

Cross-cultural pilgrimage and religious change: translation, filial cults, and networks

Book or Report Section

Published Version

Creative Commons: Attribution 4.0 (CC-BY)

Open Accesss

Rutherford, I. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2103-0711 (2024) Cross-cultural pilgrimage and religious change: translation, filial cults, and networks. In: Palamidis, A. and Bonne, C. (eds.) What's in a Divine Name? Religious Systems and Human Agency in the Ancient Mediterranean. De Gruyter, Berlin, pp. 801-824. doi: https://doi.org/10.1515/9783111326511-041 Available at https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/115949/

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See <u>Guidance on citing</u>.

To link to this article DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1515/9783111326511-041

Publisher: De Gruyter

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the <u>End User Agreement</u>.

www.reading.ac.uk/centaur



CentAUR

Central Archive at the University of Reading

Reading's research outputs online

Ian Rutherford

Cross-Cultural Pilgrimage and Religious Change: Translation, Filial Cults, and Networks

Abstract: Pilgrimage tends to bring together people of different religious backgrounds, and it may be a vehicle for the diffusion of religious belief and practice. That's even true within a single culture such as ancient Greece: Greek pilgrims are sometimes instructed to set up "filial cults"; this seems to happen particularly in the context of oracles or healing shrines, the best attested case being Roman Claros. Things are more complex in the case of pilgrimage-sites shared by people from entirely different religious backgrounds, and it is this that I discuss in this paper. I explore three case studies: Greek pilgrimage to the Libyan-Egyptian oracle of Zeus Ammon at Siwa; Phoenician encounters with the sanctuary of Apollo on Delos; and pilgrimage associated with the bicultural healing deity Imhotep-Asclepios in Greco-Roman Egypt. In discussing these cases studies, I shall examine equivalences between gods' names, which we often find articulated at pilgrimage contexts. I shall also look at the migration of foreign gods' names and the growth of religious networks, which could at least in some cases (e.g. that of Zeus Ammon) have been facilitated by returning pilgrims.

1 Introduction

Pilgrimage¹ is a common phenomenon in the Ancient Mediterranean world but it works in many different ways.² It can be conservative and homeostatic, perpetuating social structures and hierarchies; but it can also be an engine for change of various sorts, both social and religious. And while it can act as a focus for consolidating a single religious community, it can also serve to mediate between and integrate different groups of people, sometimes from widely different cultural and religious backgrounds. In this short paper I shall try to show how pilgrimage in the Ancient Mediterranean world illustrates the second of each of these alternatives, that is how cross-cultural pil-

¹ Thanks to Corinne Bonnet for the invitation to write this. And thanks also to Sandy Blakely, Irad Malkin, Hana Navratilova and Rostislav Oreshko.

² On pilgrimage in the ancient world in general, Elsner/Rutherford 2005; Rutherford 2013, 12–14; Rutherford 2020; McCorriston 2011, 19 has a useful definition: "a journey to a sacred place to participate in a system of sacred beliefs".

a Open Access. © 2024 the author(s), published by De Gruyter. [(cc)] **EV** This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. https://doi.org/10.1515/9783111326511-041

grimage can be said to facilitate religious change (e.g. the movement of cults and sometimes also of divine names). In this analysis it makes sense to focus on three aspects:

- 1. divine encounters, resulting from pilgrims visiting the sanctuary. These could include permanent offerings and dedications, but also the ways people engage with the divinity there, how they try to integrate it into their own religious system, by "translation" or in some other way.
- 2. the establishment of filial cults: change brought about by people who visit the sanctuary and return home.
- 3. growth of pilgrimage networks. Regular pilgrimage creates communication: between pilgrims and the sanctuary and between different groups of pilgrims, leading to the development of a network connecting people who visit the same sanctuary. This may have the effect of levelling out local differences, producing a more homogenous culture in a region.

These things typically happen together. However, the overall effect is different depending on the type of pilgrimage and the type of sanctuary. In the case of oracle-pilgrimage or healing-pilgrimage, you perhaps get more filial cults; when the focus is a festival, you'll get something more like regional convergence and a common network.

The second and third aspects can be observed in "ordinary", i.e. non-crosscultural pilgrimage as well. Thus in the case of (2), people establish "filial" cults in their home towns, often at the bidding of the gods, in oracle and healing sanctuaries, which could thus be said to "export" religion. In the dossier for Apollo of Claros/Klarios (2nd century CE) we can actually see the oracle giving instructions on what cults should be established, including the setting up statues of Clarian Apollo (the precise name is important) at their city gates.³ Cults of Asclepios may have been spread in a similar way; the *Iamata* from the Epidauros claim that a man from Halieis, having visited Epidauros without receiving a dream, inadvertently transported a snake back from there to his home town; the Delphic oracle interpreted this as a sign that a cult of Asclepios should be set up there.⁴

To move to the growth of networks (3), it has been argued that the great Panhellenic sanctuaries of Greece played a major role in establishing and maintaining Greek identity in the Archaic period; even if it didn't create it, it certainly intensified it.⁵ So

³ See Rutherford 2019a; Rutherford 2013, 300–301. Davies 2009 thinks that this may be how the cult of Pythian Apollo spread.

⁴ *IG* IV^2 1, 122 69–82 = LiDonnici 1995, B13; cf. Dillon 1997, 199, comparing the case of Nikagora of Sikyon in Paus. 2.10.3; cf. the case of Isis, Thessalonike and Opous discussed by Sokolowski 1974. For the cult of Athenian Asclepios and other cases, Garland 1992, 122. **5** Hall 2002.

too many modern traditions of pilgrimage have been seen as a symbol of national or ethnic identity (termed "mystical nationalism" by Victor and Edith Turner).⁶

The issue of divine encounters (1) works differently depending on whether or not the pilgrims are foreigners. If Greek pilgrims visit a Greek sanctuary, they're usually more or less familiar with the deities there. However, when Greeks visit foreign sanctuaries or non-Greeks visit a Greek one, they encounter unfamiliar deities and have to decide how to name them: whether by their local name or by "translating" them into their own religious system. An early instance of translation is known from Archaic Samos where someone (presumably an Egyptian) offered as a dedication a statue of the Egyptian goddess Mut, which in view of Mut's status as consort of Amun-Re, the chief deity of Egyptian Thebes, almost certainly implies the belief that Mut is a "translation" of Samian Hera.⁷ It must have been common in the Ancient Mediterranean for sanctuaries to be patronized by people from different religious backgrounds;⁸ this can be traced right back to the Late Bronze Age when many different groups must have met at sites like Ugarit.⁹ Some of the best known cases are from Late Antiquity, e.g. Mamre near Hebron in Idumaea, traditionally site of Abraham's encounter with the three angels (Gen 18), where Christian and non-Christian (Jewish, Idumean) pilgrimages may have co-existed.¹⁰

One problem that has to be faced at the start is that the surviving evidence for any particular sanctuary is *always* insufficient to understand all aspects of the behaviour of foreign pilgrims. Most sanctuaries leave almost no relevant evidence at all. There must have been a great deal of pilgrimage between Cyprus and sites in Phoenicia, but we know very little about it.¹¹ Even for the great sanctuary of Artemis at Ephesos, which surely must have attracted visitors from Greece, Anatolia and other areas for many centuries, we lack the right sort of evidence to say very much about the three aspects outlined above.¹²

In this paper I shall briefly examine three cases where intercultural pilgrimage seems to result in religious change. The examples have been chosen largely because in these cases there is at least enough evidence to say *something*. The three cases are: first the oracle of Ammon at Siwa and Greek pilgrimage there; second, Apollo's sanc-

⁶ Ethnic examples: Ireland: Shovlin 1991; Taiwan: Sangren 1987; Mexico, the Virgin of Guadelupe: Turner/Turner 1978; Poland, the Black Madonna of Czestokhova: Turner/Turner 1978; for Greece, Rutherford 2013, 264–271; India, Benares: Eck 1982, 38–39; Bhardwaj 1973, 43–57; Sax 2000.

⁷ von Lieven 2016, 62. See Guralnick 1997, 133; Ebbinghaus 2006; Jantzen 1972, 33–35; Kilian-Dirlmeier 1985.

⁸ The term "ambiguous sanctuary" is sometimes used for this, see Albera 2017; Hobart/Zarcone 2017b; Hasluck 1913–1914.

⁹ See Rutherford 2019b.

¹⁰ Drbal 2017, 2018, 161–173, Cline 2014.

¹¹ See below.

¹² On Ephesos, Elsner 1997.

tuary on Delos and Phoenician pilgrimage; and third, the healing cult of Imhotep/ Asclepios in Memphis in Egypt.

2 Ammon, Zeus Ammon and the Greeks

Just as Egyptians encountered Greek religion in Greece (cf. the case of Mut on Samos above), so Greeks must have encountered Ammon and other Egyptian gods in Egypt and elsewhere. In fact the Egyptian deity Greeks latched onto earliest was Amun-Re or Ammon, and not in Egypt but in his filial cult in the Siwa Oasis in the Western desert in what was then Libya.

The origins of this oracle are pretty murky, but the context seems to be the highly polarised geopolitical situation in Libya in the early 6th century BCE, when the newly founded Cyrene faced off against Egypt to the East and Libya to the South-East.¹³ The current view is that both oracle and god are largely Egyptian.¹⁴ Libyan traditions may have made an early contribution,¹⁵ Baal Hammon of Carthage probably didn't, though the similarity of names (Hammon *vs* Ammon) may have led people to associate them.¹⁶ Greeks from Cyrene must have been visiting already by the late 6th century BCE.¹⁷

Amplified by Cyrene, its fame spread to the Greek world. It has been suggested on the basis of coins and material culture that Ammon makes it to Cyprus by the later 6th BCE, though it is not always easy to tell one horned god from another.¹⁸ In the early 5th century it seems to have started to attract pilgrims from a broader area. The first known Spartan consultation is by Lysander in 403/2BCE, but Spartan relations with Siwa must surely be earlier, in view of Cyrene's Dorian origins, and early traditions about the Spartan colonisation of Libya.¹⁹ No doubt concerned not to let their rivals get some undue advantage, the Athenians were soon consulting it as well (starting with Cimon according Plutarch). In the 4th century, they were sending frequent delegations, and even named one of their sacred ships Ammonias.²⁰ Alexander the

¹³ Colin 1998.

