

# *Enclisis after paroxytones in Sanson de Nantuil's 'Proverbs of Solomon'*

Article

Published Version

Isoz, C. C. (1978) Enclisis after paroxytones in Sanson de Nantuil's 'Proverbs of Solomon'. Reading Medieval Studies, IV. pp. 56-68. ISSN 0950-3129 Available at <https://centaur.reading.ac.uk/84358/>

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. See [Guidance on citing](#).

Publisher: University of Reading

All outputs in CentAUR are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including copyright law. Copyright and IPR is retained by the creators or other copyright holders. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the [End User Agreement](#).

[www.reading.ac.uk/centaur](http://www.reading.ac.uk/centaur)

**CentAUR**

Central Archive at the University of Reading

Reading's research outputs online

Sanson de Nantuil's Proverbs of Solomon, a mid-twelfth-century text which is preserved in one manuscript, B.M. Harley 4388, is the earliest Old French translation of the Proverbs to have come down to us: it is composed in octosyllabic rhyming couplets, has 11,852 lines, and is clearly incomplete, at least as it appears in the manuscript. The translation of the biblical text is divided into sections of varying lengths, and each is followed by a gloss, also in verse. The copy we have was written in England c. 1200 by a copyist who belies the reputation of Anglo-Norman scribes for carelessness and errors. Nothing at all is known of Sanson de Nantuil apart from his name, his work on Proverbs, and his patroness. Sanson tells us in his prologue that he is writing his poem at the instigation of Aëliz de Cundé, noble damme enseigné a bele.<sup>1</sup> She has now been convincingly identified as Alice de Clare, daughter of Rannulf le Meschin, Earl of Chester, and sister of the rebel Rannulf de Gernon: after the death of her first husband Richard fitz Gilbert de Clare in the Welsh rising of 1136, she allied herself, possibly for political reasons, with a less illustrious family by marrying Robert de Condé, a Lincolnshire knight, but was soon left a widow again.<sup>2</sup> Alice de Condé, who was still alive at the beginning of Henry II's reign, is the main link between Sanson de Nantuil and England, for the language of our author is basically Western French, and taken on its own it would not necessarily suggest a firm Anglo-Norman connection.<sup>3</sup> This is also the case, however, for a number of early Anglo-Norman works, and the fact that Sanson de Nantuil's poem has few specifically Anglo-Norman traits does not by itself rule out the possibility of classifying it (at least tentatively) as Anglo-Norman. Our author's patroness lived in England, and the only surviving manuscript of the Proverbs was written in England: it is therefore a reasonable supposition that Sanson de Nantuil composed his work in England. He may not have been born on this side of the Channel (indeed I do not think he was), but if not an Anglo-Norman by birth, his association with Alice de Condé makes it highly probable that he had made England his country of residence.<sup>4</sup> One can also look at the question from another angle: what criteria do editors of early texts rely on when deciding whether a work is Anglo-Norman? I must stress here that as far as the first half of the twelfth century is concerned, the question of what constitutes an Anglo-Norman text is one fraught with difficulties since Western French and Anglo-Norman do not show any marked divergence in that period, and the main grounds for classing a work as Anglo-Norman are usually a known connection between its author and England, the presence of dialectal features common to Anglo-Norman and Western French, and finally a few characteristics which predominate in Anglo-Norman alone, and which generally herald in a small way later usage. Sanson de Nantuil's poem satisfies all these requirements.<sup>5</sup> To sum up, the precise

nature of Sanson's contacts with England will probably remain an open question, but his work has undoubtedly considerable relevance for the historical development of the Old French language in general and of Western French and Anglo-Norman in particular; and it is to one, admittedly minor, aspect of this development that I wish to call attention.

An intriguing problem when considering the language of the Proverbs is Sanson's occasional use of enclitic pronouns after words of more than one syllable as shown by the following complete list of examples:

a) with the pronoun le enclitic:

11. 3441-6      La veie as felons est dotose,  
(MS. fol.25c)      Neire e obscure e tenebrose.  
                    Cil ki la tent veïe pert,  
                    Clarté guerpist, d'able sert:  
                    Se trebuchet ne pot lever,  
                    Diable el tient kil fait dampner. 6

11. 5747-56      Ki felon de sun crim reprent  
(MS. fol.42d)      Ke escuser ne pot nent:  
                    Li hom ki ne s'en pot defendre,  
                    Enging porquiert de lui reprendre  
                    D'achaison false porpenser  
                    Dunt il le puisset diffamer.  
                    Li juste el fait pur carité  
                    Kel retraisist d'enequité.  
                    Li fels pur sun benefait le het  
                    E en sun queor mal gré l'en set. 7

11. 7039-42      Quant juste el mont cure receit  
(MS. fol.51d)      Dunt et cel od Deu plus halt seit,  
                    Fel e pecchiere el deit molt plus  
                    K'il en guerpissent malveis us. 8

b) with the pronoun les enclitic:

11. 5129-34      De lui [scil. Christ] retrait l'escrit lisant  
(MS. fol.38b)      K'el temple criat pié estant:  
                    'Viengent a mei cil ki seïd unt  
                    E bone ewe vive bevrunt.'  
                    D'eve vive es ad abevrez,  
                    Ço est de molz escriz doctrinez.

