

# Transfer of 13C between paired Douglasfir seedlings reveals plant kinship effects and uptake of exudates by ectomycorrhizas

Article

Accepted Version

Pickles, B. J. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9809-6455, Wilhelm, R., Asay, A. K., Hahn, A. S., Simard, S. W. and Mohn, W. W. (2017) Transfer of 13C between paired Douglasfir seedlings reveals plant kinship effects and uptake of exudates by ectomycorrhizas. New Phytologist, 214 (1). pp. 400-411. ISSN 1469-8137 doi: 10.1111/nph.14325 Available at https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/67532/

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See <u>Guidance on citing</u>.

To link to this article DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/nph.14325

Publisher: Wiley

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the <u>End User Agreement</u>.



# www.reading.ac.uk/centaur

## CentAUR

Central Archive at the University of Reading

Reading's research outputs online

1	Transfer of <sup>13</sup> C between paired Douglas-fir seedlings reveals plant kinship
2	effects and uptake of exudates by ectomycorrhizas
3	
4	Brian J. Pickles <sup>1,3*</sup> , Roland Wilhelm <sup>2*</sup> , Amanda K. Asay <sup>1</sup> , Aria S. Hahn <sup>2</sup> , Suzanne W. Simard <sup>1</sup> ,
5	and William W. Mohn <sup>2</sup>
6	
7	<sup>1</sup> Department of Forest and Conservation Sciences, University of British Columbia, Vancouver,
8	BC, V6T 1Z4, Canada. <sup>2</sup> Department of Microbiology & Immunology, Life Sciences Institute,
9	University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z3, Canada. <sup>3</sup> School of Biological
10	Sciences, University of Reading, Harborne Building, Whiteknights, Reading, RG6 6AS, UK
11	*These authors contributed equally to this work.
12	
13	Author for correspondence:
14	Brian J Pickles
15	<i>Tel:</i> +44 118 378 7955
16	Email: b.j.pickles@reading.ac.uk
17	Word counts - Summary 197. Total: approx. 5030. Introduction 1027, Methods 1661, Results
18	1054, Discussion: 1203, Acknowledgements: 85.
19	Tables: 3
20	Figures: 4 [Colour figures: 1, 4]
21	Supporting information: Methods 2, Figures 6
22	Running title: Kinship and mycorrhizal effects on carbon transfer
23	Subject categories: plant-soil interactions, multi-trophic systems, mycorrhizas [Fungal paper;
24	Plant-relevant soil processes]
25	
26	Conflict of interest statement: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

27	Summary
28	
29	• Processes governing the fixation, partitioning, and mineralization of carbon in soils are
30	under increasing scrutiny as we develop a more comprehensive understanding of global
31	carbon cycling. Here we examined fixation by Douglas-fir seedlings and transfer to
32	associated ectomycorrhizal fungi, soil microbes, and full-sibling or non-sibling
33	neighbouring seedlings.
34	
35	• Stable isotope probing with 99% <sup>13</sup> C-CO <sub>2</sub> was applied to trace <sup>13</sup> C-labelled
36	photosynthate throughout plants, fungi, and soil microbes in an experiment designed to
37	assess the effect of relatedness on <sup>13</sup> C-transfer between plant pairs. The fixation and
38	transfer of <sup>13</sup> C-label to plant, fungal, and soil microbial tissue was examined in biomass
39	and PLFAs.
40	
41	• After a 6-day chase period, approximately 26.8% of the <sup>13</sup> C remaining in the system
42	was translocated belowground. Enrichment was proportionally greatest in
43	ectomycorrhizal biomass. The presence of mesh barriers (0.5 or 35 $\mu$ m) between
44	seedlings did not restrict <sup>13</sup> C-transfer.
45	
46	• Fungi were the primary recipients of <sup>13</sup> C-labelled photosynthate throughout the system,
47	representing 60–70% of total <sup>13</sup> C-enriched phospholipids. Full-sibling pairs exhibited
48	significantly greater <sup>13</sup> C-transfer to recipient roots in two of four Douglas-fir families,
49	representing 3- and 4-fold increases (+ approx. 4 $\mu$ g excess <sup>13</sup> C) compared to non-
50	sibling pairs. The existence of a root/mycorrhizal exudation – hyphal uptake pathway
51	was supported.
52	
53	Key words (5-8): Carbon allocation / ectomycorrhizas / host relatedness / interior Douglas-fir /

54 PLFA / stable-isotope probing.

Page 3 of 31

Pickles et al.

#### **New Phytologist**

#### 55 Introduction

56 Accurate estimates of belowground carbon cycling are critical to linking terrestrial 57 ecosystems with biogeochemical processes and making useful predictions about how these 58 may change under future climates (Richter & Billings, 2015). In temperate forests, the 59 estimated quantities of atmospheric carbon sequestered via fixation are globally-relevant (~73-60 159 Pg C aboveground, and 153-195 Pg C belowground; Reichstein, 2007; Lorenz & Lal, 61 2010), with humid and warm evergreen forests displaying the highest gross primary production 62 of any temperate or boreal forest types (Luyssaert et al., 2007). Photosynthate is mainly 63 incorporated into plant biomass, but also supports a diverse microbial soil community either 64 directly, via mycorrhizal fungi, or more generally, via scavenging of root exudates (Nehls et 65 al., 2007; Phillips et al., 2011) and rhizodeposits (Jones et al., 2009). Studying the belowground ecology governing carbon cycling is challenging due to the complexity of these 66 67 communities and soil systems in general (De Deyn *et al.*, 2008; Bardgett *et al.*, 2013), and 68 requires quantitative data on the allocation of photosynthate to plant biomass and its transfer to 69 mycorrhizal fungi and microbes (Kaiser et al., 2015). Here we undertook a multifaceted 70 exploration of carbon allocation within and between paired interior Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga 71 *menziesii* var. *glauca*) seedlings, their mycorrhizal symbionts, and soil microbiota. 72 While the majority of plants form mycorrhizas, less than 5% of plant species are 73 estimated to associate with ectomycorrhizal fungi (EMF). However, globally, these interactions 74 are abundant in all forest biomes (Brundrett, 2009). Soils in ecosystems where ectomycorrhizal 75 plants dominate exhibit higher C:N ratios compared to soils where they do not (Averill *et al.*, 76 2014), and ectomycorrhizal hosts have been found to allocate 10% - 30% of their 77 photosynthate to mycorrhizas (Söderström, 1992; Leake et al., 2006; Högberg & Read, 2006). 78 EMF incorporate photosynthate into their biomass, enhancing carbon sequestration by 79 synthesising recalcitrant carbon compounds like chitin (Clemmensen et al., 2013; Kashian et 80 al., 2013), especially in poorly oxygenated soil where decomposition is slow (Wallander *et al.*, 81 2001). Additionally, EMF add mineral nutrients to soils through the breakdown of rock with 82 organic acids (Hoffland et al., 2003; Plassard & Fransson, 2009), and promote soil aggregate 83 formation and carbon sequestration by exuding extracellular proteins and compounds that bind 84 mineral particles (Rillig & Mummey, 2006; Graf & Frei, 2013). However, not all mycorrhizal 85 activity is a carbon sink. In addition to respiration of host-derived photosynthate, some EMF 86 species can decompose plant litter to acquire limiting nutrients, thus releasing soil carbon back 87 into the atmosphere at rates comparable to saprotrophic fungi (Talbot et al., 2008; Rineau et 88 al., 2013; Phillips et al., 2014). Therefore, to assess how these processes jointly influence the

dynamics of soil carbon cycling in complex belowground systems, quantification of the fate of
photosynthate in EMF-dominated systems is required.

91 An emergent property of mycorrhizal systems is the common mycorrhizal network, 92 which arises when a fungal mycelium connects multiple plant hosts belowground across scales of cm<sup>2</sup> to at least tens of m<sup>2</sup> (Selosse et al., 2006; Beiler et al., 2010; Simard et al., 2012). 93 94 Ectomycorrhizal networks have been demonstrated to transfer water, nitrogen, and small 95 quantities of carbon between interior Douglas-fir hosts (Simard et al., 1997a; Teste et al., 96 2009; Bingham & Simard, 2011). Evidence that EMF display trait heritability based on host 97 and fungal genotype (Rosado et al., 1994a,b; Karst et al., 2008), and that closely related plants 98 display greater arbuscular mycorrhizal network size and root colonisation (File *et al.*, 2012; 99 Dudley et al., 2013), raises the possibility of preferential connectivity of kin through 100 compatibility of parent-mycorrhiza-offspring genotypes. This has not previously been explored 101 in conifers. In arbuscular mycorrhizal grassland plant species, root exudates play a role in 'kin 102 recognition' (Dudley et al., 2013) by moderating intra- and inter-specific plant root behaviour 103 (Semchenko *et al.*, 2014), suggesting that plant relatedness may influence nutrient uptake or 104 transfer by altering root growth and hence mycorrhizal formation. The finding that root 105 exudates are important in kin recognition suggests that mycorrhizas are involved in recognition 106 mechanisms in temperate forests, where trees are comprehensively mycorrhizal. If nutrient 107 transfer through ectomycorrhizal networks can also differ with host relatedness, then fitness, 108 and thereby forest stand composition, may be altered (Simard, 2009). Thus, to assess the 109 potential for host relatedness effects in the experimental system, the extent of carbon transfer 110 between 'kin' (full sibling) and 'non-kin' (no shared parent) seedling pairs was quantified. 111 Although mycorrhizal fungi are known to transfer labelled carbon between plants

112 (Finlay & Read, 1986; Simard *et al.*, 1997b), interpretations are split between those suggesting retention of labelled carbon by fungi within their biomass (Graves et al., 1997; Fitter et al., 113 114 1998; Wu et al., 2001) and those indicating small (Simard et al., 1997a; Teste et al., 2010; 115 Philip et al., 2010) or large (Klein et al., 2016) degrees of carbon transfer through fungal 116 mycelium and into plant biomass. The transfer of carbon between plants may also occur via 117 uptake of root exudates along an 'exudation-dissolved organic carbon-mycorrhizal hyphae' 118 pathway (Robinson & Fitter, 1999), and these hypotheses regarding the mechanism of transfer 119 need not be mutually exclusive. In this experiment we established a size-hierarchy between 120 seedlings of different ages together in the same pot, separated by a mesh barrier to prevent 121 direct root interaction, and labelling the larger (older) seedling with <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub>.

