

Beneficial effects of multi-species mixtures on N2O emissions from intensively managed grassland swards

Article

Accepted Version

Creative Commons: Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0

Cummins, S., Finn, J. A., Richards, K. G., Lanigan, G. J., Grange, G., Brophy, C., Cardenas, L. M., Misselbrook, T. H., Reynolds, C. K. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4152-1190 and Krol, D. J. (2021) Beneficial effects of multi-species mixtures on N2O emissions from intensively managed grassland swards. Science of the Total Environment, 792. 148163. ISSN 0048-9697 doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.148163 Available at https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/98772/

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See <u>Guidance on citing</u>.

To link to this article DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.148163

Publisher: Elsevier

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the <u>End User Agreement</u>.



www.reading.ac.uk/centaur

CentAUR

Central Archive at the University of Reading Reading's research outputs online

Beneficial effects of multi-species mixtures on N₂O emissions from intensively managed grassland swards.

Saoirse Cummins^{1,2,3}, John A. Finn^{1*}, Karl G. Richards¹, Gary J. Lanigan¹, Guylain Grange^{1,4}, Caroline Brophy⁴, Laura M. Cardenas², Tom H. Misselbrook², Chris K. Reynolds³, Dominika J. Krol¹.

¹ Teagasc, Environment, Soils and Land Use Dept, Johnstown Castle, Co. Wexford, Ireland

² Rothamsted Research, Sustainable Agriculture Sciences, North Wyke, Okehampton, Devon, UK.

³ School of Agriculture, Policy and Development, University of Reading, Earley Gate, Reading, UK

⁴ School of Computer Science and Statistics, Trinity College Dublin, Dublin 2, Ireland

*Corresponding author, email: John.finn@teagasc.ie Tel: 00 353 (0)53 9171273

Emailaddresses:saoirse.cummins@teagasc.ie;john.finn@teagasc.ie;karl.richards@teagasc.ie;gary.lanigan@teagasc.ie;guylain.grange@teagasc.ie;caroline.brophy@tcd.ie;laura.cardenas@rothamsted.ac.uk;tom.misselbrook@rothamsted.ac.uk; c.k.reynolds@reading.ac.uk;dominika.krol@teagasc.ie

KEY WORDS

Grasslands, GHG emissions, nitrous oxide, yield-scaled N₂O emissions, multi-species mixtures, grassland production.

GRAPHICAL ABSTRACT



(a) N yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ / N yield kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹)
(b) DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O gha⁻¹ year⁻¹/DM yield tonne ha⁻¹ year⁻¹)

- We assessed annual N₂O emissions from field plots sown with multi-species grassland communities (1-6 species)
- N₂O emissions in mixtures were best predicted from a linear combination of species' identity effects (equivalent to species' performances in monoculture), with no additional suppressive effect due to interspecific interactions.
- Based on emissions intensities, the same N yield or DM yield from the 6-species mixture and *L. perenne* monoculture could have been produced while reducing N₂O losses by 41% and 24% respectively (at 150 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ of nitrogen fertiliser).

1 Beneficial effects of multi-species mixtures on N₂O emissions

² from intensively managed grassland swards.

- 3 Saoirse Cummins^{1,2,3}, John A. Finn^{1*}, Karl G. Richards¹, Gary J. Lanigan¹, Guylain
- 4 Grange^{1,4}, Caroline Brophy⁴, Laura M. Cardenas², Tom H. Misselbrook², Chris K.
- 5 Reynolds³, Dominika J. Krol¹.
- ⁶ ¹ Teagase, Environment, Soils and Land Use Dept, Johnstown Castle, Co. Wexford,
- 7 Ireland
- ⁸ ² Rothamsted Research, Sustainable Agriculture Sciences, North Wyke, Okehampton,
- 9 Devon, UK.
- ³ School of Agriculture, Policy and Development, University of Reading, Earley Gate,
 Reading, UK
- ⁴ School of Computer Science and Statistics, Trinity College Dublin, Dublin 2, Ireland

13 *Corresponding author, email: <u>John.finn@teagasc.ie</u> Tel: 00 353 (0)53 9171273

Email saoirse.cummins@teagasc.ie, john.finn@teagasc.ie, 14 addresses: karl.richards@teagasc.ie, gary.lanigan@teagasc.ie guylain.grange@teagasc.ie 15 16 caroline.brophy@tcd.ie laura.cardenas@rothamsted.ac.uk, tom.misselbrook@rothamsted.ac.uk, c.k.reynolds@reading.ac.uk, 17 dominika.krol@teagasc.ie 18

19 KEY WORDS

Grasslands, GHG emissions, nitrous oxide, yield-scaled N₂O emissions, multi-species
mixtures, grassland production.



23

25 ABSTRACT

26 In a field experiment, annual N₂O emissions and grassland yield were measured across different plant communities, comprising systematically varying combinations of 27 monocultures and mixtures of three functional groups (FG): grasses (Lolium perenne, 28 29 Phleum pratense), legumes (Trifolium pratense, Trifolium repens) and herbs (Cichorium intybus, Plantago lanceolata). Plots received 150 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ N (150N), except L. 30 perenne monocultures which received two N levels: 150N and 300N. The effect of plant 31 diversity on N2O emissions was derived from linear combinations of species 32 performances' in monoculture (species identity) and not from strong interactions between 33 34 species in mixtures. Increasing from 150N to 300N in L. perenne resulted in a highly significant increase in cumulative N₂O emissions from 1.39 to 3.18 kg N₂O-N ha⁻¹ year 35 ¹. Higher N₂O emissions were also associated with the legume FG. Emissions intensities 36

37 (yield-scaled N₂O emissions) from multi-species mixture communities around the equiproportional mixture were lowered due to interactions among species. For N₂O emissions 38 scaled by nitrogen yield in forage, the 6-species mixture was significantly lower than L. 39 perenne at both 300N and 150N. In comparison to 300N L. perenne, the same N yield or 40 DM yield could have been produced with the equi-proportional 6-species mixture (150N) 41 while reducing N₂O losses by 63% and 58% respectively. Compared to 150N L. perenne, 42 the same N yield or DM yield could have been produced with the 6-species mixture while 43 reducing N₂O losses by 41% and 24% respectively. Overall, this study found that multi-44 45 species grasslands can potentially reduce both N₂O emissions and emissions intensities, contributing to the sustainability of grassland production. 46

47 **1. INTRODUCTION**

Nitrous oxide (N₂O) is a potent greenhouse gas (GHG) (Ravishankara et al., 2009) with 48 265 times the global warming potential of carbon dioxide (CO₂) (IPCC, 2014). Large N₂O 49 losses result from both (N) fertiliser application to grasslands (Harty et al., 2016; Krol et 50 al., 2020) and the N fertiliser production process itself (Wood and Cowie, 2004). 51 Although conventional grassland systems for livestock production tend to use high levels 52 of N fertiliser, they are not heavily reliant on imported concentrate feeds which have a 53 high carbon footprint (O'Brien et al., 2011). Therefore, temperate grassland production 54 systems have the potential to curtail N₂O losses through the displacement of N fertiliser 55 for symbiotically produced plant-available N. 56

57 Multi-species mixtures composed of grasses, legumes and herbs provide a range of 58 agronomic and environmental benefits in grass-based production systems. These include: 59 increased dry matter (DM) yield production (greater biomass production from species in 60 mixtures relative to the best performing monoculture – transgressive overyielding) (Nyfeler et al., 2009; Finn et al., 2013; Moloney et al., 2020), improved animal
performance (for both cattle and sheep) (Cranston et al., 2015; Roca-Fernández et al.,
2016; Bryant et al., 2017; Grace et al., 2019; Jerrentrup et al., 2020), increased N use
efficiency (NUE) (Hooper et al., 2005, Suter et al., 2015), weed suppression (Suter et al.,
2017; Connolly., 2018), and greater yield stability during drought events (Hofer et al.,
2016; Haughey et al., 2019). Although these benefits are well established, less is known
about how multi-species grasslands influence the soil N cycle and therefore N₂O fluxes.

