

The impact of onshore wind power projects on ecological corridors and landscape connectivity in Shanxi, China

Article

Accepted Version

Creative Commons: Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0

Guo, X., Zhang, X., Du, S., Li, C., Siu, Y. L., Rong, Y. and Yang, H. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9940-8273 (2020) The impact of onshore wind power projects on ecological corridors and landscape connectivity in Shanxi, China. Journal of Cleaner Production, 254. 120075. ISSN 0959-6526 doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.120075 Available at https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/88509/

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See <u>Guidance on citing</u>.

To link to this article DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.120075

Publisher: Elsevier

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the <u>End User Agreement</u>.

www.reading.ac.uk/centaur



CentAUR

Central Archive at the University of Reading

Reading's research outputs online

1 The impact of onshore wind power projects on ecological

2 corridors and landscape connectivity in Shanxi, China

3 4

Xinya Guo^a, Xingqi Zhang^{b*}, Shixun Du^a, Chao Li^a, Yim Ling Siu^c, Yuejing Rong^d, Hong Yang^{e,f*}

5 6

⁷ ^a Research Center for Eco-Environment Sciences in Shanxi, Taiyuan 030000, China

8 ^b School of Geography and Ocean Sciences, Nanjing University, Nanjing 210023, China

9 ^c School of Earth & Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds LS2 9JT, UK

^d Research Centre for Eco-Environmental Sciences, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100085,
 China

12 ^eCollaborative Innovation Center of Atmospheric Environment and Equipment Technology, Jiangsu

13 Key Laboratory of Atmospheric Environment Monitoring and Pollution Control (AEMPC), School

of Environmental Science and Engineering, Nanjing University of Information Science &
 Technology, 219 Ningliu Road, Nanjing 210044, China

- 17 UK
- 18
- 19

*Corresponding authors: X. Q. Z. (zxqrh@nju.edu.cn) or H. Y. (hongyanghy@gmail.com)

20

21 Abstract: The wind power industry has developed rapidly in China, but the effect of wind power 22 projects on the ecosystem is far from being clearly understood. The objective of this study is to 23 evaluate the negative impact of wind power plants on the ecosystem. In this research, least-cost 24 distance and least-cost path models were employed to establish potential ecological corridors based 25 on the resistance at the site of the wind power projects—which is located in the ecological function 26 area in Qinyuan, South Shanxi Province, China. The landscape connectivity was evaluated using a 27 set of connectivity indices. In addition, the impact on the corridor patency, length, and the 28 connectivity between ecological corridors were analyzed. The results showed that the wind power 29 projects could not only significantly increase the migration resistance that hampers the formation of ecological corridors of the species at the landscape scale, but also have an obvious cutting effect on 30 31 the landscape—resulting in an increase in the length of the ecological corridors and a decrease in 32 corridor patency and landscape connectivity. There was also a positive relationship between the 33 increase in length and the distance between the source patches. In addition, the connectivity was 34 enhanced with the increase in distance threshold. This study evaluated the ecological impact of 35 onshore wind power projects at the landscape level, filling the gap in research on landscape ecology, 36 especially in the protected area with key ecological function. Meanwhile, the results are beneficial to guide the location selection for wind power projects and minimize their negative impact on the 37 38 key ecological corridors.

39 Key words: Wind power project; Ecological corridor; Landscape connectivity; Migration resistance

- 40
- 41

42 1. Introduction

43 China's economy has developed rapidly in the last four decades at the cost of the degradation 44 of its ecology and environment (Yang et al., 2012; Yang et al., 2014a). The root cause for the 45 ecosystem degradation is the heavy reliance on fossil fuels, particularly coal (Han et al., 2018). At 46 present, China is still in the process of rapid urbanization and industrialization, and the demand for 47 energy continues to grow. Maintaining the balance between rapid economic growth and environmental protection has been a big challenge for China (Yang, 2014; Yang et al., 2013). In the 48 49 last decade, China has made great efforts to reverse the environmental degradation. One of the most 50 important measures is to gradually reduce coal consumption and increase the use of renewable 51 energy—reshaping the energy structure of China (Dai et al., 2016; Yang et al., 2016; Yang et al., 2017). 52

53 Wind power is an important form of renewable energy. With the increasing demand for energy, 54 wind power is considered to be a promising source of renewable energy as a result of its technical 55 maturity, low cost, flexible installation, simple operation, spatial efficiency, and minimal pollution 56 (Hepbasli et al., 2004). In China, the wind power industry has developed rapidly due to 57 technological progress, power guiding policies, and improved energy price mechanism (Feng et al., 58 2015; Sun et al., 2015). Along with the expansion of wind power industry, there are many studies 59 on wind power technology (Khosravi et al., 2018; Zhao et al., 2015; Zhou et al., 2010), industrial 60 development (Alexandre et al., 2012; Luo et al., 2016; Zhao et al., 2013), policy recommendations 61 (Kang et al., 2012; Liu et al., 2010; Wolsink, 2010), and economic analyses on the investment and 62 operation (Li et al., 2013).

63 However, there are potentially adverse environmental and ecological impacts of wind power 64 projects, which should not be overlooked (Leung et al., 2013). The low frequency noise generated 65 by rotating turbines can detrimentally impact humans and other organisms (Laratro et al., 2014; 66 Wasala et al., 2015). The lights and shadows also visually impact the local communities (Juan et al., 67 2004). Additionally, the turbine blades can interfere with radio signals (Mroziński et al., 2015). Research on the ecological impact of wind power projects mainly focused on their influence on 68 69 animals and plants (Escobar et al., 2015; Welcker et al., 2016; Whang et al., 2015). The impact may 70 be direct, such as deaths caused by the rotating turbines (Peste et al., 2015; Wang et al., 2015); or 71 indirect, such as the damage caused to foraging and breeding by habitat loss (Braunisch et al., 2015; 72 Law et al., 2018; Madsen et al., 2008; Pescador et al., 2019). Moreover, the operation of the wind 73 farm can affect vegetation species and biomass (Fagúndez, 2010).

In particular, it is worth noting that the construction of wind power projects changed the 74 75 original landscape. The landscape pattern determines the landscape's characteristics, such as spatial 76 heterogeneity, landscape diversity, landscape connectivity, and so on (Cook, 2002; Peng et al., 2015). 77 Landscape process refers to the circulation and migration of internal and external material, energy, 78 information, as well as the evolution of the landscape system (Klunder, 2004). The effects of wind 79 power projects stem from substance retrospection above the landscape scale—which is crucial for 80 ecological corridor construction, the maintenance of ecosystem function, and regional ecological 81 security (Skarin et al., 2015). The fragmentation of the landscape pattern blocks the material flow, 82 the information flow, and the species flow-affecting the landscape's ecological processes and 83 damaging landscape (Liu et al., 2005).

84 The environmental impact of wind power projects can be analyzed using Geographical 85 Information System (GIS) methods. GIS-based spatial models have been applied to effectively

assess the impact of wind farms on animal behavior and habitats (Roscioni et al., 2013). GIS-86 87 assisted approaches have also been developed and applied to predict and evaluate the visual impact 88 of wind farms (Molina-Ruiz, 2011). In addition, GIS-based approaches can be used for wind 89 resource assessment, and can also support the decision-making process by taking into account 90 comprehensive factors that address geological characteristics, economic cost, and environmental 91 constraints (Haaren et al., 2011; Li, 2018; Siyal, et al., 2015). With the development of GIS 92 technology, least-cost distance (LCD) and least-cost path (LCP) models have been increasingly 93 applied to quantitatively research ecological corridors, landscape connectivity, ecological network construction, conservation planning, and so on (Avon et al., 2016; Barrows et al., 2011; Rabinowitz 94 95 et al., 2010). Ecological corridors are land linkages which facilitate wildlife migration between 96 green spaces, and enhance landscape connectivity to promote dispersal and other types of movement 97 (Balbi et al., 2019; Zhu et al., 2005). The field observation has confirmed that migration corridors 98 and habitat connectivity for some species have been disrupted owing to the construction of onshore 99 wind power projects (Francis et al., 2018; Roscioni et al., 2014; Skarin et al., 2015). However, little 100 has been known about their potential effect on ecological processes through the fragmentation that 101 they cause at the landscape scale. Therefore, it is paramount to conduct a large scale quantitative 102 ecological impact assessment of wind power projects-coupling ecological corridor with landscape 103 connectivity-which would be necessary for the trade-off between wind power development and 104 ecological conservation.