¹⁴ On the temple, see above all Kuhlmann 1988; Kuhlmann suggests (33) that the temple, though of Egyptian design, may have been built by Greek craftsmen; see also Muller/Pliett/Kuhlmann/Wenzel 2002, 217.

¹⁵ Montanari 2011, 111 suggests that there may have been an old Libyan ram-god independent of Egyptian Ammon; Colin 1998 also discusses the Libyan background.

¹⁶ Malkin 1994, 167–168; Kuhlmann 1988, 98–99; Lipiński 1986; Xella 1991, 145–146.

¹⁷ On early votive practice see Vaelske 2017.

¹⁸ Counts 2009; Herodotus 4.162.3 attests early links between Cyprus and Cyrene; Matricon-Thomas 2015, who argues that Cyprus was significant.

¹⁹ See Malkin 1994, *passim*; cf. the constitution: Hdt 4.161.3. Lysander's brother Libys may have been named after the king of Siwa who was a guest-friend of his father, so the relationship could be earlier: Malkin 1990.

²⁰ Woodard 1962; Rutherford 2013, 117.

Great's self-mythologising pilgrimage to Siwa in 331BCE represents the peak of Ammon's fame; Corinne Bonnet has suggested that here too one could speak of political rivalry between states, since Athens was also consulting Ammon at this time.²¹ After that we have less information. Strabo claims that the oracle was not much used in his time, though we hear of some consultations in the early Roman Empire.²²

Ammon is one of the first foreign deities known to have found a place in the Greek pantheon, and perhaps the first where we can follow the process in any depth. Sparta ought to have had the earliest cult, though in fact the only evidence is Pausanias, who also attests one in Sparta's port Gythion.²³ Pausanias also reports that the Eleans worshipped Ammon, and consulted the oracle, that there was a statue of him in Arcadian Megalopolis, and that there was another cult of him in Boeotian Thebes where the poet Pindar had dedicated a statue made by Calamis;²⁴ according to this account, Pindar wrote a hymn to Ammon, which Pausanias himself had seen inscribed at Siwa, next to an altar to Ammon dedicated by Ptolemy Soter.²⁵ There must have been a cult in Athens too, at least from the mid-4th century.²⁶ Another important one seems to have been at Aphytis in the Eastern Chalcidike, founded around 400 BCE,²⁷ possibly a focus for Macedonian interest. Beyond that the texts fail us, but several towns put Ammon on their coins, which may indicate a local cult.²⁸ One of these was Cyzicus, which had a cult association of Ammoneitai in the Roman period, of which more later.²⁹

Since they are found in cities which are known to have sent pilgrimages there, there seems to be a good chance that pilgrimage led to the establishment of filial cults;³⁰ Ammon could even have ordered that people set them up, as Apollo of Claros did in the Roman period. Or possibly we could see the cult of Ammon in the home town as forming one pole of a bilateral ritual complex: the pilgrims start and end with the same god.³¹ However, two texts from the Roman period imply something dif-

²¹ Bonnet 2015a, 440–441; Parke 1967, 218–219; cf. Collins 2012 on the possible background to Alexander's pilgrimage.

²² Str. 17.1.43 (C813); cf. below on Cyzicus.

²³ Sparta: Paus. 3.18.3; Gythion: 3.21.8.

²⁴ Eleans: 5.15.11; Megalopolis: 8.32.1 (Fredricksmeyer 1979 argued that this was a cult of Alexander); Thebes: 9.16.1.

²⁵ Fr. 36; see Paus. 9.16.1.

²⁶ Matricon-Thomas 2015.

²⁷ For the site, see Tsigarida 2011 who says it shows an Egyptian design; there are coins from first half of 4th century BC: Leclant/Clerc 1981, 109–110.

²⁸ Parke 1967, 220; for coins, see Leclant/Clerc 1981, 679–680. Possible candidates include Pitane in Aeolis, Thymbra in the Troad, Lesbos and Tenos.

²⁹ *Steinepigramme* 08/01/01. Cyzicus has an Ammon coin from second half of 5th century: Leclant/ Clerc 1981, 679, no. 104. Evidence from onomastics is later; in particular, the name Philammon, an early priest at Delphi, is probably not connected: see Parker 2000, 75 n. 86.

³⁰ Alternative hypothesis: trade: see Parke 1967, 212.

³¹ Cf. Pythian cults in Athens, Koans and Delos: Rutherford 2013, 176–178.

ferent, that a local cult of Ammon is enough. The first is by Favorinus of Arelate (2nd century CE).³²

This is what Ammon seems to me to mean in particular, when he replied to men from Aphytis in Thrace who consulted the oracle that they should no longer send people to Libya to ask him, but enquire there in Thrace, since he would listen there too, and he listened. "For Zeus the all seeing goes over the wave of the sea and the land and the well-leaved meadows, as water rises from fountains (anonymous poetic fragment)."³³

The second text is an oracle from Cyzicus, which is usually interpreted to mean that there is no need to send delegates to Ammon's oracle in Libya and that sending them to Claros instead is OK. Here, then, the foundation of the filial cult is represented as a substitute for pilgrimage to Ammon.³⁴

This exotic Libyan deity seems to have been incorporated into the Greek pantheon with surprising ease. The usual view is that the process was expedited by identifying Ammon with Zeus (as we just saw in Favorinus), whose roles included that of oracle giver. If the clientele had been just Spartans and Dorians, one might have expected them to have chosen Apollo Karneios, another deity with ram-associations, and one with great importance at Sparta and Cyrene.³⁵ But Zeus was chosen, perhaps because he was a better fit in Panhellenic terms. Pindar is very emphatic that Ammon is Zeus (Pyth. 4.16 and fr. 36 where he is "master of Olympus" – a text of the poem was supposedly dedicated at Siwa); Herodotus comes to the same conclusion on the grounds that (2.42) Ammon of Siwa is the same as Amoun of Thebes, who he is satisfied is Zeus.³⁶ Herodotus thought the relationship between Ammon and Zeus was particularly close because the oracle at Siwa was the sister oracle of that of Zeus at Dodona, both having been founded from Egypt in the distant past (through the intermediary of doves or possibly priestesses).³⁷ A century later identity between Ammon and Zeus is presupposed in the tradition that the oracle instructed Alexander the Great that he was the "son of Zeus" (Callisthenes ap. Strab. 17.1.43 [C814]).³⁸

³² Barigazzi 1966, 383, 23–26. Cf. Parke 1967, 219–220; Tepedino Guerra 2007, 74.

³³ Tepedino Guerra 1997 suggested the fragment is Pindaric.

³⁴ See above.

³⁵ Apollo Karneios and the ram: Malkin 1994, 153. For the idea that the identification with Ammon was mediated via an earlier one with Apollo Karneios; see Struffolino 2012, 187. At Gythion Pausanias found Ammon and the ram-god Apollo Karneios, worshipped next to each other (3.21.8). It has been suggested that Ammon's iconography on Cyprus resembles that of Herakles: Counts 2009.

³⁶ Is there a note of caution in his account of the foundation of the oracle (2.55), where he says that the dove that came to Libya told the Libyans to construct an oracle of Ammon and adds "this is also to Zeus"?

³⁷ Herodotus: Parker 2017.

³⁸ This identification with Zeus is said to be implied in the iconography of coins and statues as well: see Montanari 2011.

But there were other views. In Cyrene itself there is no evidence that Zeus and Ammon were worshipped together,³⁹ and it seems likely that Ammon had his own temple there, and separate rituals.⁴⁰ Tellingly, Greek inscriptions of this period never call him "Zeus Ammon", always simply Ammon.⁴¹ Pausanias in reporting Elean ritual practice calls him "the Libyan god", explicitly distinguishing him from Greek deities, and making him part of a triad, along with Hera Ammonia and Parammon ("which is a surname of Hermes"), the latter now believed to be a Greek version of an Egyptian theonym;⁴² the same triad is found in an Athenian inscription from the 4th century BCE and elsewhere.⁴³ There are other traces of alternative Greek analyses. In some versions Ammon was a former human.⁴⁴ There was a Spartan tradition that he was son of Zeus and Pasiphae, the daughter of Atlas (Plut., Agis 9). Centuries later the poet Nonnos (Dion. 3.285–293) adopts a compromise position, calling him Zeus ("Belos, the Libyan Zeus" and "Zeus Asbystes"), but distinguishing him from the true Zeus; he is son of Poseidon and a nymph Libye, who is herself the daughter of Epaphos, son of Zeus and Io.⁴⁵ Frédéric Colin suggested that Nonnos' genealogy is implied already in a Greek stele from Siwa dated to about 200 BCE, which he read as dedicated to Ammon, Para[mmon], Poseidon, Hera and Libya.⁴⁶ This is speculative,⁴⁷ but it could be right, and this genealogy could even be earlier, since its basic structure can be found in the Hesiodic Catalogue of Women (6th century BCE).⁴⁸

³⁹ They are separate in the sacred calendar *CGRN* 190, 18–19 = *LSCG* Suppl., 196, no. 116 = Pugliese Carratelli 1960; see also Mohamed/Reynolds/Dobias-Lalou 2007, 21–22.

⁴⁰ Parker 2017, 61 with references.

⁴¹ So too Greek coins: see Leschhorn/Franke 2002–2009, I.37.

⁴² See Colin 1995. For an alternative view, see Aly/Demery/Bagnall 2022, 73–74, who argue that Parammon was a form of the deified Alexander.

⁴³ See Paus. 5.15.11; Athens: the inventory from the Mahdia shipwreck, *SEG* 46, 122; Rutherford 2013, 117 and App.#C3 (363/2 BCE); *I. Lindos* no. 77 (about 275 BCE).

⁴⁴ See Paus. 4.23.10; cf. Dionysius Scytobrachion cited by Diod. 3.68; and Diod. 1.15.3: "Osiris, they add, also built a temple to his parents, Zeus and Hera, which was famous both for its size and its costliness in general, and two golden chapels to Zeus, the larger one to him as god of heaven, the smaller one to him as former king and father of the Egyptians, in which role he is called by some Ammon" (transl. C.H. Oldfather, *LCL*).

⁴⁵ If Zeus Belos is identified with Ammon, does this suggest that the identification was made by people familiar with Phoenician/Carthaginian Baal Hammon?