Multi-species grasslands may affect N₂O fluxes in several ways (Gardiner et al., 2016; 68 De Klein et al., 2019). Nitrous oxide is mainly lost during the soil-based processes of 69 nitrification and denitrification (Bremner et al., 1997). Different plant species can 70 influence these processes through differential niche occupation of the rhizosphere which 71 can affect plant water uptake (Holtham et al., 2007) and soil gas diffusivity. These 72 73 processes determine the nitrification and denitrification pathways and the final N₂O:N₂ ratio of the denitrification process (Balaine et al., 2016). Biochemical reactions may also 74 75 affect N₂O production. *Plantago* species contain biological nitrification inhibition (BNI) compounds within the plant that prevent ammonium (NH_4^+) transformation to nitrate 76 (NO₃⁻); this results in stability of the soil mineral N pool and increased plant N uptake 77 (Chapman et al., 2006; Cantarel et al., 2015). Legume inclusion within grassland swards 78 79 and multi-species mixtures allows for reduced fertiliser application without adversely affecting yields (Egan et al., 2018). This is due to biological nitrogen fixation (BNF) and 80 the transfer of N from legumes to non-legumes within a multi-species sward (Nyfeler et 81 al., 2011; Pirhofer-Walzl et al., 2012). Legume inclusion in grasslands can increase N₂O 82 emissions when N fertiliser is not reduced to account for symbiotically fixed N (Hakala 83 et al., 2012; Burchill et al., 2016; Luo et al, 2018). 84

85 There can be species-specific effects of plants on N₂O emissions. A laboratory incubation by Abalos et al. (2014) quantified the N_2O fluxes from mixtures with up to four grass 86 species including L. perenne, Festuca arundinacea, P. pratense and Poa trivialis. No 87 88 relationship was found between plant species richness and N₂O emissions; however, there was a significant reduction in N₂O emissions when certain plant species were combined. 89 In a field study, Luo et al. (2018) applied cattle urine and compared the N₂O fluxes from 90 91 monocultures of P. lanceolata and Medicago sativa with a T. repens and L. perenne mixture. Despite seasonal variation, P. lanceolata had lower N₂O emissions than L. 92 93 perenne throughout the year. Although these studies showed potential for multi-species swards to reduce N₂O emissions, the various experiments were either not monitored on 94 an annual basis, across a range of plant communities or did not apply different N fertiliser 95 96 levels. These three considerations are each important to properly understand the 97 application of multi-species swards in livestock production systems.

Fuchs et al. (2020) modelled the N2O mitigation potential and productivity of various 98 99 combinations of legume proportions and fertilizer rates for five temperate grassland sites 100 using two different biogeochemical models. They recommended further study of the effect of clover proportions ranging from 30-50% receiving ≤ 150 kg N ha-1 yr-1 input, 101 as these were identified as best-bet climate smart agricultural practices. Our study directly 102 responds to those research recommendations. In a year-long experiment, we investigated 103 N₂O fluxes from six different forage types including two species from each of three FGs: 104 grasses (L. perenne, P. pratense), legumes (T. pratense, T. repens) and herbs (C. intybus 105 and *P. lanceolata*) in monocultures and mixtures of systematically varying proportions. 106 In addition, emission intensity was calculated for all treatments (van Groenigen et al., 107 2010) as N yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹/ kg N yield ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) and 108 DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹/ tonne DM yield ha⁻¹ year⁻¹). The 109

experimental design and analyses allowed quantification of species identity effects and species interaction effects on each of the three responses (N₂O emissions, N yield-scaled emissions and DM yield-scaled emissions). There was also a 300 kg N ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ *L*. *perenne* treatment (300N *L. perenne*) to allow for a comparison between all treatments and conventional agricultural practice. The specific aims of this study were to:

1) Investigate the effect of systematically varying species and FG proportions within
grassland communities on annual N₂O emissions, N yield-scaled N₂O emissions and DM
yield-scaled N₂O emissions.

2) Compare annual N₂O emissions and yield-scaled N₂O emissions from 150N forage
communities with the 300N *L. perenne* community.

120 2. MATERIALS & METHODS

121 2.1 Experimental site

The year-long field experiment took place at Teagasc, Johnstown Castle, Co. Wexford, Ireland 52°18′27 N between March 2018 – March 2019. The climate is temperate maritime and meteorological data (precipitation, air and soil temperature) was recorded at the Johnstown Castle weather station. The soil type at the field site was a stagnic brown podzolic. Soil texture was sandy loam, pH was 5.7 and the average bulk density of the plots on the trial site at 5-10 cm depth was 1.35 g cm⁻³.

128 2.2 Experimental design

The experimental site was treated with herbicide, ploughed, and reseeded in spring 2017.
The experiment followed a simplex design (Scheffe, 1963) for use in conjunction with
the statistical modelling described in Section 2.5. Experimental plots, each measuring 5
m x 7 m were sown with grassland communities (*Appendix A and D*) comprising one to

133 six species that systematically varied FG composition and relative abundance. The six species comprised two species from each of three FGs: two grasses (L. perenne and P. 134 pratense), two clovers (T. repens and T. pratense) and two deep-rooting herbs (C. intybus 135 and P. lanceolata). There were 20 different communities with between one to four 136 replicates per treatment (Appendix B) resulting in 43 experimental plots in total. Each 137 main plot was divided into two 5 m x 3.5 m sub plots, and two water supply treatments 138 139 were applied at random to the two halves. One split plot (randomly chosen) received natural water supply over the year ('rain fed'), while a two-month summer drought was 140 141 simulated on the other half, using rainout shelters ('drought'). Here, we only report the measured N₂O emissions from the rain fed sub plots. Due to the natural drought 142 conditions during the summer of 2018, the rain fed sub plots were irrigated on three 143 144 occasions with 30mm of water, to match historical rainfall records (Met Éireann, 2020). 145 Fertiliser N application was divided into five applications of varying rate from March-September 2018 (Appendix C). Maintenance levels of P and K fertilisers were applied in 146 line with soil test recommendations at the beginning of the growing season. Calcium 147 ammonium nitrate (CAN) fertiliser was applied at rates of 150 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ (150N; 148 communities 1-19, Appendix B) and 300 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ (300N L. perenne; community 20, 149 150 Appendix B).

151 2.3 Nitrous oxide measurements

152 Nitrous oxide emissions were monitored from 13^{th} March $2018 - 21^{st}$ March 2019. To 153 capture fertiliser-induced effects on N₂O fluxes, a high resolution N₂O sampling strategy 154 was put in place for six months (March to September 2018) in order to coincide with 155 fertiliser application - the time that emissions were expected to be highest. Sampling took 156 place four days a week for two weeks immediately following each fertiliser application, 157 two days a week in the next two weeks (weeks three and four) and once per week up until the next fertiliser application date. High-resolution N₂O sampling was followed by six
months of low-resolution sampling at a frequency of once a month (October 2018 to
March 2019). The less intensive sampling approach is reflective of the low N₂O fluxes
expected during this period due to a combination of no N fertiliser application and low
soil temperature (Maire et al., 2020).