105 Shanxi Province-which is located in the eastern part of the Loess Plateau and borders on the 106 southern part of Inner Mongolia-has abundant wind energy resources due to its geomorphological conditions—which consists of hills, deep valleys, and rugged terrain (He et al., 2014). As one of the 107 108 largest energy bases in China (Cao, 2017), Shanxi Province has been aggressively pursuing the 109 optimization of its energy structure to mitigate serious environmental pollution and ecological 110 damage (Li et al., 2018; Wei et al., 2018; Yang et al., 2012) from its high dependence on fossil fuels. 111 In recent years, large-scale centralized wind farms have been built in Shanxi (Wang et al., 2018). 112 By the end of 2017, the total installed wind power capacity in Shanxi was 8.72×10^6 kW, accounting 113 for 11% of installed electricity generation capacity. The target for wind power development in 2020 114 has been set to 16×10^6 kW, nearly double the amount in 2017 (Zhou et al., 2018). Although an 115 environmental impact assessment is required for the wind farm project, the impact on ecological 116 corridor and landscape connectivity is largely oversimplified or even ignored. Hence, 117 comprehensively understanding the ecological corridor and the landscape connectivity is necessary 118 to provide a macro-perspective ecological impact analysis at a landscape scale.

This study made the effort to fill the gap in research regarding the impact of wind power projects on ecological corridor and landscape connectivity in Shanxi Province. The main research aims of the study are: (1) to estimate the effects of wind power projects on ecological corridor by simulating the corridor construction process under multiple influence factors in the selected constructed wind power area; and (2) to explore how the landscape connectivity is affected by the wind power projects by estimating relevant connectivity indices through the use of resistance distance.

126 The rest of the paper is organized as follows. In Section 2, two important approaches— 127 selecting the origination of landscape process, and determining the distribution of the resistance 128 surface with multiple factors including wind farms—were used as the basis for applying LCD and 129 LCP methods to assess ecological corridor and landscape connectivity. In Section 3, the spatial distribution characteristics of the research region were presented, and the status of ecological corridor patency, corridor length, and landscape connectivity in the area before and after the construction of wind power projects were compared to assess changes in the migration routes and the landscape connectivity. In Section 4, the reasons for onshore wind power's adverse effects on landscape's ecological indicators were discussed, and some suggestions to mitigate the effects were proposed.

136

137 **2. Material and Methods**

138 2.1 Study Area

139 The Taivue Mountain Wind Power Project-possessing a capacity of 250MW-is located north of Qinyuan County within Shanxi Province, China (36°51'N, 112°3'E) (Fig. 1). The project 140 141 was proposed in 2010, and went into operation in 2014. The study area—which includes the turbines, roads, and a buffer area of 2 km—covers an area of 165.68 km² and reaches a height of around 2100 142 143 m above sea level (asl). The average annual wind speed is 7.2 m/s and the wind power density is 144 319 W/m², showing significant potential for developing wind power plants. The study area is located 145 in a warm temperate semi-arid and semi-humid continental monsoon climate zone, with an annual 146 mean temperature of 8.6 °C and an annual average precipitation of 656.7 mm. The main soil type 147 is mountain meadow soil, and the main types of vegetation are short grasses and alpine plants 148 (Zhang, 2016).

The Taiyue Mountain Wind Power Project is the first wind power project to be built and put into production in the southeastern region of Shanxi Province. The study area is located in the ecological function area for water conservation—which is one of the most typical subalpine meadows in Shanxi Province. In addition, the wind power project lies in the experimental area of Mianshan Nature Reserve (Fig. 2). Due to its ecological importance, this area was selected to assess the ecological impact of the wind power projects.

155

156 2.2 Data

157 Landsat TM images with a resolution of 30 m—spanning the research period of 2005-2017— 158 were obtained from the Geospatial Data Cloud (http://www.gscloud.cn/search). These images were used to analyze the Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI). NDVI indicates the amount 159 of green vegetation present in the pixel by measuring the difference between near-infrared—which 160 is strongly reflected by vegetation-and the absorbed red light. Higher NDVI values denote more 161 green vegetation in the pixel. The Landsat TM images in 2005 and 2017 were classified into 162 163 different land use types. The locations of the wind turbines and the distances from the turbine were 164 obtained from the Landsat TM images in 2017. These images were processed using the Environment 165 for Visualizing Images (ENVI) Version 5.0 (Esri, Redlands, CA). The slope and relief were obtained 166 using the Global Digital Elevation Model (GDEM) from the Geospatial Data Cloud 167 (http://www.gscloud.cn/sources/?cdataid=302&pdataid=10), with a spatial resolution of 30 m. 168 Daily precipitation data was provided by Shanxi Meteorological Station and calculated by using 169 Kriging interpolation in ArcGIS 10.2 (Esri, Redlands, CA). The vegetation coverage was calculated 170 based on the NDVI as follows:

171
$$Vegetation \ coverage = \frac{NDVI - NDVI_{min}}{NDVI_{max} - NDVI_{min}}$$
(1)

where *NDVI_{min}* and *NDVI_{max}* represent the minimum and maximum value of NDVI,
respectively.

174

175 **2.3 Methods**

176 The methodology of this research is schematically illustrated in Figure 3. First, to identify the 177 starting point of ecological changes, the source patches were selected based on a variation trend analysis of the NDVI. Second, ArcGIS was applied to build a landscape resistance surface that 178 179 synthesized the multiple factors affecting the landscape process in the wind farms. Third, LCD and 180 LCP methods were used to establish the ecological corridors derived from the source patches and 181 the landscape resistance surface. A connectivity analysis was performed using a set of connectivity indices based on the resistance of corridors. Finally, the effects of the wind power projects on the 182 ecological corridor and the landscape connectivity were assessed based on corridor patency, corridor 183 184 length, and connectivity indices.

185

186 **2.3.1 Selection of source patches**

In landscape ecology, source patches are basic units that can promote the development of the landscape ecological process (Leitao et al., 2002; Sun et al., 2018). In general, high vegetation cover areas can provide more suitable habitats—which are important for the survival of wildlife (Jiménez-Alfaro et al., 2016). In order to study the species migration process in the areas with good vegetation cover as indicated by the NDVI, the pixels with an increasing trend in the NDVI that linked up with each other to form a continuous area were selected as the sources, and were outlined with a closed curve.

Monadic linear regression trend analysis can simulate the changing trend of each grid,
reflecting the spatiotemporal variations of the whole area. The change trend of NDVI was evaluated
by using the following Monadic linear regression equation (Stow et al., 2003):

197

$$S = \frac{n \times \sum_{i=1}^{n} (i \times NDVI_i) - (\sum_{i=1}^{n} i) (\sum_{i=1}^{n} NDVI_i)}{n \times \sum_{i=1}^{n} i^2 - (\sum_{i=1}^{n} i)^2}$$
(2)

199

200 where *S* is pixel's NDVI change rate; *n* is total years, *i* is an annual sequence; *NDVI*_{*i*} is the 201 NDVI value in the year of *i*. *S* can reflect the improvement or degradation of the NDVI. S > 0202 indicates an increase in the NDVI with time. The larger the value is, the more apparent the 203 improvement is. On the contrary, S < 0 indicates a decrease in NDVI with time.

204

205 **2.3.2 Determination of resistance surface**

Resistance surfaces are the basis for modeling connectivity and designing conservation initiatives (Zeller et al., 2012). Different methods can be used to quantify the resistance surface. In order to avoid the risk of oversimplification, a range of indicators were used to calculate the migration resistance.

Land cover type and topography are two basic factors affecting the landscape (Diffendorfer et al., 2014). Slope and topography are the resistance factors affecting vegetation growth (Zhao et al., 2014). In addition to the direct impact on the natural environment, noise pollution and visual impact caused by the wind power projects also affect the migration of species. The low frequency noise and the shadows on the ground generated by the rotation of the turbines negatively impact the ecosystem (Juan et al., 2004; Laratro et al., 2014; Wasala et al., 2015). The species need to keep a certain distance away from the turbines to avoid its negative effects. Based on these, the land use type, slope, relief, vegetation coverage, the impact on vegetation, noise pollution, and visual impact were selected as factors in the assessment of the migration resistance.