⁴⁶ Colin 1987; see also Wagner 1987, 330–331. Another dedication reported by Kuhlmann 2010, 220 (image at fig.14) = *SEG* 60, 1809 seems to be to Ammon, Parammon, Poseidon, Hermes and Herakles. Hermes and Parammon are distinct, then, unlike at Elis; for Herakles see Wagner 1987, 339–341.

⁴⁷ *SEG* **47**, 2138 is cautious "it may be too rigid to connect our inscription with these specific mythographic traditions collecting the five deities into one family". For Ammon as a minor Zeus see Diod. 1.15.3 cited above.

⁴⁸ In the *Catalogue of Women* the son of Poseidon and Libye is simple Belos, the father of Danaos and Aigyptos; while not identified with Zeus or Ammon, Belos is Egyptian, and not Babylonian or W. Semitic, as the name might suggest. West 1985, 177; Fowler 2013, 347–349. Again, one might consider the possibility that Ammon had already become associated with Baal Hammon of Carthage in Greek mentality if in no other way.

As so often our evidence is patchy, but it is enough to make us cautious about the idea of a simple and straightforward identification between Ammon and Zeus. Translation is fluid: Greeks translated Ammon in different ways at different times, but just as often they left him untranslated.⁴⁹

3 Pilgrimage and Religious Diplomacy: Phoenicia Etc

While Greek pilgrims were visiting foreign gods, non-Greeks were visiting Greek ones. The best place to see this may have been sanctuary of Apollo and Artemis on the island of Delos, which had a thriving pilgrimage tradition, attested already in the 6th century BCE (*Homeric Hymn to Apollo*). And it always seems to have had a multicultural dimension, since the Deliades were famous for imitating the voices of visitors; and it had mythological links to the Hyperboreans in the North and Lycia.

The first evidence for Phoenician contact with Delos comes in the third quarter of the 4th century BCE. This is a bilingual dedication by the Tyrian *Hieronautai* ("sacred sailors") in which they dedicated statues representing the cities of Tyre and Sidon to Apollo:⁵⁰ just like many Greek pilgrims, their aim in making the dedication seems to have been to use of the space of a Panhellenic sanctuary to advertise themselves.⁵¹ Visits by Phoenician *Hieronautai* could have been common; an offering from Byblos recorded in the Delian inventories for 276 BCE could have been brought in that manner,⁵² as could the crowns dedicated by Philokles of Sidon a little earlier.⁵³

In the Hellenistic period there's more evidence for Phoenicians on Delos, though not necessarily as pilgrims. There's a bilingual Phoenician-Greek dedication from temple of Asclepios (166–157 BCE).⁵⁴ And Phoenician cults are among the many foreign cults at Delos set up by merchants, since the island was in a tax-free zone after the destruction of Corinth.⁵⁵ We find Syrian gods, including Atargatis, sometimes called Aphrodite in these inscriptions; the gods of Ascalon; and the gods of the Palestinian city of Iamneia: Herakles and Hauron or Houron, a deity already attested in the Late

⁴⁹ Robert Parker sees Zeus Ammon as a case where Zeus does not necessarily imply identification between two deities, but rather means something like "great god" (Parker 2017, 94); this may be true to some extent, but Pindar seems to have gone for a strong identification between the two.

⁵⁰ I.Délos 50; cf. Rutherford 2013, Appendix #C2.

⁵¹ This is consonant with the practice of Greek *theoroi*, who act on behalf their cities: see Rutherford 2013; the choruses accompanying *theoriai* sang about their own cities: Rutherford 2004.

⁵² Lipiński 2004, 166–171; Byblos: *IG* XI.2.164B4 with Bruneau 1970, 113; Lipiński 2004, 166: "it is possible that such sacred embassies were coming from Phoenicia on a regular basis".

⁵³ Hauben 1987, 417 n. 22, n. 24 and n. 29; Hauben 2004, Lipiński 2004, 166.

⁵⁴ Lipiński 1995, 156, Baslez/Briquel-Chatonnet 1990.

⁵⁵ Strab. 10.5.4 (C486); Parker 2017, 154. This is all about trade; see now also Padilla Peralta 2020.

Bronze Age.⁵⁶ There were also permanent guilds of the Herakleistai of Tyre who take their name from Melqart-Herakles of Tyre and the Poseidoniastai of Berytos, whose deity must be the Greek translation of an unknown Phoenician deity. The guild (*thiasos*) of the Herakleistai in 153/2 BCE requested land from Athens to build a temenos of Herakles on Delos, citing the benefits that Herakles has done for Athens, a sort of "kinship diplomacy".⁵⁷ So this creates a permanent presence, a little like a treasury at one of the Panhellenic sanctuaries.

Back to the hieronautai. The Greek text says the dedication was by the Tyrian hieronautai; the Phoenician text is damaged, but it starts with a dating formula which mentions a king Abdashtart/Straton.⁵⁸ This is usually thought to be one of two kings of Sidon who bore that name. Both kings' reigns played out against the political and military turmoil of the East Mediterranean in mid 4th century. The first (365–355 BCE) rebelled against Persia and was defeated.⁵⁹ The second (342–333 BCE) was deposed by Alexander the Great. It has been argued that that hand of the inscription is better fit for reign of Straton II;⁶⁰ so were these Tyrian argonauts perhaps celebrating his accession, or courting Apollo's support in anticipation of Alexander's attack? There are, however, problems with this hypothesis: there is no evidence that Sidon and Tyre formed a political unity at this point or any other, so why would Tyrians act on behalf of Straton II?⁶¹ Could it be because the Tyrians had greater expertise at navigating sacred maritime networks, and perhaps were used to performing this service on behalf of other Phoenician cities? (as sometimes happens in Greece⁶²). The problem would go away if Straton were the king Straton of Tyre mentioned by Justin in his epitome of Pompeius Trogus (18.3); Justin/Trogus says he was made king after a slave revolt, and his family were spared by Alexander the Great.⁶³ Josette Elayi proposes that the *hieronautai* were representing this Tyrian Straton in the mid-4th century; Jo Quinn⁶⁴ suggests that he was put on the throne by Alexander,⁶⁵ in which case the ded-

⁵⁶ Parker 2017, 154–172; Bonnet 2015a, 475–520; Bruneau 1970, 621–630.

⁵⁷ I.Délos 1519, Bruneau 1970, 622.

⁵⁸ Hermary 2014, 274 observes how little we know about the part of the inscription in Phoenician.

⁵⁹ He is usually thought to be the Straton honoured with a proxeny decree by Athens (*IG* $II^2.141$), though that decree is now dated to 394–386 BCE; were there three kings with that name?

⁶⁰ Hermary 2014. The earlier interpretation put it slightly earlier. Quinn 2018, 67 on the possible implications of a political unity.

⁶¹ Though Boyes 2012, 37 seems to think Straton I ruled Tyre, based on Justin 18.3 (see below).

⁶² See Rutherford 2013, 179–180.

⁶³ Quinn 2018, 67; Elayi 2006, 95 with Elayi 1981, also Elayi 1988; Elayi 2006 dates the end of his reign to 349 BCE.

⁶⁴ Quinn 2018, 67.

⁶⁵ In fact, Justin says that it was the Tyrian Straton's family that Alexander spares, but one would expect the same name to appear among subsequent rulers.

ication of the *hieronautai* must have been about Hellenization: Tyre would be confirming its relationship with Apollo and the Aegean world.⁶⁶

When the *hieronautai* visited Phoenicians had already been part of Mediterranean world for centuries and had probably long been interested in Greek sanctuaries.⁶⁷ They were also acquainted with Apollo: whatever we make of Herodotus' report (6.118) that a Phoenician ship in Datis' fleet had carried off a gold statue of Apollo from Delos, or of the chorus of Tyrian girls bound for Delphi in Euripides' *Phoenissae*,⁶⁸ Apollo reached Tyre in 404 BCE according to Diodorus of Sicily, a statue of Apollo having been sent there by the Carthaginian general Himilco after he sacked Sicilian Gela in 404 BCE. When Alexander the Great sacked Tyre he chose not to return it to Gela, but left it in place – a symbol, perhaps, of its new Hellenized status.⁶⁹ Later on in the mid-2nd century BCE Tyre seems to have had a religious-political relationship with Delphi, since it sent them a letter which stressed their relationship (*sunkrasis* in line 2), perhaps involving Herakles in some way.⁷⁰ Apollo was also a presence at Sidon: the so-called Tribune found in the sanctuary of the Eshmun at Bostan-esh-Sheikh near Sidon, dated perhaps to the mid-4th century BCE, has an image of several Greek gods, including Apollo Citharoedus.⁷¹

It thus appears that the Tyrian *hieronautai* made their dedication with knowledge that Apollo was already established at home in Tyre and probably in Sidon. There is, however, no sign a filial cult of Delian Apollo in Phoenicia. This could be due to deficiencies in the evidence, but in fact filial cults of Delian Apollo are not common anywhere, except the islands of the SE Aegean (the "Dodecanesos"), e.g. in Kos, which seems to have regularly sent a major *theoria* to Delos.⁷²

The Greek part of *hieronautai* dedication mentions Apollo; the corresponding part of the Phoenician text does not survive. We don't know whether they identified Apollo with a Phoenician god, and if so which one. If they had chosen to do so, there were two obvious equivalents. The only explicitly attested Phoenician translation for Apollo is the old Syrian warrior and plague god Reshef. This equation is found only in

⁶⁶ In a similar way it has been suggested that Aspendos joined the network of Argos after its encounter with Alexander the Great: see Lane Fox 2008, 232–238. Rutherford 2013, 275.

⁶⁷ E.g. for Ephesos: Bammer 1985.

⁶⁸ See Bonnet 2015a, 336–338.

⁶⁹ See Bonnet 2015, 400. There is thought to be a sanctuary of Apollo at Tyre, which may be pre-Hellenistic: see Bikai/Fulco/Marchand 1996.

⁷⁰ Curty 1995, no. 12; Rigsby 1996, 481–485; Bonnet 2015a, 304–305; Quinn 2018, 140. Arados was included in the list of *thearodokoi* in late 3rd century BCE; it's not clear if Tyre and other Phoenician cites were as well.

⁷¹ Stucky 1984. In Hellenistic Sidon a victorious athlete makes a dedication to Apollo Delphikos (not Delios), and in early Roman period there is an Apolloneia festival. Bonnet 2015a, 242; Rigsby 2007, 144, 149.

