

The rise in pay for performance among higher managerial and professional occupations in Britain: eroding or enhancing the service relationship?

Article

Supplemental Material

Williams, M., Zhou, Y. and Zou, M. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1095-1489 (2020) The rise in pay for performance among higher managerial and professional occupations in Britain: eroding or enhancing the service relationship? Work Employment and Society, 34 (4). pp. 605-625. ISSN 1469-8722 doi: 10.1177/0950017019841552 Available at https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/83985/

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See <u>Guidance on citing</u>.

To link to this article DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0950017019841552

Publisher: SAGE

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the End User Agreement.



www.reading.ac.uk/centaur

CentAUR

Central Archive at the University of Reading Reading's research outputs online

APPENDIX

Further analyses on the complement/substitution effect

Our interpretation is that, because service class occupations have certain job characteristics that entail a certain employment relationship, the rise in PFP should benefit them the most financially by acting as a bonus, while for other occupational classes, since they entail less valuable human assets and their work is more easily controlled, PFP will substitute base pay, acting more as a piece rate where the employee does not receive the full value of their PFP. Thus PFP is more consistent with 'rent sharing' in service class occupations but 'risk sharing' in other occupational classes. To get more insight on this assertion, we report three robustness checks in this Online Appendix. First, we examine differences within more detailed occupational classes. The rationale here is that the results presented thus far for the service class are largely driven by managerial categories, who are perhaps better able to bargain for PFP to not substitute for base pay, but not necessarily professionals, in effect concealing differences within 'big classes'. Second, we examine differences across industries. The rationale here is that since economic rents are larger in some sectors relative to others (e.g., finance and business services vs. the public sector where there are no profits) and PFP is more likely to be found in such sectors, the occupational class-based patterns we found might be driven by certain sectors. Third, we examine differences within occupational classes between whether covered by a collective bargaining agreement or not. The rationale here is that unions may help to ameliorate the substitution effect for non-service class occupations and reduce class-based differences in the balance between complement and substitution across occupational classes within the unionised relative to the nonunionised sectors. In the fixed-effects analyses, we find very little substantive differences from the main analysis in Table 4. They underline our main conclusion that the rise in PFP has been broadly beneficial to service class occupations across the board in financial terms, and broadly negative for other occupational classes.

Table A1. The substitution or complement effect on earnings of PFP across occupational micro classes