Nitrous oxide was measured using static chamber methodology (De Klein and Harvey, 163 2012), with a single chamber placed in each plot giving a total of 43 chambers. Chambers 164 consisted of square, stainless steel collars 40 cm (length) \times 40 cm (breadth) x 10cm 165 (height) lined with a neoprene strip and inserted to 5 cm soil depth with matching steel 166 167 covers creating an approximately 16 litre headspace. A 10 kg weight was placed on top of the covers at sampling times to ensure an airtight headspace for an enclosure time of 168 169 40 minutes. A 10 ml air sample was removed through a 16 mm rubber septum using a 10 ml polypropylene syringe and hypodermic needle. The syringe was filled and emptied 170 twice within the chamber to mix the headspace air prior to sampling. The gas samples 171 172 were injected into pre-evacuated (-1,000 mbar) 7 ml screw-cap septum glass vials. Gas 173 samples were taken from each chamber at 0, 20 and 40 minutes to measure N₂O concentration over time. Sampling events took place between the hours of 10:00 and 174 13:00 to obtain measurements representative of the average hourly flux of the day (De 175 176 Klein & Harvey, 2012). Nitrous oxide concentrations were analysed using a gas chromatograph (GC, Varian CP 3800 GC, Varian, USA) fitted with an electron capture 177 detector using high-purity helium as the carrier gas. Quality control N₂O standards, which 178 were representative of the upper N₂O concentration limit expected, were analysed 179 alongside N₂O field samples. Linear regression of the increase in N₂O gas concentrations 180 over time (0, 20 and 40 minutes) was used to calculate daily fluxes (g N ha⁻¹ day⁻¹). A 181 single annual cumulative N₂O value was calculated per plot by integration of daily fluxes 182

and linear interpolation between measurements (Burchill et al., 2014; De Klein and Harvey, 2012). Yield scaled-N₂O emissions (van Groenigen et al., 2010; Sanz-Cobena et al., 2014) were calculated by dividing annual cumulative g N₂O-N (g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) by 1) aboveground N yield (kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) and 2) DM yield (tonnes ha⁻¹ year⁻¹).

187 2.4 Ancillary measurements

An area of the experimental plots was designated for ancillary measurements. A meteorological station was located approximately 500 m from the experimental site. Air temperature and atmospheric pressure were noted at each N₂O sampling occasion along with volumetric soil water content using a Theta probe (type ML2; Delta-T Devices, Cambridge, UK). Soil moisture measurements were used to calculate the water filled pore space % (WFPS) (Equation 1):

Equation 1. Where SWC = volumetric soil water content, BD = bulk density and PD =
particle density (Fichtner et al., 2019).

196
$$WFPS \% = \frac{SWC}{1 - \frac{BD}{PD}} \times 100$$

197 2.5 Data analyses

The three response variables (y) were: N₂O-N emissions (kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹), N yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹/ kg N yield ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) and DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹/ tonne DM yield ha⁻¹ year⁻¹). Using the regression-based Diversity-Interactions modelling approach (Kirwan et al., 2009), we regressed responses on the sown proportional contributions of the six species as follows:

203 Equation 2. Regression model equation

204
$$y = \sum_{i=1}^{6} \beta_i P_i + \beta_7 P_{Lp300N} + \delta \sum_{\substack{i,j=1\\i < j}}^{6} P_i P_j + \varepsilon$$

205 Where y is the response variable (model fitted separately to each of our three responses), P_i represents the sown proportion of a species in a community (for i: 1 = L, perenne, 2 = 1206 207 *P. pratense*, 3 = T. *pratense*, 4 = T. *repens*, 5 = C. *intybus* and 6 = P. *lanceolata*). The β_1 to β_6 coefficient are the identity effects of each species (under 150N fertiliser); if $P_i = 1$, 208 the β_i coefficient is the expected monoculture response of species *i*, while if $P_i < 1$, the 209 210 expected contribution of that species to the mixture is $\beta_i P_i$. An extra term (β_7) was included for the 300N L. perenne monoculture plots ($P_{Lp300N} = 1$ for these plots and 0 211 otherwise). Equation 2 assumes that all pairs of species interact in the same way (captured 212 213 by the coefficient δ). We tested various forms of the interactions, including no interaction effects and whether pairwise interactions were determined by FG membership (Kirwan 214 et al., 2009). The error term ε was initially assumed to be normally distributed with zero 215 mean and constant variance σ^2 . However, exploratory analysis indicated that responses 216 217 from plots with 100% legume were considerably more variable than all other plots, therefore we assumed that the error was normally distributed with zero mean and with 218 two variance terms depending on the sown proportion of legume (100% or <100%). The 219 220 Diversity-Interactions modelling approach allows prediction of the response for a wide 221 range of communities from this six-species pool, based on the relative proportions of the 222 component species. The overall response is based on the linear combinations of the identity effects, plus the sum of the interaction effects as required. Thus, for example, for 223 a 50:50 grass-legume mixture of L. perenne and T. pratense, the expected response is 224 $(\beta_1)0.5 + (\beta_3)0.5 + (\delta)(0.5*0.5)$. We predicted from the final fitted model to assess the 225 effects on our three response variables across the monocultures and selected communities, 226

which included the 6-species mixture and 300N *L. perenne* monoculture. The analysis
was performed using SAS software version the software package SAS version 9.4 (SAS
Institute, Cary, North Carolina, USA).

230 **3. RESULTS**

231 3.1 Climatic conditions

232 The highest average daily temperature (Fig. 1) recorded at the field site was in July at 20.4°C. The lowest daily average temperature was 18th March 2018 at 0.1°C. These are 233 in contrast to long-term climatic averages recorded at the Rosslare Co. Wexford station 234 235 (10 km away). Between 1978 and 2007, on average the highest daily temperature was 13.1°C and the lowest was 8.1°C. The long term mean annual rainfall for Johnstown 236 Castle was 905.5 mm, with 49.9 mm for July, whereas the total annual rainfall for 2018-237 2019 (Fig. 1) was 1089.4 mm, with the average monthly rainfall for July 2018 being 1.7 238 mm (not including irrigation). The WFPS of soil at the experimental site averaged 48% 239 240 over the experimental year (Fig. 2). Following high levels of precipitation in early 2018 (Fig. 1), the WFPS stayed at ~70% until early May, whereas during June, July and August 241 the WFPS declined to 20-30%. 242

- 243 Fig. 1. Precipitation (mm) and temperature (°C)
- 244 *3.2 Nitrous oxide emissions*
- 245 3.2.1 Seasonal patterns in N₂O emissions

High N₂O fluxes were measured in April 2018, coinciding with high soil WFPS during
March 2018 (Fig. 2). Conversely, low daily average N₂O fluxes were recorded during the
drought period from June-August 2018 (Fig. 2). The highest daily average N₂O flux
recorded (cumulative flux/number of days within the period) during the experimental year

was from 300N L. perenne at 17.85 g ha⁻¹ day⁻¹ and the lowest was from P. lanceolata at 250 4.07 g N₂O ha⁻¹ day⁻¹. The 150N L. perenne had a daily average N₂O flux of 5.40 g ha⁻¹ 251 day⁻¹. The highest individual N₂O measurement was from 300N L. perenne at 112 g ha⁻¹ 252 day⁻¹ (Fig. 2) on 18th April. From April to May, (Fig. 2) the daily average N₂O flux of 253 300N L. perenne was nine times higher than the 6-species mixture and five times greater 254 than 150N L. perenne. No N fertiliser was applied after September 2018 (in line with the 255 Nitrates Directive), resulting in little to no N₂O fluxes during the autumn and winter 256 period, except for the legume monocultures. Both clover species continued to produce 257 258 N₂O emissions in the autumn/winter period (Fig. 2) with 36% of legume N₂O emissions occurring from August 2018 to January 2019, a time usually associated with low 259 emissions. 260

Fig. 2. Nitrous oxide emissions and corresponding water filled pore space (WFPS %)