219 Vegetation growth can be affected by climate change and human activity. Wind power projects, 220 as a kind of human activity, has certain effects on vegetation. In order to assess the impact of wind 221 power projects on vegetation, the impact of climate change needs to be eliminated. The residual 222 analysis method, proposed by Evans and Geerken (2015), was used to conduct a regression analysis 223 of the NDVI and the climate indicators for each pixel in order to obtain the prediction value of the 224 NDVI—which can be considered as the effect of climate factors on the NDVI. Then, the vegetation 225 influenced by human activities was calculated as the difference between the real NDVI value and 226 the predicted NDVI value as follows:

- 227
- 228 229

 $\varepsilon = NDVI_{real} - NDVI_{predicted} \tag{3}$

where ε is the residual value of NDVI for each pixel. $\varepsilon > 0$ indicates a positive impact caused by human activities; $\varepsilon = 0$ means no impact; and $\varepsilon < 0$ suggests a negative impact. *NDVI*_{real} is the real NDVI value of the pixel, which was obtained from Landsat TM images. *NDVI*_{predicted} is the NDVI value which was predicted by the linear regression equation between NDVI and climate indicators. Since the study area is located in a mountainous region with limited water, the main factor reflecting climate characteristics is precipitation, and the NDVI change is largely correlated with precipitation (Zhao et al., 2011).

According to the *in-situ* survey of the wind power projects, the blade length of the turbines is about 45 m. Shadows of different lengths are formed on sunny days. Considering the effect of the noise, a distance of at least 200 m between the wind turbines and residential areas or roads would be considered safe (Wang, 2011). The attenuation effect of the turbines' noise in the air is mainly related to the propagation distance. With attenuation, the noise contribution value at 500 m from the turbines is less than the minimum noise level in the night (Wang, 2011). Therefore, the noise pollution and visual impact can be calculated by the distance from the turbine.

For a landscape factor, the resistance value was determined according to the different degrees of impact on migration. Table 1 summarizes the relative resistance values of different landscape factors. Within the resistance value range of 1-100, the species move freely when the resistance value is close to 1. However, they cannot move when the value is close to 100. The resistance value of the forest was the smallest, followed by grassland, farmland, and construction land. The larger the slope and the relief are, the greater the resistance value is.

The comprehensive analysis was performed to synthesize the spatial layers of each factor by running ArcGIS. Each resistance factor was classified using the reclassify tool and the corresponding resistance value was assigned to each landscape unit for each factor layer. The resistance surface was determined by overlaying these factor layers together.

254

255 2.3.3 Establishment of ecological corridors by Least-cost distance and Least-cost path

The relationship between the landscape pattern and the ecological process is the core of landscape ecology (Fu et al., 2011). The landscape pattern and the spatial combination 258 characteristics of different landscape elements are relatively static in a given period of time, but the 259 real ecological process can be dynamic during the same period. Source-sink landscape theory breaks through this limitation in the traditional sense-making the landscape pattern dynamic and 260 reflecting both the influence of the pattern on the process and the effect of the process on the pattern 261 262 (Chen et al., 2003; Chen et al., 2008). The approaches for regulating the ecological process were analyzed based on the spatial balance of the "source" landscape. The extension of species to the 263 264 surroundings is a process of competitive control of land use, which must be achieved by overcoming 265 the resistance, so the resistance surface can reflect the spatial trend of species migration. With the 266 advantage of evaluating the landscape spatial patterns by analyzing the effects of different landscape types on the target species, the LCD and the LCP have been applied to evaluate the impact of 267 268 different land use types on the ecological flow (Balbi et al., 2019; Chetkiewicz et al., 2009). 269 Similarly, the LCD and the LCP models were used to establish ecological corridors based on the 270 resistance surface in this study (Walker et al., 1997).

271 LCD is the accumulated cost distance of the most likely route where an individual would take 272 to move between two habitat patches (Walker et al., 1997). Since many factors affect species 273 migration, a range of distances rather than only one is used, causing variation in species dispersal 274 distances (Adriaensen et al., 2003). In the LCD model, a single path of least resistance between two 275 nodes is identified based on the resistance surface (Adriaensen et al., 2003). All paths between two 276 habitat patches are used to calculate resistance distance, which represents the effective distance 277 separating the two habitat patches for a species (Ayon et al., 2016). Resistance distance has been 278 widely used to evaluate the functional landscape connectivity between patches (Avon et al., 2016; 279 Rabinowitz et al. 2010; Richard et al., 2010). In addition, LCP is the single path for a species to 280 move between two source patches.

Both the LCD and the LCP methods were performed in ArcGIS 10.2. In the LCD model, cumulative cost from each pixel to the nearest source was obtained by inputting the previously derived source patches and resistance surface. As a further calculation based on the LCD, the LCP identified a singular least cost path connecting every two source patches based on cumulative cost. These paths were the potentially ecological corridors.

286

287 2.3.4 Assessment of landscape connectivity

The connectivity of each habitat patch in the network was assessed using a measure of the relative change in the integral index of connectivity (IIC) and probability of connectivity (PC) (Pascual-Hortal and Saura 2006; Saura and Pascual-Hortal 2007) following the equations: 291

292

$$IIC = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \frac{a_i \times a_j}{1 + nl_{ij}}}{A_L^2}$$
(4)

 A_L^2

$$\Pi C = \frac{A_L^n}{A_L^2}$$

$$PC = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n \sum_{j=1}^n a_i \times a_j \times P_{ij}}{A_L^2}$$
(5)

where a_i and a_j are the area of each habitat patch; nl_{ij} is the number of links in the shortest path (topological distance) between patches *i* and *j*; A_L is the total area; and P_{ij} is the maximum product probability of all paths between patches *i* and *j*. If patches *i* and *j* are close enough, the maximum probability path will simply be the step between nodes *i* and *j*. If patches *i* and *j* are more distant, the maximum probability path will probably be composed of several steps through intermediate 300 stepping stone patches.

The impact of the wind power projects on landscape connectivity of core patches was evaluated by using the equivalent connected area (ECA)—which includes the equivalent connected area of integral connectivity (EC(IIC)) and the equivalent connected area of probability connectivity (EC(PC))—using Conefor 2.6 (Saura and Torne, 2009).

305

306 **3. Results**

307 **3.1 Spatial patterns of the NDVI variation trend and the resistance surface**

Figure 4 and Table 2 show the statistical characteristics of the NDVI changing trends during the 2005-2017 period. The variation trends were divided into serious degradation ($S \le -0.01$), degradation ($-0.01 < S \le -0.005$), unchanged (-0.005 < S < 0.005), increase (0.005 < S < 0.01), and significant increase (S > 0.01), according to their *S* values. Approximately 59.35% of the NDVI values remained basically unchanged, 26.69% of the NDVI showed an increasing trend, and 13.97% of the NDVI showed a decreasing trend.

The NDVI values in the northern part of the study area were less affected by human activities and illustrated a period of growth through their increasing trend. Despite the effect of human activities and climate change, the NDVI of shrub and grassland in the central and southern parts of the study remained largely unchanged during the study period.

318 The NDVI variation trend was related to the change in the type of land use. Table 3 and Figure 319 5 show the different land use categories with and without the wind power projects. Forests-320 including the deciduous broad-leaved forest, the evergreen needle forest, and the deciduous broad-321 leaved shrub—accounted for 77.13% of the whole area in 2017. Grassland, which includes grass 322 and meadow, accounted for 14.10%. Farmland, residential land, and industrial land areas accounted 323 for 3.04%, 0.09% and 5.64% respectively. Compared to the period before the construction of the 324 wind power projects in 2005, the area of the main patterns of land use in the source patches—the 325 evergreen needle forest and the deciduous broad-leaved forest-increased in 2017. This indicates 326 that the ecosystem of the source patches was less impacted by the wind power projects.

Figure 6 shows the spatial distribution of the different landscape resistances with and without the wind power projects. The resistance distribution is continuous, and low resistance dominated in the study area without wind power projects. When the wind power projects were built, the resistance values were obviously stratified, and the largest resistance values appeared in area of the wind power projects.

332

333 **3.2** Effects of wind power projects on the ecological corridor and the landscape connectivity

334 Based on the NDVI evaluation results, seven sources were identified in the study area. 335 Considering the ecological corridors with the least cumulative resistance, potential ecological 336 corridors connecting every two source patches with and without the wind power projects were 337 created based on the LCD values (Fig. 7). There were seven sources in different locations throughout 338 the study area. In order to maintain landscape connectivity and ensure that species can move 339 smoothly between sources, every two source patches were connected by an ecological corridor. The 340 overlap of ecological corridors with and without the wind power projects was small, indicating that 341 the construction of wind power projects had changed the ecological corridors.

343 3.2.1 Effects on corridor patency

344 Figure 8 shows the before and after comparison of the resistance increment resulting from the 345 wind power projects. The construction of the wind power projects reduced the corridor patency 346 between the source patches, which is reflected in the increase in the LCD values. Although the LCD 347 values of one corridor decreased, this corridor does not go through the region of the wind power 348 projects-indicating minimal impact by the wind power projects on this corridor. The average, minimum and maximum of the LCD increased to 1019.66, 71.35, and 3557.43 respectively. The 349 350 high resistance corridors generally crossed over the wind power projects, resulting in an enhanced 351 reduction effect on the corridor patency.

