

A Neandertal dietary conundrum: insights provided by tooth enamel Zn isotopes from Gabasa, Spain

Article

Accepted Version

Jaouen, K., Villalba-Mouco, V., Smith, G. M. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7155-5140, Trost, M., Leichliter, J., Lüdecke, T., Méjean, P., Mandrou, S., Chmeleff, J., Guiserix, D., Bourgon, N., Blasco, F., Mendes Cardoso, J., Duquenoy, C., Moubtahij, Z., Salazar Garcia, D. C., Richards, M., Tütken, T., Hublin, J.-J., Utrilla, P. and Montes, L. (2022) A Neandertal dietary conundrum: insights provided by tooth enamel Zn isotopes from Gabasa, Spain. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 119 (43). e2109315119. ISSN 1091-6490 doi: 10.1073/pnas.2109315119 Available at https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/117100/

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See <u>Guidance on citing</u>.

To link to this article DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2109315119

Publisher: National Academy of Sciences

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law,



including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the End User Agreement.

www.reading.ac.uk/centaur

CentAUR

Central Archive at the University of Reading

Reading's research outputs online

A Neandertal dietary conundrum: new insights provided by tooth enamel Zn isotopes from Gabasa, Spain

Klervia Jaouen^{1,2}, Vanessa Villalba Mouco^{3,4,5}, Geoff M. Smith^{2,6}, Manuel Trost², Jennifer
Leichliter^{7,8}, Tina Lüdecke⁷, Pauline Méjean¹, Stéphanie Mandrou¹, Jérôme Chmeleff¹, Danaé
Guiserix^{1,9}, Nicolas Bourgon^{2,8}, Fernanda Blasco¹⁰, Jéssica Mendes Cardoso^{1,11}, Camille Duquenoy¹,
Zineb Moubtahij², Domingo C. Salazar Garcia^{2,12,13,14}, Michael Richards¹⁵, Thomas Tütken⁸, Jean
Jacques Hublin^{2,16}, Pilar Utrilla⁵, Lourdes Montes⁵

8		
9		
10		
11 12	1.	Géosciences Environnement Toulouse, Observatoire Midi Pyrénées, UMR 5563, CNRS, Toulouse, France
12	2	Department of Human Evolution Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology
13	2.	Leipzig Germany
15	3	Institute of Evolutionary Biology CSIC Universitet Pompeu Fabra Barcelona Spain
15 16 17	<i>3</i> . 4.	Department of Archaeogenetics, Max Planck Institute for the Science of Human History, Kellsische Starsen 10, 07745 Lang Communi
1/	~	Kaniaische Strasse 10, 07/45 Jena, Germany.
18 19	5.	Dpt. Sciences of Antiquity-Prehistory, Research Group "Primeros pobladores y Patrimonio Arqueológico del valle del Ebro" (P3A), University of Zaragoza, Zaragoza, Spain
20	6.	School of Anthropology and Conservation, University of Kent, Kent, United Kingdom,
21	7.	Emmy Noether Group for Hominin Meat Consumption, Max Planck Institute for Chemistry,
22	0	55128 Mainz, Germany
23 24	8.	University, Mainz, Germany
25	9.	LGTPE, Ecole Normale Supérieure de Lyon, UMR 5276, CNRS, Lyon, France
26	10.	Avutamiento de Zaragoza, Zaragoza, Spain
27	11.	MAE. University of Sao Paulo, Sao Paulo, Brazil
28	12.	Departament de Prehistòria, Arqueologia i Història Antiga, Universitat de València (Spain)
29	13.	Grupo de Investigación en Prehistoria IT-1223-19 (UPV-EHU)/IKERBASOUE-Basque
30	101	Foundation for Science Vitoria Spain
31	14.	Department of Geological Sciences, University of Cape Town, (South Africa)
32	15.	Department of Archaeology. Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, Toulouse
33	16.	Collège de France. Paris. France
34		
35		
36		
37		
38		
39		
40		
41	Correst	oonding author: Klervia_iaouen@get.omp.eu
42	control	Source and the second
43	Kevwo	rds: hominin, zinc isotope ratios. Iberian Neandertals, carnivory, Middle Paleolithic
44	<u>110 j ((0</u>	
45		
46		
47		
48		
49		
50		
51		
52		

53 54 55

56

58

57 Significance statement

59 Neandertals' diets are a topic of continued debate, especially since their disappearance has been 60 frequently attributed to their subsistence strategy. There is no clear consensus on how variable their 61 diets were in time and space. Isotope studies have helped quantify meat consumption in Neandertals, 62 but usually rely on nitrogen isotope analyses of collagen, a protein rarely preserved in samples older 63 than 50 ka. Moreover, collagen-extraction for isotope analyses is rarely successful in Iberian skeletal 64 material. Here, we employ zinc isotope analysis of dental enamel of a Neandertal and associated fauna 65 (Gabasa, Spain), which can be applied to contexts >50 ka. This proxy confirms a high level of 66 carnivory in an Iberian Neandertal.

67 68

69 Abstract

70 The characterization of Neandertals' diets has mostly relied on nitrogen isotope analyses of bone and 71 tooth collagen. However, few nitrogen isotope data have been recovered from bones or teeth from 72 Iberia due to poor collagen preservation at Paleolithic sites in the region. Zinc isotopes have been 73 shown to be a reliable method for reconstructing trophic levels in the absence of organic matter 74 preservation. Here we present the results of zinc (Zn), strontium (Sr), carbon (C), and oxygen (O) 75 isotope and trace element ratios analysis measured in dental enamel on a Pleistocene food web in 76 Gabasa, Spain, to characterize the diet and ecology of a Middle Paleolithic Neandertal individual. Based on the extremely low δ^{66} Zn value observed in the Neandertal's tooth enamel, our results support 77 the interpretation of Neandertals as carnivores as already suggested by $\delta^{15}N$ isotope values of 78 79 specimens from other regions. Further work could help identify if such isotopic peculiarities (lowest δ^{66} Zn and highest δ^{15} N of the food web) are due to a metabolic and/or dietary specificity of the 80 81 Neandertals.

82

- 83 Introduction:
- 84

Over the last thirty years, analyses of nitrogen isotopes in collagen ($\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$) have provided direct 85 86 evidence for Neandertal diets across Europe and Asia. These studies all indicate a carnivorous (1-12), 87 or at least a meat-heavy diet for European Neandertals. However, one peculiarity of Neandertal 88 $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ remains the subject of an ongoing debate. From the one Siberian and eight Western 89 European sites, where both Neandertal and associated fauna have been analyzed, nitrogen isotope 90 ratios in Neandertal collagen are systematically higher than that of other carnivores (3, 6–8, 10, 11, 13, 91 14). An explanation for such elevated values could be the consumption of herbivores, such as mammoths, which themselves exhibit elevated δ^{15} N values due to the consumption of plants growing 92 93 on arid soils (1, 2, 7). While mammoth remains are usually scarce at Neandertal fossil localities, they 94 were nonetheless occasionally consumed, as suggested by remains with cut marks and other human 95 butchery signatures (15). The absence of mammoth remains at Middle Paleolithic sites could be a 96 result of a) Neandertals chose to leave large bone elements at the kill-site, and transport other edible 97 carcass products, mainly meat, back to the habitation site (15) or b) mammoths were not frequently consumed, and the δ^{15} N peculiarity consequently reflects the consumption of other resources enriched 98 in ¹⁵N. 99

Alongside this $\delta^{15}N$ peculiarity, one major obstacle to our knowledge of Neandertals' 100 101 subsistence patterns is that the preservation of organic matter limits the application of collagen-bound 102 nitrogen isotope analysis to fossil specimens. Collagen degrades over time at a varying speed 103 depending on climatic and environmental conditions (16). The oldest hominin specimen in which bone 104 protein is preserved is that of Scladina (Belgium), which dates to 90,000 cal BP (17), but most studied 105 specimens are younger than 50,000 cal BP (1-3, 6-8, 10-13, 18). Furthermore, these specimens are 106 only from sites in northwestern and central Europe and Siberia, where climatic conditions favored 107 collagen preservation. As a result, the variability of Neandertals' diet over time and between regions 108 may not accurately reflected by the currently available isotope data. In Iberia, where the latest 109 surviving Neandertals have been discovered (19, 20), collagen was successfully extracted for only one 110 site (21). Therefore, our knowledge of Iberian Neandertal diets mostly relies on zooarcheological and

111 dental calculus data, which show some inconsistencies (21–25). For instance, similar to other Western 112 European sites, zooarcheological studies emphasize the consumption of terrestrial mammals and birds 113 (21). In contrast, analysis of dental calculus for micro-remains and aDNA metagenomic analysis (26-114 28) highlight the frequent consumption of plants and mushrooms. Indeed, Weyrich et al. (26) even 115 suggest that Neandertals at El Sidrón (Figure 1) rarely consumed meat, but often ate mushrooms, which would also result in elevated δ^{15} N values (29). The consumption of marine foods is also attested 116 117 for coastal Neandertals, but its frequency cannot be truly assessed in the absence of isotope studies 118 (21, 23-25, 30). Finally, cannibalism has been documented at two Iberian sites (El Sidrón and 119 Zafarraya) (22, 31) (Figure 1), though such practices appear limited and most likely occurred only 120 during periods of nutritional stress (32). Therefore, it is challenging to confirm the homogeneity of 121 Neandertals' diets across time and space, calling into question a direct link between their subsistence 122 strategy and disappearance.