Pickles et al.

#### **New Phytologist**

122 A small number of stable isotope probing (SIP) studies, in which a plant is exposed to  $^{13}$ C-labelled CO<sub>2</sub> and the distribution of  $^{13}$ C-photosynthate is examined after a specific time 123 124 period, have investigated interconnections between the Pinaceae and their EMF symbionts (see 125 Epron *et al.*, 2012). Here, for the first time in a paired seedling model system, we investigated 126 the fungal and microbial communities active in plant photosynthate assimilation and transfer, 127 applying SIP methods to quantify <sup>13</sup>C allocation to plant and fungal biomass and the 128 phospholipid fatty acids (PLFA) of plants, fungi, and bacteria (Boschker et al., 1998). Our 129 study examined paired interior Douglas-fir seedlings with the following objectives: (i) to 130 quantify the distribution of <sup>13</sup>C-labeled photosynthate throughout plant and soil carbon pools 131 and within microbial biomass, (ii) to determine the proportion of carbon transferred (if any) 132 between seedlings by EMF symbionts, and (iii) to determine whether relatedness has a role in 133 carbon transfer between conifer seedlings.

134

### 135 Materials and methods

136 Seed and soil

137 Seeds from four 'families' (cross-bred from four different pairs of known parents) of 138 interior Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziesii (Mirb.) Franco var. glauca (Beissn.) Franco) were 139 sourced from the B.C. Ministry of Forests, Lands, and Natural Resource Operations 140 (Kalamalka Research Station, B.C.). To encourage EMF colonization, seeds were grown in a 141 soil mixture with the following specifications: 1:1 mix (approximately 3.4 L total) of 142 autoclaved potting soil (1.7 L 1:1 mix of peat to perlite) and forest soil (1.7 L). Forest soil was 143 classified as Dystric Brunisol (Inceptisol in U.S. soil taxonomy) with moderate humus and 144 sandy loam texture (Soil Classification Working Group, 1998). Soil was collected from two 145 sub-locations within a mono-specific interior Douglas-fir stand (120.58°W, 49.43°N) in the 146 Dry, Cool Interior Douglas-fir (IDFdk) biogeoclimatic subzone (Pojar et al., 1987). Following 147 the removal of the litter layer, the fermentation layer, humus layer, and mineral soil were 148 sampled to a total depth of 10-15 cm. Large debris was removed during collection and soil 149 was homogenised in clean conditions before sub-sampling to create experimental units. 150

## 151 Experimental design and seedling growth

Each experimental unit was a 3.8 L pot containing a pair of seedlings of different ages to establish a carbon gradient, which were spaced approximately 8 cm apart and separated by a nylon mesh bag (Plastok® Meshes and Filtration Ltd., Birkenhead, UK). One 'donor' seedling was established from seed planted in March 2012 in the 805 g (11.9 s.e.m.) dry weight soil 156 outside the mesh bag. One 'recipient' seedling was established from seed planted in November 157 2012 inside the 8 x 18 cm mesh bag containing 403 g (5.9 s.e.m.) dry weight soil. Seedlings 158 were grown in a glasshouse without supplementary light or fertiliser, in order to encourage 159 mycorrhizal formation. Pots were watered to field capacity once per week following an early 160 germination period of light daily watering. A fine gravel layer was applied to soil surfaces to 161 discourage infection and mortality by pathogenic soil fungi (e.g. Fusarium, Phytophthora, 162 *Pythium*, *Rhizoctonia*; colloquially called 'damping off' fungi). Harvesting took place in the 163 first week of February 2013, when donor and recipient seedlings were 11 and 3 months old, 164 respectively (Asay, 2013).

165 Seedling relatedness was manipulated through seed origin: seedling pairs were either 166 full siblings (same parents; 'kin') or non-siblings (different parents; 'non-kin'). Kin seed was 167 obtained from four pairs of parent trees to assess whether any relatedness effects were a 168 general observation or family specific. Sufficient seed was provided to establish 10 kin pairs 169 from each of the four sets of parents (n=40). Non-kin seed was more readily available so 170 additional pairs were planted (n=60). Hyphal connection was manipulated via mesh bags: 171 seedling pairs were separated by a root-blocking barrier that either allowed the passage of EMF 172 hyphae (35  $\mu$ m mesh) or was expected to restrict or prevent the passage of EMF hyphae (0.5 um) (Teste et al. (2006). Mesh sizes were divided equally among the relatedness treatments 173 174 resulting in the following experimental factors: kin-unrestricted (n=20), kin-restricted (n=20), 175 non-kin-unrestricted (n=30), non-kin-restricted (n=30).

176

## 177 $^{l3}CO_2$ isotope labelling

Donor plants were pulse-labelled with 99 atom% <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> eleven months after they 178 179 were established in pots. Surviving pairs in each treatment were assigned to subsequent analyses as follows. To estimate the initial uptake and fixation of <sup>13</sup>C-label, we assessed 180 181 incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-photosynthate into plant and fungal biomass 1 day after labelling ("1-day 182 chase"): non-kin-unrestricted (n=3), non-kin-restricted (n=3), non-labelled controls (n=3). To examine the transfer and incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-photosynthate into biomass 6 days after labelling 183 184 ("6-day chase"): kin-unrestricted (n=9), kin-restricted (n=8), non-kin-unrestricted (n=10), non-185 kin-restricted (n=10). Unlabelled controls consisted of kin-unrestricted (n=9), kin-restricted 186 (n=8), non-kin-unrestricted (n=7), non-kin-restricted (n=7). 187 Immediately before labelling, all donor seedlings were sealed using Tuck® Contractors

188 Sheathing Tape inside plastic Foodsaver® vacuum bags (6 L). Bags were fitted with an 189 injection valve and inflated with ambient air. Non-labelled control seedlings were bagged in Pickles et al.

#### **New Phytologist**

190 the same manner and stored with a minimum separation distance of 4 m from the nearest labelled seedling. Three injections of <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> were received by labelled seedlings at equal 191 time intervals through the 10 h pulse period, totalling 50 mL of <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> (with maximum 192 193 concentrations of 2500-3000 ppm). An additional seedling was used to monitor bag  $CO_2$ 194 concentration using a portable infrared gas analyser (Qubit Systems, Kingston, Canada). 195 Ambient greenhouse CO<sub>2</sub> levels (394 ppm) were checked prior to labelling, 5 h after labelling, 196 and 10 h after labelling and showed no significant variation. After the final pulse, when bag 197 CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations had dropped below 300 ppm, labelling bags were removed. 198

199 Sampling of plant and soil pools

200 Eleven distinct plant and soil pools were examined in this experiment, with donor (D) 201 and recipient (R) seedling samples collected as described in Figure 1. Due to growth stage 202 differences between donor and recipient seedlings, root sections were collected from donor 203 transport fine roots (McCormack et al., 2015) and the recipient's main tap root, which were of 204 equivalent diameter and structure (i.e. no absorptive fine roots were included in these samples). 205 Samples were kept on dry ice after weighing, and stored at -80 °C. All fine root tips were 206 sampled from each seedling, morphotyped based on ectomycorrhizal structures or their absence 207 (Goodman et al., 1998), then counted and weighed prior to subsampling for fungal 208 identification via amplified internal transcribed spacer (ITS) sequences. All root tips from six 209 plant pairs were kept on dry ice after weighing, and stored at -80 °C. Soil for PLFA analyses 210 was immediately frozen in liquid nitrogen before storage at -80 °C. Samples were lyophilized 211 prior to DNA or PLFA extraction and isotopic analysis. Remaining plant biomass from each 212 pool was oven-dried and weighed.

213

214 Isotopic measurements

215 Total carbon and nitrogen content and carbon isotopic composition of samples were 216 measured with combustion analysis using an elemental analyzer (Elementar, Hanau, Germany) 217 in C, N mode, interfaced with an isotope-ratio mass spectrometer (IRMS; Isoprime, Cheadle, UK). Samples were considered enriched if their  $\delta^{13}$ C value was greater than the upper 99% 218 confidence interval of the control mean  $\delta^{13}$ C (natural abundance) and all control sample  $\delta^{13}$ C 219 values. Atom %<sup>13</sup>C excess was calculated for each pool as per Leake *et al.* (2006). Teste *et al.*'s 220 (2009) modification of Boutton's (1991) isotopic calculations was applied to convert  $\delta^{13}$ C into 221 222 "excess  $^{13}$ C" as  $^{12}$ C-equivalent (mg), the mass of labelled carbon compensating for the one Dalton difference in mass of  $^{12}$ C. 223

224	Isotopic composition of PLFAs was analysed using gas chromatography-IRMS,
225	following extraction according to Bligh & Dyer (1959), as detailed in Churchland et al. (2013),
226	with the following exceptions: (i) methyl undecanoate (c11:0) was the internal standard, and
227	(ii) quantitation was performed based on average values derived from serial dilution of
228	undecanoate, nonadecanoate (c19:0), and methyl cis-13-docosenoate (c22:1 $\omega$ 9). Peak
229	identification was based on retention time compared to two reference standards: bacterial acid
230	methyl-ester standard 47080-0 (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, USA) and a 37-Component fatty
231	acid methyl-ester mix (47885-U). Unidentifiable <sup>13</sup> C-enriched peaks were included in analysis
232	if they met the following conditions: i) detection in > 3 samples, ii) average $\delta^{13}$ C > +50 ‰.
233	Taxonomic affiliations of specific PLFAs were assigned as per Högberg et al. (2013), with
234	c18:1 $\omega$ 9 and c18:3 $\omega$ 6 added as fungal markers, according to Ruess & Chamberlain (2010).
235	
236	Fine root tip fungal DNA extraction-sequencing
237	Fungal DNA was extracted from multiple representative root tips of each EMF
238	morphotype, from which adhering soil had been carefully removed, using ITS1 (White et al.,
239	1990) and ITS4/ITS4B primers (Gardes & Bruns, 1993) following the protocol provided in
240	Supporting Methods S1. Raw sequence data were analysed using SEQUENCHER Version 3.0
241	(Gene Codes Corp., Ann Arbor, USA) and converted into FASTA format prior to comparison
242	with the UNITE database (Kõljalg et al., 2013), using the BLAST algorithm to identify each
243	fungal species. Sequence data were deposited in the GenBank database as accession numbers
244	KT314836 to KT314861. Three samples from the rhizosphere soil partition were selected for
245	metatranscriptomic sequencing to assess activity of root-associated communities (Supporting