⁷² Rutherford 2009; Rutherford 2013, 231–236.

central Cyprus in the 4th century BCE;⁷³ it is also suggestive that in Egyptian Thebes in the Hellenistic period Reshef and Apollo are individually equated with the Egyptian god Montu.⁷⁴ (another case of translation-fluidity – Apollo is usually the translation of Egyptian Horus). How widespread the Apollo-Reshef equation was is hard to say: Reshef is conspicuously absent from the record in the Western Mediterranean,⁷⁵ and not well attested in the East,⁷⁶ but it would surely be unwise to assume it was confined to Cyprus.

The other equivalent that has been proposed is Eshmun, a healing god, whose principal seat of worship was Sidon/Bostan-esh-Sheikh. This is not straightforward, because Eshmun was also identified with Asclepios, apparently already in the 4th century BCE, if this is the implication of a syllabo-cypriot dedication by a certain Timon to Asclepios found at Sarepta near Sidon.⁷⁷ There seem to be two ways of interpreting this. First, the argument has been made the identification with Asclepios replaced the earlier one with Apollo, both here and in the West.⁷⁸ Kent Rigsby sees it as the triumph of the "literary and banal" (Asclepios) over the "local" (Apollo), and argues, on the grounds that the main "Panhellenic" festival at Sidon was named after Apollo, that Asclepios was not officially adopted there till the late Hellenistic or Roman period (Timon's dedication to Asclepios were closely associated healing deities, perhaps Eshmun was identified with both of them at the same time,⁸⁰ "Apollo" being the more general term, "Asclepios" denoting him in his healing aspect.

None of this makes it any easier to figure out how the *hieronautai* interpreted Delian Apollo. If the Sidonians saw him as Eshmun, we can't be certain that Tyrians would have agreed, and actually they might be expected to have pushed back if Eshmun was perceived as the Sidonian deity par excellence, rivalling their own Melqart.⁸¹ The Apollo-Reshef translation should not be ruled out, since it's the only

80 Cf. Lipiński 1995, 164 who talks about a "duality".

⁷³ Lipiński 1995, 188.

⁷⁴ Lipiński 2009, 256; von Lieven 2016, 67. Lipiński 2009, 244 also suggests the parallel Apollo, Reshef is implied in the Hebrew Bible.

⁷⁵ The name has been read in an inscription from Ibiza (*KAI* 72A-B = *DB MAP* T#2205), but against this see Lipiński 2009, 236 and Münnich 2013, 257.

⁷⁶ Lipiński 1995, 188. It has often been suggested that the Arabic name of Arsuf = Apollonia near Tel Aviv reflects Reshef, but that's not certain.

⁷⁷ See Masson 1982; *ICS* 369e. The *locus classicus* for the identification with Asclepios is Damascius, *Life of Isidorus*, Athanassiadi fr. 142B = Phot. *Bibl.* cod. 242, 302 (= 352b).

⁷⁸ See Lipiński 1995, 162–166; Lipiński 2004, 484–492; Rigsby 2007, 147–149.

⁷⁹ If Asclepios was now Eshmun, was there a different Phoenician deity standing behind Apollo? Some late sources make Asclepios' father the obscure Sydyk, which may be "Justice": Lipiński 1995, 112–114; Lipiński 2004, 488; could Sydyk have been intended an equivalent to Apollo, who can be associated with morality and order (see e.g. Rutherford 2001, 172, 320)?

⁸¹ Münnich 2013, 266: Reshef was replaced in part by Eshmun "specially as the ruler over disease". Apollo appears in the Roman version of the god list in the treaty recorded by Plb. 7.9.2–3 between Hannibal and Philip 5 of Macedon made in 215 BCE: Lipiński 2004, 486 n. 52 says this is

Phoenician translation of Apollo that's actually attested, and for all we know it was established in Syrian-Aegean religious diplomacy. There is also a third possibility: non-translation. When people encounter foreign deities, translation can provide convenient ways of understanding them within the framework of their own religious system; but they could also choose to recognise the foreign deity with its own name as something new and different, an addition to their own pantheon (like Egyptian Isis in the Hellenistic period). In fact, the difference between this and translation may be one of emphasis only; thus, Phoenicians visiting Delos in 350 BCE might have recognise Apollo as a transregional deity and addressed him as "Apollo", while acknowledging that there were similarities between him and Eshmun or Reshef.⁸²

We can learn a little more about the dynamics of Phoenician *theoria* to Delos by looking at the *hieronautai*. Sacred ships used in *theoria* ("*theorides*") are well known from Greek religion especially in the context of Delos (e.g. the one in Plato's *Phaedo*).⁸³ The term *hieronautai* does not occur in that context, though we do find it used in late inscriptions relating to Isiac religion.⁸⁴ There are a few other references to Phoenician sacred sailing. An unusual verse epitaph from the Piraeus for Antipatros-Shemy of Askalon (late fourth century BCE) refers to a "sacred ship", and this has led to the speculation that Antipatros-Shemy was a sacred delegate or *theoros* visiting a Phoenician cult there, or perhaps Delos.⁸⁵ Secondly, a "ship for carrying sacred offerings" (*naus hieragogos*) was sent yearly from Carthage to Tyre bringing *patrioi aparchai* and also apparently attending the festival:⁸⁶

Finding a Carthaginian ship that had carried sacred offerings anchored at the mouth of the Tiber, he (Menyllos of Alabanda) hired it. Such ships were specially selected at Carthage for the conveyance of the traditional offering of firstfruits to their gods that the Carthaginians send to Tyre.

Sources also tell is that these envoys celebrated a yearly festival in Tyre; Arrian calls them *theoroi*.⁸⁷ Greek colonies sometimes send offerings back home as well, though there's no sign that sacred ships were used for this.⁸⁸ There is, however, a broad simi-

86 Plb. 31.12.11–12 (trans. W.R. Paton, *LCL*).

Eshmun (". . . since Resheph did not belong to the Carthaginian pantheon"); so Xella 2019, 283; Barré 1983, 61–64 says it's Reshef.

⁸² So Bonnet 2015a, 400; cf. Parker 2017, 45–46.

⁸³ Rutherford 2013, 181-182.

⁸⁴ I.Tomis 98. See Avram 2018, 123–124.

⁸⁵ *IG* II².8388. Stager (2005, 438 n. 52) conveniently catalogues scholars who have seen a *theoria* here, starting with Köhler in *IG* II.2836 (1888), and including Wolters 1888, 315, and Bonnet 1990, 45.

⁸⁷ Arr. *An.* 2.24.5: καὶ Καρχηδονίων τινὲς θεωροὶ ἐς τιμὴν τοῦ Ἡρακλέους κατὰ δή τι[να] νόμιμον παλαιὸν εἰς τὴν μητρόπολιν ἀφικόμενοι (. . . as well as some Carthaginian envoys who had come to their mother-city to pay honour to Herakles, according to an ancient custom [trans. P.A. Brunt, *LCL*]); cf. also Quintus Curtius 4.2.10. Another case can be found in Diod. 20.14, with Bonnet 2015b. For the role of "Baal of Tyre/of the Rock" in the Tyrian network, see Guillon 2021.

⁸⁸ Rutherford 2013, 61–62.

larity between the way Phoenician and Greek sacred networks worked, as Michael Sommer has observed:

The paramount importance of Melqart throughout the Phoenician colonial diaspora, especially his association with seafaring, suggests that the god played a key role on keeping the network alive – different from but analogous to the oracle of Delphi (Sommer 2009, 100).

The point here is that Carthage sending first fruits to Tyre resembles representatives of all Greeks, including colonists, meeting at the great Panhellenic sanctuaries. Probably we should see the Tyrian *hieronautai* at Delos in the same way: because they have a similar institution – the sacred ship – they use it to latch onto and become part of the Greek network. That also might explain why they are Tyrians: it is because they were the experts in sacred navigation (see above).

So while we don't have much evidence about translation or filial cults, we can at least see how the Phoenician sacred network comes to merge with the Greek one. This could have happened elsewhere as well. There were cultic links between Cyprus and Phoenician sanctuaries such as Sidon/Bostan esh-Sheik and Amrit near Arados.⁸⁹ Corinne Bonnet⁹⁰ has suggested that in the early Hellenistic period there was a simple sacred network linking Asclepios in Kos and Eshmun in Sidon, and that Sidon was trying to "s'insérer dans une dynamique de *koinè* cultuelle".⁹¹ Kos was in the Delian sacred network, and sent a regular *theoria* to Delos,⁹² so perhaps we could imagine the Phoenicians as sometimes joining the sacred flotilla.

4 Imhotep and Asclepios: Cultic Mobility in Ptolemaic Egypt

Some of the best known "ambiguous" cult sites are healing sanctuaries. One such case is that of Eshmun in Sidon, just discussed. Other cases are also known from Roman Thrace: Asclepios Zimidrenus and Asclepios Culculsenus.⁹³ In Egypt, Asclepios was usually identified with Imhotep, a divinised human, once a minister and architect in

⁸⁹ Eshmun linking Kition and Amrit: Bonnet 2015, 124–125; Bordreuil 1985, 227–230; Cypriots may even have dedicated an image of Ammon at Amrit: Bisi 1981. Timon's dedication to Asclepios-Eshmun at Sarepta near Sidon: see above; there is another syllabo-cypriot inscription from Sidon dedicated to a goddess (*ICS* 369d); Bonnet 2015a, 257.

⁹⁰ Bonnet 2015, 254–257; cf. also Bonnet 2013, 48–49.

⁹¹ Bonnet 2015, 256. Sidonian Diotimos son of Abdalonymos makes a bilingual dedication on Kos: Lipiński 2004, 149–155; Bonnet 2015, 251–257. This hypothesis depends on Sidonian Eshmun being Asclepios at this time, which Rigsby would not accept. For similarities between Phoenician and Greek networks (specifically those relating to *aphidrumata*), see Bonnet 2015b.

⁹² Rutherford 2013, 321–326; Rutherford 2009.