123 This study aims to investigate if the novel Zn isotope proxy could help elucidate the dietary behaviors of Neandertals and the source of their δ^{15} N peculiarity, specifically by studying a Late 124 125 Pleistocene Iberian food web where the presence of mammoth has not been documented (33). The development of Zn isotope analysis (66 Zn/ 64 Zn, expressed as δ^{66} Zn) has proven that trophic level 126 127 information can be retrieved from mammalian tooth enamel (δ^{66} Zn_{enamel}) (34, 35), including fossil 128 samples from Pleistocene food webs where organic matter is typically not preserved (36, 37). Previous studies have demonstrated that δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} decreases by ca. 0.30 to 0.60 ‰ with each step in 129 archeological and modern food webs (34–38) and that δ^{66} Zn values associated with breastfeeding are 130 higher than post-weaning associated values (39). While the main source of variation of δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} 131 132 values is diet, local geology can also likely influence the isotope ratio of a given animal (36, 39). To 133 date, three modern assemblages from Koobi Fora (Kenya), Kruger Park, and the Western Cape (South 134 Africa)(40), a few animals from a historical site (Rennes, France) (41), and three Late Pleistocene sites 135 (Tam Hay Marklot, Nam Lot and Tam Pà Ling, Laos) (36, 37) are the only terrestrial food webs for 136 which Zn isotope data in teeth and/or bones have been published (Figure S14). In the modern Koobi For asavannah food web, $\delta^{66}Zn_{enamel}$ differences have been observed between browsers and grazers 137

138 (35), but this pattern was not seen in any of the three Pleistocene Asian forest food webs (36, 37). 139 Among modern and historical human populations, historically-documented diets relying on plants are 140 associated with higher δ^{66} Zn values than those that include a substantial quantity of animal products 141 (41–44). Zinc isotopes of ancient hominins have been analyzed only in one Pleistocene *Homo sapiens* 142 individual (37) from Southeast Asia, but not yet in any Neandertal specimen.

143 This current study contributes significantly to our understanding of Iberian Neandertal diets by 144 providing information on their trophic ecology for a region where traditional nitrogen isotope analyses 145 are unfeasible due to the poor preservation of organic matter. We use the novel Zn isotopic tool as 146 well as other mobility, ecological and dietary proxies applied on tooth enamel from hominin and 147 animal remains from the cave site Cueva de los Moros 1 (Gabasa – Pyrenees – Spain, Figure 1). The 148 site, excavated in the 1980's, is very well documented (for stratigraphic context, see Montes and 149 Utrilla (45) and Supplementary Information 1). All remains come from the layers e, f, and g of a single 150 stratigraphic layer directly above layer h dated to 143±43 ka. Numerous carnivore remains were recovered along with Neandertal remains (layers e and f), allowing for comparison of the different 151 152 meat-eating taxa. Co-existing herbivores from three different types of environmental contexts are 153 homogenously represented in layers e, f, and g: mountains (Iberian ibex [Capra pyrenaica], chamois 154 [Rupicapra rupicapra]), forest (cervids including red deer [Cervus elaphus]), and open environments 155 (horses [Equus caballus], European wild asses [Equus hydruntinus]).

156

- 157 Sample collection
- 158 159

160

Species, sample, and proxy selection

161 We analyzed the tooth enamel of 65 samples belonging to 43 different teeth of 12 taxa for 162 δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} (Figure 3, Table S15), 42 samples belonging to 39 different teeth for δ^{13} C_{enamel}, δ^{18} O_{enamel} 163 (Table S19), 23 samples belonging to 18 different teeth for 87 Sr/ 86 Sr (Table S7) and 40 samples for 164 trace element ratios (Table S11). We sampled 12 to 50 mg of tooth enamel (1 to 20 mg for Zn 165 isotopes) of five carnivore taxa (lynx [*Lynx spelaea*], wolf [*Canis lupus*], fox [*Vulpes vulpes*], dhole 166 [*Cuon alpinus*], hyena [*Crocuta spelaea*]), one omnivore (bear [*Ursus spelaeus*]) and at least five 167 herbivores (Iberian ibex [*Capra pyrenaica*], chamois [*Rupicapra rupicapra*], red deer [*Cervus*] *elaphus*], rabbit [*Oryctolagus cuniculus*], horse [*Equus caballus*], European wild ass [*Equus hydruntinus*]), as well as one of the four Neandertal dental remains recovered from the site. Hyenas
(*Crocuta spelaea*) are treated as a separate dietary group (bone-eating carnivores) based on the results
of the Koobi Fora and Nam Lot food webs (35, 37).

172

Sampling strategy related to breastfeeding

173 The single sampled Neandertal tooth is a first molar (M1; Ga1.Rev.303)(46). Previous studies based 174 on tooth wear and trace elements suggest that Neandertals were likely weaned between the age of 1 to 175 2.5 years old (47–50), thus possibly overlapping with the crown's formation period for this tooth. To 176 minimize destructive analyses, we sampled an enamel fragment from the lower part of the crown, next 177 to the cervical margin. This part of the tooth probably formed after weaning or at least when maternal 178 milk consumption could have been strongly reduced (51). The specimen was heavily worn, making it 179 difficult to evaluate the enamel formation period of the part that we sampled. Still, we were able to 180 evaluate trophic spacing between species while taking into account the influence of maternal milk consumption, which triggers higher δ^{66} Zn values in human M1 (39). To do so, we analyzed δ^{66} Z_{enamel} 181 182 on different types of non-hominin teeth (dp4, C, P2, P3, P4, M1, M2, and M3, See SI Table S4) 183 formed at different times during ontogeny and obtained values associated with breastfeeding and/or 184 solid food consumption for all species analyzed from Gabasa. In addition, we analyzed Sr/Ca and 185 Ba/Ca ratios that also show variation between tooth enamel mineralized in utero and during pre-or 186 post-weaning periods (52).

187

Sampling strategy related to Neandertal mobility and ecology

188 Other factors such as diagenesis, geographical origin, environmental context, or metabolism can be a 189 source of Zn isotope variability (35, 36, 39, 53). In recent studies, linear mixing models highlighted a 190 possible link between Zn and Sr isotope ratios in teeth, which has been interpreted as resulting from 191 the influence of the local geology on the Zn isotope ratios of its associated food webs (36, 37, 39). To 192 control for this potential bias, we analyzed strontium isotope ratios of Gabasa tooth enamel 193 (⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr_{enamel}) for samples with sufficient material (Supplementary Information 5). We also collected 194 Sr isotope data from rocks, soils, plants, and teeth to assess the regional bedrock isotopic data 195 (⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr_{bedrock}) and identify whether some animals could have been derived from areas proximal to 196 Gabasa with different geology (Supplementary Table S18). We hypothesize that the Neandertal
 197 consumed local food sources, whereby its ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr should fall within the ranges observed both for the
 198 local bedrock and assumed sympatric animals.

We estimated carbon and oxygen isotope compositions ($\delta^{13}C_{enamel}$ and $\delta^{18}O_{enamel}$, respectively) of the 199 Neandertal and associated fauna. Notably, $\delta^{13}C_{enamel}$ and $\delta^{18}O_{enamel}$ values can offer insights into 200 201 ecological proxies, such as the environment from which the Neandertal individual obtained its prey 202 (i.e. open arid vs. closed mesic habitats), and possibly reveal information about which types of prev 203 were consumed (54–56). Moreover, carbon and oxygen isotope data allow us to compare the food web 204 of Gabasa to other food webs where Neandertals have been discovered. For one horse tooth, five 205 samples were taken serially along the growth axis of the teeth to evaluate potential seasonality and 206 intra-tooth variability over time on Sr and Zn isotope ratios.