Higher managerial and administrative	Higher managerial and administrative (0.001) Higher professional - traditional (0.006) Higher professional - new (1.540**** Lower professional and higher technical - (1.394**** traditional (0.005) Lower professional and higher technical - (1.394**** traditional (0.005) Lower professional and higher technical - (1.353**** new (0.011) Lower managerial and administrative (1.409**** (1.800**** (0.004) Higher supervisory (1.800**** (0.004) Higher supervisory (0.136) Intermediate clerical and administrative (1.813*** (1.800**** (0.022) Intermediate sales and service (0.029) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (1.900*** (0.029) Intermediate engineering (0.117) Lower supervisory (0.734*** (0.126) Lower technical craft (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.119) Semi-routine sales (0.041) Semi-routine service (1.358*** (0.041) Semi-routine decinical (0.102) Semi-routine decinical (0.109) Semi-routine agricultural (0.820*** Semi-routine clerical (0.137) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) Routine sales and service (0.7715*** (0.171) Routine production (0.740*** Routine operative (0.949*** (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.425) Routine agricultural (0.445)	
Higher managerial and administrative	Higher managerial and administrative	
Higher professional - traditional 1.344*** 0.964** 1.344*** 0.964** 1.344*** 0.964** 1.295*** (0.006) (0.035) (0.006) (0.035) (0.006) (0.035) (0.006) (0.035) (0.004) (0.365) (0.006) (0.005) (0.0076) (0.005) (0.0076) (0.005) (0.0076) (0.005) (0.0076) (0.001) (0.005) (0.005) (0.001) (0.005) (0.001)	Higher professional - traditional (0.006) Higher professional - new (0.006) Higher professional - new (0.004) Lower professional and higher technical - traditional (0.005) Lower professional and higher technical - new (0.001) Lower managerial and administrative (1.409*** (0.001) Lower managerial and administrative (1.409*** (0.004) Higher supervisory (1.800*** (0.022) Intermediate clerical and administrative (0.022) Intermediate sales and service (0.022) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.089) Intermediate engineering (0.117) Lower supervisory (0.126) Lower technical craft (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.119) Semi-routine sales (0.041) Semi-routine service (1.358*** (0.041) Semi-routine technical (0.079) Semi-routine operative (0.109) Semi-routine derical (0.079) Semi-routine clerical (0.445) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) Routine sales and service (0.715*** (0.171) Routine production (0.740*** (0.045) Routine operative (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine operative (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine operative (0.0466) Routine agricultural (0.045)	
Higher professional - traditional (0.006) (0.035) Higher professional - new (1.540*** 1.295*** (0.004) (0.365) Lower professional and higher technical - 1.394*** 0.979*** traditional (0.005) (0.076) Lower professional and higher technical - 1.394*** 0.979*** (0.001) (0.005) Lower professional and higher technical - 1.353*** 0.970*** (0.011) (0.050) Lower managerial and administrative (0.004) (0.039) Higher supervisory (0.136) (0.154) Intermediate clerical and administrative (1.813*** 0.983*** (0.022) (0.068) Intermediate sales and service (0.029) (0.075) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.029) (0.075) Intermediate engineering (0.117) (0.102) Lower supervisory (0.126) (0.044) Lower technical craft (0.045) (0.126) (0.044) Lower technical process operative (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical erical (0.041) (0.19) (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine service (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine service (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine operative (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine operative (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine clerical (0.103) (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine sales and service (0.153** (0.342*** (0.045) (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) (0.106) Routine production (0.740*** (0.379*** (0.342*** (0.045) (0.044) (0.035) (0.044) (0.039) (0.070) Routine technical (0.045) (0.048) Routine technical (0.045) (0.048) (0.045) (0.048)	Higher professional - traditional Higher professional - new Lower professional and higher technical – 1.394*** (0.004) Lower professional and higher technical – 1.394*** traditional Lower professional and higher technical – 1.353*** new (0.001) Lower managerial and administrative Higher supervisory Lower managerial and administrative (0.004) Higher supervisory Intermediate clerical and administrative Intermediate sales and service (0.022) Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate engineering Intermediate engineering Lower supervisory Lower technical craft Lower technical process operative Lower technical process operative Lower technical process operative Semi-routine service 1.560*** (0.045) Semi-routine operative Semi-routine delical Semi-routine delical Semi-routine clerical Semi-routine clerical Semi-routine childcare occupations Routine production Routine production Routine operative 0.949*** (0.045) Routine operative 0.939 Routine operative 0.0715*** (0.171) Routine operative 0.949** 0.949** 0.066) Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural	
Higher professional - new	Higher professional - new	(0.092)
Higher professional - new	Higher professional - new	
Lower professional and higher technical – 1.394*** 0.979*** traditional (0.005) (0.076) Lower professional and higher technical – 1.353*** 0.970*** new (0.011) (0.050) Lower managerial and administrative (0.004) (0.039) Higher supervisory 1.800** 0.981*** (0.136) (0.154) Intermediate clerical and administrative 1.813*** 0.983*** (0.022) (0.068) Intermediate sales and service 0.979** 0.816** (0.029) (0.075) Intermediate technical and auxiliary 1.900** 0.923*** (0.089) (0.197) Intermediate engineering 1.209** 0.757** (0.117) (0.102) Lower supervisory 0.734** 0.491*** (0.126) (0.064) Lower technical craft 0.808** 0.542*** (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative 1.560** 0.845*** (0.019) (0.019) Semi-routine sales 1.216** 0.814*** (0.044) (0.0135) Semi-routine technical 0.820** 0.758*** (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* 0.449* (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine clerical 1.536** 0.767*** (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536** 0.767*** (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536** 0.767*** (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536** 0.767*** (0.171) (0.109) Semi-routine sales and service 0.715** 0.342*** (0.045) (0.048) Routine production 0.740*** 0.379*** (0.327*** 0.342*** (0.045) (0.045) (0.048) Routine technical 0.527** 0.342*** (0.045) (0.045) (0.048)	Lower professional and higher technical – traditional (0.005) Lower professional and higher technical – new (0.011) Lower managerial and administrative (0.004) Higher supervisory (0.136) Intermediate clerical and administrative (0.022) Intermediate sales and service (0.029) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.089) Intermediate engineering (0.117) Lower supervisory (0.126) Lower technical craft (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.199) Semi-routine sales (0.041) Semi-routine service (0.102) Semi-routine technical (0.102) Semi-routine operative (0.109) Semi-routine agricultural (0.137) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) Routine sales and service (0.171) Routine production (0.102) Routine operative (0.172) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine operative (0.171) Routine operative (0.172) Routine operative (0.102) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.0466) Routine agricultural (0.0466) Routine agricultural (0.0466)	
