she discerns:

a wider tendency in medical and scientific writing from the twelfth century onwards to reduce the area of human experience attributable to the supernatural by looking for natural explanations first.⁶¹

This development is also reflected in the arrangements for papal canonisation in the early thirteenth century which demanded verifiable information that would live up to the standards of evidence required by canon law.⁶² For instance, the lists and reports used in Elizabeth's canonisation process in 1235 demonstrate the increasing need for factual and reliable accounts and a cautious approach to the supernatural. Not only did the commission require the long testimony of the *Libellus de dictis quatuor ancillarum* [Booklet containing the oral evidence of the four maidservants] but Elizabeth's miracles, which consisted predominantly of healing the sick, had been earlier validated and 'differ from the often fable-like stories of earlier miracle lists'.⁶³ Bozon's *Vie de seynte Elizabeth* reflects this restrained depiction of the saint's abilities. It is possible, therefore, that the lack of reference in *De*

seynt Panuce to miracle-working by the saint stems from a growing perception that saintly identity is defined as much by exceptional piety as the ability to create miracles.

De seynt Panuce celebrates the humility of the two laymen but divulges comparatively little about the piety of Paphnutius' life; indeed, he demonstrates few of the traditional saintly qualities and is a fallible human being. Yet he is acknowledged as a holy man by the two lay protagonists and, at his death, he is escorted to heaven by the Angel, with the accompanying music of the heavenly host (ll. 205-9). The Angel tells him that he has merited this reward (ll. 209, 10) and, in the final sentence of the poem, he reveals the deceit practised on Paphnutius: God recognised his worth from the very beginning but wanted to teach him a lesson:

Kaunt vous desirastes de saver
 Ky fut au secle vostre peer,
 Jeo vous moustray deux seculiers,
 Ke orguyl ne entrat en vos quers. (ll. 211-14)

[When you wanted to know who was your equal on earth, I showed you two laymen so that arrogance would not enter your heart]

The Angel's comment, however, identifies the saint's fatal flaw – his pride in his own abilities and endeavours. While mapping out the qualities of two exemplary laymen, the narrative has also tracked the saint's progress, from his struggle with arrogance, through humble acknowledgement and acceptance of other men's worth, to the fulfilment of his sainthood.

The holy layman epitomised in *De seynt Panuce* is, in many respects, a virtual monk since he has accepted the restraints of chastity, obedience and poverty. The typology of the monk had been tried and tested over centuries and the traditional set of monastic virtues is simply amended to fit the lay model. This is unsurprising in a text which promotes concepts and ideas that are deeply embedded in the traditional ideology of the Church and which reiterates customary instruction: the need for sexual restraint; the procreative function of

marriage; the necessity of obedience to God. The poem provides a blueprint for lay conduct by adhering to well-established monastic virtues but the process also serves the additional function of endorsing lay status. Since both pious laymen and professed religious have analogous attributes, they may be considered spiritual equals. Moreover, *De seynt Panuce* recognises that the layman has further duties to perform in providing for those around him. He is a social agent whose ethical conduct has an essential part to play in the discharge of civic responsibilities – the text displays a fresh orientation towards the duties of status in this highly gendered model of virtue.

Thus, despite the vein of conservative thoughts and ideas, *De seynt Panuce* is an innovative type of *vita* which transfers the instructional potential of the exemplum to the hagiographic tale.⁶⁴ The poem reflects developments in contemporary society, doubtless of interest to the Campsey community of women, many of whom retained a degree of social influence in aristocratic circles. Bozon recognises that new times require new saintly exemplars, secular and imperfect perhaps, like the reformed robber, leading lives that appear to replicate lay experience. Even the sanctity of designated holy men is demystified: Paphnutius has the external markers of the saint – he communicates with the Angel, for instance – but he is no timeless stereotype, being a fallible human being who must overcome hubris.

Most significantly, perhaps, the poem adds insight into how the good Christian may navigate a society perceived to be in flux and in which traditional values are breaking down. Many old certainties are overturned: saintly figures may be ambiguous, lacking essential qualities such as humility; asceticism may be the expression not of personal religiosity but of self-pride; old tropes become inconsistent: the city represents good, evil or, eventually, neutral space. The disruption of accustomed order outlined in *De seynt Panuce* calls for expediency: absolute values may no longer be relevant and should give way to practical approaches and attitudes to human activity and behaviour. The life of poverty, for instance, is desirable but problematic for those who live in the world; yet the ideal may be moderated and re-construed on a different basis. Similarly, divine approval is forthcoming when proceeds of crime are used to charitable ends. The poem suggests that it is often difficult to distinguish good from evil: they are relative terms and must be judged in context. This pragmatism is particularly evident

in the poem's treatment of wealth and possessions, approving the rejection of worldly goods but also validating the important function of wealth in a monetary economy – where money is essential to charity, and charity is essential to piety. The pious layman must add the ability to make realistic and reasonable judgements to his otherwise monkish character.