262 3.2.2 Effects of plant diversity on cumulative N₂O emissions

According to model comparisons, the best model for the N₂O emissions included species 263 identity effects for each species and a term for 300N L. perenne, but no effects of species 264 interactions were detected (model coefficient estimates shown in Table 1, first column). 265 Thus, the effects of plant diversity on N₂O emissions were derived from species identity 266 effects and their linear combination in mixtures, rather than from synergistic or 267 antagonistic species interaction effects in mixtures (as shown in equation 2, but with the 268 last term involving δ omitted). There was no significant difference between the 6-species 269 mixture and any of the 150N monocultures, with the exception of the C. intvbus 270 monoculture (Fig. 3). The N₂O emissions from 300N L. perenne (3.18 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) were 271 over twice that of the 6-species mixture (1.52 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) (Table 1, Fig. 3). 272

Table 1. (a) Coefficient estimates \pm standard errors for the identity effects (β) and interaction estimates (δ)

Fig. 3. Comparison of predicted N₂O-N emissions

The highest N₂O emissions were from 300N *L. perenne* (significantly higher than all other treatments). Increasing fertiliser application to a *L. perenne* monoculture from 150N to 300N increased (P < 0.001) cumulative N₂O emissions from 1.39 to 3.18 N₂O-N kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ (Table 1, Fig. 3). N₂O emissions from 300N *L. perenne* were nearly three times higher than those from the *C. intybus* monoculture, the latter having the lowest estimated annual emissions at 1.1 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹.

The ternary diagram (Fig. 4a) displays how variation in FG proportion (grass, herb and 282 legume) affected the predicted annual N₂O emissions; higher N₂O emissions resulted 283 from increased legume proportion while lower emissions were associated with 284 communities dominated by grasses and/or herbs. The annual N2O emissions from the 285 community comprising 100% legume FG (50% T. pratense and 50% T. repens) were 286 287 significantly higher (P = 0.033 and P = 0.007) than those from the equi-proportional community of either the grass (150N L. perenne and P. pratense) or herb (C. intybus and 288 P. lanceolata) FGs, respectively (Fig. 4b). 289

Fig. 4 a) Predicted annual N₂O emissions (N₂O-N kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) in response to variation within grassland communities. b) Predicted annual N₂O emissions (N₂O-N kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ from each FG: grass, legume and herb.

293 3.3 Yield-scaled N₂O analyses (emissions intensity)

For 2018, the average N-yield in harvested forage of the 6-species mixture, 150N *L*. *perenne* and 300N *L. perenne* was 40.5 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹, 19.9 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ and 28.5 kg ha⁻¹

¹ year⁻¹ respectively. The 6-species mixture produced an average DM yield of 12.4 tonnes DM ha⁻¹ year⁻¹, and *L. perenne* at 150N and 300N produced 9.2 and 10.7 tonnes DM ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ respectively (Grange et al., in review). This yield data was combined with N₂O data to calculate two measures of yield-scaled N₂O emissions; as outlined in section 2, the two measures of emission intensity analysed were N yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹/ kg N yield ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) and DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹/ tonne DM yield ha⁻¹ year⁻¹).

For both measures of emission intensity, the best model included species identity effects 303 for each species, and a negative average pairwise interaction effect that resulted in an 304 305 additional suppressive effect on yield-scaled N₂O emissions in mixtures (as in equation 2, with model estimates in Table 1). The suppressive interaction term was only borderline 306 significant for the DM yield-scaled emissions (P = 0.056), however, diagnostic analysis 307 308 of the model with and without the interaction term indicated a superior fit when the interaction term was included and it was kept in the final model. Emissions from the 6-309 310 species mixture were lower than the mean of the six 150N monocultures for N yield-311 scaled emissions (P = 0.012) and there was a similar indication for DM yield-scaled emissions (P = 0.056), demonstrating that increasing species diversity in multi-species 312 mixtures suppressed yield-scaled N₂O emissions (Fig. 5a and 5b). The 300N L. perenne 313 treatment had higher N yield-scaled emissions (Fig. 5a) than all other 150N communities. 314 This result was similar for DM yield-scaled emissions (Fig. 5b), with the exception of 315 316 both legume monocultures.

As the proportions of grasses, legumes and herbs change, communities with high proportions of legumes and/or grasses showed an increase in N yield-scaled N₂O emissions (Fig. 6a). Communities with high legume proportion showed an increase in DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions (Fig. 6b) compared with herbs and grasses.

- **Fig. 5. a and b** Comparison of yield-scaled N₂O emissions.
- **Fig. 6. a and b** Estimated emission intensity analyses (ternary diagrams).

323 **4. DISCUSSION**

324 *4.1 N₂O emissions*

Nitrous oxide emissions from multi-species mixtures were best explained as a linear 325 326 combination of the identity effects, showing that there was no net synergy or antagonism 327 attributable to interspecific interactions. Given the large magnitude of differences among the species' identity effects, emissions from mixture compositions at and around the equi-328 proportional 6-species mixture tended to be considerably lower than those from the 329 highest-emitting communities (Fig. 4), e.g. those dominated by legumes. There were no 330 net synergistic or antagonistic effects due to interspecific interactions; nevertheless, there 331 332 was still a benefit from multi-species mixtures through a reduction in the proportions of higher-emitting species in the mixture, i.e., legumes (Fig. 4a and b). 333

Our study highlights the potential for the multi-functional benefits associated with diverse 334 grassland communities (e.g., see Introduction) to be gained without an associated increase 335 336 in N₂O emissions. Comparing N₂O emissions from the 6-species mixture and 300N L. perenne, greater DM yield and total N yield can be obtained from the six-species mixture 337 while halving N₂O emissions (1.52 vs 3.18 N₂O-N kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) (Table 1). The strong 338 339 effect of higher fertilizer application (300N vs 150N) on N₂O emissions probably reflects non-plant uptake of excess mineral N in the soil, and these results align with the previous 340 findings of Harty et al., (2016), Krol et al. (2016) and Cardenas et al (2020). Our results 341 reiterate the reduced nitrogen use efficiency associated with conventional grassland L. 342 perenne monocultures receiving high N fertiliser application. 343

344 Overall, increasing the proportion of both grasses and herbs within a grassland community resulted in lower N₂O emissions than in legume-dominated communities 345 (Fig. 4a). When comparing FGs, legumes had significantly higher N₂O emissions than 346 347 both herb and grass communities (Fig. 4b). When looking at selected monocultures, there was no significant difference in N₂O emissions between P. lanceolata and 150N L. 348 perenne (Fig. 3). This is surprising given that many studies have found that swards 349 dominated by *Plantago* species can directly reduce N₂O emissions in comparison with L. 350 perenne monocultures (Gardiner et al., 2018; Luo et al., 2018). Bracken et al. (2020) 351 352 found evidence that P. lanceolata potentially inhibits nitrification when included in a mixed sward. In contrast to aforementioned studies, the lowest N₂O emissions in our 353 experiment were from the C. intybus monoculture rather than P. lanceolata. 354

When looking at annual N_2O emissions from selected individual monocultures (Fig. 3), 355 356 each of T. repens and T. pratense did not have significantly higher N₂O emissions than other monocultures (with the exception of *T. pratense* being higher than *C. intybus* (Fig. 357 358 3)). This is strongly related to the much higher variability associated with legume monocultures in this experiment, compared to the other species (Table 1). If this is a 359 general occurrence, legume monocultures may need more replication to have sufficient 360 power to test their difference from other monocultures. When averaging over the species-361 to-species variation within each functional group, an effect of the legume FG on N_2O 362 emissions of N₂O was evident (Fig. 4a, b). Many studies report high N₂O emissions from 363 legume-based pastures due to the accumulation of nitrate following mineralization of 364 biologically fixed organic N (e.g., Dalal et al., 2003; Burchill et al., 2014). 365