Co.004 (0.365)	(0.004) Lower professional and higher technical - traditional 1.394*** traditional (0.005) Lower professional and higher technical - new (0.011) Lower managerial and administrative (0.004) Higher supervisory (0.136) Intermediate clerical and administrative (0.022) Intermediate sales and service (0.022) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.089) Intermediate engineering (0.117) Lower supervisory (0.126) Lower technical craft (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.041) Semi-routine sales (0.041) Semi-routine service (0.102) Semi-routine operative (0.102) Semi-routine agricultural (0.079) Semi-routine clerical (0.387** (0.445) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.33) Routine sales and service (0.171) Routine production (0.102) Routine operative (0.172) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine operative (0.171) Routine operative (0.172) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine operative (0.174)** Routine operative (0.174)** Routine operative (0.102) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.066) Routine agricultural (0.066)	1.295***
traditional (0.005) (0.076) Lower professional and higher technical - new (0.011) (0.050) Lower managerial and administrative (0.004) (0.039) Higher supervisory 1.800*** 0.981*** (0.024) (0.039) Higher supervisory 1.800*** 0.981*** (0.022) (0.068) Intermediate clerical and administrative (0.022) (0.068) Intermediate sales and service (0.022) (0.068) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.029) (0.075) Intermediate engineering (0.117) (0.102) Lower supervisory (0.126) (0.064) Lower technical craft (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative (0.019) (0.109) Semi-routine sales (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service 1.358*** 0.786*** (0.109) (0.079) Semi-routine technical (0.109) (0.079) Semi-routine operative 0.934*** 0.385*** (0.109) (0.079) Semi-routine agricultural 0.820*** 0.504*** (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** 0.767*** (0.109) (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** 0.767*** (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine sales and service 0.934*** 0.385*** (0.044) (0.135) (0.043) Routine sales and service 0.715*** 0.342** (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740*** 0.379*** (0.172) (0.048) Routine technical 0.527*** 0.342*** (0.044) (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical 0.527*** 0.342*** (0.044) (0.102) (0.048)	traditional (0.005) Lower professional and higher technical - new (0.011) Lower managerial and administrative (1.409*** (0.004) Higher supervisory (0.136) Intermediate clerical and administrative (0.022) Intermediate sales and service (0.022) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.089) Intermediate engineering (0.117) Lower supervisory (0.126) Lower technical craft (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.019) Semi-routine sales (0.041) Semi-routine service (0.109) Semi-routine technical (0.109) Semi-routine agricultural (0.137) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) Semi-routine sales and service (0.139) Routine sales and service (0.171) Routine production (0.102) Routine operative (0.172) Routine operative (0.172) Routine operative (0.173) Routine operative (0.166) Routine agricultural (0.445) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine operative (0.172) Routine operative (0.172) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.046) Routine agricultural (0.046)	
traditional (0.005) (0.076) Lower professional and higher technical - new (0.011) (0.050) Lower managerial and administrative (0.011) (0.050) Higher supervisory 1.800*** 0.981*** (0.136) (0.154) Intermediate clerical and administrative (0.022) (0.068) Intermediate sales and service (0.022) (0.068) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.029) (0.075) Intermediate engineering (0.117) (0.102) Lower supervisory (0.126) (0.068) Lower technical craft (0.045) (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative (0.019) (0.109) Semi-routine sales (0.019) (0.041) Semi-routine technical (0.109) (0.068) Semi-routine operative (0.109) (0.068) Semi-routine agricultural (0.109) (0.079) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) (0.106) Routine production (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.041) (0.102) (0.048)	traditional (0.005) Lower professional and higher technical - new (0.011) Lower managerial and administrative (1.409*** (0.004) Higher supervisory (0.136) Intermediate clerical and administrative (0.022) Intermediate sales and service (0.022) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.089) Intermediate engineering (0.117) Lower supervisory (0.126) Lower technical craft (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.019) Semi-routine sales (0.041) Semi-routine service (0.109) Semi-routine technical (0.109) Semi-routine agricultural (0.137) Semi-routine clerical (0.33) Routine sales and service (0.171) Routine production (0.102) Routine operative (0.102) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine operative (0.171) Routine operative (0.172) Routine operative (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine agricultural (0.102) Routine operative (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.046) Routine agricultural (0.046)	0.979^{***}
Lower managerial and administrative	Lower managerial and administrative	(0.076)
Lower managerial and administrative	Lower managerial and administrative	0.070***