207

Sampling strategy to assess the degree of chemical tooth alteration

208 Although it has been shown that dental enamel preserves biogenic Zn isotope signatures very well in 209 Pleistocene or even older samples (36, 57), we independently confirmed that Zn isotope variability is 210 not related to diagenetic processes. For this purpose, we analyzed trace elements that are abundant in 211 soils but not in tooth enamel (Fe, Al, Mn) and hence are indicative of post-mortem trace element 212 uptake (Supplementary Information 3). Additionally, we examined the carbonate content of dental 213 enamel to eliminate samples with obvious diagenetic alteration (>10 wt% CO_3) (Supplementary 214 Information 3). To capture the influence of diagenesis on isotope ratios, we also performed 215 measurements on dentin samples from two wolves for Sr, C, and O isotopes and trace elements and 216 one wild ass for Zn isotopes. Finally, four roots of teeth whose enamel was sampled (one chamois, 217 two foxes, and one lynx) were used to attempt collagen extraction (Table S9, S10), using a high 218 extraction-yield protocol adapted for radiocarbon dating (58, 59) in the hope of getting additional 219 trophic level information and possibly permitting high-precision radiocarbon dating.

220

221 **Results**

Datasets, details on the method, and additional discussions are given in detail in the supplementaryinformation (SI).

224

225 Zinc isotope data

226 Zinc isotope values of Gabasa mammalian tooth enamel range from 0.35 to 1.63 % (n = 65) and are mainly influenced by the dietary group of the animals (Figures 2 and 3) (Kruskal-Wallis $\chi^2 = 19.496$, 227 *p*-value = 0.0002159 and χ^2 = 18.298, *p*-value = 0.0003818; samples with elevated Al, Mn, and Fe 228 content are excluded), which are assigned based on those used in other δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} isotope studies and 229 230 zooarcheological data (dietary groups: carnivores, bone-eating carnivores, omnivores, and herbivores) 231 (35, 60, 61). Animal values from different archeological layers fall in the same range (Supplementary 232 Information 4). As previously observed for modern, historical, and Late Pleistocene tooth enamel, 233 there is no correlation between Zn isotope values and Zn concentration data (35, 36, 39, 41, 42). This 234 is an excellent indicator to assess the preservation of biogenic Zn isotope signatures (62). On average, large herbivores have higher Zn isotope ratios (δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} = 1.24 ± 0.17 ‰ 1 σ , n = 16) than carnivores 235 $(\delta^{66}Zn_{enamel} = 0.92 \pm 0.18 \% 1\sigma; n = 16, 0.85 \pm 0.14 \%$ if hyenas and the Neandertal are excluded). The 236 Neandertal tooth exhibits the lowest $\delta^{66}Zn_{enamel}$ value (0.35 ± 0.00 %), substantially lower 237 $(\Delta^{66}Zn_{Neandertal-carnivores} = 0.57 \%)$ than that of the lowest carnivore's value. Mirroring patterns in the 238 239 modern Koobi Fora (East Africa) food web, the difference between herbivore and carnivore values is 240 even more pronounced when hyenas are excluded, as bone-consumption is thought to induce higher δ^{66} Zn values (35). The omnivorous cave bears (δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} = 1.15 ± 0.13 ‰ 1 σ ; n = 3) exhibit Zn 241 242 isotope ratios closer to those of large herbivores and rabbits rather than the carnivores', similar to a pattern often observed in nitrogen isotopes (63–66). The herbivores show the highest δ^{66} Zn values 243 (0.96 to 1.60 % 1 σ ; $n_{measurements} = 40$ from $n_{tooth} = 27$ teeth) with grazers (European wild ass and horses, 244 δ^{66} Zn = 1.35 ± 0.18 ‰ 1 σ ; n_{tooth} = 6) exhibiting the highest values, another similarity to observations 245 246 in modern food webs (35, 40).

247 Strontium isotope data

The ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr_{enamel} range from 0.70834 to 0.70916 (n = 24)⁻Strontium and Zn isotope ratios show no correlation, and the Neandertal individual shows an ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr_{enamel} overlapping with those of deer and rabbits (Figure 4A). Strontium isotope ratios from dental enamel and dentin are compatible with the values expected for the region of Gabasa (Supplementary Information 1 and 5). As dentin is likely to be affected by diagenetic alteration and Sr exchange with the soil, these values might reflect soil values and can thus be an indicator of the local bioavailable Sr isotope composition at Gabasa. (Supplementary Information 3).

255

256 Carbon and oxygen isotope data

257 δ^{13} C_{enamel} data range from -14.13 to -8.35 ‰ (*n* = 44), and δ^{18} O_{enamel} data range from -7.46 to 1.64 ‰ (*n* = 43). Mountain herbivores (chamois and Iberian ibex) have distinct higher $\delta^{13}C_{enamel}$ and $\delta^{18}O_{enamel}$ 258 259 compared to other herbivores, which might be due to water evaporation on mountain slopes and 260 consumption of plants from more arid contexts (Supplementary Information 6, Figure 2). The Neandertal's $\delta^{13}C_{enamel}$ and $\delta^{18}O_{enamel}$ values overlap with those of cave animals (Figure 4A and B, 261 262 Figure S12. Five carbon (δ^{13} C) and oxygen (δ^{18} O) data were possibly impacted by diagenetic 263 carbonate, and those values were excluded for ecological interpretation (mostly rabbits, see 264 Supplementary Information 3 and 6).

265

266 Trace element ratios (Ba/Ca and Sr/Ca)

Trace element ratios are mostly discussed in Supplementary Information 3 and 7. The $-\log(Ba/Ca)$ ranges from 3.25 to 4.75 (n = 40) and $-\log(Sr/Ca)$ from 2.77 to 3.62 (n = 40). The two ratios measured in dental enamel do not correlate. As expected (67), mixed feeders exhibit lower Sr/Ca than grazers, but carnivores (especially hyenas) show Sr/Ca ratios overlapping with those of grazers (Figure S13). We report the highest Sr/Ca and Ba/Ca ratios for mountain and forest animals and the lowest Ba/Ca for the Neandertal individual. Here, these ratios do not correlate with tooth developmental stages (i.e., ontogenetic time of crown mineralization).

274

275 Correlations and comparisons between different dietary proxies

276 Zn isotopes do not correlate with Sr/Ca or Ba/Ca ratios (Figure 4, Supplementary Information 3 and 277 4). Equids have higher δ^{66} Zn, δ^{13} C, and 87 Sr/ 86 Sr, and lower Ba/Ca than the rest of the herbivores

(Figure 4). When performing a PCA based on five proxies (δ^{66} Zn, δ^{13} C, δ^{18} O, Sr/Ca, and Ba/Ca), the 278 279 PC1 places the Neandertal among cave animals (hyenas and bears). This first component is mostly based on δ^{13} C, δ^{18} O, and Ba/Ca values. Strangely, it is precisely when cave animals are removed that a 280 positive correlation appears between δ^{13} C and δ^{66} Zn (R² = 0.41, p = 0.00009). This correlation could 281 be due to a combination of a trophic level effect and higher δ^{13} C and δ^{66} Zn values among grazers. No 282 clear trend has been observed between δ^{66} Zn values and the type of tooth sampled (Supplementary 283 284 Information 4), but it should be noted that this could result from the low sample size per tooth group 285 and different timing of weaning and dental development between species.

286

287 Collagen extraction

288 The collagen extraction performed on the dentin from four teeth was unsuccessful, and not enough 289 collagen was extracted for $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ and/or radiocarbon analyses. This failure is not surprising for 290 samples dating back to about 150 ka (62) (Supplementary Information 2).

- 291
- 292

293 Discussion

294

295 New insights into the diet and ecology of Iberian Pleistocene mammals from Zn isotopes in tooth 296 enamel

297 Our study shows similar trends to those previously reported in modern and fossil food webs: Herbivores exhibit higher δ^{66} Zn than carnivores (Δ^{66} Zn_{herbivores-carnivores} = +0.31 ‰ and +0.38 ‰ 298 299 excluding hyenas). The trophic level depletion is similar to that of the modern food web of Koobi Fora 300 (dental enamel values: +0.40 ‰, hyenas included and +0.44‰ excluding hyenas), Kenya, or the 301 marine mammal food webs of Arctic Canada (+0.32 ‰ on average in bones) (34, 38) but lower than 302 that of the Laotian fossil sites (+0.63 ‰, hyenas excluded). Grazers (horses and European wild ass) tend to show higher δ^{66} Zn than browsers, as observed in the savannah of Koobi Fora (35), but not in 303 304 the tropical rain forests of Tam Hay Marklot and Nam Lot (36, 37). Hyenas have more

elevated δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} values than other carnivores (Figure 3), as systematically observed in other sites 305 306 (35, 37, 40). These higher values are likely due to bone consumption (35), although hyenas have extended breastfeeding time than other carnivores (68), and milk would also similarly drive δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} 307 308 up. However, high Sr/Ca and low Ba/Ca ratios observed in the different teeth of all hyenas support the 309 interpretation of the signature of solid food consumption and consequently of bones as a likely driving factor behind their elevated δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} compared to other sympatric carnivores (Figure S13, Table S4). 310 311 Cave bears exhibit δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} overlapping with rabbits, deer, and chamois (Figure 3), which confirms the frequent observations based on low $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$, indicating they were mostly herbivorous (12, 63, 312 313 66).