Greater variation in N₂O emissions from legumes may stem from the high levels of
variation associated with BNF (and therefore N₂O emissions from legume stands)
(Rochette et al., 2004; Unkovich et al., 2008; Evers., 2011; Nyfeler et al., 2011;). Across

studies, the rate of BNF can range from 100 to 380 kg N ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ in northern temperate 369 pastures and is dependent on multiple factors including environmental conditions, 370 grassland management practices and legume species/cultivar type and proportion 371 372 (Ledgard and Steele 1992; Hansen and Vinther 2001; Fox et al., 2019). Nitrous oxide fluxes associated with legumes can be attributed to N release from root exudates and from 373 crop residue decomposition, rather than from the BNF process itself (Rochette and 374 Jansen., 2005). The latter results were pivotal in the removal of the BNF process from the 375 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) N₂O inventory methodology. 376 377 Legume inclusion within a grassland community allows for N addition into the soil system by BNF, lowering reliance on N fertilizer application without compromising on 378 379 yield (Egan et al., 2018). Legume residues can improve the quality and quantity of soil 380 organic matter over time, providing benefits for following crops (termed 'legacy effect'). Fox et al. (2019) assessed legacy effects over a range of legume proportions and N 381 application levels, and found maximum legacy benefits on a L. multiflorum crop from a 382 383 prior grassland ley comprising 50% legume proportion and receiving 150N. Our study should be considered when using legumes as ley cover crops as environmental benefits 384 of N addition to soil (i.e., less fertilizer N requirement) may be compromised by high N2O 385 losses. 386

387

388 4.2 Yield-scaled N₂O emissions (emissions intensity)

The effects of multi-species swards were more pronounced when considering yield-scaled N₂O emissions (expressed as either N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ / N yield kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ or N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ / DM yield tonne ha⁻¹ year⁻¹). Looking at both responses, the performance of mixtures was best explained as a linear combination of the identity effects, and an 393 additional antagonistic interaction between species that acted to suppress emissions intensity. Thus, compared to the yield-scaled N₂O emissions predicted from the average 394 of the six monocultures, the yield-scaled N₂O emissions of the 6-species mixture were 395 396 29.1 % lower (P = 0.012) and 24.9% lower (P = 0.056) for the N- and DM yield-scaled measures respectively (Table 1). Given the differences among the species, mixture 397 compositions at and around the 6-species mixture tended to have considerably lower 398 yield-scaled N₂O emissions (Fig. 6a and b). As both yield-scaled N₂O responses had the 399 400 same numerator (N_2O emissions) the significant diversity effect must be related to a 401 strong effect of plant diversity (interspecific interactions) on each of the denominators, total N yield and total DM yield (presented elsewhere for both the former (Grange et al., 402 403 unpubl.) and latter (Grange et al., in review)). Transgressive over yielding, whereby 404 mixtures outperform the highest performing constituent monoculture, is driven by 405 resource use efficiency and complementarity among species in mixtures (Mason et al., 2020). 406

407 Our study confirms that reduced emissions intensity can now be considered one of the 408 many multi-functional benefits associated with multi-species swards. The 6-species mixture was more efficient, because more yield was produced with reductions in N₂O 409 losses to the environment. Overall, the six-species mixture significantly reduced N yield-410 scaled N₂O emissions compared with L. perenne (both 150N and 300N) and 150N legume 411 monocultures (Fig. 5a) and lower DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions than 300N L. perenne 412 (Fig. 5b). These results accord with the agronomic assessment of N₂O emissions by van 413 Groenigen et al (2010), where yield-scaled N₂O emissions of non-leguminous crops 414 increased rapidly at higher N application levels (>190 kg N ha⁻¹ year-¹). As a practical 415 416 consequence, in comparison to 300N L. perenne, the same N yield or DM yield could have been produced with the 150N six-species mixture using half the amount of fertiliser 417

and reducing N₂O losses by 63% and 58% respectively. Similarly, in comparison to 150N *L. perenne*, the same N yield or DM yield could have been produced with the six-species
mixture while reducing N₂O losses by 41% and 24% respectively.

421 5. Conclusion

422 Overall, the effect of plant diversity on N₂O emissions was derived from linear combinations of the species' performance in monoculture (species' identity). The effects 423 of multi-species mixtures on N₂O emissions intensity included species identity effects, 424 and a net interspecific interaction that suppressed emissions intensity. The conventional 425 300N L. perenne community produced over double the N₂O emissions as the 150N six-426 species mixture (3.18 vs 1.52 kg N₂O-N ha⁻¹ year⁻¹). Considering emissions intensity, the 427 same N yield and DM yield of 300N L. perenne could have been produced with the 6-428 species mixture using half the fertiliser and reduced N₂O losses of 63% and 58% 429 respectively. In comparison to 150N L. perenne, the same N yield and DM yield could 430 have been produced with a 6-species mixture while producing 41% and 24% less N₂O 431 emissions. Communities dominated by legumes significantly increased N₂O emissions, 432 this should be considered when using legumes as cover crops. Overall, the manipulation 433 of grassland composition is a practical, farm-scale management action that can reduce 434 both N₂O emissions and yield-scaled N₂O emissions, and contribute to the sustainability 435 of grassland production. 436

437 6. Acknowledgements

This work was supported by The Teagasc Walsh Scholarship Programme. The authors
would like to thank the laboratory and field staff at Teagasc Johnstown Castle for their
assistance on this project.

441			
442			
443			
444			
445			
446			
447			
448			

449 7. Appendices

- 450 Appendix A Seeding rates of the multi-species experimental field trial. Species include *L. perenne* (Lp) *P.*
- 451 pratense (Pp), T. pratense (Tr), T. repens (Tr), P. lanceolata (Pl), and C. intybus (Ci).

Species	Lp	Рр	Тр	Tr	Pl	Ci
Seed (Kg ha ⁻¹)	28	12	12	15	10	8

452

453 Appendix B Experimental design indicating the composition and relative abundance of the sown
454 communities. Also indicated are functional group richness (FGs), species richness (Species) and number of
455 replicates (Reps). Species include *L. perenne* (Lp) *P. pratense* (Pp), *T. pratense* (Tr), *T. repens* (Tr), *P.*456 *lanceolata* (Pl), and *C. intybus* (Ci).

Community	Reps	FGs	Species	FG(G)	FG(H)	FG(L)	Lp	Рр	Тр	Tr	Pl	Ci
1	3	1	1	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0
2	3	1	1	1	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0
3	3	1	1	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	0	0
4	3	1	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	0
5	3	1	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	0
6	3	1	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	1
7	2	1	2	1	0	0	0.5	0.5	0	0	0	0
8	2	1	2	0	1	0	0	0	0.5	0.5	0	0
9	2	1	2	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0.5	0.5
10	2	2	4	0.5	0.5	0	0.25	0.25	0.25	0.25	0	0
11	2	2	4	0.5	0	0.5	0.25	0.25	0	0	0.25	0.25
12	2	2	4	0	0.5	0.5	0	0	0.25	0.25	0.25	0.25
13	1	3	5	0.6	0.2	0.2	0.6	0	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1
14	1	3	5	0.6	0.2	0.2	0	0.6	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1
15	1	3	5	0.2	0.6	0.2	0.1	0.1	0.6	0	0.1	0.1
16	1	3	5	0.2	0.6	0.2	0.1	0.1	0	0.6	0.1	0.1
17	1	3	5	0.2	0.2	0.6	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.6	0
18	1	3	5	0.2	0.2	0.6	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0	0.6
19	3	3	6	0.33	0.33	0.33	0.17	0.17	0.17	0.17	0.17	0.17
20	4	1	1	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0

457

458

459

- 461 Appendix C Fertiliser application rate equivalents to each plot over the agronomic year. (The community
- 462 numbers are as listed in Appendix B.)