352

353 3.2.2 Effects on corridor length

354 Figure 9 shows the comparison of the corridor length increment between before and after the 355 wind power projects were built. The wind power projects lengthened most of the corridors, thus 356 increasing the migration distance. The length of one corridor decreased, while the lengths of others 357 increased by different levels-with the average increase being 95 km. The increase was related to 358 the distance between the source patches. The farther the distance was, the larger the increase was. 359 The distance between the source patches of no.1 and no.7 was the largest, which made the length of 360 the corridors increase by 119.460 km. A thorough change in the route between source patches of 361 no.3 and no.5 led to a 6.5-fold increase in the corridor length.

The relationships between the rate of reduction of the corridor patency and the rate of increase of the corridor length were expressed as P=0.268 L-24.804 and L=3.499 P+125.726, where P is the reduction rate (%) of the corridor patency and L is the increase rate (%) of the corridor length. The determination coefficient (R²) is 0.937, indicating a well-fitted linear relationship.

366

367 3.2.3 Effects on landscape connectivity

368 Habitat network models were used to calculate a set of connectivity indices-including EC(IIC) and EC(PC)-using Conefor 2.6. The patch connectivity is related to the scales of different 369 370 ecological processes, and the calculation of the connectivity index needs to specify the distance 371 threshold for the patch connectivity (Ramirez-Reyes et al., 2016). When the resistance distance 372 exceeds the distance threshold, the two patches are not related. Otherwise, they are related. According to the real LCD values, 1000, 3000, and 5000 were set as the distance thresholds-373 374 representing weak, medium, and strong migration ability respectively (Table 4). Comparing the before and after values indicates that the construction of the wind power projects weakened the 375 ecological processes of different migration abilities. The reduction rates of EC(IIC) under different 376 377 distance thresholds were 25.09%, 0.85%, and 0 respectively. The reduction rates of EC(PC) under 378 different distance thresholds were 11.06%, 3.91%, and 2.35% respectively. The value of the 379 connectivity index increased gradually along with the growth of the distance threshold, indicating 380 that the larger the scale of the ecological process was, the higher the connectivity of the same 381 landscape was.

383 4. Discussions

384 4.1 NDVI variation trend and resistance surface characteristics

The LCD model was used to identify the ecological corridors in this study. In the application of a concrete model, the source patches and the resistance surface should be considered. The source patches were identified based on the NDVI variation trend. Potential ecological corridors connecting the source patches were calculated based on the resistance surface value.

389 Wind power projects not only include large sized turbines (point projects), but also additional 390 associated infrastructure required to support an array of turbines, such as roads and electrical 391 transmission lines (line projects). Although the turbine footing occupies marginal land, there are 392 numerous turbines and they span a wide range of area. The study area mainly consisted of high-393 quality land conducive to the growth of forest and meadow, and the construction of the wind power 394 projects unavoidably destroyed the original vegetation. Meanwhile, the construction of turbines and 395 roads caused various levels of interference to the landscape structure, wildlife movement, and the 396 land use change in the surrounding areas (Fu et al., 2010; Loro et al., 2015; Obermeye et al., 2011; 397 Shi et al., 2018). The range of interference may be further expanded with large scale development. 398 As shown in Table 1, the resistance value was negatively correlated with the vegetation coverage 399 and the distance from the turbine, so the construction of the wind power projects contributed 400 significantly to the increased resistance.

401

402 **4.2** Effects of wind power projects on the ecological corridor and landscape connectivity

403 Ecological corridors can be the habitat of wildlife, and they can act as a channel, source, sink, 404 obstruction, and filter for biological movement-serving many functions such as biodiversity 405 conservation, contamination filtration, erosion prevention, and flood control (Forman, 1995; Zhu et 406 al., 2005). As an industrial zone with fully equipped infrastructure to support specific targeted 407 industries, the wind power projects are not conducive for the formation of ecological corridors due to the lack of ecological function. In addition, the wind power projects-as pointed and linear 408 409 landscape units—have an obvious cutting effect on the landscape (Kuvlesky et al., 2007; Obermeye 410 et al., 2011). It cut the entire landscape into isolated patches, causing an extensive fragmentation of the landscape and the isolation of wildlife. Therefore, the wind power projects negatively impact 411 412 the ecological corridor patency, the ecological corridor length and the landscape connectivity through their construction of turbines and their development of infrastructure such as roads. 413

On the one hand, the construction of the wind power projects altered the direction of the 414 415 corridors between the source patches in the landscape—which hindered the migration and diffusion 416 of species (Kuvlesky et al., 2007)-leading to the reduction in corridor patency. On the other hand, the construction of the wind power projects also changed the landscape structure and weakened the 417 418 species exchange among the patches. A species can move a larger geographical distance through 419 permeable landscapes than through high resistance landscapes (Avon and Berges, 2016). When the 420 species has to migrate over high resistance areas, the corridor length increases at the same time. Our 421 results confirm the significant relationship between the rate of increase of the corridor length and 422 rate of reduction of the corridor patency. The corridor length increased greatly due to corridor 423 change, leading to an increase in the resistance. Even though the distance in the source patches 424 between no.1 and no.2 decreased, the resistance still increased. Increased resistance means that the 425 ecological corridors with rich biodiversity and important ecological functions will play less 426 important roles. Clearly, the negative impact of wind power projects should not be ignored. Wildlife 427 are sensitive to human infrastructure and activity, and they have to adjust their migration routes to 428 avoid the low frequency noise and the shadows on the ground generated by the rotation of the 429 turbines (Cabrera-Cruz et al., 2016; Harrison et al., 2017).

430 In addition, studies found that the landscape configuration became fragmented and the 431 connectivity of the natural landscape declined along with wind energy development (Kuvlesky et 432 al., 2007; Obermeye et al., 2011). The wind power projects in the study area include 164 turbines 433 and 80 connecting roads. The construction has an obvious cutting effect on the landscape, causing 434 landscape fragmentation and a decline in connectivity. Fragmentation is detrimental to both the 435 integrity of the ecological systems and the long-term viability of associated wildlife, and may 436 magnify the deleterious effects on species and ecosystems by limiting the species' ability to adapt or migrate (Ewers et al., 2006). Therefore, the protection of the current ecological corridors and the 437 438 construction of new ones in appropriate locations should be prioritized.

439

440 **4.3 Comparison between the current study with previous results**

441 This study focuses on ecological corridors and landscape connectivity to better reflect the 442 landscape pattern and the landscape ecological structure. In view of the ecological impact of onshore 443 wind power projects, there are some differences in research objectives, methods, and results between 444 this study and previous studies (Table 5). Unlike many previous studies-which focused on particular species (especially birds)—this study instead focused primarily on the landscape ecology 445 to determine the potential ecological corridor-which provide the paths for wildlife migration and 446 447 plays an important role in connecting the isolated and dispersed ecosystem (Zhu et al., 2005). Our 448 purpose was to quantitatively evaluate the ecological impact of the wind power projects on the 449 ecological corridor and the landscape connectivity. Meanwhile, with the GIS technology, this study took into account the specific elements of the wind power projects to accurately assess their impact 450 on the ecosystem. Previous studies showed that the construction of wind power projects altered the 451 452 migration corridors (Cabrera-Cruz et al., 2016; Harrison et al., 2017; Pocewicz et al., 2013; Skarin 453 et al., 2015)-reinforcing our results which depicted changes in the ecological corridors with respect 454 to wildlife migration.

455

456 **4.4 Implication and application of the results**

Landscape planning for species of concern requires detailed knowledge of the amount and the quality of habitats as well as the connectivity or spatial configuration of habitats (Fahrig, 2001). The construction of an ecological corridor is beneficial for the conservation of biodiversity. Landscape connectivity is an important factor to consider during the decision-making process. The wind power projects can be routed optimally so that the disturbance can be minimized.

The construction of projects at different stages can have various effects on ecosystems (Hazem et al., 2019; Lin, 2018). In order to reduce the negative impact of a wind power project on the landscape ecology, an ecological impact assessment should be carried out strictly before the construction, and ecological restoration should be carried out properly after construction. It is necessary to scientifically plan and identify the optimal location for wind power projects. A quantitative assessment of the impact of the wind power projects on the ecological corridor and the landscape connectivity is the foundation of scientific planning in ecologically sensitive areas.