- 246 Methods S2).
- 247

### 248 Statistical analyses

249 All analyses were performed using R 3.2.3 (R Core Team, 2015) unless otherwise 250 stated. Data was square root or log<sub>10</sub> transformed where necessary to meet parametric 251 assumptions, with highly influential data points (> 3 st. dev. from the treatment median) treated 252 as statistical outliers and removed prior to analysis. Differences between treatments in the excess <sup>13</sup>C content of recipient pools were assessed by fitting linear mixed models in R-253 254 packages "nlme" (Pinheiro et al., 2016) and "lme4" (Bates et al., 2015). The fixed factors in 255 each model were: seedling relatedness (kin or non-kin), hyphal restriction (35 µm or 0.5 µm), recipient family (A, B, C, or D), and their two-way interactions. In all models, donor family 256 was included as a random factor. The response variables examined were "excess <sup>13</sup>C as <sup>12</sup>C 257

8

#### **New Phytologist**

258 equivalent" of the R<sub>bulk</sub>, R<sub>rhizosphere</sub>, R<sub>ECM</sub>, and R<sub>root</sub> pools. Model fit was determined using Rpackage "piecewiseSEM" (Lefcheck, 2016). Standardised coefficients, a measure of 259 260 standardised effect size (SES) (Schielzeth, 2010), were estimated for each model (regression 261 coefficients divided by two times their standard deviation). Linear models were used to assess whether excess <sup>13</sup>C in kin and non-kin recipient 262 pools displayed different relationships to potentially explanatory biological factors (D<sub>shoot</sub><sup>13</sup>C-263 enrichment, D<sub>ECM</sub> <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment, D<sub>ECM</sub> abundance). SES was measured using Cohen's d 264 265 (Cohen, 1988). False discovery rate (FDR) correction (Verhoeven et al., 2005) was applied 266 where data was regressed against multiple factors. Enriched fungal biomass (<sup>13</sup>C per g tissue dry weight) was calculated by converting 267 268 from mg enriched fungal PLFAs, using the conversion factor provided by Joergensen & 269 Wichern (2008). Average carbon incorporation into fungal biomass was calculated for  $D_{ECM}$ (reflecting the hartig net, mantle, and extramatrical mycelium of EMF) and D<sub>root</sub> (to account for 270 271 the presence of fungal endophytes and any potential extension of EMF hyphae into transport 272 fine roots; see Kaiser et al., 2010).

273 Seedling EMF community data was examined with the Sørensen (Bray-Curtis) distance 274 measure using nonparametric multi-dimensional scaling (NMDS) and multi-response

275 permutation procedures (MRPP) in PC-Ord 5 (MjM Software, Gleneden Beach, USA).

All data used in this analysis, along with a custom script for processing SIP-PLFA data,
can be found at the stable URL: https://github.com/roli-wilhelm.

278

## 279 Results

280 Partitioning of <sup>13</sup>C-labeled photosynthate

Every plant and soil pool exhibited elevated levels of <sup>13</sup>C-labelled carbon relative to the natural abundance in unlabelled controls (Table 1). No significant differences in  $\delta^{13}$ C were

283 observed among unlabelled controls. <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment of R<sub>shoot</sub>, the most distant pool from donor

284 plants, was significant in 4 kin and 2 non-kin samples (6/37). The decrease in <sup>13</sup>C-labelled

 $\label{eq:shoot} 285 \quad \mbox{carbon, from $D_{shoot}$ to $R_{shoot}$, revealed the scope and scale of carbon flow through the} $$$ 

- 286 belowground system (Table 1; Supplementary Figure S1a). As expected, in each plant D<sub>ECM</sub>
- and  $R_{ECM}$  contained significantly more <sup>13</sup>C-labelled carbon as a percentage of their total carbon
- 288 content compared to all other pools, illustrating their assimilation of this carbon

289 (Supplementary Figure S1b).

290 Of the total mass of pulsed <sup>13</sup>C-labelled carbon (29.02 mg), approximately 75.4% 291 (21.88 mg) was fixed in donor plant tissue after the 1-day chase. Following the 6-day chase period, approximately 44.1% (9.64 mg) of the fixed label (33.2% of the pulse) was detected

293 across all biomass pools. The total transfer to measured belowground and recipient pools was 294 approximately 12% of the <sup>13</sup>C-label fixed, amounting to 26.8% of the total <sup>13</sup>C-label detected 295 in the 6-day chase. For an account of all individual pools see Table 1. The remaining 296 unaccounted <sup>13</sup>C-label was either not fixed or fixed and respired during the labelling period. 297 A strong inverse relationship was observed between  $D_{shoot} \delta^{13}C$  and donor biomass ( $r^2 =$ 298 0.66, P < 0.001), while the total mass of excess <sup>13</sup>C in  $D_{shoot}$  did not vary significantly with 299 donor biomass ( $r^2 < 0.01$ , P = 0.29). Thus larger plants had a lower <sup>13</sup>C-content relative to total

300 301

292

#### 302 Role of seedling relatedness and ectomycorrhizal hyphae in carbon transfer

seedling biomass than smaller plants.

303 Analysis using linear mixed models revealed a seedling relatedness effect on R<sub>root</sub> excess <sup>13</sup>C, with the significant model interaction term revealing variation between the four 304 recipient families (Table 2). Significantly greater R<sub>root</sub> excess <sup>13</sup>C was observed in kin 305 306 recipients from families A and B than in non-kin recipients (Fig. 2a), whereas there was no significant difference based on relatedness in families C and D. In terms of  $\mu g$  excess <sup>13</sup>C this 307 represented a 3-fold increase in kin of family A (kin mean 5.7 µg; non-kin mean 1.9 µg), and a 308 309 4-fold increase in kin of family B (kin mean 5.6 µg; non-kin mean 1.4 µg). Carbon transfer to 310 other recipient pools was not significantly different between relatedness treatments (Table 2). Linear regression analysis revealed that  $R_{root} \delta^{13}C$  enrichment increased with increasing  $D_{ECM}$ 311 abundance in kin pairs only (Fig. 3a). In both kin and non-kin pairs,  $R_{\text{bulk}} \delta^{13}C$  enrichment 312 increased with increasing D<sub>ECM</sub> abundance (both:  $r^2 = 0.34$ , kin: P = 0.014; non-kin: P =313 0.007). In kin pairs only,  $R_{ECM}$  excess <sup>13</sup>C was positively associated with that of both  $D_{ECM}$ 314 315 (Fig. 3b) and D<sub>shoot</sub> (Fig. 3c). 316 Hyphal exclusion did not reduce colonisation of recipient roots, or significantly reduce 317 overall sub-surface carbon transfer. However, analysis using linear mixed models (Table 2) indicated a reduction in  $R_{\text{bulk}}$  excess <sup>13</sup>C with hyphal exclusion in recipient family D (SES = 318 0.60-0.66), and reduced  $R_{rhizosphere}$  excess <sup>13</sup>C among kin recipients in families C (SES = 0.58) 319 and D (SES = 0.62). Conversely, increased  $R_{root}$  excess <sup>13</sup>C with hyphal exclusion was 320 321 observed for kin in recipient family A and regardless of relatedness in family D (Fig. 2b).

- 322 Carbon transfer to other recipient pools did not differ between mesh treatments (Table 2).
- To assess whether the observed relatedness effects could be due to differences in belowground biomass allocation between families, the same linear mixed models were performed for donor and recipient root: shoot ratio, and the biomass of D<sub>root</sub>, R<sub>root</sub>, D<sub>ECM</sub> and

Page 11 of 31

Pickles et al.

#### **New Phytologist**

R<sub>ECM</sub>. The only significant factor across these models was that family C exhibited a lower root:
shoot ratio than the other three families. No other fixed or interactive factors proved to be
significant (data not shown).