Lower managerial and administrative (0.004) (0.039) (0.039) (0.136) (0.154) (0.136) (0.154) (0.136) (0.154) (0.136) (0.154) (0.022) (0.068) (0.022) (0.068) (0.022) (0.068) (0.029) (0.075) (0.089) (0.197) (0.089) (0.197) (0.117) (0.102) (0.089) (0.197) (0.117) (0.102) (0.089) (0.197) (0.126) (0.064) (0.045) (0.045) (0.043) (0.045) (0.045) (0.119) (0.109) (0.119) (0.068) (0.102) (0.068) (0.102) (0.068) (0.102) (0.068) (0.102) (0.069) (0.079) (0.059) (0.079) (0.059) (0.137) (0.109) (0.079) (0.059) (0.137) (0.109) (0.137) (0.109) (0.137) (0.109) (0.137) (0.109) (0.137) (0.109) (0.137) (0.109) (0.137) (0.109) (0.137) (0.109) (0.533) (0.106) (0.171) (0.106) (0.171) (0.106) (0.171) (0.106) (0.102) (0.044) (0.171) (0.106) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.171) (0.106) (0.171) (0.106) (0.171) (0.106) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.102) (0.044) (0.171) (0.106)	Lower managerial and administrative	
Higher supervisory 1.800*** 1.813*** 1.813*** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1	Higher supervisory	(0.030)
Higher supervisory 1.800*** 1.813*** 1.813*** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1.816** 1	Higher supervisory	1.008***
Higher supervisory	Higher supervisory	
Intermediate clerical and administrative Intermediate sales and service Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate engineering Intermediate technical auxiliary Intermediate technical auxiliary Intermediate technical Intermediate sales Intermediate sales sand service Intermediate sales sales Intermediate sales sand service Intermediate sales sales Intermediate sales sales sales Intermediate sales Intermediate sales sales Intermediate sales Inte	Intermediate clerical and administrative Intermediate sales and service Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate engineering Intermediate technical engineering Intermediate engineering Intermediate technical Intermediate sales and service Intermediate sales Intermediate s	
Intermediate clerical and administrative Intermediate sales and service Intermediate sales and service Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate engineering Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate sales in the support of th	Intermediate clerical and administrative 1.813***	
Intermediate sales and service (0.022) (0.068) (0.029) (0.075) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.089) (0.197) Intermediate engineering (0.120) (0.089) (0.197) Intermediate engineering (0.117) (0.102) Lower supervisory (0.126) (0.064) Lower technical craft (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine technical (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine agricultural (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine agricultural (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine childcare occupations Routine production (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.049) Routine technical (0.101) (0.106) Routine technical (0.102) (0.068) Routine technical (0.103) (0.106) Routine production (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical	Intermediate sales and service 0.979*** (0.022) Intermediate technical and auxiliary 1.900*** (0.089) Intermediate engineering 1.209*** (0.117) Lower supervisory 0.734*** (0.126) Lower technical craft (0.045) Lower technical process operative 1.560*** (0.119) Semi-routine sales 1.216*** (0.102) Semi-routine technical 0.820*** Semi-routine operative 0.934*** Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** (0.045) Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** (0.109) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** (0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 (0.533) Routine sales and service 0.715*** (0.171) Routine production 0.740*** Routine operative 0.949*** Routine operative 0.949*** Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425	0.131)
Intermediate sales and service (0.979°** (0.075) Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.089) (0.075) Intermediate engineering (0.190°** (0.089) (0.197) Intermediate engineering (0.117) (0.102) Lower supervisory (0.126) (0.064) Lower technical craft (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine technical (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine operative (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine agricultural (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) (0.106) Routine production (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.068) Routine technical (0.171) (0.1066) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.045) (0.041)	Intermediate sales and service 0.979***	
Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate engineering Interpeach engineering Interpeach engineering Interpeach engineering Interpeach engineering Interpeach engineering Interpeach engin	Intermediate technical and auxiliary Intermediate engineering Intermediate enginearite Intermediate engineering Intermediate engineering Intermediate engines Inte	
Intermediate technical and auxiliary (0.089) (0.197) Intermediate engineering (0.117) (0.102) Lower supervisory (0.126) (0.064) Lower technical craft (0.808*** (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine technical (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine operative (0.109) (0.109) (0.109) Semi-routine agricultural (0.079) (0.079) Semi-routine clerical (0.445) (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) (0.106) Routine production (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102*** (0.045*** (0.045*** (0.049) (0.045***	Intermediate technical and auxiliary 1.900***	
Intermediate engineering (0.089) (0.197) Intermediate engineering (1.209*** 0.757*** 0.757*** (0.117) (0.102) Lower supervisory (0.126) (0.064) Lower technical craft (0.088*** 0.542*** (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales (1.216*** 0.814*** (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service (1.358*** 0.786*** (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine technical (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine operative (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine agricultural (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine clerical (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) (0.106) Routine production (0.740*** 0.379*** (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.045) (0.041) (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.045) (0.048)	Intermediate engineering (0.089) Intermediate engineering (1.209*** Lower supervisory (0.126) Lower technical craft (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.045) Lower technical process operative (0.119) Semi-routine sales (1.216*** (0.041) Semi-routine service (1.358*** (0.102) Semi-routine technical (0.109) Semi-routine operative (0.079) Semi-routine agricultural (0.445) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) Routine sales and service (0.171) Routine production (0.102) Routine technical (0.045) Routine operative (0.066) Routine agricultural (0.425 Co.510)	
Intermediate engineering	Intermediate engineering 1.209***	