Figures 8 and 9 show a comparison of the impact on the ecological corridor with and without the 469 470 wind power projects, and Table 4 shows the comparison of the impact on landscape connectivity which can be used to evaluate the ecological impact of the proposed wind power projects before 471 their construction. Traditionally, the location selection of the wind power projects focuses on local 472 473 wind resources, but its negative effects on ecosystems should not be ignored. According to the 474 results in Figures 7, 8, and 9, and Table 4, in order to minimize the impact of the wind power projects 475 on the ecological system, the following steps need to be undertaken. First, attention must be given 476 to the ecological corridors that suffer significant changes due to wind farm construction. Second, the wind farms that affect these corridors should be identified. Lastly, suitable locations for the wind 477 478 farms should be selected based on the degree of their impact on the ecosystem. In addition, 479 ecological restoration is mainly to improve the ecosystem service functions. In our study area, the 480 main aim of ecological restoration is to improve water conservation and maintain biodiversity. 481 Around the constructed area of the wind power projects, local dominant species of dwarf grass and 482 alpine plants—such as purple fescue, lanceola, and others—should be planted.

This study analyzed the ecological impact of the wind power projects at the landscape level in Shanxi Province, filling the gap in research on the same. In addition, this study focused on the preconstruction and the operational phase of the wind farms, thus beneficially guiding the selection of locations for future wind power projects by avoiding the key ecological corridors in the area. Reducing carbon emissions by replacing fossil fuels with renewable energy has received increasing attention in most countries. In the meantime, measures are still needed to mitigate the environmental and ecological impacts caused by the development of renewable energy (Yang et al., 2014b).

490

491 **4.5 Limitation and future study**

492 Similar to many existing studies, this study also has its limitations. The LCD method has been 493 widely used for landscape ecology evaluation (Avon et al. 2016; Chen et al. 2017), but it is difficult 494 to accurately set the resistance values. Due to a lack of observational data, the simulation results 495 were not able to be calibrated—possibly incorporating a certain level of bias within the results. 496 However, the performance evaluation is based on the comparative data, and is not informed by 497 direct simulations of the observed results. For this reason, the impact of bias on the calculated results 498 due to uncertainty regarding the resistance values is minor (Shi et al., 2018). In addition, this study 499 did not analyze the obstructed situation of different species such as flying birds, large animals, and 500 small animals—which could affect the pertinence of the calculation results. Even so, the ecological influence of the wind power projects revealed in this study can facilitate sustainable wind power 501 502 development in the future (Francis et al., 2018; Skarin et al., 2015). In future studies, field 503 observations of the migration of different species can be applied to further improve the simulation 504 results.

505

506 **5. Conclusions**

507 This study evaluated the impact of onshore wind power projects on the ecological corridors 508 and the landscape connectivity in the Taiyue Mountain Wind Power Project in Qinyuan, Shanxi, 509 China.

510 The results showed that the wind power project not only significantly increased the resistance 511 to the formation of ecological corridors at the landscape level, but also had an obvious cutting effect

on the landscape—resulting in an increase in the length of the ecological corridors and a decrease 512 513 in the corridor patency and the landscape connectivity. The resistance distribution determines the 514 construction of corridors that are beneficial for species migration. When the wind power projects were built, the resistance value was obviously stratified, and the largest resistance value appeared 515 516 in the area of wind power projects. The construction of the wind power projects reduced the corridor 517 patency between the source patches, which was reflected in the increase in the migration resistance. 518 The average increased value and rate were 1019.66 and 148.63% respectively. The construction of 519 the wind power projects altered the direction and length of the corridor between the source patches, which hindered the migration and diffusion of species. The wind power projects caused most 520 521 corridors to grow in length, and the average length increased by 95 km. The further the distance was, 522 the larger the increased value was. The relationships between the rate of reduction in corridor 523 patency and the rate of increase in corridor length were expressed as P=0.268 L-24.804 and L=3.499 524 P+125.726 (P is the rate of reduction (%) in corridor patency and L is the rate of increase (%) in 525 corridor length). The construction of the wind power projects weakened the landscape connectivity, 526 which was illustrated by the reduction of the connectivity indices. In addition, the larger the scale 527 of the ecological process was, the higher the connectivity of the same landscape was. When 528 resistance thresholds were 1000 m, 3000 m, and 5000 m, the reduction rates of EC(IIC) were 25.09%, 529 0.85%, and 0 respectively; while the reduction rates of EC(PC) were 11.06%, 3.91%, and 2.35% 530 respectively.

531 Our results indicate the ecological impact of wind power plants, and therefore it is crucial for 532 strict ecological impact assessments to be conducted before the construction of wind power plants. 533 Afterwards, its ecological damage should be minimized by undertaking comprehensive ecological 534 restoration.

535

536 Acknowledgements

We thank Geospatial Data Cloud, Shanxi Meteorological Station for the NDVI, the DEM data
and the meteorological data. This work was supported by the Natural Science Foundation of Shanxi
Province (2014012003) and open funded by the Jiangsu Key Laboratory of Atmospheric
Environment Monitoring and Pollution Control (KHK1806)—a project funded by the Priority
Academic Program Development of Jiangsu Higher Education Institutions (PAPD).

543 **Ref**

- 13References
- Adriaensen, F., Chardon, J. P., De Blust, G., Swinnen, E., Villalba, S., Gulinck, H., Matthysen, E.,
 2003. The application of 'least-cost' modeling as a functional landscape model. Landscape and
 Urban Planning 64, 233-247. doi: 10.1016/S0169-2046(02)00242-6
- Alexandre Château, F., Chang, Y.C., Chen, H., Ko, T. T., 2012. Building a stakeholder's vision of
 an offshore wind-farm project: A group modeling approach. Science of the Total Environment
 420, 43-53. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2012.01.031
- Avon, C., Berges, L., 2016. Prioritization of habitat patches for landscape connectivity conservation
 differs between least-cost and resistance distances. Landscape Ecology 31, 1551-1565.
 doi:10.1007/s10980-015-0336-8
- Balbi, M., Petit, E. J., Croci, S., Nabucet, J., Georges, R., Madec, L., Ernoult, A., 2019. Ecological
 relevance of least cost path analysis: An easy implementation method for landscape urban

- doi: 10.1016/j.jenvman.2019.04.124
- Barrows, C. W., Fleming, K. D., Allen, M. F., 2011. Identifying Habitat Linkages to Maintain
 Connectivity for Corridor Dwellers in a Fragmented Landscape. The Journal of Wildlife
 Management 75, 682-691. doi: 10.1002/jwmg.138
- Braunischa, V., Coppesa, J., Bächlea, S., Suchant, R., 2015. Underpinning the precautionary
 principle with evidence: A spatial concept for guiding wind power development in endangered
 species' habitats. Journal for Nature Conservation 24, 31-40.
- 563 doi: 10.1016/j.jnc.2015.01.003
- Cabrera-Cruz, S. A., Villegas-Patraca, R., 2016. Response of migrating raptors to an increasing
 number of wind farms. Journal of Applied Ecology, 1-9. doi: 10.1111/1365-2664.12673
- Cao, X., 2017. Policy and regulatory responses to coalmine closure and coal resources consolidation
 for sustainability in Shanxi, China. Journal of Cleaner Production 145, 199-208. doi:
 10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.01.050
- Chen, C. D., Wu, S.J., Meurk, C. D., lv, M. Q., Wen, Z. f., Jiang, Y., Chen., J. L., 2015. Effects of
 changing cost surface values on landscape connectivity simulation. Acta Ecologica Sinica 35,
 7367-7375. doi: 10.5846/stxb201404010611
- 572 Chen, C., Meurk, C. D., Jia, Z. Y., Lv, M. Q., Wu, S. J., Jia, J. S., 2017. Incorporating landscape
 573 connectivity into household pond configuration in a hilly agricultural landscape. Landscape
 574 and Ecological Engineering 13, 189-204. doi: 10.1007/s11355-016-0317-3
- 575 Chen, L. D., Fu, B. J., Xu, J. Y., Gong, J., 2003. Location-weighted landscape contrast index: a
 576 scale independent approach for landscape pattern evaluation based on "Source-Sink"
 577 ecological processes. Acta Ecologica Sinica 23, 2406-2413.