329

## 330 Assimilation of <sup>13</sup>C-photosynthate by the microbial community

Total <sup>13</sup>C-incorporation into PLFAs in all pools amounted to 1% of belowground 331 carbon transfer (0.023 mg <sup>13</sup>C in PLFAs / 2.31 mg total <sup>13</sup>C transferred). Fungal PLFA <sup>13</sup>C-332 enrichment was 5.57 mg fungal C g<sup>-1</sup> dry weight in D<sub>ECM</sub> and 1.97 mg fungal C g<sup>-1</sup> dry weight 333 in D<sub>root</sub>. Estimated D<sub>ECM</sub> PLFA <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment was strongly correlated with <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment of 334 335  $D_{FCM}$  tissue ( $r^2 = 0.844$ , P < 0.001), and  $D_{FCM}$  PLFAs contained the highest total excess <sup>13</sup>C measured (Supplementary Figure S2). The D<sub>root</sub> pool contained the next highest level of PLFA 336 <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment, originating from the plant root and associated fungi and bacteria. Fungal 337 PLFA markers were the most  $^{13}$ C-enriched in all pools, containing  $\sim 70\%$  of assimilated  $^{13}$ C-338 label. The second most <sup>13</sup>C-enriched taxonomic group were the 'higher eukaryotes,' a 339 340 heterogeneous category of long-chain fatty acids, indistinguishable between fungi, plants, and 341 other eukaryotic species. 342 Microbes closely associated with host roots were less diverse than those in soil ( $\sim 27$ 343 PLFAs), based on the average number of enriched PLFAs (D<sub>root</sub>: 12, D<sub>ECM</sub>: 9, R<sub>ECM</sub>: 13). 344 Differences between root-associated and soil-associated communities were evident in <sup>13</sup>C-345 enriched PLFA profiles (Supplementary Figure S3) and unidentified fatty acid profiles 346 (Supplementary Figure S4). The D<sub>coarse</sub> community was the most distinct, displaying increased 347 <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment of medium-length fatty acids between  $c14:0 - c16:1\omega9$ . Fungi assimilated the vast majority of photosynthate based on total <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment of PLFAs; however, other 348 349 taxonomic groups in the rhizosphere exhibited substantial assimilation rates (Fig. 4). In the D<sub>root</sub> pool bacteria incorporated <sup>13</sup>C-label at rates comparable to that of fungi (i.e. relative to 350 their biomass). Gram-negative bacteria assimilated significant amounts of <sup>13</sup>C-exudate across 351 352 all donor pools in every sample assayed, whereas gram-positive bacteria did not assimilate

- 353 detectable <sup>13</sup>C-exudate in ectomycorrhizal pools.
- 354

355 Fungal root-tip community

356 Seedlings were primarily colonised by *Rhizopogon vinicolor*, and an ectomycorrhizal

357 Pyronemataceae sp. (Table 3), both of which were also detected in a preliminary

358 metatranscriptomic analysis of three rhizosphere soil samples (Supporting Methods S1 and Fig.

359 S5). The abundance of these EMF species on recipient seedlings was positively related to their

360 abundance on donor seedlings regardless of treatment. MRPP analysis following NMDS

- 361 ordination (Supporting Fig. S6) revealed that the only significant difference between EMF
- 362 communities was weak and occurred between donor and recipient seedlings, rather than
- 363 treatments (A = 0.131, P < 0.001; where A > 0.3 is considered an ecologically relevant effect).
- 364 Notably, in the sole case where a plant lacked *Rhizopogon* sp. ectomycorrhizas, <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment
- 365 was not detected in recipient pools.
- 366

#### 367 Discussion

368 Fungi dominated the assimilation of photosynthetic carbon in all belowground experimental pools, with ectomycorrhizal fungi serving as major agents of carbon transfer. 369 370 EMF incorporation of photosynthate from host plants is hypothesised to be a major factor in 371 carbon sequestration in coniferous forests (Clemmensen et al., 2013). An estimated 26.8% of the <sup>13</sup>C-label remaining in the system was recovered from belowground pools (primarily donor 372 373 roots), of which 6.3% was assimilated by, or transferred through, EMF. Carbon transfer from 374 donor to recipient seedlings was significantly greater to sibling roots than non-sibling roots in 375 two of the Douglas-fir families, indicating a host relatedness effect that was most likely mediated by EMF. The transfer of <sup>13</sup>C-label in the presence of a hyphae-restricting mesh 376 implies that labile <sup>13</sup>C-compounds were exuded into soil by donor roots and/or EMF, before 377 378 being taken up by recipient hyphae. Overall we observed that a diverse microbial community 379 was actively assimilating <sup>13</sup>C-labeled photosynthate.

380

#### 381 Scale and significance of belowground partitioning of Douglas-fir photosynthate

382 Carbon allocation to donor plant root and ectomycorrhzial root tip biomass (~23% of 383 the total recovered) was within the range of previously estimated allocation values for 384 ectomycorrhizal seedlings of other species: Norway spruce, Scots pine, and silver birch (13-385 24%; Pumpanen et al., 2008), Scots pine (31%; Heinonsalo et al., 2010), and willow (47%; Durall et al., 1994). Furthermore, <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment of fungal-specific PLFAs indicated 386

- 387 significant carbon allocation to fungi within donor transport fine roots, most likely attributable
- 388 to intra-root EMF biomass (Kaiser et al., 2010) and/or fungal endophytes.

389 Mycorrhizal networks in mature forests can be extensive (Beiler et al., 2010), offering 390 the potential for substantial carbon transfer among plants. Yet the net benefit of seedling-to-391 seedling carbon transfer remains poorly understood. Previous research indicates that EMF and 392

- their mycorrhizal networks mediate the transfer of variable amounts of carbon (Simard et al.,
- 393 1997a; Teste et al., 2009; Philip et al., 2010), water (Allen, 2007; Plamboeck et al., 2007;

Page 13 of 31

Pickles et al.

#### **New Phytologist**

394 Bingham & Simard, 2011), and nitrogen (He et al., 2003; Read & Perez-Moreno, 2003; Teste 395 et al., 2009) between plants. The quantities of seedling-seedling carbon transfer measured in 396 our experiment (~0.1% of total recovered <sup>13</sup>C-label across all pools) and elsewhere (Teste et 397 al., 2009, 2010) are small, and unlikely to represent a substantial nutritional source. However, 398 research on the EMF host-symbiont interface reveals that EMF produce signalling compounds, 399 which are translocated into plant cell nuclei. For example, Laccaria bicolor produces the 400 MiSSP7 protein, which alters the host transcriptome to promote ectomycorrhizal formation and 401 reduce jasmonic acid production (Plett et al., 2011, 2014). Our observations may therefore 402 represent the transfer of signalling compounds through a fungal mycelium, or their uptake by 403 roots or fungal hyphae following exudation. The stimulation of physiological responses in 404 recipient plants by potential signalling compounds has previously been observed in arbuscular 405 mycorrhizal systems (Babikova et al., 2013; Song et al., 2014) and EMF systems involving 406 interior Douglas-fir and ponderosa pine (Song et al., 2015).

407

#### 408 *Host relatedness*

409 Intriguingly, kin pairs exhibited increased carbon transfer to the R<sub>root</sub> pool in two of the four Douglas-fir families, with excess <sup>13</sup>C in those families 3 to 4-fold greater than in non-kin 410 pairings. The absolute quantities of increased excess <sup>13</sup>C involved in this relatedness effect 411 412 were small (+ 4  $\mu$ g), but represented a large proportion of total recipient plant excess <sup>13</sup>C 413 content (overall recipient plant mean: 6.4 µg). The strong positive relationship between R<sub>root</sub> 414  $\delta^{13}$ C and D<sub>ECM</sub> abundance in kin pairs demonstrated that the genetic relatedness effect on 415 carbon transfer involved donor plant EMF. This was further reinforced by the positive relationships between excess  ${}^{13}$ C in the R<sub>ECM</sub> pool and both the D<sub>shoot</sub> and D<sub>ECM</sub> pools in kin 416 417 pairs. Further investigation is required, but we propose that the establishment of an 418 ectomycorrhizal symbiosis between an individual fungal mycelium and a host plant may 419 increase both the likelihood that the fungus will successfully colonise other hosts of a similar 420 genotype, and the efficiency of carbon transfer through its mycelium. In our system, 421 *Rhizopogon* spp. and the ectomycorrhizal Pyronemataceae sp. are the most likely candidate 422 fungi due to their abundance on seedling roots and their detected activity in soil 423 metatranscriptomes. We further hypothesise that increased carbon transfer among kin 424 seedlings may have resulted from (i) increased inter-root EMF biomass between compatible 425 host genotypes (Rosado et al., 1994a,b; Dudley et al., 2013), and/or (ii) increased inter-root 426 activity due to increased transfer of signalling compounds and/or micronutrients (Plett et al., 427 2011; Babikova *et al.*, 2013). Alternative explanations for the observed carbon transfer are

428 certainly possible, but would have to account for the significant interaction between relatedness
429 and family (e.g., differences in belowground carbon allocation between families would not
430 explain why increased transfer of <sup>13</sup>C to roots in families A and B only occurred in the
431 presence of kin).

432

### 433 Hyphal restriction

Transfer of <sup>13</sup>C-carbon to recipient pools occurred regardless of hyphal exclusion, 434 demonstrating that <sup>13</sup>C-compounds can be transferred in the absence of a direct linkage 435 436 between mycorrhizal hyphae (e.g. Robinson & Fitter, 1999). Carbon transfer was clearly 437 associated with mycorrhizas, since: (i) exclusion reduced transfer to bulk soil in some of the 438 recipient families; (ii) donor and recipient EMF abundance was positively associated for 439 several EMF species; (iii) D<sub>ECM</sub> abundance was associated with enrichment of recipient pools; and (iv)  $D_{ECM}$  and  $R_{ECM}$  biomass contained proportionally more <sup>13</sup>C-label than all other pools. 440 Previous studies similarly reported small quantities of <sup>13</sup>C transfer across a 0.5 µm mesh in 441 442 both ectomycorrhizal (Teste et al., 2009; Philip et al., 2010; Deslippe & Simard, 2011) and 443 arbuscular mycorrhizal (Fitter et al., 1998) systems. Thus, the mesh-bagging treatment may not 444 be effective for preventing mycorrhizal-mediated carbon transfer. This is potentially due to: (i) recipient EMF hyphae scavenging donor <sup>13</sup>C-exudates that diffused through the mesh 445 446 (Robinson & Fitter, 1999; Johnson & Gilbert, 2015), (ii) hyphae fusing across the mesh, or (iii) 447 hyphae breaching the mesh, possibly degrading it via secreted organic acids (Plassard & 448 Fransson, 2009). No breaches were observed in our experiment, but consistent with 449 possibilities (i) and (ii), there were regions of mesh with adjacent patches of hyphae on either 450 side. Future experiments could employ the in-growth core rotation method (Johnson et al., 451 2001) to reduce the possibility of (ii) and (iii), although it is unlikely to prevent (i), which 452 represents an alternative belowground transfer pathway in natural systems (Simard et al. 453 1997b; Robinson & Fitter, 1999; Philip *et al.*, 2010; Deslippe & Simard, 2011). 454