Split	Date	Fertiliser application: communities 1-19	Fertiliser application: community 20
1	12-Mar-2018	30 kg N ha ⁻¹	60 kg N ha ⁻¹
2	09-Apr-2018	30 kg N ha ⁻¹	60 kg N ha ⁻¹
3	09-May-2018	30 kg N ha ⁻¹	60 kg N ha ⁻¹
4	11-Jun-2018	20 kg N ha ⁻¹	40 kg N ha ⁻¹
5	20-Aug-2018	40 kg N ha ⁻¹	80 kg N ha ⁻¹

464 Appendix D Aerial photograph of the experimental plot layout.





470 **REFERENCES**

- 471 Abalos, D., De Deyn, G.B., Kuyper, T.W. and van Groenigen, J.W., 2014. Plant species identity
- 472 surpasses species richness as a key driver of N₂O emissions from grassland. *Global Change*
- 473 *Biology*, *20*(1), pp.265-275.F
- Balaine, N., Clough, T. J., Beare, M. H., Thomas, S. M. & Meenken, E. D. 2016. Soil gas
 diffusivity controls N₂O and N₂ emissions and their ratio. *Soil Science Society of America Journal*,
 80, 529-540.
- 477 Bracken, C.J., Lanigan, G.J., Richards, K.G., Müller, C., Tracy, S.R., Grant, J., Krol, D.J.,
- 478 Sheridan, H., Lynch, M.B., Grace, C. and Fritch, R., 2020. Sward composition and soil moisture
- 479 conditions affect nitrous oxide emissions and soil nitrogen dynamics following urea-nitrogen
 480 application. *Science of the Total Environment*, p.137780.
- Bremner, J.M., 1997. Sources of nitrous oxide in soils. *Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems*, 49(13), pp.7-16.
- Bryant, R.H., Miller, M.E., Greenwood, S.L. and Edwards, G.R., 2017. Milk yield and nitrogen
 excretion of dairy cows grazing binary and multispecies pastures. *Grass and Forage Science*,
 72(4), pp.806-817.
- 486 Burchill, W., Lanigan, G., Li, D., Williams, M. & Humphreys, J. 2016. A system N balance for a
- 487 pasture-based system of dairy production under moist maritime climatic conditions. Agriculture,
- 488 *Ecosystems & Environment*, 220, 202-210.
- 489 Burchill, W., Li, D., Lanigan, G. J., Williams, M. & Humphreys, J. 2014. Interannual variation in
- 490 nitrous oxide emissions from perennial ryegrass/white clover grassland used for dairy production.
- 491 *Global Change Biology*, 20, 3137-3146.
- 492 Cantarel, A.A., Pommier, T., Desclos-Theveniau, M., Diquélou, S., Dumont, M., Grassein, F.,
- 493 Kastl, E.M., Grigulis, K., Laîné, P., Lavorel, S. and Lemauviel-Lavenant, S., 2015. Using plant

- traits to explain plant–microbe relationships involved in nitrogen acquisition. *Ecology*, 96(3),
 pp.788-799.
- 496 Cardenas, L.M., Bhogal, A., Chadwick, D.R., McGeough, K., Misselbrook, T., Rees, R.M.,
- Thorman, R.E., Watson, C.J., Williams, J.R., Smith, K.A. and Calvet, S., 2019. Nitrogen use
 efficiency and nitrous oxide emissions from five UK fertilised grasslands. *Science of the Total Environment*, *661*, pp.696-710.
- Chapman, S.K., Langley, J.A., Hart, S.C. and Koch, G.W., 2006. Plants actively control nitrogen
 cycling: uncorking the microbial bottleneck. *New Phytologist*, 169(1), pp.27-34.
- 502 Connolly, J., Sebastià, M.-T., Kirwan, L., Finn, J. A., Llurba, R., Suter, M., Collins, R. P.,
- 503 Porqueddu, C., Helgadóttir, Á., Baadshaug, O. H., Bélanger, G., Black, A., Brophy, C., Čop, J.,
- 504 Dalmannsdóttir, S., Delgado, I., Elgersma, A., Fothergill, M., Frankow-Lindberg, B. E.,
- 505 Ghesquiere, A., Golinski, P., Grieu, P., Gustavsson, A.-M., Höglind, M., Huguenin-Elie, O.,
- 506 Jørgensen, M., Kadziuliene, Z., Lunnan, T., Nykanen-Kurki, P., Ribas, A., Taube, F., Thumm,
- 507 U., De Vliegher, A. & Lüscher, A. 2018. Weed suppression greatly increased by plant diversity
 508 in intensively managed grasslands: a continental-scale experiment. *Journal of Applied Ecology*,
 509 55, 852-862.
- 510 Cranston, L.M., Kenyon, P.R., Morris, S.T. and Kemp, P.D., 2015. A review of the use of chicory,
- plantain, red clover and white clover in a sward mix for increased sheep and beef production. *Journal of New Zealand Grasslands*, 77, pp.89-94.
- Dalal, R. C., Wang, W. J., Robertson, G. P. & Parton, W. J. 2003. Nitrous oxide emission from
 Australian agricultural lands and mitigation options: a review. *Australian Journal of Soil Research*, 41, 165-195.
- 516 De Klein, C. & Harvey, M. 2012. Nitrous oxide chamber methodology guidelines. Global
 517 Research Alliance on Agricultural Greenhouse Gases, Ministry for Primary Industries:
 518 Wellington, New Zealand.

- 519 De Klein, C. A., Van Der Weerden, T. J., Luo, J., Cameron, K. C. & Di, H. J. 2019. A review of
 520 plant options for mitigating nitrous oxide emissions from pasture-based systems. *New Zealand*521 *Journal of Agricultural Research*, 1-15.
- 522 Egan, M., Galvin, N. & Hennessy, D. 2018. Incorporating white clover (Trifolium repens) into
- 523 perennial ryegrass (*Lolium perenne*) swards receiving varying levels of nitrogen fertilizer: effects
- on milk and herbage production. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 101, 3412-3427.
- Evers, G.W., 2011. Forage legumes: Forage quality, fixed nitrogen, or both. *Crop science*, *51*(2),
 pp.403-409.
- Fichtner, T., Goersmeyer, N. and Stefan, C., 2019. Influence of Soil Pore System Properties on
 the Degradation Rates of Organic Substances during Soil Aquifer Treatment (SAT). *Applied Sciences*, 9(3), p.496.
- Finn, J.A., Kirwan, L., Connolly, J., Sebastià, M.T., Helgadottir, A., Baadshaug, O.H., Bélanger,
 G., Black, A., Brophy, C., Collins, R.P., Čop, J. et al., 2013. Ecosystem function enhanced by
 combining four functional types of plant species in intensively managed grassland mixtures: a 3year continental- scale field experiment. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, *50*(2), pp.365-375.
- Fox, A., Suter, M., Widmer, F. & Lüscher, A. 2019. Positive legacy effect of previous legume
 proportion in a ley on the performance of a following crop of *Lolium multiflorum*. *Plant and Soil*,
 1-10.
- 537 Fuchs, K., Merbold, L., Buchmann, N., Bellocchi, G., Bindi, M., Brilli, L., Conant, R.T., Dorich,
- C.D., Ehrhardt, F., Fitton, N. and Grace, P., 2020. Evaluating the potential of legumes to mitigate
 N2O emissions from permanent grassland using process- based models. *Global Biogeochemical*
- 540 *Cycles*, *34*(12), p.e2020GB006561.
- 541 Gardiner, C. A., Clough, T. J., Cameron, K. C., Di, H. J., Edwards, G. R. & De Klein, C. A. 2018.
- 542 Potential inhibition of urine patch nitrous oxide emissions by Plantago lanceolata and its
- 543 metabolite aucubin. *New Zealand Journal of Agricultural Research*, 61, 495-503.