578 doi: 10.3321/j.issn:1000-0933.2003.11.025

- 579 Chen, L. D., Fu, B. J., Zhao, W. W., 2008. Source-sink landscape theory and its ecological
 580 significance. Frontiers of Biology in China 3, 131-136. doi: 10.1007/s11515-008-0026-x
- 581 Chetkiewicz, C. L. B, Boyce, M. S., 2009. Use of resource selection functions to identify
 582 conservation corridors. Journal of Applied Ecology 46, 1036-1047.
 583 doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2664.2009.01686.x
- Cook, E. A., 2002. Landscape structure indices for assessing urban ecological networks. Landscape
 and Urban Planning 58, 269-280. doi: 10.1016/s0169-2046(01)00226-2
- Dai, H. C., Xie, X. X., Xie, Y., Liu, J., Masui, T., 2016. Green growth: The economic impacts of
 large-scale renewable energy development in China. Applied Energy 162: 435-449.
 doi: 10.1016/j.apenergy.2015.10.049
- Diffendorfer, J. E., Compton, R. W., Magar, V., 2014. Land Cover and Topography Affect the Land
 Transformation Caused by Wind Facilities. PLoS ONE 9, e88914.
- 591 doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0088914
- Escobar, L. E., Juarez, C., Medina-Vogel, G., Gonzalez, C. M., 2015. First Report on Bat Mortalities
 on Wind Farms in Chile. GAYANA 79, 11-17.
- 594 doi: 10.4067/S0717-65382015000100003
- Evans, J., Geerken, R., 2004. Discrimination between climate and human-induced dryland
 degradation. Journal of Arid Environments 57, 535-554.
 doi: 10.1016/S0140-1963(03)00121-6
- 598 Ewers, R. M., Didham, R. K., 2006. Confounding factors in the detection of species responses to

⁵⁵⁵ planning. Journal of Environmental Management 244, 61-68.

- babitat fragmentation. Biological Reviews 81, 117-142. doi: 10.1017/S1464793105006949
- Fagúndez, J., 2008. Effects of wind farm construction and operation on mire and wet heath
 vegetation in the Monte Maior SCI, north-west Spain. Mires and Peat 4, 1-12. In:
 http://www.mires-and-peat.net/, ISSN 1819-754X.
- Fahrig, L., 2001. How much habitat is enough? Biological Conservation 100, 65-74.
 doi: 10.1016/S0006-3207(00)00208-1
- Feng, Y., Lin, H., Ho, S. L., Yan, J., Dong, J. N., Fang, S. H., 2015. Overview of wind power
 generation in China: Status and development. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 50,
 847-858. doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2015.05.005
- Forman, R. T. T., 1995. Some general principles of landscape and regional ecology. Landscape
 Ecology 10, 133-142. doi: 10.1007/BF00133027
- Francis, O., Safi, Kamran., Aryal, Jagannath., 2018. Predicting Migratory Corridors of White Storks,
 Ciconia ciconia, to Enhance Sustainable Wind Energy Planning: A Data-Driven Agent-Based
 Model. Sustainability 10, 1470. doi: 10.3390/su10051470
- Fu, B. J., Chen, L. D., Ma, K. M., Wang, Y. L., 2011. The principle and application of landscape
 ecology. Beijing: Science Press.
- Fu, W., Liu, S., Degloria, S. D., Dong, S. K., Beazleyc, R., 2010. Characterizing the "fragmentation–
 barrier" effect of road networks on landscape connectivity: A case study in Xishuangbanna,
 Southwest China. Landscape and Urban Planning 95, 122-129.
- 618 doi: 10.1016/j.landurbplan.2009.12.009
- Haaren, R. V., Fthenakis, V., 2011. GIS-based wind farm site selection using spatial multi-criteria
 analysis (SMCA): Evaluating the case for New York State. Renewable and Sustainable Energy
 Reviews 15, 3332-3340. doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2011.04.010
- Han, S., Chen, H., Long, R., Cui, X., 2018. Peak coal in China: A literature review. Resources,
 Conservation and Recycling 129, 293-306. doi: 10.1016/j.resconrec.2016.08.012
- Harrison, A. L., Petkov, N., Mitev, D., Popgeorgiev, G., GoveGeoff, B., Hilton, M., 2017. Scaledependent habitat selection by wintering geese: implications for landscape management.
 Biodiversity and Conservation 27, 167-188. doi: 10.1007/s10531-017-1427-4
- Hazem, R. T., Breesam, H. K., 2019. Development of Possible Solution to Overcome Factors
 Influence on Sustainable Construction Process. Civil Engineering Journal 5, 1506-1517.
 doi: 10.28991/cej-2019-03091348
- He, G., Kammen, D. M., 2014. Where, when and how much wind is available? A provincial-scale
 wind resource assessment for China. Energy Policy 74, 116-122.
 doi: 10.1016/j.enpol.2014.07.003
- Hepbasli, A., Ozgener, O., 2004. A review on the development of wind energy in Turkey.
 Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 8, 257-276. doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2003.10.006
- Jiménez-Alfaro, Borja., Chytrý, M., Mucina, L., Grace, J. B., Rejmánek, M., 2016. Disentangling
 vegetation diversity from climate-energy and habitat heterogeneity for explaining animal
 geographic patterns. Ecology and Evolution 6, 1515-1526. doi: 10.1002/ece3.1972
- Juan, P. H., Joaquin, F., Jorge, L. P., 2004. Spanish method of visual impact evaluation in wind
 farm. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 8, 483-491.
 doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2003.12.009
- Kang, J. j., Yuan, J. H., Hu, Z. G., Xu, Y., 2012. Review on wind power development and relevant
 policies in China during the 11th Five-Year-Plan period. Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Reviews 16, 1907-1915. doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2012.01.031 643 644 Khosravi, S., Zamanifar, M., Derakhshan-Barjoei., P., 2018. Analysis of Bifurcations in a Wind 645 Turbine System Based on DFIG. Emerging Science Journal 2, 39-52. doi: 10.28991/esj-2018-01126 646 647 Klunder, G., 2004. The search for the most eco-efficient strategies for sustainable housing 648 construction; Dutch lessons. Journal of Housing and the Built Environment 19, 111-126. 649 doi: 10.1023/b:joho.0000017709.65252.e4 650 Kuvlesky, W. P., Brennan, L. A., Morrison, M. L., Boydston, K. K., Ballard, B. M., Bryant, F. C., 2007. Wind energy development and wildlife conservation: Challenges and opportunities. The 651 Journal of Wildlife Management 71, 2487-2498. doi: 10.2193/2007-248 652 653 Laratro, A., Arjomandi, M., Kelso, R., Cazzolato, B., 2014. A discussion of wind turbine interaction 654 and stall contributions to wind arm noise. Journal of Wind Engineering and Industrial 655 Aerodynamics 127, 1-10. doi: 10.1016/j.jweia.2014.01.007 656 Law, P. R., Fuller, M., 2018. Evaluating anthropogenic landscape alterations as wildlife hazards, 657 with wind farms as an example. Ecological Indicators 94, 380-385. 658 doi: 10.1016/j.ecolind.2018.06.061 659 Leitao, A.B., Ahern, J., 2002. Applying landscape ecological concepts and metrics in sustainable 660 landscape planning. Landscape and Urban Planning 59, 65-93. doi: 10.1016/S0169-2046(02)00005-1 661 662 Leung, D., Yang, Y., 2012. Wind energy development and its environmental impact: A review. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 16, 1031-1039. doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2011.09.024 663 Li, C. B., Lu, G. S., Wu, S., 2013. The investment risk analysis of wind power project in China. 664 665 Renewable Energy 50, 481-487. doi: 10.1016/j.renene.2012.07.007 666 Li, L., Lei, Y., S, Wu., He, C., Yan, D., 2018. Study on the coordinated development of economy, environment and resource in coal-based areas in Shanxi Province in China: Based on the multi-667 objective optimization model. Resources Policy 55, 80-86. 668 669 doi: 10.1016/j.resourpol.2017.10.017 670 Li, Z. D., 2018. Study of site suitability assessment of regional wind resources development based 671 on multi-criteria decision. Clean Technologies and Environmental Policy 20, 1147-1166. 672 doi: 10.1007/s10098-018-1538-y 673 Lin, F., 2018. Construction Network Ventilation System for Underground LPG Storage Cavern. 674 Civil Engineering Journal 4, 1521-1541. doi: 10.28991/cej-0309192 675 Liu, J. F., Xiao, W. F., Jiang, Z. P., Xia, F., Li, X. Y., 2005. A study on the influence of landscape 676 fragmentation on biodiversity. Forest Research 18, 222-226. doi: 10.1360/biodiv.050121 677 Liu, Y. Q., Kokko, A., 2010. Wind power in China: Policy and development challenges. Energy 678 Policy 38, 5520-5529. doi: 10.1016/j.enpol.2010.04.050 679 Loro, M., Ortega, E., Arce, R. M., Geneletti, D., 2015. Ecological connectivity analysis to reduce