Lower supervisory 0.117 (0.102) Lower technical craft 0.808*** 0.542*** Lower technical process operative 1.560*** 0.845*** Lower technical process operative 1.560*** 0.845*** Countine sales 1.216*** 0.814*** (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service 1.358*** 0.786*** (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine technical 0.820*** 0.504*** (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine operative 0.934*** 0.385*** (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* 0.449* (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** 0.767*** (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268* (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715*** 0.342** (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical 0.527*** 0.342*** (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical 0.527***	Lower supervisory 0.734*** (0.126) Lower technical craft 0.808*** (0.045) Lower technical process operative 1.560*** (0.119) Semi-routine sales 1.216*** (0.041) Semi-routine service 1.358*** (0.102) Semi-routine technical 0.820** Semi-routine operative 0.934*** (0.079) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** (0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715*** Routine production 0.740*** Routine operative 0.949*** Routine operative 0.949*** Routine agricultural 0.425	(0.197)
Lower supervisory (0.117) (0.102) (0.734*** 0.491*** (0.126) (0.064) Lower technical craft (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine technical (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine operative (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine agricultural (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine clerical (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service (0.102) (0.068) Routine production (0.171) (0.106) Routine technical (0.109) (0.740*** (0.740*** 0.379*** (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical	Lower supervisory 0.734*** (0.126) Lower technical craft 0.808*** (0.045) Lower technical process operative 1.560*** (0.119) Semi-routine sales 1.216*** (0.041) Semi-routine service 1.358*** (0.102) Semi-routine technical 0.820*** (0.109) Semi-routine operative 0.934*** Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715*** Routine production 0.740*** Routine operative 0.949*** Routine operative 0.949*** Routine agricultural 0.066) Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425	0.757^{***}
Lower technical craft (0.126) (0.064) Lower technical craft (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative 1.560*** (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales 1.216*** (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service 1.358*** (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine technical 0.820*** (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine operative 0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine operative 0.934*** (0.079) (0.070) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* (0.449* (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** (0.767*** (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715*** (0.342*** (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740*** (0.379**** (0.048)) Routine technical 0.527*** (0.342**** (0.045)) (0.041) Routone production	Lower technical craft	(0.102)
Lower technical craft (0.126) (0.064) 0.808*** 0.542*** (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative 1.560*** 0.845*** (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales 1.216*** 0.814*** (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service 1.358*** 0.786*** (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine technical 0.820*** 0.504*** (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine operative 0.934*** 0.385*** (0.045) (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** 0.767*** (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268* (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715*** 0.342** (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740*** 0.379*** Routine technical 0.527*** 0.342*** (0.045) (0.041) (0.045) (0.045) (0.045) (0.045) (0.045) (0.045) (0.045)	Lower technical craft 0.808*** (0.045) Lower technical process operative 1.560** Semi-routine sales 1.216*** (0.041) Semi-routine service 1.358*** (0.102) Semi-routine technical 0.820*** (0.109) Semi-routine operative 0.934*** Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715*** Routine production 0.740*** Routine technical 0.527*** Routine operative 0.949*** Routine agricultural 0.949*** Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425	0.491***
Lower technical craft (0.045) (0.043) Lower technical process operative 1.560*** 0.845*** (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales 1.216*** 0.814*** (0.041) (0.135) Semi-routine service 1.358*** 0.786*** (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine technical 0.820*** 0.504*** (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine operative 0.934*** 0.385*** (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* 0.449* (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** 0.767*** (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268* (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715*** 0.342** (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740*** 0.379*** Routine technical	Lower technical craft 0.808***	(0.064)
Lower technical process operative	Lower technical process operative Lower technical process operative 1.560*** (0.119) Semi-routine sales 1.216*** (0.041) Semi-routine service 1.358*** (0.102) Semi-routine operative 0.820*** (0.109) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873* Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** (0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations Routine sales and service 0.715*** Routine production Routine technical 0.527*** Routine operative 0.949*** (0.066) Routine agricultural 0.425 (0.510)	
Lower technical process operative 1.560^{***} (0.119) (0.109) Semi-routine sales 1.216^{***} 0.814^{***} Semi-routine service 1.358^{***} 0.786^{***} Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} 0.504^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} 0.385^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^{**} 0.449^{*} Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} 0.767^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^{*} Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***}	Lower technical process operative 1.560^{***} Semi-routine sales 1.216^{***} Semi-routine service 1.358^{***} Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^{*} Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425	
Continue technical Continu	Semi-routine sales	0.845***
Semi-routine sales 1.216^{***} 0.814^{***} Semi-routine service 1.358^{***} 0.786^{***} Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} 0.504^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} 0.385^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^{*} 0.449^{*} Semi-routine clerical 0.536^{***} 0.767^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^{*} Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} 0.045 0.041 0.045^{***} 0.041^{***}	Semi-routine sales 1.216^{***} Semi-routine service 1.358^{***} Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425	