Notes

- 1 André Vauchez, *Les laïcs au Moyen Âge: Pratiques et expériences religieuses* (Paris, Editions du Cerf, 1987), p. 10. Vauchez deems this ‘une des innovations majeures de ce temps dans le domaine religieux’ [one of the major advances in religious life at this period]. All translations are mine.
- 2 See http://margot.uwaterloo.ca/campsey/CmpBrowserFrame_e.html: Campsey 2 (Pnc): Nicole Bozon, De s. Panuce. For discussion of the ms., see Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, *Saints' Lives and Women's Literary Culture c. 1150-1300: Virginity and its Authorizations* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2001); and Delbert Russell, ‘The Campsey Collection of Old French Saints' Lives: A Re-examination of its Structure and Provenance,’ *Scriptorium* LVII (2003): 51-83.
- 3 Rachel S. Stone, ‘The Rise and Fall of the Lay Moral Elite in Carolingian Francia’ in *La culture du haut Moyen Âge: une question d'élites?* ed. François Bougard, Religine Le Jan and Rosamond McKitterick (Turnhout, Brepols, 2009), pp. 363-375.
- 4 See Mathew Kuefler, *The Making and Unmaking of a Saint: Hagiography and Memory in the Cult of Gerald of Aurillac* (Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014).
- 5 *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils*, ed. and trans. Norman P. Tanner, vol.1 (London, Sheed & Ward and Georgetown University Press, 1990), p. 230.
- 6 See Vauchez's comments on Innocent: André Vauchez, *La sainteté en Occident aux derniers siècles du Moyen Âge (1198-1431)* (Rome, École française de Rome, 1981), p. 142. Elsewhere Vauchez stresses how Homebon's reputation was limited to his local area until the 15th c.: André Vauchez, ‘Le ‘trafiquant céleste’: Saint Homebon de Crémone (†1197), marchand et ‘père des pauvres’ in *Horizons marins, itinéraires spirituels (Ve - XVIIIe siècles)*, vol. I. *Mentalités et sociétés*. Etudes réunies par Henri Dubois, Jean-Claude Hocquet, André Vauchez (Paris, Publications de la Sorbonne, 1987), pp. 115-122 (115).

-
- 7 Frances Andrews, 'Living like the laity? The negotiation of religious status in the cities of late medieval Italy', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* (Sixth Series) 20 (2010): 27-55; and Frances Andrews, *The Early Humiliati* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2000).
- 8 Pecham's syllabus was based on the fourteen Articles of Faith, the Decalogue, the two evangelical precepts, the Seven Works of Mercy, the Seven Deadly Sins, the Seven Virtues and the Seven Sacraments. See *Councils and Synods with other Documents relating to the English Church*, II, A.D. 1205-1313, Part ii 1265-1313, ed. F.M. Powicke and C. R. Cheney (Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1964), pp. 900-5.
- 9 Bishop of Exeter (1280-91). For the statutes, see Powicke, *Councils*, pp. 982-1059; the *Summula*, pp. 1059-77.
- 10 For an overview of all *pastoralia*, see the pioneering work of Fr. Leonard E. Boyle OP. See, too, Joseph Goering's seminal work, *William de Montibus (c.1140-1213): The Schools and Literature of Pastoral Care*, Studies and Texts 108 (Toronto, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1992) For pastoral literature in the vernaculars of England, see the final chapters of William Pantin, *The English Church in the Fourteenth Century* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1955), especially Chapter 10, 'Religious and Moral Treatises in the Vernacular', pp. 220-43.
- 11 Pantin, *The English Church*, p. 250.
- 12 Tanner, *Decrees*, pp. 242-4, canons 14-19.
- 13 Geoffroi de Charny, *The Book of Chivalry of Geoffroi de Charny: Text, Context and Translation*, ed. Richard W. Kneuper and Elspeth Kennedy (Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 1996). For the spirituality of the knight, see section 42, 'The Orders of Priesthood and Knighthood Compared', pp. 180-90.
- 14 Rober le Chapelain, *Corset, a Rhymed Commentary on the Seven Sacraments*, ed. K.L. Sinclair, Anglo-Norman Text Series 52 (London, Anglo-Norman Text Society, 1995), written c.1240.
- 15 In all likelihood, a member of the large house in Nottingham. See Brian J. Levy, *Nine Verse Sermons by Nicholas Bozon: The Art of an Anglo-Norman Poet and Preacher*, Medium Aevum Monographs, New Series 1 (Oxford, Society for the Study of Mediaeval Languages and Literature, 1981), pp. 1, 2.
- 16 L.Toulmin Smith and P. Meyer eds, *Les contes moralisés de Nicole Bozon, frère mineur: publiés d'après les manuscrits de Londres et de Cheltenham*, Société des Anciens Textes Français, (Paris, Didot, 1889). Bozon's complaints resemble those of the moralist Bernard of Cluny (writing c.1150) in *Scorn for the World: Bernard of Cluny's 'De contemptu mundi'*, trans. Ronald E. Pepin (East Lansing; Woodbridge, Boydell and Brewer, 1991).