- bio, M., Ortega, E., Arce, K. M., Generetti, D., 2013. Ecological connectivity analysis to reduce
 the barrier effect of roads. An innovative graph-theory approach to define wildlife corridors
 with multiple paths and without bottlenecks. Landscape and Urban Planning 139, 149-162. doi:
 10.1016/j.landurbplan.2015.03.006
- Luo, G. L., Li, Y. L., Tang, W. J., Wei, X., 2016. Wind curtailment of China's wind power operation:
 Evolution, causes and solutions. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 53, 1190-1201.
 doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2015.09.075
- 686 Madsen, J., Boertmann, D., 2008. Animal behavioral adaptation to changing landscapes: spring-

687	staging geese habituate to wind farms. Landscape Ecology 23, 1007-1011.
688	doi: 10.100//s10980-008-9269-9
689	Mojica, E. K., Watts, B. D., Turrin, C. L., 2016. Utilization Probability Map for Migrating Bald
690	Eagles in Northeastern North America: A Tool for Siting Wind Energy Facilities and Other
691	Flight Hazards. Plos One, 11, e0157807. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0157807
692	Molina-Ruiz, J., Martínez-Sánchez, M. J., Pérez-Sirvent, C., Tudela-Serrano, M. L.,
693	Lorenzo, M. L. G., 2011. Developing and applying a GIS-assisted approach to
694	evaluate visual impact in wind farms. Renewable Energy 36, 1125–1132. doi:
695	10.1016/j.renene.2010.08.041
696	Mroziński, A., Piasecka, I., 2015. Selected aspects of building, operation and environmental impact
697	of offshore wind power electric plants. Polish Maritime Research 22, 86-92.
698	doi: 10.1515/pomr-2015-0021
699	Pascual-Hortal, L., Saura, S., 2006. Comparison and development of new graph-based landscape
700	connectivity indices: towards the prioritization of habitat patches and corridors for
701	conservation. Landscape Ecology 21, 959-967. doi: 10.1007/s10980-006-0013-z
702	Pocewicz, A., Estes-Zumpf, W. A., Andersen, M. D., Copeland, H. E., Keinath, D. A., Griscom, H.
703	R., 2013. Modeling the Distribution of Migratory Bird Stopovers to Inform Landscape-Scale
704	Siting of Wind Development. PLOS ONE 8, e75363. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0075363
705	Peng, J., Liu, Y. X., Wu, J. S., Lv, H. L., Hu, X. X., 2015. Linking ecosystem services and landscape
706	patterns to assess urban ecosystem health: A case study in Shenzhen City, China. Landscape
707	and Urban Planning 143, 56-68. doi: 10.1016/j.landurbplan.2015.06.007
708	Pescador, M., Ramírez, J. I. G., Peris, S. J., 2019. Effectiveness of a mitigation measure for the
709	lesser kestrel (Falco naumanni) in wind farms in Spain. Journal of Environmental Management
710	231, 919-925. doi: 10.1016/j.jenvman.2018.10.094
711	Peste, F., Paul, A., da Silva, L. P., 2015. How to mitigate impacts of wind farms on bats? A review
712	of potential conservation measures in the European context. Environmental Impact Assessment
713	Review 51, 10-22. doi: 10.1016/j.eiar.2014.11.001
714	Obermeye, B., Manes, R., Kiesecker, J., Fargione, J., Sochi, K., 2011. Development by Design:
715	Mitigating Wind Development's Impacts on Wildlife in Kansas. PLoS ONE 6, e26698.
716	doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0026698
717	Rabinowitz, A., Zeller, K. A., 2010. A range-wide model of landscape connectivity and
718	conservation for the jaguar, Panthera onca. Biological Conservation 143, 939-945.
719	doi: 10.1016/j.biocon.2010.01.002
720	Ramirez-Reyes, C., Bateman B. L., Radeloff V. C., 2016. Effects of habitat suitability and minimum
721	patch size thresholds on the assessment of landscape connectivity for jaguars in the Sierra
722	Gorda, Mexico. Biological Conservation 204, 296-305.
723	doi: 10.1016/j.biocon.2016.10.020
724	Richard, Y., Armstrong, D. P., 2010. Cost distance modelling of landscape connectivity and gap-
725	crossing ability using radio-tracking data. Journal of Applied Ecology 47, 603-610.
726	doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2664.2010.01806.x
727	Roscioni, F., Rebelo, H., Russo, D., Carranza, M. L., Febbraro, M. D., Loy, A., 2014. A modelling
728	approach to infer the effects of wind farms on landscape connectivity for bats. Landscape
729	Ecology 29,891-903. doi: 10.1007/s10980-014-0030-2
730	Saura, S., Pascual-Hortal, L., 2007. A new habitat availability index to integrate connectivity in

- landscape conservation planning: comparison with existing indices and application to a case 731 study. Landscape and Urban Planning 83, 91-103. doi: 10.1016/j.landurbplan.2007.03.005 732
- Saura, S., Torne, J., 2009. Conefor Sensinode 2.2: A software package for quantifying the 733 734 importance of habitat patches for landscape connectivity. Environmental Modelling & 735 Software 24, 135-139. doi: 10.1016/j.envsoft.2008.05.005
- 736 Shi, H., Shi, T., Yang, Z., Wang, Z., Han, F., Wang, C., 2018. Effect of Roads on Ecological 737 Corridors Used for Wildlife Movement in a Natural Heritage Site. Sustainability 10. 738 doi: 10.3390/su10082725
- 739 Siyal, S. H., Mortberg, U., Mentis., D., Welsch, M., Babelon, I., Howells, M., 2015. Wind energy 740 assessment considering geographic and environmental restrictions in Sweden: A GIS-based 741 approach. Energy 83, 447-461. doi: 10.1016/j.energy.2015.02.044
- 742 Skarin, A., Nellemann, C., Ronnegard, L., Sandstrom, P., Lundqvist, H., 2015. Wind farm 743 construction impacts reindeer migration and movement corridors. Landscape Ecology 30, 1527-1540. doi: 10.1007/s10980-015-0210-8 744
- Stow, D., Petersen, A., Hope, A., Engstrom, R., Coulter, L., 2007. Greenness trends of Arctic tundra 745 746 vegetation in the 1990s: Comparison of two NDVI datasets from NOAA AVHRR systems. 747 International Journal of Remote Sensing 28, 4807-4822. 748
 - doi: 10.1080/01431160701264284

- Sun, S. P., Liu, F. L., Xue, S., Zeng, M., Zeng, F. X., 2015. Review on wind power development 749 750 tin China: Current situation and improvement strategies to realize future development. 751 Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 45, 589-599. doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2015.02.018
- Sun, R. H, Xie, W., Chen, L. D., 2018. A landscape connectivity model to quantify contributions of 752 753 heat sources and sinks in urban regions. Landscape and Urban Planning 178, 43-50. 754 doi: 10.1016/j.landurbplan.2018.05.015
- 755 Walker, R., Craighead, L., 1997. Analyzing wildlife movement corridors in Montana using GIS. 756 1997 ESRI International User Conference.

In: gis.esri.com/library/userconf/proc97/proc97/to150/pap116/p116.htm.

- 758 Wang, C., Liu, S., Bie, Z. H., Wang, J. H., 2018. Renewable Energy Accommodation Capability 759 Evaluation of Power System with Wind Power and Photovoltaic Integration. IFAC-760 PapersOnLine 51, 55-60. doi: 10.1016/j.ifacol.2018.11.677
- 761 Wang, S. F., Wang, S. C., Smith, P., 2015. Ecological impacts of wind farms on birds: Questions, 762 hypotheses, and research needs. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 44, 599-607. doi: 763 10.1016/j.rser.2015.01.031
- 764 Wang, S. F., Wang, S., C., Liu, J., X., 2019. Life-cycle green-house gas emissions of onshore and 765 offshore wind turbines. Journal of Cleaner Production 210, 804-810. 766 doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.11.031
- 767 Wang, Y. H., 2011. Wind noise, light and shadow from the study of environmental protection. Northeastern University. (in Chinese) 768
- 769 Wasala, S. H., Storey R. C., Norris S. E., Cater J. E., 2015. Aeroacoustic noise prediction for wind turbines using large eddy simulation. Journal of Wind Engineering and Industrial 770 771 Aerodynamics 145, 17-29. doi: 10.1016/j.jweia.2015.05.011
- 772 Wei, W., Li, P., Wang, H., Song, M., 2018. Quantifying the effects of air pollution control policies: 773 A case of Shanxi province in China. Atmospheric Pollution Research 9, 429-438.
- 774 doi: 10.1016/j.apr.2017.11.010