314 The δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} values of the entire food web of Gabasa are the most elevated values ever 315 measured in dental enamel (Mean values about 0.2 ‰ higher than in the modern food web of Koobi 316 Fora and 0.7 ‰ higher than in the Late Pleistocene food webs of Marklot, Nam Lot and Tam Pa Ling 317 (35, 36, 41, 42), Supplementary Information 4, Figure S14). This is probably not due to the geology 318 because limestones, known to show the highest δ^{66} Zn (69), are present at both Gabasa and the Laotian 319 sites. Gabasa food web's uniqueness comes from its environmental context as it is the coldest terrestrial biotope ever studied for faunal δ^{66} Zn. Pollen data suggest an arid and cold climate (70) with 320 321 periods characterized by steppe vegetation and some forest patches mainly composed of conifers (45, 322 70, 71). Carbon and oxygen isotopes exhibit patterns similar to those observed for mammals from 323 various Middle Paleolithic Western European sites (54, 55, 72) and are compatible with mid-mountain 324 mosaic landscape (Supplementary Information 1 and 6). Tree leaves usually exhibit relatively low 325 δ^{66} Zn and they were probably scarce in Gabasa, as opposed to the forest of Tam Hay Marklot and the fynbos of Western Cape(40), where the lowest δ^{66} Zn in herbivore teeth were measured. 326

327

328

329 The diet of a Neandertal at Gabasa

330 Our results demonstrate that the Neandertal individual from Gabasa shows a Zn isotope 331 signature of a top-level carnivore, similarly to that observed for nitrogen isotopes for other sites with 332 Neandertal occupation. Carbon and oxygen isotope and trace element data suggest that the individual 333 inhabited the local area around the cave (Supplementary Information 6 and 7). Of all the animal taxa 334 analyzed in Gabasa, the Neandertal specimen easily exhibits the lowest Zn isotope ratio. As the Sr 335 isotope ratio of the Neandertal tooth enamel is similar to those of other animals (Figure 4), the low 336 δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} value is unlikely the result of a different geographic origin (and consequently different 337 bedrock and isotope baseline) of this individual, but reflect diet instead. Previous work on animal food webs documented a trophic spacing for δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} of 0.3 to 0.6 ‰ (34–36, 38). In Gabasa, the average 338 339 difference between carnivores and herbivores is 0.31 ‰, but the Neandertal shows a δ^{66} Zn value 0.57 340 % lower than that of the carnivores -0.50 % if hyenas are excluded- and 0.85 % lower than the 341 herbivores, which would be about three trophic levels higher than that of the herbivores if we consider 342 a trophic spacing of 0.31 ‰. This mirrors dietary reconstructions based on nitrogen isotopes from 343 individuals from other European sites such as Goyet (18) (Belgium), Jonzac (France) (13), or Les Cottés (7) (France), where Neandertals exhibit higher $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ values than sympatric carnivores. 344

345 Dietary peculiarities other than high-trophic level carnivory either do not explain the low 346 δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} values or conflict with other observations. Here we consider: 1) a signature of 347 breastfeeding; 2) Specific diets (the consumption of either light Zn-bearing foods or the absence of 348 consumption of heavy Zn-bearing foods); 3) a metabolic origin.

349 The breastfeeding signature hypothesis can be ruled out because it leads to high δ^{66} Zn_{enamel}. In 350 a previous study, teeth formed during the breastfeeding period of two human populations from very different geographical and archeological contexts exhibit average δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} values that are 0.3 ‰ 351 352 higher than the teeth whose dental enamel forms after weaning (39). Furthermore, the low Ba/Ca of 353 the Neandertal dental enamel suggests that it was formed after the breastfeeding period (49, 52, 73) 354 (Table S20). Moreover, the region of the tooth sampled was very close to the tooth's cervical margin 355 because of tooth wear, which usually corresponds to formation ages of 2-3 years old (74). The 356 turnover of Zn in the body occurs over the course of just a few months, and weaning age (or at least an 357 age with substantial consumption of solid food) among Neandertals is assumed to be around 1 year old 358 (49). Even if milk consumption extended to the period from which enamel was sampled from the 359 tooth, it is unlikely that it was a major source of Zn in the diet at this stage. Therefore, the value 360 observed in the Neandertal tooth enamel is likely a reflection of an adult diet. An early weaning age 361 also prevails in recent humans and has also been documented with Zn isotopes in a Late Pleistocene 362 Homo sapiens (37), strongly contrasting with the conditions observed among apes, Australopithecus 363 (75), and earlier representatives of the genus Homo (76). This adaptation results from the necessity for 364 the breastfeeding mother to share the energetic burden of her child's large brain with other adults able 365 to contribute to solid food. It is central to the human pattern of "cooperative breeding" and has critical 366 social and behavioral implications.

367 Some dietary explanations for the low $\delta^{66}Zn_{enamel}$ of the Neandertal individual involving light Zn 368 bearing foods are also excluded:

369 a. Adult vs juvenile prey: In principle, if (as in humans (39)) milk consumption leads to higher 370 δ^{66} Zn, preferential consumption of post-weaning juveniles or adults might lead to lower δ^{66} Zn. However, this explanation seems unlikely for two reasons. First, such an isotopic 371 372 disparity has not been observed in herbivore teeth in relationship to weaning in this study or 373 elsewhere (36), so the age of the prev does not appear to matter. Secondly, Neandertals 374 targeted younger deer and horses (61) (Supplementary Information 1) and while other carnivores targeted adult ibexes. As such, if prey age mattered, Neandertal Zn isotope 375 compositions should be biased towards higher δ^{66} Zn, not lower. Although we cannot rule out 376 377 the possibility that the formation period of the Neandertal tooth is asynchronous with the site's 378 period of occupancy, there is currently no evidence to support this...

b. Cannibalism or hypercarnivorism: Cannibalism or carnivore meat consumption could be
associated with low Zn isotope ratios, but the absence of cut marks on hominin and carnivore
bones rules out this hypothesis.

382 c. Food with unusually low δ^{66} Zn values: Archaeological evidence for some isotopically light 383 foods that Neandertals might have specifically targeted may be missing (e.g., animal livers 384 (53, 77, 78), birds, mushrooms, fruits, leaves (79–81), insects (82, 83) or aquatic resources 385 (43)). However, δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} of the consumers of those foods have been measured and are not

13

associated with lower values than that of sympatric carnivores, both in Gabasa (e.g., lynx are
known to consume liver, deer consume leaves, while foxes, bears, and rabbits have been
known to consume mushrooms) and other food webs (apes and tapirs for insects and fruits
(36)).