455 Conclusions

456 Our stable isotope approach successfully elucidated the pattern and scale of

457 mycorrhiza-mediated carbon transfer between interior Douglas-fir seedlings, and the

458 incorporation of enriched carbon into microbial biomass. EMF symbionts, specifically

459 Rhizopogon spp. and Pyronemataceae sp., were the primary external beneficiaries of host-

460 derived photosynthate, and were able to take it up despite the presence of a hyphae-restricting

461 mesh. The small quantities of carbon transferred between seedlings suggest that it is unlikely

- to be an important nutritional source, although the timing and transfer of micronutrients or
- 463 signalling compounds may have a substantial ecological impact. We report evidence that
- 464 relatedness influences carbon transfer between donor and recipient plants, and that the presence
- 465 of this effect varied between families, raising the possibility of a mosaic of relatedness effects
- 466 at larger scales. These findings require further exploration in the field, however, the
- 467 implications for forest ecology are substantial.
- 468

### 469 **Conflict of interest statement**

- 470 The authors declare no conflict of interest.
- 471

## 472 Acknowledgements

- 473 We thank Melissa Dergousoff and Scott Besse for sustained lab assistance, and Matthew
- 474 Zustovic, Aaron Zwiebel, Hilary Leung, and Julia Maddison for lab and greenhouse
- 475 contributions; Alice Chang provided advice on EA-IRMS analysis; Spencer Reitenbach
- 476 provided the seeds used in this experiment. We also thank Ian Dickie and three anonymous
- 477 referees for their comments on an earlier version of this manuscript. This project was funded by
- 478 an NSERC Strategic Project grant, with individual support provided to A.S.H., R.W., and
- 479 A.K.A., by NSERC and UBC scholarships.
- 480

## 481 Author contributions

- 482 A.K.A. and S.W.S. planned the seedling kin-recognition experiment, which A.K.A. performed.
- 483 B.J.P., R.W., and S.W.S. designed the SIP experiment, with B.J.P. analysing the excess <sup>13</sup>C data
- 484 and implementing all experimental models, and R.W. analysing the  $\delta^{13}$ C data. R.W. and
- 485 W.W.M. planned the analysis of <sup>13</sup>C-labelled PLFA, which R.W. performed and analysed.
- 486 B.J.P. and A.K.A. collected the EMF colonisation data, which B.J.P. analysed. A.S.H. generated
- 487 the metatranscriptome data, which A.S.H. and R.W. analysed. A.K.A., B.J.P., R.W., and A.S.H.
- 488 performed the experiments. B.J.P. led the writing of the manuscript with significant
- 489 contributions from R.W. All authors reviewed and commented on the manuscript.

490

## 491 Supporting Information

- 492 Additional supporting information may be found in the online version of this article.
- 493 Supporting Methods S1. EMF DNA extraction and Sanger sequencing details.
- 494 Supporting Methods S2. Metatranscriptome analysis extraction-sequencing details.
- 495 **Supporting Figure S1.** Boxplots of excess <sup>13</sup>C; a) biomass, b) proportion.

- 496 **Supporting Figure S2.** Incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-label by microbial groups.
- 497 **Supporting Figure S3.** PLFA profiles of root and soil pools.
- 498 **Supporting Figure S4.** Profiles of unidentified PLFAs in root and soil pools.
- 499 Supporting Figure S5. Metatranscriptomic data based on Silva taxonomy.
- 500 Supporting Figure S6. NMDS ordination of seedling root tip fungal communities.
- 501
- 502 **References**
- 503 Allen MF. 2007. Mycorrhizal Fungi: Highways for Water and Nutrients in Arid Soils. Vadose
- 504 Zone Journal 6: 291–297.
- 505 Asay AK. 2013. Mycorrhizal facilitation of kin recognition in interior Douglas-fir
- 506 (Pseudotsuga menziesii var. glauca). M.Sc. Thesis. University of British Columbia,
- 507 Vancouver, BC, Canada.
- 508 Averill C, Turner BL, Finzi AC. 2014. Mycorrhiza-mediated competition between plants and
- 509 decomposers drives soil carbon storage. *Nature* **505**: 543–545.
- 510 Babikova Z, Gilbert L, Bruce T, Birkett M, Caulfield J, Woodcock C, Pickett J, Johnson
- 511 D. 2013. Underground signals carried through common mycelial networks warn neighbouring
- 512 plants of aphid attack. *Ecology Letters* **16**: 835–843.
- 513 Bardgett RD, Manning P, Morrien E, De Vries FT. 2013. Hierarchical responses of plant -
- 514 soil interactions to climate change : consequences for the global carbon cycle. *Journal of*
- 515 *Ecology* **101**: 334–343.
- 516 Bates D, Mächler M, Bolker B, Walker S. 2015. Fitting Linear Mixed-Effects Models Using
- 517 Ime4. Journal of Statistical Software 67: 1–48.
- 518 Beiler KJ, Durall DM, Simard SW, Maxwell SA, Kretzer AM. 2010. Architecture of the
- wood-wide web: *Rhizopogon* spp. genets link multiple Douglas-fir cohorts. *New Phytologist* **185**: 543–553.
- 521 Bingham MA, Simard SW. 2011. Do mycorrhizal network benefits to survival and growth of
- 522 interior Douglas-fir seedlings increase with soil moisture stress? *Ecology and Evolution* 1:
- 523 306-316.
- 524 Bligh E, Dyer W. 1959. A rapid method of total lipid extraction and purification. *Canadian*
- 525 Journal of Biochemistry and Physics 37: 911–917.
- 526 Boschker HTS, Nold SC, Wellsbury P, Bos D, de Graaf W, Pel R, Parkes RJ, Cappenberg
- 527 **TE**. **1998**. Direct linking of microbial populations to specific biogeochemical processes by <sup>13</sup>C-
- 528 labelling of biomarkers. *Nature* **392**: 801–805.
- 529 Boutton T. 1991. Stable carbon isotope ratios of natural materials: I. sample preparation and

- 530 mass spectrometric analysis. In: Coleman DC, Fry B, eds. Carbon isotope techniques. San
- 531 Diego: Academic Press, 155–171.
- 532 Brundrett MC. 2009. Mycorrhizal associations and other means of nutrition of vascular
- 533 plants: Understanding the global diversity of host plants by resolving conflicting information
- and developing reliable means of diagnosis. *Plant and Soil* **320**: 37–77.
- 535 Churchland C, Grayston SJ, Bengtson P. 2013. Spatial variability of soil fungal and
- 536 bacterial abundance: Consequences for carbon turnover along a transition from a forested to
- 537 clear-cut site. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 63: 5–13.
- 538 Clemmensen KE, Bahr A, Ovaskainen O, Dahlberg A, Ekblad A, Wallander H, Stenlid J,
- 539 Finlay RD, Wardle DA, Lindahl BD. 2013. Roots and Associated Fungi Drive Long-Term
- 540 Carbon Sequestration in Boreal Forest. *Science* **339**: 1615–1618.
- 541 Cohen J. 1988. Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences. Hillsdale, NJ, USA:
- 542 Lawrence Earlbaum Associates.
- 543 Deslippe JR, Simard SW. 2011. Below-ground carbon transfer among Betula nana may
- 544 increase with warming in Arctic tundra. *New Phytologist* **192**: 689–698.
- 545 De Deyn GB, Cornelissen JHC, Bardgett RD. 2008. Plant functional traits and soil carbon
- 546 sequestration in contrasting biomes. *Ecology Letters* **11**: 516–531.
- 547 Dudley SA, Murphy GP, File AL. 2013. Kin recognition and competition in plants.
- 548 Functional Ecology 27: 898–906.
- 549 **Durall D, Jones MD, Tinker PB**. **1994**. Allocation of <sup>14</sup>C-Carbon in ectomycorrhizal willow.
- 550 New Phytologist **128**: 109–114.
- 551 Epron D, Bahn M, Derrien D, Lattanzi FA, Pumpanen J, Gessler A, Högberg P, Maillard
- 552 P, Dannoura M, Gérant D, et al. 2012. Pulse-labelling trees to study carbon allocation
- 553 dynamics: a review of methods, current knowledge and future prospects. *Tree Physiology* **32**:
- 554 776–798.
- 555 File AL, Klironomos J, Maherali H, Dudley SA. 2012. Plant Kin Recognition Enhances
- 556 Abundance of Symbiotic Microbial Partner. *PLoS ONE* 7: 15–17.
- 557 Finlay RD, Read DJ. 1986. The Structure and Function of the Vegetative Mycelium of
- 558 Ectomycorrhizal Plants . I . Translocation of <sup>14</sup>C-Labelled Carbon Between Plants
- 559 Interconnected by a Common Mycelium. *New Phytologist* **103**: 143–156.
- 560 Fitter AH, Graves JD, Watkins NK, Robinson D, Scrimgeour C. 1998. Carbon transfer
- between plants and its control in networks of arbuscular mycorrhizas. *Functional Ecology* **12**:
- 562 406-412.
- 563 Gardes M, Bruns TD. 1993. ITS primers with enhanced specificity for basidiomycetes-
  - 17