- Welcker, J., Nehls, G., 2016. Displacement of seabirds by an offshore wind farm in the North Sea. 775 Marine Ecology Progress 554, 173-182. doi: 10.3354/meps11812 776 777 Wolsink, M., 2010. Near-shore wind power-Protected seascapes, environmentalists' attitudes, and 778 the technocratic planning perspective. Land Use Policy 27, 195-203. 779 doi: 10.1016/j.landusepol.2009.04.004 780 Yang, H., 2014. China must continue the momentum of green law. Nature 509, 535-535. 781 doi: 10.1038/509535a 782 Yang, H., Clarke, J.L., Thompson, J.R. 2016. Nuclear energy: Improve collaboration. Science 353, 783 1107-1107. doi: 10.1126/science.aai8681 Yang, H.; Flower, R.J.; Thompson, J.R., 2012. Rural factories won't fix Chinese pollution. Nature 784 785 490, 342-343. doi: 10.1038/490342d 786 Yang, H., Flower, R.J., Thompson, J.R. 2013. China's new leaders offer green hope. Nature 493, 787 163-163. doi: 10.1038/493163d 788 Yang, H., Huang, X., Thompson, J.R., Flower, R.J. 2014a. Soil Pollution: Urban Brownfields. 789 Science 344, 691-692. doi: 10.1126/science.344.6185.691-b 790 Yang, H.; Thompson, J.R.; Flower, R.J. 2014b. Earthshaking energy development plans. Science, 791 346, 710-711. doi: 10.1126/science.346.6210.710-b 792 Yang, H., Xia, J., Flower, R.J. 2017. Locals embrace China nuclear project. Nature 542 (7642), 414-793 414. doi: 10.1038/542414c 794 Yang, H., Xie, P., Ni, L., Flower R.J. 2012. Pollution in the Yangtze. Science 337, 410-410. 795 doi: 10.1126/science.337.6093.410-a 796 Zeller, K. A., McGarigal, K., Whiteley, A. R., 2012. Estimating landscape resistance to movement: a review. Landscape Ecology 27, 777-797. doi: 10.1007/s10980-012-9737-0 797 798 Zhang, Y. R., 2016. The evaluation study of forest landscape pattern of Qinyuan County in Shanxi 799 Province. Beijing forestry university. (in Chinese) 800 Zhao, H. R., Wu, Q. W., Hu, S. J., Xu, H. H., Rasmussen, C. N., 2015. Review of energy storage 801 system for wind power integration support. Applied Energy 137, 545-553. 802 doi: 10.1016/j.apenergy.2014.04.103 Zhao, W. J., Zhang, Y., Zhu, Q. K., Li, P., Yao, W. J., Ma, H., Bo, Y. J., 2014. Effects of 803 804 Microtopography on Tree Growth Characteristics in Loess Slope of Northern Shaanxi. Journal 805 of Basic Science and Engineering 22, 69-79. 806 doi: 10.3969/j.issn.1005-0930.2014.01.008 807 Zhao, X., Tan, K., Zhao, S., Fang, J., 2011. Changing climate affects vegetation growth in the arid 808 region of the northwestern China. Journal of Arid Environments 75, 946-952. doi: 10.1016/j.jaridenv.2011.05.007 809 810 Zhao, Z. Y., Yan, H., Zuo, J., Tian, Y. X., Zillante, G., 2013. A critical review of factors affecting 811 the wind power generation industry in China. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 19, 812 499-508. doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2012.11.066 813 Zhou, W., Lou, C. Z., Li, Z. S., Lua, L., Yang, H. X., 2010. Current status of research on optimum sizing of stand-alone hybrid solar-wind power generation systems. Applied Energy 87, 380-814 815 389. doi: 10.1016/j.apenergy.2009.08.012 816 Zhou, C., Huang, G., Chen, J., 2018. A Multi-Objective Energy and Environmental Systems Planning Model: Management of Uncertainties and Risks for Shanxi Province, China. Energies 817
- 818 11, 2723. doi: 10.3390/en11102723

Zhu, Q., Y. K. J., Li, D. H., 2005. The width of ecological corridor in landscape planning. Acta
Ecologica Sinica 9, 2404-2412. doi: 10.3321/j.issn:1000-0933.2005.09.037

821 Table 1 The relative resistance values of different landscape factors

Factors	Classification	Value	Factors	Classification	Value
The land use type	Forest	1	Vegetation coverage (%)	>75	1
	Grassland	10		60-75	10
	Farmland	50		45-60	50
	Construction land	100		30-45	75
Slope (°)	<8	1		<30	100
• · · ·	8-15	10	NDVI residual	<-0.05	1
	15-25	50		-0.05-0.05	50
	25-35	75		>0.05	100
	>35	100			
Relief	<25	1	Distance from the turbine	>500	1
	25-50	10	(m)	200-500	50
	50-75	50		<200	100

824 Table 2 Statistical summary of NDVI variation trends

Variation trend	Serious degradation	Degradation	Unchanged	Increase	Significant increase
Area (m ²)	3.48	19.66	98.32	41.20	3.02
Percent (%)	2.10	11.87	59.35	24.87	1.82

827 Table 3 Land use categories

		Area (km ²)	
Туре	2005	2017	Change between 2005 and 2017
Evergreen needle forest	25.92	27.21	1.30
Deciduous broad-leaved forest	78.11	86.74	8.63
Deciduous broad-leaved shrub	23.93	13.82	-10.11
Grass	8.33	4.98	-3.35
Meadow	23.54	18.20	-5.34
Farmland	5.37	5.00	-0.37
Residence land	0.45	0.41	-0.03
Wind power projects land	0.00	9.27	9.27

830 Table 4 Landscape connectivity indices under different distance thresholds

Tuble + Eulascupe connectivity indices under arterent distance unesholds					
Without wind power project		With wind p	ower project		
EC(IIC)	EC(PC)	EC(IIC)	EC(PC)		
19.41	22.51	14.54	20.02		
22.41	24.02	22.22	23.08		
22.41	24.29	22.41	23.72		
	Without wind EC(IIC) 19.41 22.41 22.41	Without wind power project EC(IIC) EC(PC) 19.41 22.51 22.41 24.02 22.41 24.29	Without wind power project With wind p EC(IIC) EC(PC) EC(IIC) 19.41 22.51 14.54 22.41 24.02 22.22 22.41 24.29 22.41		

Objective	Methods	Results	Data sources
Eagles and other raptors along migratory routes	GPS-data	The frequency of collisions or displacement of raptors away from their usual migratory pathways increased as wind energy projects grow	Katzner et al., 2012
Distribution of migratory bird stopovers	Migratory concentration models	73% of high potential wind development area intersects the important bird migration concentration areas in Wyoming.	Pocewicz et al., 2013
Landscape connectivity for bats	Species Distribution Model	54% of the existing and 72% of planned wind farms interfere with important corridors connecting western and eastern parts of the study areas.	Roscioni et al., 2014
Reindeer migration and movement corridors	GPS-data	During construction of the wind farms, use of original migration routes and movement corridors declined by 76 %.	Skarin et al., 2015
Migratory bald eagles	Dynamic Brownian bridge movement model	There was small overlap between bald eagle migration corridors and viable wind power areas in northeastern North America.	Mojica et al., 2016
Migratory raptor	Radar and hawk- watch monitoring observations	Migratory raptors adjusted their flight trajectories to avoid wind farms.	Cabrera-Cruz et al., 2016
Habitat selection by wintering geese	Linear models	Geese strongly avoided power-lines, and wind turbines.	Harrison et al., 2017
Migration corridor of white storks	Multi-criterial evaluation model	Approximately 60% of the patches in the predicted migration corridor had either a moderate or high potential for wind energy generation.	Francis et al., 2018
Ecological corridor and landscape connectivity	LCD and LCP	Wind power projects reduced corridor patency, lengthened most of corridors, and weakened landscape connectivity.	This study

833 Table 5 Comparison between this study with previous studies









Fig.2. Wind power project, the road, and core, buffer and experimental zones of Mianshan Nature Reserve in the 841 study area.



Note: Rhombuses represent data sources or products, and rectangles represent processes or methods.



Fig.4. The spatial distribution of the change rates of pixel's NDVI.



Fig.5. Land use categories: (a) without the wind power projects; and (b) with the wind power projects.





Fig.6. The spatial distribution of resistance: (a) without the wind power project; and (b) with the wind power

project.



Fig.8. The impact of the wind power project on corridor patency.