-
- 17 *Vade-mecum* handbooks (like BL MS Add.46919, the principal repository of Bozon's work) are described: David d'Avray, *The Preaching of the Friars: Sermons diffused from Paris before 1300* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1985), esp. p. 57.
- 18 Ll. 483-90 of my unpublished transcription of *Le char d'Orgueil*, MS Add. 46919, ff. 66r-74r.
- 19 For example, Bozon's lyrical poem *Pus ke homme deit morir* in MS Add. 46919, ff. 84r-84v, was translated in the same ms. by William Herebert as: *Soethye mon shal hoenme wende* [Since man must depart from here], ff. 208v-209r. The text was added to a thirteenth-century songbook, BL MS Sloane 1611, 68v. For Bozon's popularity, see the poem, *De bone femme la bounte* [The goodness of women], MS Add. 46919, ff. 93r-95, retracting anti-feminist remarks in *Le char d'Orgueil* which had incurred allegedly widespread fury.
- 20 All Bozon's female saints are found in BL MS Cotton Domitian A.XI (*St Elizabeth*, ff. 101r-103v). For Margaret, Mary Magdalen and Martha, see M. Amelia Klenke, ed., *Three Saints' Lives by Nicholas Bozon*, History Series 1 (St Bonaventure N.Y., Franciscan Institute, 1947). For Lucy, Elizabeth, Christine, Juliana, Agnes and Agatha, see Klenke, ed., *Seven More Poems by Nicholas Bozon*, History Series 2 (St Bonaventure N.Y., Franciscan Institute, 1951).
- 21 The Campsey MS is the sole repository of *Panuce* and *Paule*. All Bozon's hagiographical works are written in rhyming octosyllabic couplets.
- 22 Both Jocelyn Wogan-Browne and Delbert Russell believe that Bozon's *Vies* were added while the manuscript was in the possession of a female community: Wogan-Browne, *Saints' Lives*, p. 10; Russell, 'The Campsey Collection': 58. The repetition of certain codicological features (such as the writing of all the *Vies*, except Katherine, across quire boundaries) has convinced Russell that the original material was a planned compilation and in footnote 26, p. 59 he also states: 'In my view the same scribal hand has written all of items 4-13 and a second hand made revisions'. However, Wogan-Browne concludes: 'it is unfortunately not possible to be completely precise about the patronage and production of the Campsey book in our present state of our knowledge,' *Saints' Lives*, p. 12.
- 23 For lists drawn up of suitable reading material (often following the liturgical year), see Donatella Nebbiai-Dalla Guarda, 'Les listes médiévales de lectures monastiques. Contribution à la connaissance des anciennes bibliothèques bénédictines', *Revue bénédictine*, vol. 96, no. 3-4 (1986): 271-326.
- 24 The main body of the Campsey MS contains 10 *Lives*: (12th c.) Katherine of Alexandria, Edmund, Archbishop of Canterbury, Edward the