⁹³ Pfloeg 2018,75-76, 198.

the reign of the Old Kingdom pharaoh Djoser (27th century BCE). The centre for Imhotep's cult was in N. Saqqara to the West of Memphis, a site of great importance for the development of Egyptian religion in the 1st millennium BCE (it was probably here that the deity Sarapis (= Osir-Apis, the deified Apis bull) originated) and a great crosscultural meeting place. Imhotep's cult can be traced back to the Saite Dynasty (664–525 BCE), though it could be earlier; his temple there, probably in the vicinity of the Bubasteion,⁹⁴ may have been close to "step pyramid" of Djoser which he was supposed to have designed. In the 4th century (30th Dynasty) he was worshipped alongside Ptah (by this time regarded as his father) and Apis-Osiris.⁹⁵ The size of the cult can be judged from an inscription form the reign of Augustus which commemorates assistance given by Imhotep in bringing about the birth of a son and lists six annual festivals.⁹⁶

The cult was drawing pilgrims from a wide area: this is probably the reason for the large number of bronze statues of Imhotep found in Saqqara.⁹⁷ Inscriptions on two 4th century funerary statues mention visitors coming from cities and nomes to pray to Imhotep for life for themselves. One of these is on behalf of a priest based in Karnak and Hermonthis in area of Thebes to the South,⁹⁸ which suggests that the cult had a pan-Egyptian dimension at this time.

The identification with Asclepios can be traced back to the 3rd century BCE, when Manetho refers to Imhotep under that name.⁹⁹ We should probably think of Imhotep's cult as becoming a pilgrimage site for Greeks in Memphis and the area. The most spectacular testimony is the so-called Imouthes Papyrus (*P.Oxy*.1381, Early Roman), the writer of which purports to be translating a sacred book about the deity, claiming that his cult went back to the reign of Menkaure (26th century BCE), when it was transferred to Memphis from Heliopolis,¹⁰⁰ and that the book was discovered in the reign of Nectanebo (379–361 BCE).¹⁰¹ Not all sources saw the Greek Asclepios and Im-

⁹⁴ On the date, see Wildung 1980, 146–147; on the position see Wildung 1977a, 46–47; Wildung 1977b, 33–34, §13; Smith 1984, 412–428, 424; Nicholson 2018, 24–25; for the site, see Lang 2013, 67–69; 75–78. For the meagre epigraphic evidence, see Ray 2011, H1 and H11.

⁹⁵ Wildung 1977b, §19.

⁹⁶ Wildung 1977b, §47.

⁹⁷ Wildung 1977b, §47.

⁹⁸ Wildung 1977b, §21; cf. §20.

⁹⁹ There is a good survey in Renberg 2016, 425 n. 81; Manetho, *FGrH* 609F2–3b, 22–23 says the 4th Dynasty Pharaoh Sesorthos (= Djoser) was called Asclepios and was an architect and doctor; Imhotep lived in the reign of Djoser, so there has been some confusion here; other sources Philonides Papyrus *P.Petr* I 30(1) = Wildung 1977b, §35.

¹⁰⁰ A cult of Imhotep in Heliopolis is confirmed by Demotic papyri: see Wildung 1977b, 124. Another reference in an astrological papyrus *P.Paris* 19, col. i, l. 6.

¹⁰¹ Imhotep's importance is shown by the Demotic Egyptian "life of Imhotep" narrative, in which he and Djoser fight the Assyrians and try to reclaim the parts of Osiris' body, and Imhotep heals Djoser of blindness (Ryholt 2009). For his role in Egyptian hermetic literature see Quack 2014, Jasnow 2016,

hotep as identical. One of the Greek magical papyri has a spell which recommends inscribing on a ring the image of "Asclepios of Memphis" ($\tau \delta \nu \ \dot{\epsilon} \nu \ M \dot{\epsilon} \mu \phi \epsilon_i \ A \sigma \kappa \lambda \eta \pi_i \delta \nu$); when you use it, you're supposed to show it to the constellation of the Bear, saying: "Menophri (i.e. Memphite one), who sit on the Cherubim, send me the true Asclepios, not some deceitful *daimon* instead of the god . . .". One might have expected the Egyptian theonym to be used here (as it is in some Demotic Egyptian spells), but the Greek one has eclipsed it.¹⁰²

In the Hellenistic period Imhotep's cult spread to various places in Egypt, which probably reflects popular demand for a healing deity. At Dendara, there is an inscription praising his accomplishments on a wall close to the so-called sanatorium.¹⁰³ In some of these places, he is clearly associated with Asclepios, as at Philai, where a temple for Imhotep was built by Ptolemy V with a dedication to Asclepios in Greek at the top of the pylon, accompanying Egyptian iconography and inscriptions.¹⁰⁴ There may be some relation to the "Famine Stele" on nearby Sehel Island where Imhotep plays a prominent role.¹⁰⁵

Asclepios and Imhotep were also associated at Deir-el-Bahari in the mortuary temple of queen Hatshepsut on the West bank of the Nile near Thebes.¹⁰⁶ Deir-el-Bahari had been a pilgrimage destination for many centuries because it was on the route of the great "Festival of the Valley" when crowds of people accompanied the god Ammon crossing the Nile from Thebes to the West bank to worship the goddess Hathor and commemorate their ancestors. This pilgrimage probably continued into the Roman period; some graffiti mention Ammon or Amenophis, the god of Egyptian Thebes.¹⁰⁷

At Deir-el-Bahari there was a healing cult of another divinised man, Amenothes the son of Hapu, who had been an important official and manager under the 18th Dynasty pharaoh Amenhotep III, and was apparently remembered as a priest in Manetho's *Aegyptiaca* (= Jos., *Ap.* 1.232–6; here called "Amenophis"). Unusually for someone who wasn't royalty, he was worshipped after death in a mortuary temple on the West bank at Thebes (at Qurnet Murai).¹⁰⁸ He seems to have been regarded as a healing deity already in the 26th Dynasty and was visited by a daughter of the pharaoh Psam-

^{332–334.} For the possibility that the cult of Imhotep-Asclepios is continued in Arabic times in the tradition of Joseph's prison, see Stricker 1942.

¹⁰² *P.Lond.* 121 = *PGM* VII.628–642, 3rd-4th centuries CE.

¹⁰³ Wildung 1977a, 55–56 = *Dendara* XIII.59; cf. Cauville 2011, 74–77; the sanatorium now doubted: Cauville 2004; Renberg 2016, 377; Lang 2013, 96; Daumas 1957.

¹⁰⁴ Wildung 1977b, 152–171; A. Bernand 1969, no.8 (c. p.102–103); see Cauville/Ibrahim Ali 2013, 79–86. some have speculated that the motivation for the dedication might be a successful birth.

¹⁰⁵ See Gasse/Rondot 2007, no.542; Grenier 2004.

¹⁰⁶ Łajtar 2006, 46–47.

¹⁰⁷ Łajtar 2006, 48-49.

¹⁰⁸ Wildung 1977a, 88.

metichus I.¹⁰⁹ In the early Hellenistic period (around 300 BCE) his cult was for some reason moved a short distance North to the upper terrace of the great mortuary temple of Queen Hatshepsut at Deir-el-Bahari.

Around the same time¹¹⁰ Amenothes was joined by Imhotep-Asclepios. At Deir-el-Bahari Greek graffiti and ostraka always call him Asclepios; that theonym is not found at Memphis, but very few Greek graffiti have been published from there, and Memphite sources *do* refer to the Asclepieion. At Deir-el-Bahari he is twice invoked as son of Phoibos (Apollo),¹¹¹ which contrasts with the usual idea that Imhotep is son of Ptah; in the esoteric Memphite *P.Oxy* 1381 this is even extended to Asclepios who is "son of Hephaistos (= Ptah)".¹¹² At Deir el-Bahari the goddess Hygieia is present too and may possibly correspond to a minor Egyptian goddess.¹¹³

Visitors came to Deir-el-Bahari from Thebes and the immediate region, and occasionally from further afield, in some cases leaving graffiti or ostraca (Greek graffiti have been published; demotic Egyptian ones not). Most are from the region of Thebes, but they included a Roman solder stationed in Coptos.¹¹⁴ Some of them describe themselves as feasting.¹¹⁵ A late Greek subliterary source describes the visit of one Thessalos of Tralles to Thebes to receive a revelation from Asclepios, and this probably refers to the same deity.¹¹⁶

These two were also worshipped together in Karnak, where there was a great Egyptian hymn to them on the door to the temple of Ptah.¹¹⁷ In the late Ptolemaic period, another centre for Amenothes and Imhotep, along with Thosytmis, an oracular form of Thoth, was established nearby at Qasr el-Agouz, but pilgrims continued to visit them in Deir-el-Bahari.¹¹⁸

In one graffito from Deir el-Bahari from the Roman period,¹¹⁹ two other divine names occur:¹²⁰

καὶ Φριτωβ συνβοηθούντων Πχερσταπανε

¹⁰⁹ Wildung 1977b, §179.

¹¹⁰ Lajtar 2006, 14–15, 30–31. Imhotep's first attestation in Thebes is in the reign of Ptolemy III; he is found at Deir-el-Medina under Ptolemy VI; his introduction into Deir-el-Bahari probably happened around the same time.

¹¹¹ Łajtar 2006, 100, 208.

¹¹² Another respect in which *P.Oxy* 1381 is closer to Egyptian religion is the figure Caleoibis: Ray 2011, 238. **113** See Łajtar 2006, 47–48; Parker 2017, 42 n. 33. Laskowski-Kusztal 1984, 88 suggests Hygeia the same

as the hippopotamus goddess Ipet-Nut; von Lieven 2016, 76–77 disagrees.

¹¹⁴ Łajtar 2006, 80-86; no. 208.

¹¹⁵ Lajtar 2006, 67–68; see *Theban Ostraca* 142 for a synodos of Amenothes.

¹¹⁶ Moyer 2011, 250–251.

¹¹⁷ Wildung 1997b, 209–210; Sauneron 1965.

¹¹⁸ Łajtar 2006, 15.

¹¹⁹ Łajtar 2006, 130.

¹²⁰ Łajtar 2006, 130; cf. 48.

This is to be read with line 1 after line 2: "With the joint aid of Pkherstapane and Phritob".

This is possibly written by Eugraphios, author of the previous graffito (though this one is in smaller letters) which is a *proskunema* to Asclepios, Amenothes and Hygieia (no.129). The participle $\sigma\nu\nu\beta\sigma\eta\Thetao\nu\tau\omega\nu$ suggests that these deities are additional to Imhotep and Amenothes. Łajtar s.v. makes a case for them referring to Imhotep and Amenothes. Pkherstapane seems to represent an Egyptian rendering of the Old Persian for "satrap" (*khsathra-pavan*), with addition of the Egyptian definite article (*p3-*).¹²¹ This is attested as a divine title and epithet, but also seems to have been confused with the name of the Phoenician god Shadrapha,¹²² who is sometimes associated with Eshmun¹²³ and Greek Asclepios.¹²⁴ Phritob could be the transcription of Egyptian *p3-hry-tp*, title of a high Ptolemaic officer, which Łajtar argues could refer to Amenothes,¹²⁵ in which case Pkherstapane would be an Egyptian-Greek-Phoenician version of Imhotep/Asclepios. Even if these deities are separate, the name "Pkherstapane" suggests a further dimension of the multi-cultural pilgrimage to Deir el-Bahari, with a contribution from the Persian or Semitic world.