- application to the identification of mycorrhizae and rusts. *Molecular Ecology* **2**: 113–118.
- 565 Goodman D, Durall D, Trofymow T, Berch SM. 1998. A manual of concise descriptions of
- 566 North American ectomycorrhizae. *Mycorrhiza* **8**: 57–59.
- 567 Graf F, Frei M. 2013. Soil aggregate stability related to soil density, root length, and
- 568 mycorrhiza using site-specific Alnus incana and Melanogaster variegatus s.l. Ecological
- 569 Engineering 57: 314–323.
- 570 Graves JD, Watkins NK, Fitter AH, Robinson D, Scrimgeour C. 1997. Intraspecific
- 571 transfer of carbon betwen plants linked by a common mycorrhial network. *Plant and Soil* 192:
- 572 153–159.
- 573 He X-H, Critchley C, Bledsoe C. 2003. Nitrogen Transfer Within and Between Plants
- 574 Through Common Mycorrhizal Networks (CMNs). Critical Reviews in Plant Sciences 22:
- 575 531–567.
- 576 Heinonsalo J, Pumpanen J, Rasilo T, Hurme K-R, Ilvesniemi H. 2010. Carbon partitioning
- 577 in ectomycorrhizal Scots pine seedlings. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* **42**: 1614–1623.
- 578 Hoffland E, Giesler R, Jongmans AG, Van Breemen N. 2003. Feldspar Tunneling by Fungi
- along Natural Productivity Gradients. *Ecosystems* 6: 739–746.
- 580 Högberg M, Högbom L, Kleja D. 2013. Soil microbial community indices as predictors of
- 581 soil solution chemistry and N leaching in Picea abies (L.) Karst. Forests in S. Sweden. Plant
- 582 and Soil **372**: 507–522.
- 583 Högberg P, Read DJ. 2006. Towards a more plant physiological perspective on soil ecology.
- 584 *Trends in ecology & evolution* **21**: 548–54.
- 585 Joergensen RG, Wichern F. 2008. Quantitative assessment of the fungal contribution to
- 586 microbial tissue in soil. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 40: 2977–2991.
- Johnson D, Gilbert L. 2015. Interplant signalling through hyphal networks. *New Phytologist*205: 1448–1453.
- 589 Johnson D, Leake J, Read D. 2001. Novel in-growth core system enables functional studies
- 590 of grassland mycorrhizal mycelial networks. *New Phytologist* **152**: 555–562.
- 591 Jones DL, Nguyen C, Finlay RD. 2009. Carbon flow in the rhizosphere: carbon trading at the
- soil-root interface. *Plant and Soil* **321**: 5–33.
- 593 Kaiser C, Frank A, Wild B, Koranda M, Richter A. 2010. Negligible contribution from
- roots to soil-borne phospholipid fatty acid fungal biomarkers 18:2ω6,9 and 18:1ω9. Soil
- 595 Biology & Biochemistry **42**: 1650–1652.
- 596 Kaiser C, Kilburn MR, Clode PL, Fuchslueger L, Koranda M, Cliff JB, Solaiman ZM,
- 597 Murphy D V. 2015. Exploring the transfer of recent plant photosynthates to soil microbes:

- 598 Mycorrhizal pathway vs direct root exudation. New Phytologist 205: 1537–1551.
- 599 Karst J, Jones MD, Turkington R. 2008. Ectomycorrhizal colonization and intraspecific
- 600 variation in growth responses of lodgepole pine. *Plant Ecology* **200**: 161–165.
- 601 Kashian D, Romme W, Tinker D, Turner M, Ryan M. 2013. Postfire changes in forest
- 602 carbon storage over a 300-year chronosequence of *Pinus contorta*-dominated forests.
- 603 Ecological Monographs 83: 49–66.
- 604 Klein T, Siegwolf RTW, Korner C. 2016. Belowground carbon trade among tall trees in a
- 605 temperate forest. *Science* **352**: 342–344.
- 606 Kõljalg U, Nilsson RH, Abarenkov K, Tedersoo L, Taylor A, Bahram M, Al E. 2013.
- 607 Towards a unified paradigm for sequence-based identification of fungi. *Molecular Ecology* 22:
- 608 5271–5277.
- 609 Leake JR, Ostle NJ, Rangel-Castro JI, Johnson D. 2006. Carbon fluxes from plants through
- 610 soil organisms determined by field <sup>13</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> pulse-labelling in an upland grassland. *Applied Soil*
- 611 *Ecology* **33**: 152–175.
- 612 Lefcheck JS. 2016. piecewiseSEM: Piecewise structural equation modelling in R for ecology,
- evolution, and systematics. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* **7**: 573–579.
- 614 Lorenz K, Lal R. 2010. Carbon Sequestration in Forest Ecosystems. New York: Springer
- 615 New York.
- 616 Luyssaert S, Inglima I, Jung M, Richardson AD, Reichstein M, Papale D, Piao SL,
- 617 Schulze ED, Wingate L, Matteucci G, et al. 2007. CO<sub>2</sub> balance of boreal, temperate, and
- 618 tropical forests derived from a global database. *Global Change Biology* **13**: 2509–2537.
- 619 McCormack ML, Dickie IA, Eissenstat DM, Fahey TJ, Fernandez CW, Guo D,
- 620 Helmisaari H-S, Hobbie EA, Iversen CM, Jackson RB, et al. 2015. Redefining fine roots
- 621 improves understanding of below-ground contributions to terrestrial biosphere processes. New
- 622 Phytologist 207: 505–518.
- 623 Nehls U, Grunze N, Willmann M, Reich M, Kuster H. 2007. Sugar for my honey:
- 624 Carbohydrate partitioning in ectomycorrhizal symbiosis. *Phytochemistry* **68**: 82–91.
- 625 Philip L, Simard S, Jones M. 2010. Pathways for below-ground carbon transfer between
- 626 paper birch and Douglas-fir seedlings. *Plant Ecology & Diversity* **3**: 221–233.
- 627 Phillips RP, Finzi AC, Bernhardt ES. 2011. Enhanced root exudation induces microbial
- 628 feedbacks to N cycling in a pine forest under long-term CO<sub>2</sub> fumigation. *Ecology Letters* 14:
- 629 187–194.
- 630 Phillips LA, Ward V, Jones MD. 2014. Ectomycorrhizal fungi contribute to soil organic
- 631 matter cycling in sub-boreal forests. *The ISME journal* **8**: 699–713.

- 632 Pinheiro J, Bates D, DebRoy S, Sarkar D, Team RC. 2016. nlme: Linear and Nonlinear
- 633 Mixed Effects Models. : R package version 3.1–128, http://cran.r-project.o.
- 634 Plamboeck AH, Dawson TE, Egerton-Warburton LM, North M, Bruns TD, Querejeta JI.
- 635 2007. Water transfer via ectomycorrhizal fungal hyphae to conifer seedlings. *Mycorrhiza* 17:
- 636 439–447.
- 637 Plassard C, Fransson P. 2009. Regulation of low-molecular weight organic acid production in
- 638 fungi. Fungal Biology Reviews 23: 30–39.
- 639 Plett JM, Daguerre Y, Wittulsky S, Vayssieres A, Deveau A, Melton SJ, Kohler A,
- 640 Morrell-Falvey JL, Brun A, Veneault-Fourrey C, et al. 2014. Effector MiSSP7 of the
- 641 mutualistic fungus Laccaria bicolor stabilizes the Populus JAZ6 protein and represses
- 642 jasmonic acid (JA) responsive genes. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 111:
- 643 8299–8304.
- 644 Plett JM, Kemppainen M, Kale SD, Kohler A, Legué V, Brun A, Tyler BM, Pardo AG,
- 645 Martin F. 2011. A Secreted Effector Protein of *Laccaria bicolor* Is Required for Symbiosis
- 646 Development. *Current Biology* **21**: 1197–1203.
- 647 Pojar J, Klinka K, Meidinger D. 1987. Biogeoclimatic ecosystem classification in British
- 648 Columbia. Forest Ecology and Management 22: 119–154.
- 649 Pumpanen JS, Heinonsalo J, Rasilo T, Hurme K-R, Ilvesniemi H. 2009. Carbon balance
- and allocation of assimilated  $CO_2$  in Scots pine, Norway spruce, and Silver birch seedlings
- determined with gas exchange measurements and 14C pulse labelling. *Trees* 23: 611–621.
- 652 R Core Team. 2015. R: a language and environment for statistical computing (H Fehske, R
- 653 Schneider, and A Weiße, Eds.). R Foundation for Statistical Computing: 409pp URL
- 654 http://www.R-project.org/.
- 655 Read DJ, Perez-Moreno J. 2003. Mycorrhizas and nutrient cycling in ecosystems a journey
- 656 towards relevance? *New Phytologist* **157**: 475–492.
- 657 Reichstein M. 2007. Impacts of climate change on forest soil carbon: principles, factors,
- models, uncertainties. In: Freer-Smith P, Broadmeadow M, Lynch J, eds. Forestry and climate
- 659 change. Wallingford: CAB International, 127–135.
- 660 Richter D deB, Billings SA. 2015. 'One physical system': Tansley's ecosystem as Earth's
- 661 critical zone. *New Phytologist* **206**: 900–912.
- 662 Rillig MC, Mummey DL. 2006. Mycorrhizas and soil structure. New Phytologist 171: 41–53.
- 663 Rineau F, Shah F, Smits MM, Persson P, Johansson T, Carleer R, Troein C, Tunlid A.
- 664 **2013**. Carbon availability triggers the decomposition of plant litter and assimilation of nitrogen
- by an ectomycorrhizal fungus. *The ISME journal* 7: 2010–2022.