Semi-routine service	Semi-routine service (0.041) Semi-routine service (0.102) Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425	
Semi-routine service 1.358^{***} 0.786^{***} Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} 0.504^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} 0.385^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^{*} 0.449^{*} Semi-routine clerical 0.873^{*} 0.449^{*} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939^{*} 0.268^{*} Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{**} 0.045^{***} 0.041^{***} 0.045^{***} 0.041^{***}	Semi-routine service 1.358^{***} Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425 0.510	
Semi-routine technical (0.102) (0.068) Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} 0.504^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} 0.385^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* 0.449^* Semi-routine clerical 0.873^* 0.449^* Semi-routine clerical 0.1536^{***} 0.767^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***}	Semi-routine service (0.102) Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425	
Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} 0.504^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} 0.385^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* 0.449^* Semi-routine clerical 0.873^* 0.449^* Semi-routine clerical 0.536^{***} 0.767^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^* Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***}	Semi-routine technical 0.820^{***} Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.510	
Semi-routine deciment (0.109) (0.070) Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} 0.385^{***} (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* 0.449^* Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} 0.767^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* (0.533) (0.109) Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} 0.045 0.041 0.045 0.041	Semi-routine operative	
Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} 0.385^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* 0.449^* Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} 0.767^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^* Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} 0.045 0.045 0.041 0.045^{***} 0.045^{***} 0.520^{****}	Semi-routine operative 0.934^{***} Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.425	
Semi-routine agricultural (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* 0.449^* (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} 0.767^{***} (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***}	Semi-routine agricultural (0.079) Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 0.510	(0.070)
Semi-routine agricultural (0.079) (0.059) Semi-routine agricultural 0.873^* 0.449^* (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} 0.767^{***} (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***}	Semi-routine agricultural (0.079) Semi-routine clerical (0.445) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) Routine sales and service (0.715^{***}) Routine production (0.740^{***}) Routine technical (0.045) Routine operative (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.045)	0.385***
Semi-routine agricultural (0.445) (0.182) Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} 0.767^{***} (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***}	Semi-routine agricultural	(0.059)
Semi-routine clerical	(0.445) Semi-routine clerical 1.536*** (0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 (0.533) Routine sales and service 0.715*** (0.171) Routine production 0.740*** (0.102) Routine technical 0.527*** (0.045) Routine operative 0.949*** (0.066) Routine agricultural 0.425 (0.510)	0.449^{*}
Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} 0.767^{***} (0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} (0.045) (0.041) 0.045^{***} 0.527^{***}	Semi-routine clerical 1.536^{***} (0.137) (0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 (0.533) (0.533) Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} (0.171) 0.740^{***} (0.102) Routine technical Routine operative 0.949^{***} (0.066) Routine agricultural Routine operative 0.425 (0.510)	(0.182)
(0.137) (0.109) Semi-routine childcare occupations	(0.137) Semi-routine childcare occupations (0.533) Routine sales and service (0.715*** (0.171) Routine production (0.102) Routine technical (0.045) Routine operative (0.949*** (0.066) Routine agricultural (0.510)	
Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 0.268^* (0.533) (0.106) Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} 0.342^{**} (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} (0.045) (0.041) 0.041^{****} 0.520^{***}	Semi-routine childcare occupations 0.939 Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 (0.510)	
Routine sales and service	Routine sales and service (0.533) Routine production (0.171) Routine production (0.102) Routine technical (0.045) Routine operative (0.066) Routine agricultural (0.510)	
Routine sales and service 0.715*** 0.342** (0.171) (0.106) Routine production 0.740*** 0.379*** (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical 0.527*** 0.342*** (0.045) (0.041)	Routine sales and service 0.715^{***} Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 (0.510)	
Routine production (0.171) (0.106) Routine production (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical (0.045) (0.041)	Routine production (0.171) Routine technical (0.102) Routine technical (0.045) Routine operative (0.045) Routine agricultural (0.066) Routine agricultural (0.510)	
Routine production 0.740^{***} 0.379^{***} (0.102) (0.048) Routine technical 0.527^{***} 0.342^{***} (0.045) (0.041)	Routine production 0.740^{***} Routine technical 0.527^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} Routine agricultural 0.425 (0.510)	
Routine technical (0.102) (0.048) 0.527*** (0.045) (0.041)	Routine production (0.102) Routine technical 0.527*** (0.045) Routine operative 0.949*** (0.066) Routine agricultural 0.425 (0.510)	
Routine technical 0.527*** 0.342*** (0.045) (0.041)	Routine technical 0.527^{***} (0.045) 0.949^{***} Routine operative 0.949^{***} (0.066) 0.425 Routine agricultural 0.510	
(0.045) (0.041)	(0.045) Routine operative (0.046) Routine agricultural (0.066) (0.066) (0.0510)	(0.048)
0.040***	Routine operative 0.949*** (0.066) Routine agricultural 0.425 (0.510)	
A A 4 A *** A = 2 A ***	(0.066) Routine agricultural (0.065) 0.425 (0.510)	(0.041)
Routine operative 0.949 0.529	(0.066) Routine agricultural 0.425 (0.510)	0.529***
(0.066) (0.044)	(0.510)	(0.044)
0.405	(0.510)	
Routine agricultural		
R^2 0.688 0.929		
Observations 962,664 871,161	OUSCI VALIOIIS 902,004	0/1,101