This is thus the picture that emerges: Imhotep's cult thus began in Memphis, where he was identified with Asclepios. The Greco-Egyptian cult then spread from there to various places in Egypt in the Ptolemaic period. The most successful second-ary cult seems to have been in the Thebes area, where Imhotep-Asclepios joins the already established Amenothes as one of a pair of healing deities. There was thus a double process of cultic combination: at Memphis, Imhotep is equated with Asclepios while Deir el-Bahari Imhotep and Asclepios are associated with Amenothes. The first is paradigmatic (a substitution), the second syntagmatic (an association).

The identification of Asclepios with Imhotep/Imouthes is not, as far as we can see, found in the broader Greco-Roman world. Instead, the Egyptian healing god par excellence is Sarapis, who was often regarded as an equivalent or rival to Asclepios. Aelius Aristides revered them both; Artemidoros warned about dreams in which Sarapis heals the dreamer: these always lead to death, because Sarapis is the god of the Underworld.¹²⁶

123 See Lipinksi 1995, 196; Bonnet 2015, 120 is less sure.

¹²¹ Łajtar attributes this idea to H. J. Thissen.

¹²² For "satrap" as a theonym see Lipiński 1995, 197–198, who suggests in the Xanthos trilingual the deity Hstrpty = Khsathrapati could be Mithra as "satrap"; also Bonnet 2015, 194–195.

¹²⁴ See Lipiński 1995, 197–198: the "lion-holding" Asclepios referred to in Marinus' *Life of Proclus* 19 recalls the "Amrit Stele" of Shadrapha. Notice that a statue of Imhotep was found in the favissa at Amrit, near to where this statue comes from: Bonnet 2015, 123; for the site, Lembke 2004. Note that in Grotto Regina near Palermo in Sicily graffiti addressing Shadrapha and Isis are found together: for references see Bonnet 2015, 120.

¹²⁵ Chaeremon, cited by Jos., *Ap.* 1.289 and 295, uses Phritobautes as the name of an advisor to the pharaoh Amenophis, which looks very like Manetho's Amenophis son of Hapu.

¹²⁶ See Stambaugh 1972, 75–78, who suggested that Sarapis might have had a "healing" role in Alexandria as well; Hornbostel 1973, 22 n. 3; for Sarapis not being worshipped widely in Egypt before the

Occasionally the two gods were equated, as by Tacitus (*Hist.* 4.84.5), and by Vedius Alkisthenes who made a syncretic dedication in Lebena (3rd-4th CE).¹²⁷

The triumph of Imhotep in the *chora* may have been a deliberate religious strategy by the Ptolemies, perhaps to foster a popular cult which was shared by Egyptians and Greeks, and also to encourage a common religious culture between Memphis and Upper Egypt. The priests may have been involved as well.¹²⁸ But since this cult attracted pilgrims (both Egyptian and Greeks), it seems likely that that they played a part in the transmission, establishing filial cults as they returned. A key part in this Imhotep-ization of Egypt was surely his identification with Asclepios, which probably happened in Memphis the early 3rd century BCE, and it may have been Greco-Egyptians' expectations about Asclepios that drove the process.

5 Conclusion

So the evidence for the three key aspects I identified at the start predictably turns out to be uneven. Filial cults are best illustrated by the dissemination of Ammon to Greece. For pilgrimage networks the most suggestive case is that of the *hieronautai* of Tyre, which allows us to glimpse the Phoenician sacred network and how it may have begun to merge with the Greek one, although even here we have no information about the earliest phases. In the case Imhotep/Asclepios we seem to see filial cults as well, stimulated in part surely by popular Greek interest. In all three cases the theme that emerges most clearly is the importance and limitations of translation: people use it as a practical tool to make an unfamiliar god comprehensible within the frame of their own pantheon, by a process that has elsewhere been called "anchoring innovation"; but no single translation is fixed, and often people don't translate at all.

Finally, in the context of this volume, the question should be asked, what was the likely contribution of pilgrimage to the development and dissemination of divine names in the East Mediterranean region? My provisional answer to that is it made a major contribution, comparable to other dynamics such as trade (which is often linked to pilgrimage), migration and warfare. Two factors incline me in this direction. First, the volume of cross-cultural pilgrimage in the region must have been very high, with a broad geographical and diachronic distribution. And secondly (as I have tried to show in this paper) in cases where evidence *does* survive, we can sometimes catch

Roman period see Bricault 2021, 188. On Aristides, see Behr 1968, 149–150; on Artemidorus, see Thonemann 2020, 154–156.

¹²⁷ *I.Cret.* I.17.27 = *DB MAP* T#14355.: Διὶ Σεράπιδι Ἀσκληπιῷ ἰατρῷ Τειτανίῳ Λεβηναίῳ. The epithet Titanios is said to come from Titane in the NE Peloponnese near Sicyon where Asclepios had a major temple: see Paus. 2.11.3–7.

¹²⁸ Łajtar 2006, 34.

a glimpse of how pilgrims encountering foreign gods identified them with their own deities, and/or exported them back to their own communities. Surely it's not overextrapolating to say that the same thing must have happened all over the place.

Bibliography

- Albera, Diogini (2017), "Towards a reappraisal of ambiguity. In the footsteps of Frederick W. Hasluck", in: Angela Hobart / Thierry Zarcone (eds.), *Pilqrimage and Ambiguity. Sharing the Sacred*, Ascona, 29–51.
- Aly, M.A.I. / El-Demery, A.A. / Bagnall, R.S. (2022), "The Temple of Parammon and Isis Neotera in the Siwa Oasis", in: *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 224, 67–77.
- Avram, Alexandru (2018), "Sur les pastophores de Tomis", in: Mihai Popescu / Irina Achim / Florian Matei-Popescu (eds), *La Dacie et l'Empire romain. Mélanges d'épigraphie et d'archéologie offerts à Constantin C. Petolescu*, Bucarest, 121–126.
- Bammer, Anton (1985), "Spuren der Phöniker im Artemision von Ephesos", in: *Anatolian Studies* 35, 103–108.
- Barigazzi, Adelmo (1966), Favorino di Arelate; introduzione, testo critico e commento, Firenze.
- Barré, Michael (1983), The God-List in the Treaty between Hannibal and Philip V of Macedonia. A Study in Light of the Ancient Near Eastern Treaty Tradition, London.
- Baslez, Marie-Françoise / Briquel-Chatonnet, Françoise (1990), "L'inscription gréco-phénicienne de l'Asclépieion de Délos", in: *Semitica* 38, 27–38.
- Behr, C.A. (1968), Aelius Aristides and the Sacred Tales, Amsterdam.
- Bernand, André (1969), Les inscriptions grecques de Philae. t. 1. Époque ptolémaïque, Paris.
- Bhardwaj, Surinder (1973), *Hindu Places of Pilgrimage in India (A Study in Cultural Geography)*, Berkeley CA. Bikai, Patricia Maynor / Fulco, William J. / Marchand, Jeannie (1996), *Tyre: the Shrine of Apollo*, Amman.
- Bisi, Anna Maria (1982), "Su una terracotta di tipo cipriota da 'Amrit", in: *Rivista di Studi Fenici*, 189–196.
- Bonnet, Corinne (1990), "Antipatros l'Ascalonite dévoré par un lion: Commentaire de *CIS* I, 115", in: *Semitica* 38, 39–47.
- Bonnet, Corinne (2013), "The Religious Life in Hellenistic Phoenicia: 'Middle Ground' and New Agencies", in: Jörg Rüpke (ed.), *The Individual in the Religions of the Ancient Mediterranean*, Oxford, 41–57.
- Bonnet, Corinne (2015a), *Les enfants de Cadmos. Le paysage religieux de la Phénicie hellénistiq*ue, Paris. Bonnet, Corinne (2015b), "Des chapelles d'or pour apaiser les dieux. Au sujet des *aphidrymata* carthaginois
- offerts à la métropole tyrienne en 310 av. J.-C.", in: *Mythos. Rivista di Storia delle Religioni*, 71–86.
- Bordreuil, Pierre (1985), "Le dieu Echmoun dans la région d'Amrit", in: Edward Lipiński (ed.), *Phoenicia and its Neighbours* (Studia Phoenicia III), Leuven, 221–230.
- Boyes, Philip (2012), "The King of the Sidonians: Phoenician Ideologies and the Myth of the Kingdom of Tyre-Sidon", in: *Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research* 365, 33–44.
- Bricault, Laurent (2021), "Le glaive et la patère : Zeus Hélios grand Sarapis", in: Corinne Bonnet (ed.), *Noms de dieux. Portraits de divinités antiques*, Toulouse, 177–212.
- Bruneau, Philippe (1970), *Recherches sur les cultes de Délos à l'époque hellénistique et à l'époque impériale* (Bibliothèque de l'École française d'Athènes et de Rome 217), Paris.
- Caneva, Stefano (2011), "D'Hérodote à Alexandre: l'appropriation gréco-macédonienne d'Ammon de Siwa, entre pratique oraculaire et légitimation du pouvoir", in: Corinne Bonnet / Amandine Declercq / Iwo Slobodzianek (eds.), *Les représentations des dieux des autres* (Supplemento a Mythos 2), Palerme, 193–220.
- Cauville, Sylvie (2004), "Dendara: du sanatorium au tinctorium", in: *Bulletin de la Société Française d'Égyptologie* 161, 28–40.

820 — Ian Rutherford

Cauville, Sylvie (2011), *Dendara* XIII. *Traduction. Le pronaos du temple d'Hathor: Façade et colonies*, Louvain. Cauville, Sylvie / Ibrahim Ali, Mohammed (2013), *Philae. Itinéraire du visiteur*, Louvain.

Cline, Rangar (2014), "A Two-Sided Mold and the Entrepreneurial Spirit of Pilgrimage Souvenir Production in Late Antique Syria-Palestine", in: *Journal of Late Antiquity* 7, 1, 28–48.