- 390 d. Aquatic foods: The consumption of aquatic resources has been demonstrated for some Iberian 391 Neandertals, though not at Gabasa (23, 25, 30). Still, the consumption of common trout 392 (Salmo trutta) has been suggested for a Mousterian site at the Grotte du Noisetier (84), located 393 in the French Pyrenees (Figure 1). The trophic level of this species could potentially explain low δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} values, but would imply that the main source of Zn in the diet comes from 394 395 freshwater fish. Trout Zn content is about ten times less than that of liver or muscle from 396 mammals (85), requiring Neandertals to have consumed trout almost exclusively to shift their δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} to the observed low value. As no fishbone or other evidence for aquatic resource 397 398 use were found in the Gabasa region, we can disregard this hypothesis as unlikely.
- e. Food processing: Elevated δ^{15} N values among Neandertals have been suggested to result 399 400 from food processing such as fermentation or cooking. However, Zn fractionates only at a 401 temperature above $\sim 900^{\circ}$ C (86), which is not reached in open fires, and even if fractionation 402 did occur, it would enrich the Neandertal food in heavy Zn isotopes (86). Biotic fractionation 403 during meat processing is not documented, but could happen within muscle tissues if the 404 reactions were incomplete during fermentation (87) or other curing processes. However, this would only influence the final δ^{66} Zn of the consumed food if both reagents and products of 405 406 the curing process would not be contained in the final food product.
- 407

408 A combination of dietary practices might explain the low δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} value of the Neandertal. Zinc 409 isotopes are highly fractionated in mammal tissues (77, 78, 88, 89), and different mammal species 410 have different isotope compositions. Thus, a low δ^{66} Zn value might reflect consumption of 411 muscles and liver (low δ^{66} Zn) from deer and rabbits (lower δ^{66} Zn than other herbivores, Figure 3,

also supported by $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{18}O$ for which Neandertals exhibit values close to these animals 412 (Figure 2, 4, S10)), while excluding bones and blood (high δ^{66} Zn). Although cut marks suggest 413 414 Neandertals hunted deer and horses (61, 90), rabbits are the most abundant taxon of the site 415 (Figure S2), and some rabbit bones show cut marks (Figure S3). Disarticulation of rabbits requires 416 minimal use of tools (61), so they could have been heavily consumed without physical evidence. 417 Temporal asynchrony between cave deposits and tooth growth might explain a discrepancy 418 between zooarchaeological and isotopic dietary conclusions if the deposits represent a period 419 when Neandertals preferentially ate horses and deer, whereas the portion of the tooth corresponds 420 to a period when rabbits were preferentially eaten. Higher δ^{66} Zn among other sympatric carnivores 421 hunting the same species as Neandertal (Table S3) (61, 91) might partially reflect bone consumption: hyenas tend to have elevated δ^{66} Zn _{enamel} values, likely due to bone consumption 422 423 (35, 37). Red foxes and wolves gnaw on bones (although they ingest much less bone than hyenas 424 (92)), while lynxes partially digest the bones of rabbits, which make up 80-100% of their typical 425 diets (91). In addition, all these carnivores may consume substantial blood, possibly helping to explain higher δ^{66} Zn values than the Neandertal. 426

427 Metabolic specificity (different diet-tissue isotopic offsets) for Neandertals compared to other animals might also explain the unusually low δ^{66} Zn value and possibly the higher $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ values 428 429 that have been measured elsewhere. It is indeed striking how similar the patterns between δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} 430 and $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ mirror each other: in both proxies, Neandertals typically exhibit isotope ratios that 431 would appear to imply a higher trophic level than sympatric carnivores (1, 3–5, 7, 11, 63). Although 432 such distinct compositions have been interpreted to reflect aquatic food resources for some Paleolithic 433 humans (11), compound-specific isotope analysis of amino acids shows that anatomically modern 434 humans from Buran Kaya (Crimea) relied on terrestrial resources, even though they exhibit the highest 435 $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ known for the Paleolithic (93). These authors suggest preferential consumption of mammoths (absent from Gabasa), but a metabolic origin might yield similarly high $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ values. 436 We acknowledge that some studies show minimal offsets in $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ between humans and sympatric 437

438 herbivores (94). However, the trophic spacing between the Paleolithic and Neolithic periods did not 439 decrease to the extent expected for a transition from hunter-gatherer to a more cereal-based diet (95). 440 Furthermore, for Zn isotopes, a medieval population with expected high meat and marine fish consumption shows strikingly lower δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} values than for sympatric herbivores (0.6 % lower) 441 and for a dog, cat, and pig (0.3 % lower), while $\delta^{15}N_{collagen}$ values were strikingly higher than 442 443 herbivores (4 ‰) and dog, cat, and pig (1 ‰) (41). These observations closely resemble patterns for 444 Neandertals at Gabasa (for Zn isotopes) and elsewhere (for N isotopes), and suggest a metabolic 445 effect. Controlled feeding experiments on animals with an omnivorous diet are necessary to assess this 446 further. The reason for this metabolic difference remains unknown, but it should be noted that the 447 Neandertal is the most carnivorous species among primates, and the only meat-eater not from the order 448 Carnivora within the Gabasa faunal assemblage. Therefore, Neandertals may have had some 449 metabolic peculiarities compared to other carnivores and primates regarding adaptations of their 450 gastrointestinal tract and their dietary preferences (96).

451

452 Concluding remarks.

453

454 Zinc isotope analysis of tooth enamel can successfully characterize past animal and human diets in the absence of collagen preservation for $\delta^{15}N$ analysis. Whichever method is used to characterize 455 Neandertals' diets (δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} and δ^{15} N_{collagen}), isotope values represent an extreme in carnivore trophic 456 457 levels, and Iberian Neandertals appear to be no exception. Meat consumption is supported by both the zooarcheological data at Gabasa and δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} analysis. Furthermore, the low Zn isotope ratio 458 459 observed in the single measured Gabasa Neandertal specimen suggests that this individual might have 460 had a distinct diet compared to other carnivores (possibly avoiding the consumption of bones and 461 blood) and/or may not have fractionated Zn isotopes like other sympatric carnivores. Our study 462 represents the first successful analysis of Zn isotopes from a Neandertal tooth, and further work should 463 focus on understanding whether such unusual compositions result from specific diets or metabolic 464 fractionation in these extinct hominins.

465

466 Material and Methods

467 *Material*

Details on the context of Gabasa cave deposits, geology, dating, zooarcheology, paleoenvironment and sampling strategy are available in the Supplementary Information. The material used in this study is associated with the permit "Resolution" by the Gobierno de Aragon on the February 10th 2016, and August 31st 2018.

472

473 Methods

474 Tooth enamel fragments and powders were sampled at the Department of Human Evolution of the 475 Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology (MPI-EVA, Leipzig, Germany) using a drill with 476 a diamond saw and at the Géosciences Environnement Toulouse of the Observatoire Midi Pyrénées 477 (GET/OMP, Toulouse, France) using a MicroMill. For Zn isotope analyses, 1 to 20 mg enamel 478 fragments were dissolved in 1mL 1N HCl. Samples were cleaned with double-distilled H₂O in an 479 ultrasonic bath and dried at 50°C. Zinc was then extracted by column chromatography using the 480 modified protocol of Moynier et al. (2006) described by Jaouen et al (2016b) (34, 97). The δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} 481 analyses were conducted on three different MC ICP MS instruments: a Nu 500 (ENS Lyon, France), a 482 Neptune (MPI-EVA, Leipzig, Germany) and a Neptune Plus (GET/OMP, Toulouse, France) using a Cu doping technique (see Supplementary Information 4). The δ^{66} Zn_{enamel} values were corrected to take 483 484 into account the offset (+0.27 ‰) existing between our in-house standard, bracketing standard (AA-485 MPI) and the JMC-Lyon solution. Zinc isotope data are thus reported toward the JMC-Lyon values, 486 and this correction does not impact the relative offsets or our interpretations. Strontium isotope 487 analyses were conducted on 5 to 20 mg of enamel powder, after performing a purification step based 488 on a modified protocol of Deniel and Pin (2001) (98) described by Richards et al (2008) (13), using a 489 Triton plus TIMS and a Neptune Plus at GET/OMP Toulouse. O and C isotope data were obtained 490 from untreated tooth enamel powder (<100 µg) using the "cold trap" method with a Thermo Scientific 491 Delta V IRMS in the Vonhof laboratory at the Max Planck Institute for Chemistry (MPIC, Mainz, 492 Germany) after Vonhof et al. (2020) (99). The reference materials NIST SRM 1400 (for Zn), NIST 493 SRM 1486 (for Sr), IAEA-603, NBS18, NIST SRM 120c and three internal house standards - a 494 carbonate standard (VICS) and a tooth enamel structural carbonate (AG-Lox) (for C and O) and a 495 dentin sample (AZE) for Zn were analyzed in the same runs as the samples and gave consistent results 496 for each lab and compared to previous studies (Supplementary Tables S3 to S5). Trace element 497 analyses were conducted at the GET using an ICap (ThermoFischer) Triple Quadrupole (TQ-ICP-498 MS). Finally, collagen was extracted from four tooth roots for δ^{15} N analyses using the protocol of 499 Talamo and Richards (2011) (58). All trace elements and isotope results are available in the 500 supplementary data.

- 501
- 502

503 Acknowledgments

This study was funded by the DFG project PALEODIET (378496604), the ERC project ARCHEIS (grant number 803676), the ERC project VERTEBRATE HERBIVORY (grant number 681450) and the Max Planck Society. GMS received funding from the European Union's Horizon Europe

507 research and innovation programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement number 508 101027850. We thank Maria Alonso Lescún from the Museum of Huesca for her help during the 509 collection sampling, Adeline Le Cabec for her help in understanding of tooth development, Sven 510 Steinbrenner for technical help, Mary Kita for her help in the improvement of the figures, Jeremy 511 McCormack for helpful discussions, and Hubert Vonhof for access to the stable isotope lab at 512 MPIC Mainz. D.C.S.G. acknowledges funding by the Generalitat Valenciana (CIDEGENT/ 513 2019/061), L.M and P.U from MICINN (PID2020-116598GB-I00 GAPS AND DATES. 514 DINAMICAS CULTURALES EN LA PREHISTORIA DE LA CUENCA DEL EBRO). We

- are grateful to the two reviewers who helped to significantly improve the manuscript.
- 516
- 517
- 518 519
- 520
- 521
- 522
- 523
- 524

- 526
- 527
- 528
- 529
- 530
- 531
- 532
- 533 534

535 **References**

- H. Bocherens, D. G. Drucker, D. Billiou, M. Patou-Mathis, B. Vandermeersch,
 Isotopic evidence for diet and subsistence pattern of the Saint-Césaire I Neanderthal: review
 and use of a multi-source mixing model. *Journal of Human Evolution* 49, 71–87 (2005).
- 4. Bocherens, "Neanderthal dietary habits: review of the isotopic evidence" in *The Evolution of Hominin Diets*, (Springer, 2009), pp. 241–250.
- 541 3. H. Bocherens, *et al.*, New isotopic evidence for dietary habits of Neandertals from
 542 Belgium. *Journal of Human Evolution* 40, 497–505 (2001).
- 543 4. C. Wißing, *et al.*, Isotopic evidence for dietary ecology of late Neandertals in North-544 Western Europe. *Quaternary International* **411**, 327–345 (2016).
- 545 5. M. P. Richards, *et al.*, Neanderthal diet at Vindija and Neanderthal predation: the 546 evidence from stable isotopes. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **97**, 7663– 547 7666 (2000).
- 548 6. M. P. Richards, R. W. Schmitz, Isotope evidence for the diet of the Neanderthal type 549 specimen. *Antiquity* **82**, 553–559 (2008).
- 550 7. K. Jaouen, *et al.*, Exceptionally high δ^{15} N values in collagen single amino acids 551 confirm Neandertals as high-trophic level carnivores. *Proceedings of the National Academy of* 552 *Sciences* **116**, 4928–4933 (2019).
- 553 8. F. Welker, et al., Palaeoproteomic evidence identifies archaic hominins associated
- with the Châtelperronian at the Grotte du Renne. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 113, 11162–11167 (2016).
- H. Bocherens, *et al.*, Isotopic biogeochemistry (¹³C,¹⁵N) of fossil vertebrate collagen:
 application to the study of a past food web including Neandertal man. *Journal of Human Evolution* 20, 481–492 (1991).
- 559 10. Y. I. Naito, *et al.*, Ecological niche of Neanderthals from Spy Cave revealed by
 560 nitrogen isotopes of individual amino acids in collagen. *Journal of Human Evolution* 93, 82–
 561 90 (2016).
- 562 11. M. P. Richards, E. Trinkaus, Isotopic evidence for the diets of European Neanderthals
 563 and early modern humans. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 106, 16034–

564 16039 (2009).

- 565 12. H. Bocherens, *et al.*, Palaeoenvironmental and palaeodietary implications of isotopic 566 biogeochemistry of last interglacial Neanderthal and mammal bones in Scladina Cave 567 (Belgium) *Journal of Archaeological Science* **26** 509 607 (1999)
- 567 (Belgium). Journal of Archaeological Science **26**, 599–607 (1999).
- M. P. Richards, *et al.*, Isotopic dietary analysis of a Neanderthal and associated fauna
 from the site of Jonzac (Charente-Maritime), France. *Journal of Human Evolution* 55, 179–
 185 (2008).
- 571 14. D. C. Salazar-García, et al., Dietary evidence from Central Asian Neanderthals: A
- 572 combined isotope and plant microremains approach at Chagyrskaya Cave (Altai, Russia).
 573 *Journal of Human Evolution* 156, 102985 (2021).
- 574 15. G. M. Smith, Neanderthal megafaunal exploitation in Western Europe and its dietary 575 implications: A contextual reassessment of La Cotte de St Brelade (Jersey). *Journal of Human*

- 576 *Evolution* **78**, 181–201 (2015).
- 577 16. G. J. van Klinken, Bone collagen quality indicators for palaeodietary and radiocarbon
 578 measurements. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 26, 687–695 (1999).
- 579 17. S. Pirson, M. Toussaint, D. Bonjean, K. Di Modica, "Spy and Scladina caves: A
- Neandertal's story" in *Landscapes and Landforms of Belgium and Luxembourg*, (Springer,
 2018), pp. 357–383.
- 582 18. C. Wißing, et al., Stable isotopes reveal patterns of diet and mobility in the last
- 583 Neandertals and first modern humans in Europe. *Scientific Reports* **9**, 4433 (2019).
- 19. R. Jennings, C. Finlayson, D. Fa, G. Finlayson, Southern Iberia as a refuge for the last
 Neanderthal populations. *Journal of Biogeography* 38, 1873–1885 (2011).
- 586 20. B. Galván, *et al.*, New evidence of early Neanderthal disappearance in the Iberian
 587 Peninsula. *Journal of Human Evolution* **75**, 16–27 (2014).
- 588 21. D. C. Salazar-García, *et al.*, Neanderthal diets in central and southeastern 589 Mediterranean Iberia. *Quaternary International* **318**, 3–18 (2013).
- 590 22. A. Rosas, *et al.*, Paleobiology and comparative morphology of a late Neandertal
- sample from El Sidrón, Asturias, Spain. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*103, 19266–19271 (2006).
- 593 23. J. Zilhão, *et al.*, Last Interglacial Iberian Neandertals as fisher-hunter-gatherers. 594 *Science* **367** (2020).
- 595 24. M. Nabais, J. Zilhão, The consumption of tortoise among last interglacial Iberian 596 Neanderthals. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **217**, 225–246 (2019).
- 597 25. M. Cortés-Sánchez, *et al.*, Earliest known use of marine resources by Neanderthals.
 598 *PLOS One* 6, e24026 (2011).
- 599 26. L. S. Weyrich, *et al.*, Neanderthal behaviour, diet, and disease inferred from ancient 600 DNA in dental calculus. *Nature* **544**, 357 (2017).
- R. C. Power, *et al.*, Dental calculus indicates widespread plant use within the stable
 Neanderthal dietary niche. *Journal of Human Evolution* **119**, 27–41 (2018).
- K. Hardy, *et al.*, Neanderthal medics? Evidence for food, cooking, and medicinal
 plants entrapped in dental calculus. *Naturwissenschaften* **99**, 617–626 (2012).
- H. J. O'Regan, A. L. Lamb, D. M. Wilkinson, The missing mushrooms: searching for
 fungi in ancient human dietary analysis. *Journal of Archaeological Science* **75**, 139–143
 (2016).
- 608 30. C. B. Stringer, et al., Neanderthal exploitation of marine mammals in Gibraltar.
- 609 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **105**, 14319–14324 (2008).
- 610 31. V. Michel, D. Delanghe-Sabatier, E. Bard, C. Barroso Ruiz, U-series, ESR and 14C
- 611 studies of the fossil remains from the Mousterian levels of Zafarraya Cave (Spain): A revised
- 612 chronology of Neandertal presence. *Quaternary Geochronology* **15**, 20–33 (2013).
- 613 32. M. Yustos, J. Y. S. de los Terreros, Cannibalism in the Neanderthal world: an 614 exhaustive revision. *Journal of Taphonomy* **13**, 33–52 (2015).
- 615 33. D. J. Álvarez-Lao, N. García, Chronological distribution of Pleistocene cold-adapted
- 616 large mammal faunas in the Iberian Peninsula. *Quaternary International* 212, 120–128
 617 (2010).
- 618 34. K. Jaouen, P. Szpak, M. P. Richards, Zinc isotope ratios as indicators of diet and 619 trophic level in arctic marine mammals. *PloS one* **11**, e0152299 (2016).
- 620 35. K. Jaouen, M. Beasley, M. Schoeninger, J.-J. Hublin, M. P. Richards, Zinc isotope
- ratios of bones and teeth as new dietary indicators: results from a modern food web (Koobi
 Fora, Kenya). *Scientific Reports* 6, 1–8 (2016).
- 623 36. N. Bourgon, *et al.*, Zinc isotopes in Late Pleistocene fossil teeth from a Southeast
- 624 Asian cave setting preserve paleodietary information. Proceedings of the National Academy
- 625 *of Sciences* **117**, 4675–4681 (2020).

- 626 37. N. Bourgon, *et al.*, Trophic ecology of a Late Pleistocene early modern human from
 627 tropical Southeast Asia inferred from zinc isotopes. *Journal of Human Evolution* 161, 103075
 628 (2021).
- 629 38. J. McCormack, *et al.*, Zinc isotopes from archaeological bones provide reliable tropic 630 level information for marine mammals. *Communications Biology* **4**, 1–11 (2021).
- 631 39. K. Jaouen, *et al.*, Zinc isotope variations in archeological human teeth (Lapa do Santo,
 632 Brazil) reveal dietary transitions in childhood and no contamination from gloves. *PLOS One*

633 **15**, e0232379 (2020).

- 634 40. K. Jaouen, M.-L. Pons, V. Balter, Iron, copper and zinc isotopic fractionation up 635 mammal trophic chains. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* **374**, 164–172 (2013).
- K. Jaouen, *et al.*, Tracing intensive fish and meat consumption using Zn isotope ratios:
 evidence from a historical Breton population (Rennes, France). *Scientific Reports* 8, 1–12
- 638 (2018).
- K. Jaouen, E. Herrscher, V. Balter, Copper and zinc isotope ratios in human bone and
 enamel. *American Journal of Physical Anthropology* 162, 491–500 (2017).
- 641 43. M. Costas-Rodríguez, L. Van Heghe, F. Vanhaecke, Evidence for a possible dietary
- 642 effect on the isotopic composition of Zn in blood via isotopic analysis of food products by
- 643 multi-collector ICP-mass spectrometry. *Metallomics* **6**, 139–146 (2014).
- 644 44. L. Van Heghe, E. Engström, I. Rodushkin, C. Cloquet, F. Vanhaecke, Isotopic
- analysis of the metabolically relevant transition metals Cu, Fe and Zn in human blood from
- vegetarians and omnivores using multi-collector ICP-mass spectrometry. *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry* 27, 1327–1334 (2012).
- 648 45. L. Montes, P. Utrilla, The cave of Los Moros-1 at Gabasa (Huesca). Pleistocene and
- 649 Holocene Hunters-Gatherers in Iberia and the Gibraltar Strait. The Current Archaeological
 650 Record. Universidad de Burgos-Fundaci ón Atapuerca, 181–188 (2014).
- 651 46. J. I. Lorenzo, L. Montes, Restes néandertaliens de la Grotte de "Los Moros de
- 652 Gabasa"(Huesca, Espagne). *Trabalhos de Arqueologia* **17**, 77–86 (2001).
- 653 47. M. Skinner, Developmental stress in immature hominines from Late Pleistocene
- Eurasia: evidence from enamel hypoplasia. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 23, 833–852
 (1996).
- 48. P. B. Pettitt, Neanderthal lifecycles: Developmental and social phases in the lives of
 the last archaics. *World Archaeology* 31, 351–366 (2000).
- 658 49. C. Austin, *et al.*, Barium distributions in teeth reveal early-life dietary transitions in
 659 primates. *Nature* 498, 216–219 (2013).
- T. M. Smith, *et al.*, Dental evidence for ontogenetic differences between modern
 humans and Neanderthals. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 107, 20923–
 20928 (2010).
- 663 51. R. Macchiarelli, *et al.*, How Neanderthal molar teeth grew. *Nature* **444**, 748–751 (2006).
- 52. T. Tsutaya, M. Yoneda, Reconstruction of breastfeeding and weaning practices using
 stable isotope and trace element analyses: A review. *American Journal of Physical*
- 667 *Anthropology* **156**, 2–21 (2015).
- 668 53. K. Jaouen, *et al.*, Dynamic homeostasis modeling of Zn isotope ratios in the human
 669 body. *Metallomics* 11, 1049–1059 (2019).
- 670 54. H. Bocherens, *et al.*, Direct isotopic evidence for subsistence variability in Middle
- 671 Pleistocene Neanderthals (Payre, southeastern France). *Quaternary Science Reviews* 154,
 672 226–236 (2016).
- 673 55. M. Ecker, *et al.*, Middle Pleistocene ecology and Neanderthal subsistence: insights
- 674 from stable isotope analyses in Payre (Ardeche, southeastern France). Journal of Human
- 675 *Evolution* **65**, 363–373 (2013).

- 676 56. R. E. Stevens, R. E. M. Hedges, Carbon and nitrogen stable isotope analysis of
- northwest European horse bone and tooth collagen, 40,000BP–present: Palaeoclimatic
 interpretations. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 23, 977–991 (2004).
- 679 57. J. McCormack, et al., Trophic position of Otodus megalodon and great white sharks
- 680 through time revealed by zinc isotopes. *Nature Communications* (2022)
- 681 https://doi.org/10.1038/s42003-021-02212-z (June 26, 2021).
- 58. S. Talamo, M. Richards, A comparison of bone pretreatment methods for AMS dating
 of samples > 30,000 BP. *Radiocarbon* 53, 443–449 (2011).
- 59. S. Talamo, H. Fewlass, R. Maria, K. Jaouen, "Here we go again": the inspection of
- collagen extraction protocols for ¹⁴C dating and palaeodietary analysis. *STAR: Science & Technology of Archaeological Research* 7, 62–77 (2021).
- 687 60. M. F. Blasco, In the pursuit of game: The Mousterian cave site of Gabasa 1 in the 688 Spanish Pyrenees. *Journal of Anthropological Research* **53**, 177–217 (1997).
- 689 61. F. Blasco Sancho, Hombres, fieras y presas: estudio arqueozoológico y tafonómico
- 690 *del yacimiento del Paleolítico Medio de la Cueva de Gabasa 1 (Huesca)* (Universidad de 691 Zaragoza., 1995).
- 692 62. K. Jaouen, What is our toolbox of analytical chemistry for exploring ancient hominin
- diets in the absence of organic preservation? *Quaternary Science Reviews* 197, 307–318
 (2018).
- 695 63. Y. I. Naito, *et al.*, Evidence for herbivorous cave bears (*Ursus spelaeus*) in Goyet 696 Cave, Belgium: implications for palaeodietary reconstruction of fossil bears using amino acid 697 δ^{15} N approaches. *Journal of Quaternary Science* **31**, 598–606 (2016).
- 64. S. C. Münzel, *et al.*, Behavioural ecology of Late Pleistocene bears (*Ursus spelaeus*, *Ursus ingressus*): Insight from stable isotopes (C, N, O) and tooth microwear. *Quaternary*
- *International* 339, 148–163 (2014).
 65. H. Bocherens, M. Fizet, A. Mariotti, Diet, physiology and ecology of fossil mammals
- as inferred from stable carbon and nitrogen isotope biogeochemistry: implications for
- 702 as interfed from subjectation and introgen isotope ofogeochemistry. Impleations for
 703 Pleistocene bears. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 107, 213–225
- 704 (1994).
- 705 66. M. P. Richards, *et al.*, Isotopic evidence for omnivory among European cave bears:
- Late Pleistocene Ursus spelaeus from the Peștera cu Oase, Romania. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 105, 600–604 (2008).
- M. Sponheimer, D. de Ruiter, J. Lee-Thorp, A. Späth, Sr/Ca and early hominin diets
 revisited: new data from modern and fossil tooth enamel. *Journal of Human Evolution* 48,
 147–156 (2005).
- 711 68. W. J. Binder, B. Van Valkenburgh, Development of bite strength and feeding
- behaviour in juvenile spotted hyenas (Crocuta crocuta). *Journal of Zoology* 252, 273–283
 (2000).
- F. Moynier, D. Vance, T. Fujii, P. Savage, The Isotope Geochemistry of Zinc and
 Copper. *Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry* 82, 543–600 (2017).
- 716 70. P. González-Sampériz, L. Montes, P. Utrilla, Pollen in hyena coprolites from Gabasa
- 717 Cave (northern Spain). *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* **126**, 7–15 (2003).
- 718 71. P. Utrilla, L. Montes, B. Fernanda, T. J. Torres Pérez-Hidalgo, J. E. Ortiz Menéndez,
- La cueva de Gabasa revisada 15 años después: un cubil para las hienas y un cazadero para los
 Neandertales. *Zona Arqueológica*, 376–389 (2010).
- 721 72. H. Bocherens, M. L. Fogel, N. Tuross, M. Zeder, Trophic structure and climatic
- information from isotopic signatures in Pleistocene cave fauna of southern England. *Journal* of Archaeological Science 22, 327–340 (1995).
- 724 73. Q. Li, *et al.*, Spatially-resolved Ca isotopic and trace element variations in human
- deciduous teeth record diet and physiological change. *Environmental Archaeology* **0**, 1–10

- 726 (2020).
- 74. 727 D. Guatelli-Steinberg, Recent studies of dental development in Neandertals:
- 728 Implications for Neandertal life histories. Evolutionary Anthropology: Issues, News, and
- 729 Reviews 18, 9–20 (2009).
- 730 R. Joannes-Boyau, et al., Elemental signatures of Australopithecus africanus teeth 75. 731 reveal seasonal dietary stress. Nature 572, 112-115 (2019).
- 732 M. C. Dean, B. H. Smith, "Growth and development of the Nariokotome youth, 76.
- 733 KNM-WT 15000" in The First Humans–Origin and Early Evolution of the Genus Homo,
- 734 (Springer, 2009), pp. 101–120.
- 735 F. Moynier, T. Fujii, A. S. Shaw, M. Le Borgne, Heterogeneous distribution of natural 77. 736 zinc isotopes in mice. *Metallomics* 5, 693–699 (2013).
- 737 V. Balter, *et al.*, Contrasting Cu, Fe, and Zn isotopic patterns in organs and body fluids 78.
- 738 of mice and sheep, with emphasis on cellular fractionation. *Metallomics* 5, 1470–1482 (2013).
- 739 J. Viers, et al., Evidence of Zn isotopic fractionation in a soil-plant system of a 79.
- 740 pristine tropical watershed (Nsimi, Cameroon). Chemical Geology 239, 124–137 (2007).
- 741 80. C. Cloquet, J. Carignan, M. F. Lehmann, F. Vanhaecke, Variation in the isotopic
- 742 composition of zinc in the natural environment and the use of zinc isotopes in biogeosciences: 743 a review. Analytical and Bioanalytical Chemistry 390, 451–463 (2008).
- 744 81. C. Caldelas, D. J. Weiss, Zinc Homeostasis and isotopic fractionation in plants: a
- 745 review. Plant Soil 411, 17-46 (2017).
- 746 R. D. Evans, W. Wang, H. E. Evans, R. B. Georg, Variation in Zn, C, and N isotope 82. 747 ratios in three stream insects. Facets 1, 205–216 (2016).
- 748 K. N. Nitzsche, et al., Magnesium and zinc stable isotopes as a new tool to understand 83. 749 Mg and Zn sources in stream food webs. *Ecosphere* **11**, e03197 (2020).
- 750 84. V. Mourre, et al., Exploitation du milieu montagnard dans le Moustérien final: la
- 751 Grotte du Noisetier à Fréchet-Aure (Pyrénées centrales françaises) in Proceedings of the XV
- 752 World Congress UISPP (Lisbon, 4e9 September 2006). Mountain Environments in
- 753 Prehistoric Europe: Settlement and Mobility Strategies. British Archaeological Reports International Series, (2008).
- 754
- 755 H. Scherz, E. Kirchhoff, Trace elements in foods: Zinc contents of raw foods-A 85.
- 756 comparison of data originating from different geographical regions of the world. Journal of 757 Food Composition and Analysis 19, 420–433 (2006).
- 758 G. Monge, et al., Earliest evidence of pollution by heavy metals in archaeological 86. 759 sites. Scientific Reports 5, 14252 (2015).
- 760 87. A. Coutaud, M. Meheut, J. Viers, J.-L. Rols, O. S. Pokrovsky, Zn isotope fractionation 761 during interaction with phototrophic biofilm. *Chemical Geology* **390**, 46–60 (2014).
- 762 88. B. Mahan, F. Moynier, A. L. Jørgensen, M. Habekost, J. Siebert, Examining the
- 763 homeostatic distribution of metals and Zn isotopes in Göttingen minipigs. *Metallomics* 10, 764 1264–1281 (2018).
- 765 89. K. Jaouen, V. Balter, Menopause effect on blood Fe and Cu isotope compositions. 766 American Journal of Physical Anthropology 153, 280–285 (2014).
- 767 F. Blasco, L. Montes, P. Utrilla, Deux modèles de stratégie occupationelle dans le 90.
- 768 Moustérien tardif de la vallée de l'Ebre: les grottes de Peña Miel et Gabasa. The last
- 769 Neandertals, the first anatomically modern humans: A tale about the human diversity, 385-770 434 (1996).
- 771 91. L. Lloveras, M. Moreno-García, J. Nadal, Taphonomic analysis of leporid remains
- 772 obtained from modern Iberian lynx (Lynx pardinus) scats. Journal of Archaeological Science 773 35, 1–13 (2008).
- 774 92. G. Haynes, A guide for differentiating mammalian Carnivore taxa responsible for
- 775 gnaw damage to herbivore limb bones. *Paleobiology* 9, 164–172 (1983).

776	93. D. G. Drucker, <i>et al.</i> , Isotopic analyses suggest mammoth and plant in the diet of the		
777	oldest anatomically modern humans from far southeast Europe. Scientific Reports 7, 1–10		
778	(2017).		
779	94. S. Lösch, G. Grupe, J. Peters, Stable isotopes and dietary adaptations in humans and		
780	animals at pre-pottery Neolithic Nevallı Çori, southeast Anatolia. American Journal of		
781	<i>Physical Anthropology</i> 131 , 181–193 (2006).		
782	95. R. E. M. Hedges, L. M. Reynard, Nitrogen isotopes and the trophic level of humans in		
783	archaeology. Journal of Archaeological Science 34 , 1240–1251 (2007).		
/84	96. P. Langer, M. Clauss, Morphological adaptation of the eutherian gastrointestinal tract		
/85	to diet. Vertebrate Zoology 68 , $237-252$ (2018).		
/80	97. F. Moynier, F. Albarede, G. F. Herzog, isotopic composition of zinc, copper, and iron		
/8/	in lunar samples. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 70, 6103–6117 (2006).		
/88	98. C. Deniel, C. Pin, Single-stage method for the simultaneous isolation of lead and		
/89	strontium from silicate samples for isotopic measurements. Analytica Chimica Acta 420, 95–		
790	105 (2001). 00 II B. Vanhaf, et al. High gravisian stable isotome analysis of $\sqrt{5}$ we CeCO samples		
791	99. H. B. Vonnoi, <i>et al.</i> , High-precision stable isotope analysis of $<5 \ \mu g$ CaCO ₃ samples		
792	ess78 (2020)		
793	68878 (2020).		
795			
796			
797			
798			
799			
800			
801			
802			
803			
804	Figure 1. A. Location of the Gabasa site as well as other Neandertal sites mentioned in the text.		
805	B. Detailed map of the Gabasa region. San Estaban de Litera and Benabarre are nearby modern		
806	cities.		
807			
808	Figure 2. Average dental enamel isotope and trace element ratios for the different dietary		
809	categories at Gabasa, Spain. A: δ^{66} Zn _{enamel} , B: 87 Sr/ 86 Sr C: δ^{18} O _{enamel} , D: δ^{13} C _{enamel} , E: Ba/Ca.		
810	Omnivores correspond to one single taxon (cave bears) as well as carnivores with significant		
811	bone consumption (cave hyenas).		

812

813 Figure 3. Enamel δ^{66} Zn values per mammal taxon for different dietary groups from Gabasa,

814 Spain given as box plots. Note that sub-samples taken from one single tooth reflect differences in

815 dietary ⁶⁶Zn values. See text for detailed discussion about the low Neandertal δ^{66} Zn value.

816



Figure 4. Zinc isotope values (δ^{66} Zn, average dental enamel values per tooth) cross plotted 818 versus A) carbon (δ^{13} C), B) oxygen(δ^{18} O) and C) strontium (87 Sr/ 86 Sr) isotope composition as 819 820 well as D) Ba/Ca ratios measured in faunal and Neandertal tooth enamel at Gabasa, Spain. Each 821 point corresponds to a single tooth, except for the horse tooth for which five samples were taken 822 (samples are connected with a line). Error bars correspond to the SD between analytical duplicates for 823 C and O isotopes (0.02 to 0.36 ‰; one sample with higher SD has been removed) and for Zn 824 (analytical duplicates: 0.00 to 0.04 ‰; SD for separate samples taken from a single tooth: 0.04 to 0.21 825 ‰). SE for strontium isotope ratios are 0.000003 to 0.000010 and are too small to display.

826