Source: Employees aged 20 to 60 in the Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings. Data are weighted. Notes: Predicted differences in PFP and non-PFP jobs within occupational classes derived from an interaction between occupational class category and a pay for performance amount. All models include a common set of controls (see text) which are omitted to save space. Statistical significance * p<0.05, ** p<0.01, *** p<0.001. Robust standard errors in parentheses.

Table A2. The substitution or complement effect on earnings of PFP across occupational classes by industrial sector

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
		OLS es	stimates			FE est	imates	
	Industr	Service	Finance	Public	Industr	Service	Finance	Public
	y	S	/busine	services	У	S	/busine	services
			SS				SS	
			services				services	
Higher	1.157***	1.452***	1.211***	1.526***	1.013***	0.987***	0.953***	1.050***
man/prof	(0.002)	(0.004)	(0.002)	(0.008)	(0.019)	(0.027)	(0.117)	(0.082)
Lower	1.365***	1.448^{***}	1.313***	2.114^{***}	0.980^{***}	0.976^{***}	0.969^{***}	1.157***
man/prof	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.006)	(0.008)	(0.023)	(0.046)	(0.062)	(0.170)
Intermediate	1.602***	1.410^{***}	1.527***	1.335***	1.074^{**}	0.944^{***}	0.932^{***}	0.555***
	(0.042)	(0.030)	(0.036)	(0.046)	(0.357)	(0.093)	(0.089)	(0.161)
Supervisory/te	0.841***	0.845^{***}	1.350***	0.515***	0.527^{***}	0.578^{***}	0.740^{***}	0.494^{***}
chnical	(0.037)	(0.062)	(0.205)	(0.073)	(0.042)	(0.091)	(0.111)	(0.062)
Semi-routine	0.903***	1.170^{***}	1.636***	0.977^{***}	0.481^{***}	0.867^{***}	0.521	0.443***
	(0.040)	(0.032)	(0.130)	(0.091)	(0.057)	(0.031)	(0.285)	(0.080)
Routine	0.638^{***}	0.681^{***}	1.057***	0.521***	0.352^{***}	0.364^{***}	0.401^{**}	0.348^{***}
	(0.032)	(0.044)	(0.245)	(0.065)	(0.047)	(0.052)	(0.137)	(0.059)
R^2	0.717	0.608	0.723	0.435	0.965	0.938	0.924	0.941
N	192245	232019	192563	345837	175051	209311	174382	312417