- 544 Gardiner, C., Clough, T. J., Cameron, K. C., Di, H. J., Edwards, G. & De Klein, C. 2016. Potential
- 545 for forage diet manipulation in New Zealand pasture ecosystems to mitigate ruminant urine
- 546 derived N₂O emissions: a review. *New Zealand Journal of Agricultural Research*, 59, 301-317.
- Grace, C., Lynch, M.B., Sheridan, H., Lott, S., Fritch, R. And Boland, T.M., 2019. Grazing
 multispecies swards improves ewe and lamb performance. *Animal*, 13(8), pp.1721-1729.
- Hakala, K., Nikunen, H.-M., Sinkko, T. & Niemeläinen, O. 2012. Yields and greenhouse gas
 emissions of cultivation of red clover-grass leys as assessed by LCA when fertilised with organic
 or mineral fertilisers. *Biomass and Bioenergy*, 46, 111-124.
- Hansen, J., Vinther, F. Spatial variability of symbiotic N₂ fixation in grass-white clover pastures
 estimated by the 15N isotope dilution method and the natural 15N abundance method. Plant and
 Soil 230, 257–266 (2001).
- Harty, M.A., Forrestal, P.J., Watson, C.J., McGeough, K.L., Carolan, R., Elliot, C., Krol, D.,
 Laughlin, R.J., Richards, K.G. and Lanigan, G.J., 2016. Reducing nitrous oxide emissions by
 changing N fertiliser use from calcium ammonium nitrate (CAN) to urea based
 formulations. *Science of the Total Environment*, *563*, pp.576-586.
- Haughey, E., Suter, M., Hofer, D., Hoekstra, N.J., McElwain, J.C., Lüscher, A. and Finn, J.A.,
 2018. Higher species richness enhances yield stability in intensively managed grasslands with
 experimental disturbance. *Scientific Reports*, 8(1), pp.1-10.
- Hofer, D., Suter, M., Haughey, E., Finn, J.A., Hoekstra, N.J., Buchmann, N. and Lüscher, A.,
 2016. Yield of temperate forage grassland species is either largely resistant or resilient to
 experimental summer drought. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, *53*(4), pp.1023-1034.
- Holtham, D.A., Matthews, G.P. and Scholefield, D.S., 2007. Measurement and simulation of void
 structure and hydraulic changes caused by root-induced soil structuring under white clover
- compared to ryegrass. *Geoderma*, 142(1-2), pp.142-151.

- 568 Hooper, D. U., Chapin, F. S., Ewel, J. J., Hector, A., Inchausti, P., Lavorel, S., Lawton, J. H.,
- 569 Lodge, D., Loreau, M. & Naeem, S. 2005. Effects of biodiversity on ecosystem functioning: a
- 570 consensus of current knowledge. *Ecological Monographs*, 75, 3-35.
- 571 IPCC. 2014. Global warming potential values. Greenhouse Gas Protocol.
- 572 Jerrentrup, J.S., Komainda, M., Seither, M., Cuchillo-Hilario, M., Wrage-Mönnig, N. and
- 573 Isselstein, J., 2020. Diverse Swards and Mixed-Grazing of Cattle and Sheep for Improved
- 574 Productivity. *Frontiers in Sustainable Food Systems*, *3*, pp.1-14.
- 575 Kirwan, L., Connolly, J., Finn, J. A., Brophy, C., Lüscher, A., Nyfeler, D. & Sebastia, M. T. 2009.
- 576 Diversity-interaction modelling: estimating contributions of species identities and interactions to
- 577 ecosystem function. *Ecology*, 90, 2032-8.
- Krol, D., Laughlin, R.J., Richards, K.G. and Lanigan, G.J., 2016. Reducing nitrous oxide
 emissions by changing N fertiliser use from calcium ammonium nitrate (CAN) to urea based
 formulations. *Science of the Total Environment*, 563, pp.576-586.
- Ledgard, S.F., and Steele, K.W. Biological nitrogen fixation in mixed legume/grass pastures. *Plant and Soil* 141, 137–153 (1992).
- Luo, J., Balvert, S. F., Wise, B., Welten, B., Ledgard, S. F., De Klein, C. A. M., Lindsey, S. &
 judge, a. 2018. Using alternative forage species to reduce emissions of the greenhouse gas nitrous
 oxide from cattle urine deposited onto soil. *Science of the Total Environment*, 610-611, 12711280.
- 587 Maire, J., Krol, D., Pasquier, D., Cowan, N., Skiba, U., Rees, R., Reay, D., Lanigan, G. J. &
- Richards, K. G. 2020. Nitrogen fertiliser interactions with urine deposit affect nitrous oxide
 emissions from grazed grasslands. *Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment*, 290, 106784.

- Mason, N.W., Orwin, K.H., Lambie, S., Waugh, D., Pronger, J., Carmona, C.P. and Mudge, P.,
 2020. Resource-use efficiency drives overyielding via enhanced
 complementarity. *Oecologia*, *193*(4), pp.995-1010.
- 593 Met Éireann, Historical Data The Irish Meteorological Service. [Online] available at:
 594 https://www.met.ie/climate/available-data/historical-data [accessed 28 may 2020].
- Moloney, T., Sheridan, H., Grant, J., O'Riordan, E.G. and O'Kiely, P., 2020. Yield of binary-and
 multi-species swards relative to single-species swards in intensive silage systems. *Irish Journal of Agricultural and Food Research*, *59*(1), pp.12-26.
- 598 Nyfeler, D., Huguenin- Elie, O., Suter, M., Frossard, E., Connolly, J. And Lüscher, A., 2009.
- 599 Strong mixture effects among four species in fertilized agricultural grassland led to persistent and 600 consistent transgressive overyielding. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, 46(3), pp.683-691.
- Nyfeler, D., Huguenin-Elie, O., Suter, M., Frossard, E. and Lüscher, A., 2011. Grass–legume
 mixtures can yield more nitrogen than legume pure stands due to mutual stimulation of nitrogen
 uptake from symbiotic and non-symbiotic sources. *Agriculture, ecosystems* & *environment*, 140(1-2), pp.155-163.
- Pirhofer-Walzl, K., Rasmussen, J., Høgh-Jensen, H., Eriksen, J., Søegaard, K. & Rasmussen, J.
 2012. Nitrogen transfer from forage legumes to nine neighbouring plants in a multi-species
 grassland. *Plant and Soil*, 350, 71-84.
- Ravishankara, A., Daniel, J. S. & Portmann, R. W. 2009. Nitrous oxide (N₂O): the dominant
 ozone-depleting substance emitted in the 21st century. *Science*, 326, 123-125.
- Roca-Fernández, A. I., J. L. Peyraud, L. Delaby, and R. Delagarde. "Pasture intake and milk
 production of dairy cows rotationally grazing on multi-species swards." *Animal 10*, no. 9 (2016):
 1448-1456.