- 666 Robinson D, Fitter AH. 1999. The magnitude and control of carbon transfer between plants
- 667 linked by a common mycorrhizal network. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **50**: 9–13.
- 668 Rosado S, Kropp B, Piché Y. 1994a. Genetics of ectomycorrhizal symbiosis. I. Host plant
- variability and heritability of ectomycorrhizal and root traits. New Phytologist 126: 105–110.
- 670 Rosado S, Kropp B, Piché Y. 1994b. Genetics of ectomycorrhizal symbiosis II. Fungal
- 671 variability and heritability of ectomycorrhizal traits. New Phytologist 126: 111–117.
- 672 Ruess L, Chamberlain P. 2010. The fat that matters: soil food web analysis using fatty acids
- and their carbon stable isotope signature. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 42: 1898–1910.
- 674 Schielzeth H. 2010. Simple means to improve the interpretability of regression coefficients.
- 675 *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* **1**: 103–113.
- 676 Selosse MA, Richard F, He X, Simard SW. 2006. Mycorrhizal networks: des liaisons
- 677 dangereuses? *Trends in Ecology and Evolution* **21**: 621–628.
- 678 Semchenko M, Saar S, Lepik A. 2014. Plant root exudates mediate neighbour recognition and
- trigger complex behavioural changes. *New Phytologist* **204**: 631–637.
- 680 Simard SW. 2009. The foundational role of mycorrhizal networks in self-organization of
- 681 interior Douglas-fir forests. Forest Ecology and Management 258: 95–107.
- 682 Simard SW, Beiler KJ, Bingham MA, Deslippe JR, Philip LJ, Teste FP. 2012. Mycorrhizal
- networks: Mechanisms, ecology and modelling. *Fungal Biology Reviews* 26: 39–60.
- 684 Simard SW, Jones MD, Durall DM, Perry DA, David D, Molina R. 1997a. Reciprocal
- 685 transfer of carbon isotopes between ectomycorrhizal Betula papyfera and Pseudotsuga
- 686 menziesii. New Phytologist 137: 529–542.
- 687 Simard SW, Perry DA, Jones MD, Myrold DD, Durall DM, Molina R. 1997b. Net transfer
- of carbon between ectomycorrhizal tree species in the field. *Nature* **388**: 579–582.
- 689 Söderström B. 1992. The ecological potential of the ectomycorrhizal mycelium. In: Read D,
- 690 Lewis D, Fitter A, Alexander IJ, eds. Mycorrhizal Functioning. Wallingford: CAB
- 691 International, 77-83.
- 692 Soil Classification Working Group. 1998. The Canadian System of Soil Classification.
- 693 Ottawa.
- 694 Song YY, Simard SW, Carroll A, Mohn WW, Zheng RS. 2015. Defoliation of interior
- 695 Douglas-fir elicits carbon transfer and defense signalling to ponderosa pine neighbors through
- 696 ectomycorrhizal networks. *Scientific Reports* **5**: 8495.
- 697 Song YY, Ye M, Li C, He X, Zhu-Salzman K, Wang RL, Su YJ, Luo SM, Zeng R Sen.
- 698 2014. Hijacking common mycorrhizal networks for herbivore-induced defence signal transfer
- 699 between tomato plants. *Scientific Reports* **4**: 3915.

- 700 Talbot JM, Allison SD, Treseder KK. 2008. Decomposers in disguise: Mycorrhizal fungi as
- regulators of soil C dynamics in ecosystems under global change. *Functional Ecology* 22: 955–
- 702 963.
- 703 Teste FP, Karst J, Jones MD, Simard SW, Durall DM. 2006. Methods to control
- rotation: Effectiveness of chemical and physical barriers. *Mycorrhiza* 17:
- 705 51–65.
- 706 Teste FP, Simard SW, Durall DM, Guy RD, Berch SM. 2010. Net carbon transfer between
- 707 Pseudotsuga menziesii var. glauca seedlings in the field is influenced by soil disturbance.
- 708 Journal of Ecology **98**: 429–439.
- 709 Teste FP, Simard SW, Durall DM, Guy RD, Jones MD, Schoonmaker AL. 2009. Access to
- 710 mycorrhizal networks and roots of trees: importance for seedling survival and resource
- 711 transfer. *Ecology* **90**: 2808–2822.
- 712 Verhoeven KJF, Simonsen KL, McIntyre LM. 2005. Implementing false discovery rate
- 713 control: increasing your power. *Oikos* **3**: 643–647.
- 714 Wallander H, Nilsson LO, Hagerberg D, Bååth E. 2001. Estimation of the biomass and
- seasonal growth of external mycelium of ectomycorrhizal fungi in the field. *New Phytologist*
- 716 **151**: 753–760.
- 717 White T, Bruns TD, Lee S, Taylor J. 1990. Amplification and direct sequencing of fungal
- ribosomal RNA genes for phylogenetics. PCR protocols: a guide to methods and applications
- 719 **18**: 315–322.
- 720 Wu B, Nara K, Hogetsu T. 2001. Can <sup>14</sup>C-labeled photosynthetic products move between
- 721 Pinus densiflora seedlings linked by ectomycorrhizal mycelia? New Phytologist 149: 137–146.
- 722

Pickles et al.

Page 23 of 31

**New Phytologist** 

## 723 **Figure headings**

724 **Figure 1.** Illustration of the plant and soil carbon pools sampled in each experimental unit, 725 which consisted of (a.) one donor (D) and one full-sibling or unrelated recipient (R) 726 *Pseudotsuga menziesii* var. *glauca* seedling in one pot separated by a nylon mesh bag (dark grey 727 dashed cylinder) with holes of either 0.5 µm or 35 µm. In panels **b-f**, red and blue fill represents 728 the donor and recipient pools, respectively. **b.** Above-ground plant biomass, divided into donor 729 shoot pool (D<sub>shoot</sub>) and recipient shoot pool (R<sub>shoot</sub>). c. Below-ground plant biomass, divided into 730 donor root pool ( $D_{root}$ ) and recipient root pool ( $R_{root}$ ). **d.** Below-ground plant-fungal biomass, 731 divided into donor ectomycorrhizal root tip pool ( $D_{ECM}$ ) and recipient ectomycorrhizal root tip 732 pool (R<sub>ECM</sub>). e. Soil attached to roots following their removal from soil and light shaking, 733 divided into donor rhizosphere pool (D<sub>rhizosphere</sub>) and recipient rhizosphere pool (R<sub>rhizosphere</sub>); the 734 donor rhizoplane pool (D<sub>rhizoplane</sub>), very tightly adhering soil washed from root surface following 735 vigorous vortexing in sterile water and subsequently pelleted by centrifugation, is approximated 736 with solid black lines. f. Soil not attached to roots following their removal from soil and light shaking, divided into donor coarse soil pool (D<sub>coarse</sub>) and recipient bulk soil pool (R<sub>bulk</sub>). 737 738 Figure 2. Relatedness and hyphal restriction effects on Pseudotsuga menziesii var. glauca seedling R<sub>root</sub> pool enrichment (excess <sup>13</sup>C as <sup>12</sup>C-equivalent), and their variation among 739 recipient families. **a-b**, Standardised regression coefficients for linear mixed models (refer to 740 741 Table 2), illustrating the differences between treatment levels in each recipient family in terms of 742 their standardised effect size (SES). a. difference between kin and non-kin within mesh 743 treatment (positive values indicate greater enrichment in kin pairs). **b**. difference between 35 744  $\mu$ m and 0.5  $\mu$ m mesh within relatedness treatment (positive values indicate greater enrichment in 745 pairs separated by 35  $\mu$ m mesh). Circles indicate average estimates, lines are 95% confidence 746 intervals. Filled circles indicate significant difference between treatment levels, open points 747 indicate no significant difference. **Figure 3.** Linear regression of kin (left panels) and non-kin (right panels) <sup>13</sup>C-enrichment in 748 749 *Pseudotsuga menziesii* var. *glauca* seedlings, revealing the positive relationships between: **a.**  $R_{root} \delta^{13}C$  and  $D_{ECM}$  abundance (kin significant), **b.**  $R_{ECM}$  and  $D_{ECM}$  excess <sup>13</sup>C as <sup>12</sup>C-equivalent 750 (mg) (kin significant), and c.  $R_{ECM}$  and  $D_{shoot}$  excess <sup>13</sup>C as <sup>12</sup>C-equivalent (mg) (kin significant). 751 752 Circles represent data points. Black lines indicate significant linear relationship, grey lines 753 indicate non-significant relationship. Note that kin and non-kin panels are scaled separately. Figure 4. Incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-label into PLFAs by different taxonomic groups in each biomass 754 pool based on the average  $\delta^{13}$ C of PLFAs. Error bars correspond to standard error. Dotted red 755

756 line indicates natural abundance value of  $\delta^{13}$ C. Dashed vertical black line indicates separation

- 757 between donor and recipient pools by mesh bag. Text indicates whether biomass in the pool was
- 758 primarily derived from plant material (Pseudotsuga menziesii var. glauca), plant and fungal
- 759 material, the interface between plant/fungi and soil, or soil alone. PLFA identities are provided
- 760 in Supporting Figures S2 and S3.
- 761

## Page 25 of 31

Pickles et al.

762 **Table 1.** Partitioning of plant-assimilated <sup>13</sup>C-labelled carbon in aboveground and belowground pools of interior Douglas-fir associated with

763 ectomycorrhizal fungi six days after the start of a 10-h  $^{13}$ CO<sub>2</sub> labelling period

<sup>13</sup> C atom% excess (APE)		Total amount of ex	cess 1	Excess <sup>13</sup> C incorporated of the mean total fixed (%)						
			icess							
		Total	n	Kin	n	Non-kin	n	Kin	Non-kin	
Pool	APE (s.e.m.)	μg (s.e.m.)		μg (s.e.m.)		μg (s.e.m.)		% (s.e.m.)	% (s.e.m.)	
D <sub>shoot</sub>	0.439 (0.037)	7050.67 (325.77)	35	6858.59 (521.51)	16	7212.41 (418.62)	19	31.345 (2.383)	32.962 (1.913)	
D <sub>root</sub>	0.238 (0.020)	1980.24 (159.76)	35	1878.00 (229.32)	17	2076.80 (226.67)	18	8.583 (1.048)	9.491 (1.036)	
D <sub>ECM</sub>	0.979 (0.068)	136.21 (27.57)	31	156.72 (56.54)	14	119.31 (20.52)	17	0.716 (0.258)	0.545 (0.094)	
D <sub>rhizoplane</sub>	0.076 (0.010)	231.81 (21.54)	36	241.61 (33.26)	17	223.04 (28.65)	19	1.104 (0.152)	1.019 (0.131)	
D <sub>rhizosphere</sub>	0.035 (0.004)	167.07 (20.08)	35	122.88 (22.96)	16	204.29 (29.39)	19	0.562 (0.105)	0.934 (0.134)	
D <sub>coarse</sub>	0.014 (0.002)	53.74 (11.29)	33	60.44 (18.81)	15	48.15 (13.69)	18	0.276 (0.086)	0.220 (0.063)	
R <sub>bulk</sub>	0.001 (0.000)	3.96 (0.50)	27	5.35 (0.83)	13	2.68 (0.39)	14	0.024 (0.004)	0.012 (0.002)	
R <sub>rhizosphere</sub>	0.004 (0.001)	4.90 (1.06)	33	4.80 (1.67)	16	4.98 (1.39)	19	0.022 (0.008)	0.023 (0.006)	
R <sub>ECM</sub>	0.119 (0.021)	2.43 (0.48)	34	2.48 (0.86)	16	2.39 (0.52)	18	0.011 (0.004)	0.011 (0.002)	
R <sub>root</sub>	0.013 (0.001)	3.76 (0.47)	33	4.96 (0.80)	16	2.64 (0.35)	17	0.023 (0.004)	0.012 (0.002)	
R <sub>shoot</sub>	0.006 (0.001)	2.76 (1.11)	6	3.46 (1.59)	4	1.37 (0.59)	2	0.016 (0.007)	0.006 (0.003)	
Plant and so	il mean values									
D <sub>plant</sub>		9167.11		8893.31		9408.52		40.64	43.00	
D <sub>soil</sub>		452.62		424.93		475.48		1.94	2.17	
R <sub>soil</sub>		8.86		10.15		7.66		0.05	0.03	
R <sub>plant</sub>		8.95		10.89		6.40		0.05	0.03	