Source: Employees aged 20 to 60 in the Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings. Data are weighted. Notes: Predicted differences in PFP and non-PFP jobs within occupational classes derived from an interaction between occupational class category and a pay for performance amount. All models include a common set of controls (see text) which are omitted to save space. Statistical significance * p<0.05, ** p<0.01, *** p<0.001. Robust standard errors in parentheses.

Table A3. The substitution or complement effect on earnings of PFP across occupational classes by unionisation

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	
	OLS estimates		FE estimates		
	Non-union	Union	Non-union	Union	
Higher	1.231***	1.134***	0.954***	0.994***	
man/prof	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.105)	(0.015)	
Lower man/prof	1.380***	1.609***	0.990^{***}	0.829^{***}	
-	(0.004)	(0.008)	(0.051)	(0.071)	
Intermediate	1.415***	1.720^{***}	0.879^{***}	0.873^{***}	
	(0.025)	(0.022)	(0.061)	(0.065)	
Supervisory/tec	1.061***	0.654***	0.619***	0.546***	
hnical	(0.065)	(0.045)	(0.060)	(0.048)	
Semi-routine	1.083***	1.278***	0.770^{***}	0.686^{***}	
	(0.047)	(0.041)	(0.061)	(0.074)	
Routine	0.751***	0.652***	0.452***	0.334***	
	(0.058)	(0.037)	(0.051)	(0.044)	
R^2	0.725	0.483	0.928	0.966	
N	489033	473631	438859	432302	

Source: Employees aged 20 to 60 in the Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings. Data are weighted.

Notes: Predicted differences in PFP and non-PFP jobs within occupational classes derived from an interaction between occupational class category and a pay for performance amount. All models include a common set of controls (see text) which are omitted to save space. Statistical significance * p<0.05, ** p<0.01, *** p<0.001. Robust standard errors in parentheses.