- Confessor, Thomas Becket; (13th c.) Audrey of Ely, Osith, Faith, Modwenna, Richard of Chichester (otherwise ordered in ms).
- 25 Wogan-Browne, *Saints' Lives*, p. 136. Marilyn Oliva also demonstrates how noble women were attracted to the Campsey community: Oliva, *The Convent and the Community in Late Medieval England: Female Monasteries in the Diocese of Norwich, 1350-1540* (Woodbridge, Boydell Press, 1998), p. 122.
- 26 Both Wogan-Browne and Russell link the manuscript with the aristocratic widow Isabella, 'a figure leading on the one hand to the aristocratic community of Campsey and on the other to the devotional, social, and political aspects of saints' cults at courts': Wogan-Browne, *Saints' Lives*, p. 151.
- 27 For a discussion of the medieval female public, see Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, "Clerc u lai, muïñe u dame": Women and Anglo-Norman Hagiography in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries' in Carol M. Meale, *Women and Literature in Britain, 1150-1500*, vol. 17 (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1993), pp. 61-85.
- 28 Russell, 'The Campsey Collection': 68.
- 29 See Brigitte Cazelles, *The Lady as Saint: A Collection of French Hagiographic Romances of the Thirteenth Century* (Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 1991), pp. 151-171.
- 30 Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend: Readings on the Saints*; trans. William Granger Ryan; intro. Eamon Duffy (Princeton, N.J.; Woodstock, Princeton University Press 2012), pp. 84, 5.
- 31 Gordon Hall Gerould, 'The Hermit and the Saint', *PMLA*, vol. 20, no. 3 (1905): 529-45.
- 32 Frederic C. Tubach, *Index Exemplorum: A Handbook of Medieval Religious Tales* (Helsinki, Suomalainen Tiedeakatemia, 1969). For similar tales: nos. 2560 (p. 202), 2894 (p. 226), 3113 (p. 247), 3175 (p. 247 - like *Panuce*, a hermit visits a married man who is in a chaste marriage and uses his money well).
- 33 Robert Mannyng of Brunne, *Handlyng Syyne*, ed. Idelle Sullens, Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies 14 (Binghamton, N.Y., Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, State University of New York, 1983), ll.1915-996. See Tubach, no. 3113 for exemplum of St Macarius.
- 34 Hall Gerould, 'The Hermit', p. 539.
- 35 Musicians regularly employed in an elite household were held in some regard but prevailing medieval views were unfavourable towards minstrels, especially when they travelled or led disorderly lives; see John Southworth, *The English Medieval Minstrel* (Woodbridge, Suffolk; and Wolfeboro, N.H., Boydell and Brewer, 1989), p. 2. See the subtitle 'conflicting images of the medieval minstrel' of Chapter 6 in Gretchen Peters, *The Musical*

Sounds of Medieval French Cities: Players, Patrons, and Politics (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2012), p. 218.

- 36 My thanks to Professor Ian Short for help with this translation.
- 37 The mistreatment of women and fear of rape is a frequent theme of chronicles of warfare: see, for example, the English soldiers who saved women and nuns from violation at the siege of Caen in Jean Froissart, *The Chronicles of Froissart*, trans. John Bourchier, Lord Berners, ed. G.C. Macaulay (New York, Harvard Classics; P. F. Collier & Son, 1910), p.13. <http://legacy.fordham.edu/halsall/basis/froissart-full.html>. (accessed 30/12/2015).
- 38 Since prosecution of rape had to be led by the victim, court records show few charges: see Chapter 8: "Whose Story Was This? Rape Narratives in Medieval English Courts," in Barbara A. Hanawalt, *Of Good and Ill Repute: Gender and Social Control in Medieval England* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1998), pp. 124-41. Clergymen were frequently the perpetrators; see Kathryn Gravdal, *Ravishing Maidens: Writing Rape in Medieval French Literature and Law* (Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 1991), p. 125. Gravdal also suggests the normalisation of rape through textual discourse. See, too, the subject of rape in texts of male formation in Marjorie Curry Woods, 'Rape and the Pedagogic Rhetoric of Sexual Violence' in Rita Copeland ed., *Criticism and Dissent in the Middle Ages* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1996), pp. 56-86.
- 39 The implications of terms like chastity/virginity/ purity etc. are discussed in the context of sexual politics by John H. Arnold, 'The Labour of Continence: Masculinity and Clerical Virginity' in Ruth Evans, Sarah Salih, Anke Bernau eds, *Medieval Virginities* (Toronto and Buffalo, University of Toronto Press, 2003), pp. 102-18. My use of these terms is less rigorous, since my focus is on the promotion of a single masculine ideal.
- 40 Michel Foucault, *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*, ed. Luther H. Martin, Huck Gutman and Patrick H. Hutton (Amherst, Mass., University of Massachusetts Press, 1988), p.35
- 41 This criticism may, of course, also reflect the negative response of a mendicant such as Bozon to movements like the Flagellants. See Gary Dickson, 'Encounters in Medieval Revivalism: Monks, Friars, and Popular Enthusiasts', *Church History*, vol. 68, no. 2 (1999): 265-293: 274.
- 42 Arnold, 'The Labour', p.112.
- 43 For the views of Augustine and Jerome, see section 'The Role of Sex in Marriage' in James A. Brundage, *Law, Sex and Christian Society in Medieval Europe* (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1987), esp. pp. 89-91.