Colin, Frédéric (1995), "De la signification du nom Παράμμων", in: *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 107, 213–216.

Colin, Frédéric (1997), "Ammon, Parammon, Poséidon, Héra et Libye à Siwa", in: *Bulletin de l'Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale* 97, 97–108.

- Colin, Frédéric (1998), "Les fondateurs du sanctuaire d'Amon à Siwa (Désert Libyque). Autour d'un bronze de donation inédit", in: Willy Clarysse / Antoon Schoors / Harco Willems (eds), *Egyptian Religion. The Last Thousand Years. Part I. Studies dedicated to the Memory of Jan Quaegebeur*, Leuven, 329–354.
- Collins, Andrew (2012), "Callisthenes on Olympias and Alexander's Divine Birth," in: *Ancient History Bulletin* 26, 1–14.
- Cook, Arthur (1914), Zeus. A Study in Ancient Religion I, Cambridge.

Counts, Derek B. (2009), "From Siwa to Cyprus: The Assimilation of Zeus Ammon in the Cypriote Pantheon", in: Demetrios Michaelides / Vasiliki Kassianidou / Robert Merrillees (eds.), *Egypt and Cyprus in Antiquity*, Oxford, 104–117.

Curty, Olivier (1995), Les parentés légendaires entre les cités grecques, Genève.

- Daumas, François (1957), "Le sanatorium de Dendara", in: *Bulletin de l'Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale* 56, 35–57.
- Davies, John (2009), "Pythios and Pythion: The Spread of a Cult Title", in: *Mediterranean Historical Review* 22, 57–69.
- Dillon, Matthew (1997), Pilgrims and Pilgrimage in Ancient Greece, London.
- Drbal, Vlastimil (2017), "Pilgrimage and multi-religious worship", in: Wiebke Friese / Troels Myrup Kristensen (eds.), *Excavating Pilgrimage*, London, 245–262.
- Drbal, Vlastimil (2018), Pilgerfahrt im spätantiken Nahen Osten (3./4.-8. Jahrhundert) Paganes, christliches, jüdisches und islamisches Pilgerwesen. Fragen der Kontinuitäten, Mainz.
- Ebbinghaus, Susanne (2006), "Begegnungen mit Ägypten und Vorderasien im archaischen Heraheiligtum von Samos", in: Alessandro Naso (ed.), *Stranieri e non cittadini nei santuari Greco. Atti del convegno internazionale*, Grassina (Firenze), 187–229.
- Eck, Diana (1982), Banaras. City of Light, Princeton.
- Elayi, Josette (1981), "La révolte des esclaves de Tyr relatée par Justin", in: *Baghdader Mitteilungen* 12, 139–151.
- Elayi, Josette (1988), "L'inscription bilingue de Délos CIS I, 114", in: Baghdader Mitteilungen 19, 549–556.
- Elayi, Josette (2005), 'Abd'aštart Ier Straton de Sidon: un roi phénicien entre Orient et Occident, Paris.
- Elayi, Josette (2006), "An Updated Chronology of the Reigns of Phoenician Kings during the Persian Period (539–333 BCE)", in: *Transeuphratène* 32, 11–43.
- Elsner, Jas (1997), "The Origins of the Icon: Pilgrimage, Religion and Visual Culture in the Roman East as 'Resistance' to the Centre", in: Susan Alcock (ed.), *The Roman Empire in the East*, Oxford, 178–199.

Elsner, Jas / Rutherford, Ian (2005), "Introduction" in: Jas Elsner / Ian Rutherford (eds.), *Seeing the Gods. Patterns of Pilgrimage in Greco-Roman and Early Christian Antiquity*, Oxford, 1–38.

Fowler, Robert (2013), Early Greek Mythography. Vol.2: Commentary, Oxford.

- Fredricksmeyer, Ernst (1979), "Three Notes on Alexander's Deification", in: *American Journal of Ancient History* 4, 1–9.
- Garland, Robert (1992), Introducing New Gods: The Politics of Athenian Religion, Cornell.
- Gasse, Annie / Rondot, Vincent (2007), Les inscriptions de Séhel, Le Caire.

Grenier, Jean-Claude (2004), "Autour de la stèle de la Famine, de sa datation réelle et de sa date fictive", in: Annie Gasse / Vincent Rondot (eds.), *Séhel entre Égypte et Nubie. Inscriptions rupestres et graffiti de l'époque pharaonique*, Montpellier, 81–88. Cross-Cultural Pilgrimage and Religious Change: Translation, Filial Cults, and Networks — 821

- Guillon, Élodie (2021), "Portrait itinérant : le Baal de Tyr, d'un rocher à l'autre", in: Corinne Bonnet (ed.), Noms de dieux. Portraits de divinités antiques, Toulouse, 215–233.
- Guralnick, Eleanor (1997), "The Egyptian-Greek Connection in the 8th to 6th centuries BC. An overview", in: John E. Coleman / Clark A. Walz (eds), *Greeks and Barbarians: Essays on the Interactions between Greeks and non-Greeks in Antiquity and the Consequences for Eurocentrism*, Bethesda Md., 127–154.
- Habicht, Christian (2010), "The City of Kyzikos, Client of Oracles", in: Gary Reger / Francis X. Ryan / Timothy
 F. Winters (eds), *Studies in Greek Epigraphy and History in Honour of Stephen V. Tracy*, Pessac, 311–332.
 Hall, Jonathan (2002), *Hellenicity. Between Ethnicity and Culture*, Chicago.
- Hasluck, Frederick (1913–1914), "Ambiguous Sanctuaries and Bektashi Propaganda", in: *The Annual of the British School at Athens* 20, 94–119.
- Hauben, Hans (1987), "Philocles, King of the Sidonians and General of the Ptolemies", in: Edward Lipiński (ed.), *Phoenicia and the East Mediterranean in the First Millennium B.C.* (Phoenicia V = Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta 22), Leuven, 413–427.
- Hauben, Hans (2004), "A Phoenician King in the Service of the Ptolemies: Philocles of Sidon Revisited", in: *Ancient Society* 34, 27–44.
- Hermary, Antoine (2014), "Une petite énigme délienne : les 'curieuses offrandes' des hiéronautes de Tyr", in: *Revue archéologique*, 271–284.
- Hobart, Angela / Zarcone, Thierry (eds.) (2017a), Pilgrimage and Ambiguity. Sharing the Sacred, Ascona.
- Hobart, Angela / Zarcone, Thierry (2017b), "Why do pilgrims share a sanctuary? Some hypotheses", in: Angela Hobart / Thierry Zarcone (eds.) (2017a), *Pilgrimage and Ambiguity. Sharing the Sacred*, Ascona, 1–26.
- Hornbostel, Wilhelm (1973), Sarapis. Studien zur Überlieferungsgeschichte, den Erscheinungsformen und Wandlungen der Gestalt eines Gottes, Leiden.
- Jantzen, Ulf (1972), Ägyptische und orientalische Bronzen aus dem Heraion von Samos (Samos VII), Mainz.
- Jasnow, Richard (2016), "Between Two Waters. The *Book of Thoth* and the Problem of Greco-Egyptian Interaction", in: Ian Rutherford (ed.), *Greco-Egyptian Interactions. Literature, Translation, and Culture 500 BC-300 CE*, Oxford, 317–356.
- Kilian-Dirlmeier, Imma (1985), "Fremde Weihungen in griechischen Heiligtümern vom 8. bis zum Beginn des 7. Jahrhunderts v. Chr.", in: *Jahrbuch des Römisch-germanischen Zentralmuseums Mainz* 32, 215–254.
- Kuhlmann, Klaus (1988), *Das Ammoneion: Archäologie, Geschichte und Kulturpraxis des Orakels von Siwa*, Mainz am Rhein.
- Kuhlmann, Klaus (2010), "The Ammoneion Project: Preliminary Report by the German Institute's Mission to Siwa Oasis on 10th February, 2007-12th April, 2007", in: *Annales du Service des Antiquités de l'Égypte* 84, 217–229.
- Łajtar, Adam (2006), Deir el-Bahari in the Hellenistic and Roan Periods. A study of an Egyptian Temple based on Greek Sources, Warsaw.
- Lane-Fox, Robin (2008), *Traveling Heroes. Greeks and their Myths in the Age of Homer*, London.
- Lang, Philippa (2013), Medicine and society in Ptolemaic Egypt, Leiden.
- Laskowska-Kusztal, Ewa (1984), Le sanctuaire ptolémaique de Deir el-Bahari, Warsaw.
- Leclant, Jean / Clerc, Gisèle (1981), "Ammon", in: *Lexicon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae* 1, 1, 666–689.
- Lembke, Katja (2004), *Die Skulpturen aus dem Quellheiligtum von Amrit. Studien zu Akkulturation in Phönizien*, Mainz am Rhein.
- Leschhorn, Wolfgang / Franke, Peter Robert (2002–2009), *Lexikon der Aufschriften auf griechischen Münzen* (2 vols.), Wien.
- LiDonnici, Lynn (1995), The Epidaurian Miracle Inscriptions: Text Translation and Commentary, Atlanta.
- Lipiński, Edward (1986), "Zeus Ammon et Baal-Hammon", in: Corinne Bonnet / Edward Lipiński / Patrick Marchetti (eds.), *Religio Phoenicia* (Studia Phoenicia IV), Namur, 307–332.

- 822 Ian Rutherford
- Lipiński, Edward (1995), *Dieux et déesses de l'univers phénicien et punique* (Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta 64 = Studia Phoenicia 14), Louvain.

Lipiński, Edward (2004), Itineraria Phoenicia, Leuven.

- Lipiński, Edward (2009), Resheph: A Syro-Canaanite Deity, Leuven.
- McCorriston, Joy (2011), Pilgrimage and Household in the Ancient Near East, Cambridge.
- Malkin, Irad (1990), "Lysander and Libys", in: The Classical Quarterly 40, 541–545.
- Malkin, Irad (1994), Myth and territory in the Spartan Mediterranean, Cambridge.
- Malkin, Irad / Constantakopoulou, Christy / Panagopoulou, Katerina (2009) (eds.), *Greek and Roman Networks in the Mediterranean*, London.

Masson, Oliver (1982), "Pèlerins chypriotes en Phénicie (Sarepta et Sidon)", in: Semitica 32, 45-49.