764 APE = atom percent excess; n = number of significantly enriched samples; Total amount added during pulse = 29 020  $\mu$ g excess <sup>13</sup>C; Mean

amount fixed after 1-day chase = 21 881.08  $\mu$ g excess <sup>13</sup>C

- 766 **Table 2.** Effects of hyphal restriction and donor relatedness treatments on excess <sup>13</sup>C as <sup>12</sup>C equivalent (µg) of recipient *Pseudotsuga menziesii*
- var. *glauca* seedling biomass pools, using maximum likelihood analysis of linear mixed-effects models<sup>1</sup> and likelihood ratio tests

<b>R</b> <sub>bulk</sub>			R <sub>rhizo</sub>	sphere		R <sub>ECM</sub>			R <sub>root</sub>		
-			sqrt			-			$log_{10}$		
0.605			0.565			0.325			0.673		
df	<i>F</i> -value	<i>P</i> -value	df	<i>F</i> -value	<i>P</i> -value	df	<i>F</i> -value	<i>P</i> -value	df	<i>F</i> -value	<i>P</i> -value
1,15	97.53	<0.0001	1,15	283.15	<0.0001	1,15	50.41	<0.0001	1,15	110.65	<0.0001
1,15	1.81	0.199	1,15	0.15	0.708	1,15	0.08	0.787	1,15	6.47	0.020
1,15	3.65	0.077	1,15	3.29	0.090	1,15	0.79	0.387	1,15	5.38	0.032
3,15	2.79	0.079	3,15	2.14	0.138	3,15	0.31	0.816	3,15	0.50	0.687
1,15	0.14	0.710	1,15	0.31	0.585	1,15	1.82	0.197	1,15	2.34	0.143
3,15	0.37	0.775	3,15	0.61	0.619	3,15	1.55	0.243	3,15	4.59	0.015
3,15	3.36	0.050	3,15	3.54	0.041	3,15	0.03	0.991	3,15	4.14	0.021
	R <sub>bulk</sub> -           0.605           df           1,15           1,15           1,15           1,15           3,15           3,15           3,15           3,15	Rbulk           -           0.605           df         F-value           1,15         97.53           1,15         1.81           1,15         3.65           3,15         2.79           1,15         0.14           3,15         0.37           3,15         3.36	Rbuilk         -           0.605         -           df         F-value         P-value           1,15         97.53         <0.0001	Rbulk         Rrhize           -         sqrt           0.605         0.565           df         F-value         P-value         df           1,15         97.53         <0.0001	Rbulk         Rrhizosphere           -         sqrt           0.605         0.565           df         F-value         df         F-value           1,15         97.53         <0.0001	$R_{bulk}$ $R_{rhizosphere}$ -sqrt $0.605$ $0.565$ df <i>F</i> -valuedf <i>F</i> -value <i>P</i> -value1,1597.53<0.0001	$R_{bulk}$ $R_{rhizosphere}$ $R_{ECM}$ -         sqrt         -         0.325 $df$ $F$ -value $df$ $F$ -value $df$ $P$ -value $df$ 1,15 $97.53$ <0.0001	$R_{bulk}$ $R_{rhizosphere}$ $R_{ECM}$ -sqrt- $0.605$ $0.565$ $0.325$ df <i>F</i> -value <i>P</i> -value <i>dfF</i> -value <i>P</i> -value1,15 <i>F</i> -value <i>AA</i> 1,151.810.1991,150.150.7081,151,153.650.0771,153.290.0901,150.793,152.790.0793,152.140.1383,150.311,150.140.7101,150.610.6193,151.823,153.360.0503,153.540.0413,150.03	$\mathbf{R}_{\text{bulk}}$ $\mathbf{R}_{\text{rhizosphere}}$ $\mathbf{R}_{\text{ECM}}$ -sqrt- $0.605$ $0.565$ $0.325$ $\mathbf{df}$ $\mathbf{F}$ -value $\mathbf{P}$ -value $\mathbf{df}$ $\mathbf{F}$ -value $\mathbf{P}$ -value1,15 $97.53$ <0.0001	$\mathbf{R}_{\text{bulk}}$ $\mathbf{R}_{rhizosphere}$ $\mathbf{R}_{ECM}$ $\mathbf{R}_{root}$ $\cdot$ sqrt $ \log_{10}$ $0.605$ $0.565$ $0.325$ $0.325$ $\mathbf{df}$ $F$ -value $\mathbf{df}$ $F$ -value $\mathbf{df}$ $F$ -value $\mathbf{df}$ $\mathbf{f}$ -value $\mathbf{f}$ -value $\mathbf{df}$ $\mathbf{f}$ -value $\mathbf{f}$ -value $\mathbf{df}$ $\mathbf{f}$ -value $\mathbf{f}$ -	$\mathbf{R}_{\text{bulk}}$ $\mathbf{R}_{\text{rhizepere}}$ $\mathbf{R}_{\text{ECM}}$ $\mathbf{R}_{\text{rot}}$ $\mathbf{R}_{\text{rot}}$ -sqt- $ dg_1 $ $ 0g_1 $ 0.6050.565 $0.565$ $0.325$ $0.72$ $0.673$ <b>dfF-valuedfF-valuedfF-valuedfF-value</b> 1.15 <b>97.53&lt;0.001</b> $1,15$ <b>283.15&lt;0.001</b> $1,15$ <b>50.41&lt;0.001</b> $1,15$ <b>10.65</b> 1.151.810.199 $1,15$ <b>283.15&lt;0.001</b> $1,15$ <b>50.41&lt;0.001</b> $1,15$ <b>10.65</b> 1.153.65 <b>&lt;0.071</b> $1,15$ <b>283.15&lt;0.001</b> $1,15$ <b>0.18</b> $0.787$ $1,15$ <b>6.47</b> 1.153.650.077 $1,15$ 3.290.0901 $1,15$ $0.790$ $0.387$ $1,15$ <b>5.38</b> 3.152.7990.079 $3,15$ 2.1400.138 $3,15$ $0.310$ 0.816 $3,15$ $0.501$ 1.150.140.710 $1,15$ 0.310.585 $1,15$ $0.243$ $3,15$ $2.34$ 3.150.370.755 $3,15$ 0.619 $3,15$ $0.03$ $0.991$ $3,15$ $4.14$

768 Values in bold are significant at the  $\alpha < 0.05$  level.

769 Marginal  $R^2$  = model fit based on fixed factors alone. Inclusion of random factor did not increase model fit.

770 <sup>1</sup>Model form: (Pool) ~ (Re)\*(Hy) + (Re)\*(Rfam) + (Hy)\*(Rfam), random ~ 1| (Donor family)

## Page 27 of 31

Pickles et al.

771 Table 3. Identity and relative abundance of root-associated fungi on kin and non-kin Pseudotsuga menziesii var. glauca seedlings based on root

772 tip morphotyping and ITS region taxonomic classification. No significant differences in colonisation were observed between mesh sizes.

Fungal morphotype ID	Seedling	Relative abundance		Accession	Sequence match (NCBI accession)	% Identity	
		Kin	Non-kin				
Rhizopogon vinicolor (Morphotype 1)	Donor	0.46	0.58	KT314836	Rhizopogon vinicolor (AF263933)	652/656 (99%)	
	Recipient	0.44	0.57				
Rhizopogon vinicolor (Morphotype 2)	Donor	0.24	0.11	KT314840	Rhizopogon vinicolor (HQ385848)	529/535 (99%)	
	Recipient	0.14	0.03				
Pyronemataceae sp.	Donor	0.12	0.09	KT314854	uncultured Pyronemataceae (GU452518)	524/524 (100%)	
	Recipient	0.26	0.29				
Wilcoxina sp.	Donor	0.08	0.05	-	Sequencing failed – Taxonomic ID	-	
	Recipient	0.13	0.09				
Uncolonised root tips	Donor	0.05	0.15	N/A	N/A	N/A	
	Recipient	0.00	< 0.01				
Fusarium sp.	Donor	0.03	0.01	KT314859	Fusarium acuminatum (KP068924)	478/478 (100%)	
	Recipient	0.03	0.02	KT314860	Fusarium oxysporum (KP132221)	451/451 (100%)	
Rhizopogon sp.	Donor	0.01	0.01	KT314850	Rhizopogon fragrans (AM085523)	619/621 (99%)	
	Recipient	< 0.01	< 0.01				
Rhizopogon ochraceisporus	Donor	0.01	0.00	KT314851	Rhizopogon ochraceisporus (AF366389)	603/609 (99%)	
	Recipient	0.00	0.00				

773 N/A = not applicable (uncolonised root tips which did not generate fungal DNA).

774