-
- 44 Rober le Chapelain, *Corset*, l.154.
- 45 Idem, ll.159-62.
- 46 Idem, l. 208.
- 47 Powicke, *Councils*, p. 996.
- 48 Cited in Brundage, *Law*, p. 448.
- 49 The period of sexual abstinence has been attributed to the influence of the prayers that commonly concluded the marriage service, based on a blessing from the Book of Tobit VII: 15. See J.-B. Molin and P. Mutembe, *Le rituel du mariage en France du 12e au 16e siècle* (Paris, Beauchesne, 1974), pp. 202-4.
- 50 Ruth Mazo Karras, *Unmarriages: Women, Men, and Sexual Unions in the Middle Ages* (Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012), p. 69.
- 51 Gratian, *Decretum Magistri Gratiani, Corpus Iuris Canonici editio Lipsiensis secunda*, ed. Emil von Friedberg (Leipzig, Tauchnitz, 1879; repnt Graz: Akademische Druck-und Verlags-anstalt, 1959), secunda pars, causa xxvii, quest. ii, c.v, p. 1064.
- 52 Powicke, *Councils*, p. 996.
- 53 Dyan Elliott, *Spiritual Marriage: Sexual Abstinence in Medieval Wedlock* (Princeton, NJ., Princeton University Press, 1993), p. 219.
- 54 For discussion, see Elliott, *Spiritual Marriage*, pp. 176-83, and Penny Gold, ‘The Marriage of Mary and Joseph in the Twelfth-Century Ideology of Marriage’ in *Sexual Practices and the Medieval Church*, ed. Vern L. Bullough and James Brundage (Buffalo, N.Y., Prometheus Books, 1982), pp. 102-17.
- 55 Dyan Elliott identifies only ninety cases between the fourth and fifteenth centuries, *Spiritual Marriage*, Appendices 1-7. For Elzéar and Delphine, see Vauchez, *Laïcs*, pp. 211-24.
- 56 Elliott, *Spiritual Marriage*, p. 50.
- 57 See example in Adam J. Davies, ‘A Thirteenth-Century Franciscan Money Manager: Archbishop Eudes Rigaud of Rouen, 1248-1275’, *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, vol. 56, no. 3 (2005): 431-54.
- 58 In the poem *Pus ke honnme deit morir*, MS Add. 46919, ff. 84r-84v, ll. 40-2, Bozon uses the language of double entry book-keeping (generally thought to date from the end of the 14th c.).
- 59 See Penn R. Szittya, ‘The Antifraternial Tradition in Medieval Literature’, *Speculum*, vol. 52, no. 2 (1977): 287-313.
- 60 Barbara H. Rosenwein and Lester K. Little, ‘Social Meaning in the Monastic and Mendicant Spiritualities’, *Past and Present*, No. 63 (1974): 4-32: 31. Ian Wei discusses the stance of the Church and of religious orders towards money and usury in Ian P. Wei, *Intellectual Culture in Medieval Paris: Theologians and the University c.1100-1330* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2012), pp. 293-355.

-
- 61 Catherine Rider, *Magic and Impotence in the Middle Ages* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2006), p. 71.
- 62 For a brief description of the exclusive papal prerogative to award sainthood, see Gábor Klaniczay, *Holy Rulers and Blessed Princesses. Dynastic Cults in Medieval Central Europe*, trans. Éva Pálmai (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 232-3. For full discussion of systemic changes, see part two of André Vauchez, *La sainteté en Occident aux derniers siècles du Moyen Age d'après les procès de canonisation et les documents hagiographiques*, Bibliothèque des Ecoles Françaises d'Athènes et de Rome vol. 241 (Rome, Ecole Française, 1981), pp. 71-120.
- 63 Klaniczay, *Holy Rulers*, p. 420.
- 64 This did not lead to a popular trend, however, as in the late Middle Ages audiences preferred the prolific 'bizarre and sometimes lurid' tales of saints revered as powerful helpers and healers. Eamon Duffy, *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England, c.1400-c1580*, (New Haven, Conn.; London, Yale University Press, 2nd edn 2005), p. 174.