Matricon-Thomas, Elodie (2015), "Le culte d'Ammon à Athènes (V^e-IIIe siècle avant J.-C.) : chronique d'une intégration avortée?", in: *Circé. Histoire, Savoirs, Sociét*é 17–25 = http://www.revue-circe.uvsq.fr/le-culte-dammon-a-athenes-ve-iiie-siecle-avant-j-c-chronique-dune-integration-avortee/

Mohamed, Fadel Ali / Reynolds, Joyce / Dobias-Lalou, Catherine (2007), "Recently Discovered Inscriptions at Cyrene", in: Lidio Gasperini / Silvia Marengo (eds.), *Cirene e la Cirenaica nell' Antichità*, Tivoli, 17–48.

Montanari, Marcello (2011), "Il culto di Zeus Ammon a Cirene e in Cirenaica", in: *Orcos* 19, 111–120. Moyer, Ian (2011), *Egypt and the Limits of Hellenism*, Cambridge.

Mueller, Urs / Pliett, Hartmut / Kuhlmann, Klaus Peter / Wenzel, Fritz (2002), "Structural preservation of the Temple of the Oracle in Siwa Oasis, Egypt", in: *Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites* 5, 4, 215–230.

Münnich, Maciej (2013), *The god Resheph in the ancient Near East*, Tübingen.

Nicholson, Paul (2018), "The Sacred Animal Necropolis at North Saqqara: Narrative of a Ritual Landscape", in: Campbell Price / Roger Forshaw /Andrew Chamberlain / Paul Nicholson (eds.), *Mummies, Magic and Medicine in Ancient Egypt: multidisciplinary essays for Rosalie David*, Manchester, 19–31.

Padilla Peralta, Dan-el (2020), "Gods of Trust. Ancient Delos and the Modern Economics of Religion", in: Anna Collar / Troels Kristensen (eds.), *Pilgrimage and Economy in the ancient Mediterranean*, Leiden, 329–356.

Parke, Herbert (1967), The Oracles of Zeus, Oxford.

Parker, Robert (2000), "Theophoric names and the History of Greek Religion", in: Simon Hornblower / Elaine Matthews (eds.), *Greek Personal Names. Their Value as* Evidence (Proceedings of the British Academy 104), London, 53–80.

Parker, Robert (2017), Greek Gods Abroad: Names, Natures, and Transformations, Berkeley, CA.

Peckham, Brian (2021), *Phoenicia: Episodes and Anecdotes from the Ancient Mediterranean*, University Park, PA.

Petzl, Georg (1972), "Eine Weihinschrift aus der Oase Siwa (Ammonion)", in: *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 9, 68–71.

Ploeg, Ghislaine van der (2018) The Impact of the Roman Empire on the Cult of Asclepios, Leiden.

Pugliese Carrattelli, Giovanni (1960), "Legge sacra di Cirene", in: La Parola del Passato 15, 294–297.

Quack, Joachim (2014), "Imhotep: Der Weise, der zum Gott wurde", in: Verena M. Lepper (ed.), Persönlichkeiten aus dem Alten Ägypten im Neuen Museum, Berlin, 43–66.

Quaegebeur, Jan (1975–76), "Les appellations grecques des temples de Karnak", in: Paul Naster / Herman de Meulenaere / Jan Quaegebeur (eds.), *Miscellaea in honorem Josephi Vergote* (Orientalia Lovaniensia Periodica 6/7), Leuven, 463–478.

Quinn, Josephine (2018), In Search of the Phoenicians, Princeton.

Ray, John D. (2011), Texts from the Baboon and Falcon Galleries. Demotic, Hieroglyphic and Greek Inscriptions from the Sacred Animal Necropolis, North Saqqara, London.

Renberg, Gil (2016), *Where Dreams May Come: Incubation Sanctuaries in the Greco-Roman World*, Leiden. Rigsby, Kent J. (1996), *Asylia: Territorial Inviolability in the Hellenistic World*, California. Rigsby, Kent J. (2007), "A Greek Dedication at Sidon", *Tyche* 22, 143–150. Rutherford, Ian (2001), Pindar's Paeans. A Reading of the Fragments with a Survey of the Genre, Oxford.

- Rutherford, Ian (2004), "*Khoros heis ek tesde tes poleos*: State-Pilgrimage and Song-Dance in Athens", in: Penelope Murray / Peter Wilson (eds.), *Music and the Muses: the Culture of "Mousike" in the Classical Athenian City*, Oxford, 67–90.
- Rutherford, Ian (2009), "The Koan-Delian Ritual Complex. Apollo and *Theoria* in a Sacred Law from Kos", in: Lucia Athanassaki / Richard P. Martin / John F. Miller (eds.) *Apolline Politics and Poetics.* International symposium, Delphi 4–11 July 2003, Athens, 655–687.
- Rutherford, Ian (2013), *State-Pilgrims and Sacred Observers in Ancient Greece: A Study of* Theoria *and* Theoroi, Cambridge.
- Rutherford, Ian (2019a), "Towards a Typology of Sanctuary Networks: the Case of Claros", in: Madalina Dana / Ivana Savalli-Lestrade (eds.), *La cité interconnectée dans le monde gréco-romain : (V^e siècle a.C.-IV^e siècle p.C)* (Scripta Antiqua 118), Bordeaux, 167–183.
- Rutherford, Ian (2019b), "Religious networks and cultural exchange: some possible cases from the Eastern Mediterranean", in Rocio Da Riva / Martin Lang / Sebastian Fink (eds.), *Literary Change in Mesopotamia and Beyond and Routes and Travellers between East and West*. Proceedings of the 2nd and 3rd Melammu Workshops (Melammu Workshops and Monographs 2), Münster, 229–240.
- Rutherford, Ian (2020), "The Experience of Pilgrimage in the Roman Empire: Communitas, Paideiā, and Piety-Signaling", in: Valentino Gasparini *et al.* (eds.), *Lived Religion in the Ancient Mediterranean World. Approaching Religious Transformations from Archaeology, History and Classics*, Berlin, 137–156.
- Ryholt, Kim (2009), "The Life of Imhotep?", in: Ghislaine Widmer / Didier Devauchelle (eds.), *IXe Congrès International des Études Démotiques* (Bibliothèque d'étude 147), Cairo, 305–315.
- Sangren, Paul Steven (1987), History and Magical Power in a Chinese Community, Stanford.
- Shovlin, John (1991), "Pilgrimage and the Construction of Irish National Identity", in: *Proceedings of the Harvard Celtic Colloquium* 11, 59–76.
- Sax, William (2000), "Conquering the Quarters: Religion and Politics in Hinduism", in: *International Journal of Hindu Studies* 4, 39–60.
- Smith, Harry S. (1984), "Saqqara. Late Period", in: Lexicon der Ägyptologie 5, Wiesbaden, 413-427.
- Sokolowski, Franciszek (1974), "Propagation of the Cult of Sarapis and Isis in Greece", in: *Greek Roman and Byzantine Studies* 15, 441–448.
- Sommer, Michael (2009), "Networks of Commerce and Knowledge in the Iron Age: the Case of the Phoenicians", in: Irad Malkin / Christy Constantakopoulou / Katerina Panagopoulou (eds.), *Greek and Roman Networks in the Mediterranean*, London, 94–108.
- Stager, Jennifer M.S. (2005), "'Let No One Wonder at this Image': a Phoenician Funerary Stele in Athens", in: *Hesperia* 74, 427–449.
- Stambaugh, John E. (1972), Sarapis Under the Early Ptolemies, Leiden.
- Stricker, B.H. (1942), "La prison de Joseph", in: Acta Orientalia 19, 100-137.
- Struffolino, Stefano (2012), L'oasi di Ammone: ruolo politico, economico e culturale di Siwa nell'antichità: una ricostruzione critica, Roma.
- Stucky, Rolf A. (1984), *Tribune d'Echmoun. Ein griechischer Reliefzyklus des 4. Jahrhunderts v. Chr. in Sidon*, Basel.
- Tepedino Guerra, Adèle (1997), "Un nuovo frammento pindarico dell'Inno ad Ammone? Pap. Vat. Gr. 11, col. VII 44–46 (Favorino, Sull'esilio)", in: *Revue des études grecques* 110, 353–361.
- Tepedino Guerra, Adèle (2007), Favorino di Arelate. L'esilio (Pap. Vat. Gr. 11 verso), Roma.
- Thonemann, Peter (2020), An Ancient Dream Manual. Artemidorus' Interpretation of Dreams, Oxford.
- Tsigarida, Elisavet (2011), "The Sanctuary of Zeus Ammon at Kallithea (Chalcidice)", in: Kernos 24, 165-181.
- Turner, Victor / Turner, Edith (1978), Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture, Chichester.
- Vaelske, Veit (2017), "Ein Widder fur Ammon", in: Archäologischer Anzeiger, 31-47.
- Von Lieven, Alexandra (2016), "Translating Gods, Interpreting Gods. On the Mechanisms behind the
 - Interpretatio Graeca of Egyptian gods", in: Ian Rutherford (ed.) Greco-Egyptian Interactions, Oxford, 61–82.

824 — Ian Rutherford

- Wagner, Guy (1987), Les oasis d'Égypte à l'époque grecque, romaine et byzantine d'après les documents grecs : recherches de papyrologie et d'épigraphie grecques, Le Caire.
- West, Martin L. (1985), The Hesiodic Catalogue of Women, Oxford.
- Wildung, Dietrich (1977a), Egyptian Saints: Deification in Pharaonic Egypt, New York.
- Wildung, Dietrich (1977b), Imhotep und Amenhotep: Gottwerdung im alten Ägypten, Munich.
- Wildung, Dietrich (1980), "Imhotep", in: *Lexicon der Ägyptologie* 3, Wiesbaden, 146–147.
- Wolters, Paul (1888), "Der Grabstein des Antipatros von Ashkalon", in: *Athenische Mitteilungen* 13, 310–316. Woodward, Arthur (1962), "Athens and the Oracle of Ammon", in: *Annual of the British School at Athens* 57, 5–13.
- Xella, Paolo (1991), Baal Hammon. Recherches sur l'identité et l'histoire d'un dieu phénico-punique, Rome.
- Xella, Paolo (2019), "Religion", in: Carolina López-Ruiz / Brian Doak (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of the Phoenician and Punic Mediterranean*, Oxford, 273–292.