- 613 Rochette, P. & Janzen, H. H. 2005. Towards a revised coefficient for estimating N₂O emissions
- from legumes. *Nutrient Cycling In Agroecosystems*, 73, 171-179.
- Rochette, P., Angers, D.A., Bélanger, G., Chantigny, M.H., Prévost, D. And Lévesque, G., 2004.
- 616 Emissions of N₂O from alfalfa and soybean crops in eastern Canada. Soil Science Society of
- 617 *America Journal*, 68(2), pp.493-506.
- 618 Sanz-Cobena, A., Lassaletta, L., Estellés, F., Del Prado, A., Guardia, G., Abalos, D., Aguilera,
- E., Pardo, G., Vallejo, A. & Sutton, M. 2014. Yield-scaled mitigation of ammonia emission from
- 620 N fertilization: the Spanish case. *Environmental Research Letters*, 9, 125005.
- 621 Scheffe, H. 1963. The simplex- centroid design for experiments with mixtures. Journal of the
- 622 *Royal Statistical Society*: Series B (Methodological), 25, 235-251.
- Suter, M., Connolly, J., Finn, J. A., Loges, R., Kirwan, L., Sebastia, M. T. & Lüscher, A. 2015.
 Nitrogen yield advantage from grass-legume mixtures is robust over a wide range of legume
- proportions and environmental conditions. *Global Change Biology*, 21, 2424-38.
- Suter, M., Hofer, D. and Lüscher, A., 2017. Weed suppression enhanced by increasing functional
 trait dispersion and resource capture in forage ley mixtures. *Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment*, 240, pp.329-339.
- 629 Unkovich, M., Herridge, D.A.V.I.D., Peoples, M., Cadisch, G., Boddey, B., Giller, K., Alves, B.
- and Chalk, P., 2008. Measuring plant-associated nitrogen fixation in agricultural systems.
- 631 Australian Centre for International Agricultural Research (ACIAR).
- van Groenigen, J., Velthof, G., Oenema, O., van Groenigen, K. & Van Kessel, C. 2010. Towards
- an agronomic assessment of N₂O emissions: a case study for arable crops. *European Journal of Soil Science*, 61, 903-913.
- Wood, S.W. and Cowie, A., 2004. A review of greenhouse gas emission factors for fertiliserproduction.

- 637 http://www.sciencetheearth.com/uploads/2/4/6/5/24658156/2004_wood_a_review_of_greenhou
- 638 se_gas_emission_factors.pdf

640 Figure legends

641

Fig. 1. Precipitation (mm) and temperature (°C) meteorological data for the experimental
site collected from the JC meteorological station. Graph includes 3 x 30mm irrigation
events which took place during summer 2018 of (due to drought).

Fig. 2. Nitrous oxide emissions and corresponding water filled pore space (WFPS %) of
the experimental site for each sampling occasion. Emissions are displayed for the 6species mixture, monocultures of the individual species (*L. perenne, P. pratense, T. pratense, T. repens, C. intybus* and *P. lanceolate*) and the 300N *L. perenne* monoculture.
All communities received 150 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ nitrogen fertiliser, except for the 300N *L. perenne* community that received 300 kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ of inorganic nitrogen fertiliser.
Arrows indicate fertiliser application dates (*Appendix C*).

Fig. 3. Comparison of predicted N₂O-N emissions (kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) from monocultures and the 6-species mixture. Values that share the same letter are not significantly different ($\alpha = 0.05$).

Fig. 4 a) Predicted annual N₂O emissions (N₂O-N kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) in response to variation 655 in the proportion of the grass (G), herb (H) and legume (L) FGs within grassland 656 communities. The communities represented in this ternary diagram are based on the equi-657 proportional contribution of each of the two species within a FG. Thus, each vertex 658 represents a 50:50 mixture of the two component species in the respective FG; the sides 659 represent communities with varying proportions of two FGs (comprising four species), 660 661 and the interior points represent varying proportions of three FGs (comprising six species). Thus, for example, the predicted N₂O emissions for the community comprising 662

10% grass, 40% legume and 50% herb is calculated from the species-level composition comprising 5% *L. perenne*, 5% *P. pratense*, 20% *T. pratense*, 20% *T. repens*, 25% *C. intybus* and 25% *P. lanceolata.* **b)** Predicted annual N₂O emissions (N₂O-N kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) for a 50:50 mixture of the two species from each FG: grass, legume and herb (these predictions correspond to the vertices in the ternary diagram). For example, the legume FG contains 50% *T. pratense* and 50% *T. repens*. Bars that share a letter are not significantly different ($\alpha = 0.05$).

Fig. 5. a and b Comparison of yield-scaled N₂O emissions from forage monocultures, the 6-species mixture and the mean of the six 150N monocultures for a) N yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O-N g ha⁻¹year⁻¹/N yield kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) and b) DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O-N g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹/DM yield tonne ha⁻¹ year⁻¹). Values that share the same letter are not significantly different ($\alpha = 0.05$).

Fig. 6. Estimated emission intensity analyses for a) N yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O 675 g ha⁻¹ year⁻¹ / N yield kg ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) and b) DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions (N₂O gha⁻¹ 676 year⁻¹/DM yield tonne ha⁻¹ year⁻¹) in response to variation in the proportion of grass (G), 677 herb (H) and legume (L) FGs within grassland communities. The communities 678 679 represented in this ternary diagram are based on an equal proportional contribution of each of the two species within a FG. Thus, each vertex indicates the average of the two 680 component species in the respective FG; the sides represent communities with varying 681 proportions of two FGs (comprising four species), and the interior points represent 682 varying proportions of three FGs (comprising six species). 683







690 Fig. 2







701 Fig. 4









- Fig. 6b

Table 1. (a) Coefficient estimates \pm standard errors for the identity effects (β) and interaction estimates (δ) from equation 2, and (b) predictions for the average monoculture and the equi-proportional 6-species mixtures. These are presented for the models fitted to each of the three responses: N₂O-N emissions, N yield-scaled N₂O emissions and DM yield-scaled N₂O emissions.

	Modelled estimates					
		N ₂ O emissions	N yield-scaled N_2O emissions	Dm yield-scaled N ₂ O emissions		
		$(N_2O-N \text{ kg ha}^{-1} \text{ year}^{-1})$	$(N_2O-N g ha^{-1} year^{-1}/N yield kg ha^{-1} year^{-1})$	$(N_2O-N \text{ g ha}^{-1} \text{ year}^{-1}/DM \text{ yield tonne ha}^{-1} \text{ year}^{-1})$		
(a)	300N L. perenne	3.18 ± 0.196	10.14 ± 0.603	259.3 ± 17.46		
	150N L. perenne	1.39 ± 0.198	6.39 ± 0.644	144.4 ± 18.68		
	P. pratense	1.33 ± 0.206	4.65 ± 0.659	124.1 ± 19.11		
	T. pratense	2.18 ± 0.428	5.21 ± 1.269	183.6 ± 44.95		
	T. repens	1.87 ± 0.428	5.76 ± 1.269	174.6 ± 44.95		
	C. intybus	1.10 ± 0.197	5.04 ± 0.640	133.2 ± 18.57		
	P. lanceolata	1.23 ± 0.197	4.66 ± 0.640	115.0 ± 18.57		
	Species interaction effect δ	n/a	-3.69 ± 1.394	-87.1 ± 43.98		
(b)	6-species mixture	1.52 ± 0.083	3.75 ± 0.356	109.5 ± 10.33		
	Mean of 6 monocultures	1.52 ± 0.083	5.29 ± 0.401	145.8 ± 13.51		

Saoirse Cummins: data curation (nitrous oxide), formal analysis, visualization, writing – original draft preparation.

John A. Finn: supervision, methodology, formal analysis, visualization, writing- reviewing and editing

Karl G. Richards: supervision, methodology, writing- reviewing and editing

Gary J. Lanigan: supervision, methodology, writing- reviewing and editing

Guylain Grange: data curation (yield)

Caroline Brophy: methodology, formal analysis

Laura M. Cardenas: methodology, writing- reviewing and editing

Tom H. Misselbrook: methodology, writing- reviewing and editing

Chris K. Reynolds: methodology, writing- reviewing and editing

Dominika J. Krol: supervision, methodology, writing- reviewing and editing

Declaration of interests

 \boxtimes The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

□The authors declare the following financial interests/personal relationships which may be considered as potential competing interests: