Correlations of long-lived chemical species in a middle atmosphere general circulation model

Article

Published Version


It is advisable to refer to the publisher’s version if you intend to cite from the work. See Guidance on citing.

Published version at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2002JD002799
To link to this article DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2002JD002799

Publisher: American Geophysical Union

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the End User Agreement.

www.reading.ac.uk/centaur

CentAUR
Correlations of long-lived chemical species in a middle atmosphere general circulation model

David Sankey and Theodore G. Shepherd
Department of Physics, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Received 25 July 2002; revised 8 February 2003; accepted 12 March 2003; published 19 August 2003.

[1] Correlations between various chemical species simulated by the Canadian Middle Atmosphere Model, a general circulation model with fully interactive chemistry, are considered in order to investigate the general conditions under which compact correlations can be expected to form. At the same time, the analysis serves to validate the model. The results are compared to previous work on this subject, both from theoretical studies and from atmospheric measurements made from space and from aircraft. The results highlight the importance of having a data set with good spatial coverage when working with correlations and provide a background against which the compactness of correlations obtained from atmospheric measurements can be confirmed. It is shown that for long-lived species, distinct correlations are found in the model in the tropics, the extratropics, and the Antarctic winter vortex. Under these conditions, sparse sampling such as arises from occultation instruments is nevertheless suitable to define a chemical correlation within each region even from a single day of measurements, provided a sufficient range of mixing ratio values is sampled. In practice, this means a large vertical extent, though the requirements are less stringent at more poleward latitudes. INDEX TERMS: 0341 Atmospheric Composition and Structure: Middle atmosphere—constituent transport and chemistry (3334); 3319 Meteorology and Atmospheric Dynamics: General circulation; 3334 Meteorology and Atmospheric Dynamics: Middle atmosphere dynamics (0341, 0342); KEYWORDS: chemical correlations, long-lived species, transport and mixing


1. Introduction

[2] Chemical species in the atmosphere undergo advection by time-dependent wind patterns. As a result, point measurements of chemical species exhibit short-term variability which can be thought of as uninteresting "noise" on their long-term time evolution. Because different long-lived species are advected in a similar manner, correlation plots between chemical species are unaffected by advection and provide a way of eliminating dynamical variability from the measurements. Roach [1962] first noticed that such a plot of \( \text{O}_3 \) versus \( \text{H}_2\text{O} \) during a stratospheric sudden warming showed a relation between the two species, rather than a space-filling scatterplot, and Allam et al. [1981] found a similar relation between \( \text{O}_3 \) and \( \text{H}_2\text{O} \) using a troposphere-stratosphere general circulation model (GCM). Although the \( \text{O}_3: \text{H}_2\text{O} \) relation is generally not compact, Ehhalt et al. [1983] observed compact correlations between various long-lived chemical species using stratospheric observations.

[3] The existence of compact correlations between chemical species was given a theoretical basis in the work of Mahlman et al. [1986] and Holton [1986], who investigated the transport of chemical species in a simple one-dimensional chemical transport model of the troposphere and stratosphere. Plumb and Ko [1992] generalized their work to a two-dimensional zonally averaged model of the lower and middle atmosphere. A three-dimensional modeling study was performed by Avallone and Prather [1997], who considered the existence of correlations between various long-lived chlorine- and bromine-containing species and \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \).

[4] In addition to the modeling work, recent measurement campaigns have begun to provide much data, and a great deal of published work has confirmed that compact correlations between chemical species can be observed in the atmosphere [e.g., Loewenstein et al., 1993; Michelsen et al., 1998a, 1998b]. Kelly et al. [1989] initiated the widespread use of correlations between chemical species using data from the Airborne Antarctic Ozone Experiment (AAOE), and since then many other studies have used correlations to infer and attempt to quantify various properties of the atmospheric circulation, both chemical and dynamical. For example, Proffitt et al. [1989] used correlations between \( \text{O}_3 \), \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) and \( \text{NO}_y \) using data obtained from the AAOE campaign to investigate chemical \( \text{O}_3 \) loss in and around the Antarctic polar vortex. Similar work was performed by Proffitt et al. [1990] for the Arctic polar vortex, and followed up by Müller et al. [1996], who used the correla-
Correlations have also been used to investigate the tropical pipe [Plumb, 1996]: Murphy et al. [1993] used the correlation between O$_3$ and NO$_y$ to locate the boundaries of the tropical pipe, and Volk et al. [1996], Minschwaner et al. [1996], and Avallone and Prather [1996] used various correlations to quantify the leakiness of the tropical pipe in the lower stratosphere. Boering et al. [1994] used the correlation between CO$_2$ and N$_2$O to investigate the extent to which the tropospheric seasonal cycle of CO$_2$ propagates into the lower stratosphere. All these investigations have used either satellite or aircraft measurements as the source of their observations, except for Michelsen et al. [1998a, 1998b] who used Atmospheric Trace Molecule Spectroscopy (ATMOS) data from the space shuttle.

In this paper we present a series of chemical correlation plots based on results from the Canadian Middle Atmosphere Model (CMAM), which is a fully interactive chemistry climate model. The purpose of the study is twofold. The first is to characterize the chemical climate of the model and assess the extent to which it seems realistic, with a particular focus on transport properties. The second is to use the model as a way of testing the existence of different correlations and their degree of compactness. This has already been done with 2D models [e.g., Plumb and Ko, 1992], but not very extensively with 3D models. Hall and Prather [1995] considered only correlations between CO$_2$, N$_2$O, and O$_3$ using the Goddard Institute for Space Studies GCM, and Plumb et al. [2000] used a 3D model, although not a GCM, to investigate the effects of the polar vortex mixing barrier on correlations. By using the results from this study we can learn more about the use of certain correlations as a diagnostic. In particular, limited sampling from satellite or aircraft measurements could lead to artificially compact correlations, and the adequacy of such sampling can be tested with the model.

The outline of the paper is as follows. In section 2 we review the basic reasons why compact correlations are expected to exist for long-lived species, closely following the work of Holton [1986] and Plumb and Ko [1992]. Section 3 gives a brief overview of the CMAM. Section 4 presents some basic correlations to show that the CMAM data is producing expected results, before presenting the evolution of several correlations through a typical year of the model run. Conclusions and a discussion are presented in section 5.

2. Basis for Compact Correlations Between Long-Lived Chemical Species

Point measurements of chemical species whose lifetimes are longer than several days exhibit much variability due to short-term meteorological fluctuations. However, such fluctuations move air parcels around coherently, meaning that any correlations that exist between two species will persist despite the fluctuations. Thus examining correlations rather than point measurements provides a way to eliminate the effects of short-term dynamical variability.

![Figure 1](image1.png)

**Figure 1.** (a) Typical mixing ratio isopleths for a chemical tracer with a surface source and an upper atmosphere sink (e.g., N$_2$O, CH$_4$, CFCs). The mixing ratio decreases with altitude. (b) Correlation diagram between two such chemical species, showing how sampling different regions of the atmosphere produces different portions of a single correlation curve.

![Figure 2](image2.png)

**Figure 2.** (a) Mixing ratio isopleths of two hypothetical uncorrelated tracers A (solid lines) and B (dashed lines). The mixing ratio of A decreases from bottom-right to top-left, and the mixing ratio of B decreases from bottom-left to top-right. (b) Correlation plot obtained from sampling the whole atmosphere. (c) Correlation plot obtained from a single vertical sample. (d) Correlation plot obtained from a single horizontal sample.
from chemical measurements [Ehhalt et al., 1983]. Species whose lifetimes are longer than several weeks become reasonably well-mixed in the horizontal by isentropic motions, and therefore tend to have quasi-horizontal mixing ratio isopleths. Their meridional-vertical distribution then represents a balance between the slope-steepening effect of differential vertical advection (by the diabatic circulation) and the slope-flattening effect of isentropic mixing [Mahlman et al., 1986; Holton, 1986]. This accounts for the characteristic meridional distribution of N$_2$O, CH$_4$, etc. as seen in observations [e.g., Randel et al., 1993] and as sketched in Figure 1a.

When such conditions prevail, mixing ratio isopleths of different long-lived chemical species coincide. Scatter-plots then give a compact correlation. A vertical section of measurements (e.g., from a balloon, ground-based sensor or satellite sounding) and a horizontal section (e.g., from an aircraft) will sample different parts of this single correlation, but have to give consistent results (see Figure 1b).

For very long-lived chemical species the slope of the correlation curve is independent of altitude and the correlation is linear. For intermediate lifetimes (longer than the several-week mixing time on an isentropic surface, but shorter than the several-year timescale of the diabatic circulation) the correlation is nonlinear [Plumb and Ko, 1992]. So the slope of the correlation depends on chemistry, but the existence of a correlation in the first place is the result of dynamics.
temperature and there are other products (e.g., N2O or NOy),
chemical conversion depends on various factors such as
cases are rare. In the more general case where the extent of a

Figure 5. (a) Mixing ratio isopleths for two hypothetical
species A (dashed lines) and B (thin solid lines). The mixing
ratio of both species decreases with altitude. (b) Striations in
the correlation plot obtained by taking two horizontal
samples, labeled 1 and 2. (c) Striations in the correlation
plot obtained by taking two vertical samples, labeled 3 and 4.
Note that the same value of B corresponds to a higher value
of A in 1 than in 2, and in 3 than in 4.

[10] It is sometimes incorrectly stated that compact cor-
rrelations depend on chemistry. For two species converted
between each other but otherwise long-lived, one obtains a
compact anti-correlation arising from chemistry: An exam-
ple is CH4 and H2O in the stratosphere. However, such
cases are rare. In the more general case where the extent of a
chemical conversion depends on various factors such as
temperature and there are other products (e.g., N2O to NOy),
there would be an anti-correlation in the statistical sense, but
it would not be compact. Any compactness (e.g., in the case
of N2O and NOy, discussed further in section 4) arises from
dynamics.

[11] Another point is that if two species are not correlated,
then single sections in height or latitude will show apparent
correlations, but these are not compact correlations in the
sense we mean (see Figure 2). Rather, they are an artifact of
the reduced dimensionality of the data set.

3. Methodology

[12] The chemical correlations presented in this paper are
calculated from simulations made with the Canadian Middle
Atmosphere Model (CMAM), which is a comprehensive
GCM incorporating radiation, interactive chemistry, gravity-
wave drag, surface exchanges of heat, moisture and momen-
tum, as well as many other physical processes. The winds
and chemical transport are calculated using a T32 spectral
method, while the chemical reactions and physical processes
are calculated on an associated linear Gaussian transform
grid of 64 × 32 points (a grid spacing of approximately
5.625°). In the vertical the model ranges from the surface of
the earth to approximately 96 km, having 50 layers of
unequal thickness spanning this interval, with approximately
a 3 km vertical spacing in the middle atmosphere. In the runs
used in this paper a total of 36 different chemical species or
families are advected, and 95 gas-phase chemical reactions
are calculated (heterogeneous reactions are not included).
The vertical diffusion rate of the chemical species, $K_{zz}$, is set
to 1 m$^2$ s$^{-1}$; although this might be considered a little high, it
gives realistic column O3 amounts throughout the year. For
more details about the dynamical aspects of the CMAM, see
Beagley et al. [1997], and for more details about the
chemical aspects, see de Grandpre´ et al. [1997]. Long-term
simulations with fully interactive chemistry are described by
de Grandpre´ et al. [2000].

[13] The correlation diagrams presented in the following
sections were constructed as follows. At the particular time
step of interest, samples of the chemical species in question
were taken from the output data of the CMAM. These
included vertical samples and horizontal samples, although
the precise latitudinal and longitudinal extent of the sam-
pling varied (details are given in the figure captions). The
resulting “measurements” were then plotted against each
other to produce the correlation plot. In general, the plots
are color-coded according to the model pressure level from
which the data were taken, and all correspond to a single
model time step.

4. Correlations

[14] This section details the correlations between various
chemical species in the CMAM at different times of the
year, and investigates the conditions under which we can
expect the correlations to be compact. Unless stated other-
wise, the correlations shown are all taken from the 24th year
of the model run in order to allow for quasi-steady corre-
lations to be observed.

4.1. Passive Versus Passive

[15] We first consider the most basic of correlations: that
between two passive tracers. One is initialized as N2O and
the other initialized as O3. After the start of the model run
these two species undergo no chemical reactions, and their
spatial distributions are thereafter affected only through
advection by the model winds and numerical diffusion.

[16] According to the theory laid out by Holton [1986]
and Plumb and Ko [1992], tracers with extremely long
lifetimes produce a special type of compact correlation,
called “slope equilibrium,” characterized by a straight-line
 correlation. Since the two passive tracers have an infinite
lifetime, they ought to produce a correlation of the slope-
equilibrium type. Figure 3 shows the evolution of the corre-
lation between these two passive tracers as the model run progresses, with the color-coding corresponding to the
different pressure levels at which the “measurements” have
been taken. Initially, in the first year of the model run, there
is no correlation between the two tracers as their mixing
ratios still closely resemble those of the species with which
they were initialized. Since the chemical lifetime of O3 is
relatively short we cannot expect an O3-like tracer to have a
compact correlation with a long-lived species such as N2O.

However, as the model run progresses, we can see that even by year 2 of the run a compact correlation is beginning to form as the tracers lose knowledge of their initial state and are advected and diffused by the dynamics of the model. By year 5 the compact correlation is very strong, and by year 10 the tracers have become virtually uniformly mixed throughout the whole model atmosphere, resulting in a correlation plot that is almost a point in mixing ratio space.

It is interesting to note, however, that even for such infinitely long-lived tracers it is impossible to obtain a perfectly compact correlation. Figure 4 shows a blow-up of year 5 of the correlation between the two passive tracers. Although in Figure 3 it appears that a compact correlation has formed, examination of Figure 4 reveals that there is a striated pattern in the correlation picture, with the points at the different altitudes not lying exactly on top of each other. The striations occur at all times and are also observed in correlations between other species.

The striations arise from the finite width of the correlations combined with the discrete vertical resolution of the model. For the passive tracers the finite width is a finite-time effect. For real chemical species it reflects the finite lifetimes [Plumb and Ko, 1992]. Thus the mixing ratio isopleths are never perfectly aligned. The effect is illustrated in Figure 5. Consider two chemical species A and B which both decrease with altitude, but suppose that the meridional slope of A is slightly steeper than the slope of B (A is the dashed line in Figure 5). Then for a given value of B, A is higher at higher altitudes. This gives rise (Figure 5b) to the parallel striations seen in Figure 4. Similarly, for a given value of B, A is lower at higher latitudes. So vertical soundings lead to striations too, although at a different angle (Figure 5c).

4.2. N₂O Versus CH₄

We next consider two active chemical species with long (but not infinite) lifetimes, CH₄ and N₂O. In this case we expect a compact correlation to exist, although perhaps no longer a straight-line slope-equilibrium correlation as seen in Figure 4 for the passive tracers. The structure of the correlation between these two species for the months of January, April, July and October is shown in Figure 6 for both hemispheres, offset by 6 months to allow for easier comparison. In spite of the finite lifetime of these two species, the correlations between CH₄ and N₂O are reasonably compact. As expected, the striations found in the plots for the passive tracers can be seen here in all months.

Overall there is very little variation in the correlation between these two chemical species throughout the year. The most noticeable seasonal variation is the lower values of the two species found in the winter middle stratosphere (the red points in Figures 6c, 6d, and 6g). These lower
Figure 7. N₂O versus CH₄ in the Southern Hemisphere for (a) April and (b) October, and in the Northern Hemisphere for (c) October and (d) April. The color-coding shows the latitude at which the vertical sections were taken. In the vertical, the data lie between 100mb and 0.3mb. The black symbols represent data from Plate 2 of Michelsen et al. [1998b], with diamonds showing tropical data, squares showing midlatitude data, triangles high-latitude data, and crosses vortex data.
values are the result of air from above being drawn downward inside the winter polar vortex.

The correlation plots in Figure 6 were produced by taking horizontal samples of the species along various pressure surfaces. Figure 7 shows corresponding correlation plots for April and October generated by taking vertical samples along various latitude bands. Also shown in Figure 7 are ATMOS data from Plate 2 of Michelsen et al. [1998b], labeled by latitude (see figure caption for details). The overall structure of the plots is similar to those in Figure 6, and again we see the striations due to the slight misalignment of the tracer mixing ratio isolothes for the two species. The patterns of the striations in Figures 6 and 7 correspond well to the expected patterns sketched in Figures 5b and 5c, respectively.

However, in Figure 7 we see not just striations, but distinct structures in the correlations, separated by gaps. The theory of Plumb and Ko [1992] summarized in section 2 assumes no mixing barriers. In the real atmosphere, this is obviously not the case—there are several well-known mixing barriers, including the tropical pipe [Plumb, 1996] and the polar vortex barrier during the winter-spring season. While the theoretical understanding of the effect of mixing barriers on chemical correlations is incomplete, Plumb et al. [2000; see also Plumb, 2002] argue that the air on either side of a mixing barrier is ascending or descending at different rates and that the “leakiness” of the barrier allows air from different regions of the correlation diagram space to mix, producing an “anomalous correlation.” This manifests itself as a different curve on the correlation diagram.

There are several distinct correlations evident in Figure 7 in both the CMAM and ATMOS data. The tropical correlations (orange and magenta points and diamonds) are distinct from the midlatitude correlations, particularly for CMAM in Figures 7b and 7d (Southern Hemisphere and Northern Hemisphere spring), while in Figure 7b (Southern Hemisphere spring) the correlations in the Antarctic polar vortex (red and green points and crosses) are distinct from

Figure 8.  N₂O versus CH₄ in the Southern Hemisphere for the first day of October. The latitudinal extent of the data runs from 90S to the EQ, and the vertical extent from 100mb to 10mb. The red points denote data between 90S and 70S, the gray points denote data between 70S and 20S, and the blue points denote data between 20S and the EQ.

Figure 9.  Absolute value of the zonal-mean latitudinal gradient of N₂O for October. The dark colors show low latitudinal gradients of N₂O, while the bright colors show large latitudinal gradients representing jumps in the mixing ratio across a mixing barrier.
Figure 10. (a) The location of HALOE samplings at sunrise for January 1992. (b) Correlation between N₂O versus CH₄ from the CMAM (black points), from a month of HALOE samplings (red points) and from HALOE samplings on 16 January (yellow points). (c) Location of the ACE sampling points from a simulation. (d) As Figure 10b but for ACE.
the midlatitude correlations. With the exception of the Arctic vortex correlation (discussed further below), the CMAM and ATMOS data agree well within each of these distinct correlation regimes, where observational data exist.

To highlight the distinct correlations more clearly, Figure 8 shows the identical correlation plot between N₂O and CH₄ for CMAM for the month of October (as in Figure 7b), but color-coded differently. Here, the points are labeled by their tropical, midlatitude or vortex location rather than by their individual latitude. The red points denote data between 90S and 70S, the gray points denote data between 70S and 20S, and the blue points denote data from 20S to the equator. It is clear from this figure that even though there are distinct correlations in these three different regions, the correlations in the tropics and midlatitudes still exhibit a finite amount of spreading due to the finite lifetimes of the two species. The correlation in the vortex is much more compact.

In principle, we might expect a similar anomalous correlation in the correlation plot for April in Figure 7d due to the Arctic polar vortex, but evidently this is not the case for CMAM. In the CMAM, as in the real atmosphere, the winds at the Arctic polar vortex edge are much weaker than those at the Antarctic polar vortex edge, yielding a much weaker mixing barrier. In fact the lack of an anomalous correlation suggests that there is virtually no barrier at all in the CMAM Arctic vortex, and that the original theory of Plumb and Ko [1992] would therefore be more applicable in this region than that of Plumb et al. [2000]. The anomalous correlation can, in contrast, be clearly seen in the observational data from Michelsen et al. [1998b] (the black crosses in Figure 7d). The data are from April 1993, a year with very low total ozone in the Arctic spring, which suggests a particularly well defined Arctic vortex mixing barrier existed that year. The occurrence of such anomalously strong Arctic vortices does not appear to be a characteristic of this version of the CMAM.

The distinction between the tropical and midlatitude correlations arises from the existence of mixing barriers at the edge of the tropical pipe. The location of the tropical pipe in the CMAM can be found by considering the zonal-mean latitudinal gradient of N₂O on isentropic surfaces. Figure 9 shows a color-coded contour plot of the absolute value of the zonal-mean latitudinal gradient of N₂O on isentropic surfaces. The data are from April 1993, a year with very low total ozone in the Arctic spring, which suggests a particularly well defined Arctic vortex mixing barrier existed that year. The occurrence of such anomalously strong Arctic vortices does not appear to be a characteristic of this version of the CMAM.
Figure 12. NO\textsubscript{y} versus O\textsubscript{3} throughout the year. The correlations for the Southern Hemisphere (90S to the EQ) for (a) January, (b) April, (c) July and (d) October are shown in the top row. The correlations for the Northern Hemisphere (EQ to 90N) for (e) July, (f) October, (g) January and (h) April are shown in the bottom row. The pressure levels are color-coded as shown. The triangles show data from Figure 5 of Michelsen et al. [1998b] and the diamonds show data from Figure 3 of Murphy et al. [1993].

4.3. NO\textsubscript{y} Versus N\textsubscript{2}O

Figure 11 shows the annual variation of the correlations between NO\textsubscript{y} and N\textsubscript{2}O for both hemispheres. The
The latitudinal extent of the data are identical to those in Figure 6. NO\textsubscript{y} is the total reactive nitrogen, and is the sum of the mixing ratios of NO, NO\textsubscript{2}, HNO\textsubscript{3}, 2 \times N\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{4}, and ClONO\textsubscript{2} [Fahey et al., 1989]. Also shown in Figure 11 are ATMOS data from Michelsen et al. [1998b] and ER-2 data from Strahan [1999]. The former represent vertical profiles, while the latter represent horizontal profiles.

[10] The correlations shown here from the CMAM are in broad agreement with the 2D model results presented by Plumb and Ko [1992]. There are three distinct regions in each of the correlation plots. At low altitudes (between 100 and 35mb) there is a fairly compact correlation between the two species. In this region both tracers are long-lived compared to the quasi-horizontal mixing timescale. NO\textsubscript{y} increases with altitude while N\textsubscript{2}O decreases, reflecting the conversion from N\textsubscript{2}O to NO\textsubscript{y}. So the negative slope of the correlation results from chemistry, but as argued in section 2 the compactness of the correlation is due to mixing. At higher altitudes, however, the blue and yellow points show some evidence of spreading, and the compact correlation breaks down. At these altitudes the conversion of N\textsubscript{2}O to NO\textsubscript{y} is more rapid, meaning that at these altitudes the conditions for a compact correlation outlined in section 2 are violated. Higher still, above the source of NO\textsubscript{y} the
correlation again becomes compact because of the long lifetimes of both species in this region.

The agreement between the model and the data is reasonable, although the model values of NOy seem slightly higher at lower levels for all months. The model is unable to produce the very low values of NOy shown in the Michelsen et al. [1998b] data for the vortex (Figures 11d and 11h). It was originally thought that these low values of NOy were due to denitrification [Rinsland et al., 1999], which is not included in the current version of the CMAM, but it is now widely accepted that an alternative explanation for the low NOy is that air with lower NOy mixing ratios is brought down from above and mixes with extravortex air [Michelsen et al., 1998b] across the polar vortex barrier. The inference is then that the CMAM vortex confinement is either too strong (in the Antarctic) or too weak (in the Arctic) to exhibit the phenomenon.

4.4. $O_3$ Versus NOy

Correlations between $O_3$ and NOy are shown in Figure 12 for both hemispheres. The gaps between the colors are due to the fact that the tracers have only been sampled at distinct pressure levels, because of the distinct vertical levels in the CMAM. With higher vertical resolution these gaps would fill in. The space-filling scatterplots result from the short lifetime of $O_3$ throughout most of the stratosphere. We can also see the effects of the region of rapid conversion from N,O to NOy descending in the winter months leading to the decrease in values of NOy at 10mb at that time of year (Figures 12c, 12d, and 12g). Also shown in Figure 12 are ER-2 data from Murphy et al. [1993] (the diamonds in Figures 12a and 12g) and ATMOS data from Michelsen et al. [1998b] (the triangles in Figures 12b, 12d, 12f, and 12h). The correlations shown by these data suggest greater compactness than those produced by the model, an artifact of limited sampling. (As models are generally too diffusive compared to reality, they are likely to err on the side of overly compact correlations.) Figure 13 shows panels b, d, f, and h of Figure 12, but resampled by latitude. Again the data from Michelsen et al. [1998b] are shown and labeled by latitude (see figure caption for details). Sampling the model in this way highlights that the greatest variation in the correlation is produced in tropical latitudes. This is also shown in the data (the diamonds in Figures 13a and 13c). We can also see that the tropical correlation is clearly distinct from the midlatitude data, especially at lower altitudes (the low NOy values of the orange and magenta points), but in fact the correlations are nowhere compact. The samples from higher latitudes exhibit much less variability, but even there the correlation is not compact.

Murphy et al. [1993] have attempted to use this correlation (despite its lack of compactness) to investigate the transport of reactive nitrogen in the atmosphere, and found evidence for the existence of a subtropical mixing barrier. Because of such a subtropical barrier, the air parcels within the tropics are at least partially isolated from the air parcels on the midlatitude side of the mixing barrier, and hence there are two distinct regions of the correlation diagram. These can best be seen by plotting the ratio of NOy/$O_3$ versus latitude, as shown in Figure 14. The ratio from Murphy et al. [1993] is also shown in Figures 14c and 14g. The data from Murphy et al. was taken at various times

Figure 14. (a–h) NOy divided by $O_3$ versus latitude on the 100mb, 85mb, 50mb and 30mb pressure surfaces on the first day of January (top row) and July (bottom row) in the 24th year of the model run. The red crosses show data from the CMAM, and the diamonds on the 50mb plots show data from Figure 5 of Murphy et al. [1993].
throughout the year so the same ratio is shown in both panels. The results suggest that the tropical barrier in the CMAM certainly exists, although perhaps it is not as strong as in the real atmosphere, as evidenced by the sharper gradients in the observations from Murphy et al. For both these months the model shows that the distinction between tropical air (low values of the ratio) and extratropical air (high values of the ratio) is most clearly seen at the higher levels (50mb and 30mb). This is consistent with the idea that the tropical pipe edge is stronger at these levels. This agrees with the picture of the tropical mixing barrier seen in Figure 9, where the jump in the mixing ratio of N2O is larger at higher altitudes. In contrast, lower down, around 100mb, the pipe is known to be “leaky” thus blurring the distinction between tropical and extratropical air parcels [Volk et al., 1996].

4.5. O3 Versus CH4

[34] If data are taken throughout the stratosphere as a whole, correlations between O3 and CH4 appear very similar to those between NOx and O3; the greatest differences are that since there is no source of CH4 in the stratosphere, the values of CH4 do not decrease above 10mb in the winter months. As such, correlations between O3 and CH4 provide little information beyond what has already been noted. [35] However, an interesting issue arises from the work of Müller et al. [1996]. They attempt to use correlations between O3 and CH4 to calculate chemical O3 loss inside the Arctic polar vortex, by comparing correlations between these two species before and after springtime O3 destruction has occurred. The argument is that because CH4 is long-lived, it can be used as a parcel label and hence changes in O3 at a given value of CH4 correspond to chemical O3 loss. Given that we expect the correlation between CH4 and O3 to generally be space-filling, it is interesting to investigate this issue further. [36] The measurements used by Müller et al. [1996] are restricted in latitude range by the fact that sparse HALOE measurements are used and by the requirement that the measurements lie within the polar vortex. Figure 15 therefore shows correlation plots for O3 versus CH4 as they vary throughout the winter and spring months of year 24 of the CMAM run for points located close to the poles. Again one has to imagine the gaps being filled in reality. Figures 15a–15d show that although there is not a compact correlation between O3 and CH4 in July, one develops over the following months before beginning to break down again, particularly at the higher altitudes, in October. In the Northern Hemisphere, however, the four correlation plots show no evidence of compactness.

Figure 15. O3 versus CH4 throughout the winter/spring months of each hemisphere. The correlations for the Southern Hemisphere (90S to 70S) for (a) July, (b) August, (c) September and (d) October are shown in the top row. The correlations for the Northern Hemisphere (70N to 90N) for (e) January, (f) February, (g) March and (h) April are shown in the bottom row. The pressure levels are color-coded as shown.
When the polar vortex initially forms, the air parcels trapped inside do not exhibit a compact correlation, but instead reflect the global non-correlation of O₃ with CH₄. During the winter months, however, if the air parcels are trapped within the polar vortex, then they are not exposed to sunlight and O₃ within the vortex has a long chemical lifetime. Under such conditions, which are most likely to obtain in the Antarctic, we might expect a compact correlation to develop, although the process requires a finite time. Figure 15c shows the development of a compact correlation by September in the CMAM Antarctic. In contrast, the CMAM Arctic polar vortex appears to be sufficiently disturbed by extrapolar air to disrupt any correlation that might form over the dark winter months.

To investigate the strength of the polar vortex barrier we have performed particle advection runs using a modified version of the contour advection code of Dritschel [1988]. Particles were set up in latitude bands 10 degrees apart from 80S to 30S on several isentropic (q) surfaces and then advected diabatically for 10 days using the model winds and radiative heating rates. Figure 17 shows the distribution of the particles that started on the 700K surface (≈25 km) after 10 days for July (Figure 17a) and October (Figure 17b). The left-hand panels show a plan view of the distribution, and the right-hand panels show the θ-level-latitude distribution. The results show that during July the air inside the Antarctic vortex is well confined and mixing occurs only in midlatitudes. In October, however, although the polar air still maintains much of its distinctiveness, the mixing at the high latitudes is more pronounced (for example, the green and yellow contours overlap). Also in October the midlatitude air is seen to reach much further poleward; in the height-latitude picture for October the magenta particles reach from the equator to 60S. It is this mixing-in of midlatitude air that produces the tail-like features on the correlation plots between CH₄ and O₃ at the higher altitudes (the red and green points in Figure 15d).

Figure 16 shows the chemical lifetime of Oₓ (hours) in the stratosphere for (a) July and (b) October calculated from the CMAM data. Note that the lifetime of Oₓ inside the Antarctic polar vortex during the winter months exceeds 5000 hours.

The effects of limited sampling of the polar vortex are illustrated by Figure 19, which shows a plot of the mixing ratios of O₃ versus CH₄ inside the model vortex for January, as well as the correlation produced by sampling from the HALOE points inside the vortex for January 1992 (chosen for illustrative purposes). During January 1992 HALOE sampled points inside the model vortex relatively infrequently, and even then only at the southernmost extent. If the only measurements we had were those from HALOE, then we might falsely think that a compact correlation existed. The same point applies for measurements taken at a single altitude (say from an aircraft). This figure highlights the importance of having enough data; given limited observations at a particular altitude or latitude, one could be under the erroneous impression that a compact correlation exists between two chemical species when in reality this is not the case.

4.6. CO₂ Versus N₂O

Boering et al. [1994] have shown that the correlation between CO₂ and N₂O exhibits a strong seasonal variation in the lower stratosphere, the effect decreasing...
with increasing altitude. CO₂ is a long-lived tracer throughout the atmosphere, but its tropospheric values show a well-defined annual cycle, with low values in Northern Hemisphere fall and high values in Northern Hemisphere spring, because of the interhemispheric asymmetry of the land surface. An effect somewhat akin to the water vapor “tape recorder” [Mote et al., 1996] permits this annual variation of the CO₂ mixing ratio to propagate up into the stratosphere.

Although the CMAM run examined here does not have an annually varying CO₂, a separate run was performed to investigate if the seasonal variation of a CO₂-like correlation could be reproduced and if the effect decreased with increasing altitude. In the run, the CO₂-like tracer has a sinusoidally varying source at the surface with a period of one year. Similarly an N₂O-like tracer was set up with a constant source at the surface. Away from these surface sources the two tracers are advected in a passive manner. Figure 20 shows a correlation between the two tracers from year 9 of the run, as well as the observed correlations from Boering et al. [1994]. Although highly idealized, the results from the model are similar in character to those found observed in the data. At the higher altitudes (around 50mb) the shape of the correlation plot remains qualitatively similar between May and October. However at the lower altitudes, particularly around the 200 and 150mb levels, there is quite clearly a change in the sign of the gradient of the correlation curve between these two months. The effect of the seasonal variation propagates in phase and decreases in amplitude as one moves higher in the atmosphere. The signal appears to be about six months out of phase at 85mb. This oscillation of the correlation curve in time may be considered the “CO₂ tape recorder.”

5. Conclusion

Although it is impossible to cover all possible combinations of correlation plots between different chemical species in the atmosphere (or even in the CMAM), this paper has attempted to touch upon some of the more common ones used by various authors in recent years. Apart from helping to validate the model, the aim is to help understand the various factors that determine the structure of chemical correlation...
plots, as well as their seasonal evolution. Real measurements of chemical correlations are limited both spatially and temporally, and this work may enable such measurements to be used with greater confidence in the future.

The effects that numerical methods employed by atmospheric models have on the formation and maintenance of compact correlations between chemical species have been considered by Thuburn and McIntyre [1997]. It was found in the present study that the correlations produced by the CMAM agree well with the theory of Plumb and Ko [1992], in that only those species with long lifetimes compared to the quasi-horizontal mixing timescale exhibit compact correlations with each other. It is impossible to get a perfectly compact correlation, and some “spreading” of the correlation always occurs; this is particularly evident in the striation patterns that occur in many of the correlation plots shown here. The striations are the result of an imperfect overlap of the two tracer mixing ratio isopleths, and are obtained for both horizontal and vertical sampling.

The existence of mixing barriers in the atmosphere complicates the idealized correlations between chemical species considered by Plumb and Ko [1992]. Plumb et al. [2000] have shown how one would expect mixing barriers to produce anomalous correlations, and there is clear evidence for such anomalous correlations in the CMAM results shown here. For example, the existence of the tropical pipe mixing barrier leads to a different correlation in tropical regions than that seen in midlatitude regions (Figures 7 and 14). Although the tropical pipe mixing barrier in the CMAM may be slightly weaker than that in the real atmosphere, the distinction between the tropical and midlatitude correlations can nevertheless be quite clearly seen, and the location of the transition is consistent with the mixing barrier inferred from the tracer gradient (Figure 9).

During the wintertime, the polar vortex edge can also produce anomalous correlations. This effect was highlighted by the correlation between N$_2$O and CH$_4$ in the Southern Hemisphere in November (Figure 8). The results from the CMAM exhibit these anomalous correlations only during the Southern Hemisphere winter and spring, because the simulated Arctic polar vortex is apparently always too weak to produce an effective mixing barrier. In the real

![Figure 18](image-url) Distribution of particles after a 10 day advection run for (a) January and (b) April. The particles were initialized on latitude circles 10 degrees apart from 30N to 80N and on the 700K isentropic surface.
atmosphere, however, it appears from measurements that anomalous correlations also occur in the Arctic wintertime, depending on the strength of the polar vortex in a given year.

Using the CMAM has also allowed us to investigate the extent of data coverage required to adequately characterize a correlation. Limited sampling was shown not to be such a problem when dealing with long-lived species, where correlations are quite compact, at least within distinct regions. For the correlation between N$_2$O and CH$_4$, a reasonable representation of the midlatitude correlation can be obtained even from satellite sampling points that cover only a small range of latitudes. Similarly the measurements from a single day provide an adequate representation of the correlation as a whole. It was also shown that having a greater latitudinal coverage of data does not necessarily lead to a greater sampling of the midlatitude correlation curve. The smaller latitudinal extent of the simulated ACE data covered more of the correlation curve than the simulated HALOE data by virtue of its more northerly location, which allows sampling of a greater range of mixing ratios (Figure 10). The spatial extent of the data is nevertheless more important than the temporal extent since the correlations only vary slowly in time.

In the case of correlations between O$_3$ and CH$_4$, a general lack of compactness is evident in the CMAM data (Figure 15). Using the CMAM data it would be impossible to use the method of Müller et al. [1996] to calculate chemical O$_3$ loss in the Arctic polar vortex, because the correlations are never compact. Even in the Antarctic, where compact correlations do develop by late winter, the “early vortex” correlation would need to be taken sufficiently late in the season to ensure it was compact. The CMAM results illustrate the fact that for short-lived species, limited satellite or ground-based measurements may lead to the erroneous conclusion that a well-defined compact correlation exists when in fact it does not. Thus correlations (especially those involving O$_3$) must be used with care; the method of Müller et al. [1996] may not be reliable for warm winters where the vortex is weak, or too early in the winter [Salawitch et al., 2002].

---

**Figure 19.** O$_3$ versus CH$_4$ for the first day of January in the Northern Hemisphere as in Figure 15e. The black points represent a sample taken by HALOE over the whole month of January 1992 to mimic the data from vertical soundings. Considered alone, the black points could lead to the misleading interpretation that a compact correlation exists between the two species.

---

**Figure 20.** A CO$_2$-like versus an N$_2$O-like tracer for (a) May and (c) October for year 9 of a CMAM simulation. The latitudinal extent of the data runs from 10N to 70N. The pressure levels are color-coded as shown. (b) and (d) show observations taken from Boering et al. [1994] for May and October respectively.
Acknowledgments. This research was supported by the “Modeling of Global Chemistry for Climate” project, with support from the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council, the Meteorological Service of Canada through its Climate Research Network, the Canadian Space Agency, and the Canadian Foundation for Climate and Atmospheric Sciences. The authors would also like to thank Kristie Boieer, Hope Michelsen, Dan Murphy, and Susan Strahan for the provision of their data. Finally, we would like to thank the two anonymous reviewers for their helpful advice and suggestions.

References


Volk, C. M., et al., Quantifying transport between the tropical and mid-latitude lower stratosphere, Science, 272, 1763–1768, 1996.

D. Sankey and T. G. Shepherd, Department of Physics, University of Toronto, 60 St. George Street, Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5S 1A7. (sankey@atmosp.physics.utoronto.ca; tgs@atmosp.physics.utoronto.ca)