11. 10961-6      Senz carité a senz amor  
(MS. fol. 80c-d) Sunt alquant large don'or  
                    A lech'ors e a jolis  
                    Pur aveir el secle pris.  
                    Itel largesce es dampnerat  
                    Kar a vanité les metrat.

Scholars have long recognised that Old French, in contrast to Old Provençal, did not take to the practice of using enclitics after any but monosyllabic words except in very early texts. The situation is summarised as follows by M.K. Pope: 'Already in the eleventh century little use was made of enclisis after polysyllabic words ending in a vowel and examples are rare in the twelfth century, except in texts of the south-western region'.<sup>9</sup> The most important illustrative poems for the twelfth century on which Miss Pope relies are the *Roman de Troie*, the *Roman de Thèbes* and the *Chronique des Ducs de Normandie*,<sup>10</sup> but unlike Miss Pope I shall refer to these texts as 'Western' rather than 'South-Western'.<sup>11</sup>

The number of recorded Old French examples of the pronouns *le* and *les* being employed enclitically after words of two or more syllables is so small that I shall list them all.<sup>12</sup> In addition, I have included some examples in which the pronoun is not actually written as enclitic in the manuscript(s) but for which scholars have found good grounds to suppose that this must be due to the scribe(s).<sup>13</sup>

1.      La Passion de Clermont-Ferrand:<sup>14</sup>

1.231, rumpre.1 farai et flagellar; 1.412, allo.1 vetran o dit lor ad (the adverb allo is an oxytone); 1.419, Primera.1 vit sancta Mariae; 1.75, de dobpla corda.1z vai firend; 11.453-4, E per es mund roa.1s [MS. roal] allar/toz baptizar in trinitad (roa(t) is probably pret. 3 of rover and therefore an oxytone); 1.495, et in gradilie.1s fai toster.

2.      La Vie de Saint Léger:<sup>15</sup>

1.22, Ab u magistre sempre.1 mist; 1.26, Rende.1 qui lui lo comandat (rende(t), pret. 3 of rendre, is an oxytone); 11.205-6, Ciel Laudeberz, qual hora.1 vid, /Torne s'als altres, si lor dist.

3.      La Vie de Saint Alexis:<sup>16</sup>

1.588, En terrel [MS. terre el] metent par vive poëstët; 1.195, Andreit a Rome les portet li arez.<sup>17</sup>

4. La Chanson de Roland: 18

1.1760, S'altre.1 [MS. Saltre le] desist ja semblast grant mençunge;  
1.3911, Vivre.1 [MS. Viure le] laissez, car mult est gentilz hoem.

5. Le Voyage de Charlemagne: 19

1.421, Le rei tint par la main, en sa cambre.1 [MS. cambre les] menat.

6. The Romance of Tristan by Beroul: 20

1.830, E que li rois destruire eus veut.

7. Le Roman de Troie: 21

11.8356-7, Por ço deit om desavancir / Ses enemis, qui fairel puet;  
1.10359, Vengerai vos, se fairel puis; 11.15862-3, La m'en estuet par force  
aler / Cestui vengier, se fairel puis; 1.10219, Sa merel prist entre ses braz;  
1.19097, Cil s'aaisa qui fairel pot; 1.22267, Vos vengerai, se fairel puis;  
1.25449, Jo le ferai, se fairel puis; 11.29411-12, Il a grant dreit, quos  
feïssez / De lui, se fairel pousseiz.

Editorial conjecture: 11.8551-2, Li dus le prist par la ventaille / Por traire[1]  
fors de la bataille.

8. Le Roman de Thèbes: 22

1.3913, Il la mena, que fairel sot; 1.8704, Jes somondrai, qui fairel  
sueil, 1.5331, A destrel fiert soz la mamèle.

9. Eneas: 23

1.1852, Or m'en repant, que faire el doi; 1.2235, Cil li dient que  
faire el doi; 1.5855, Vengerai vos, se faire el puis.

10. Le Livre de Manières: 24

1.360, Qui mestier ont et feire el deit.

It is interesting that all the texts listed above, apart from the Passion  
and the Saint Léger are generally considered to be Western French or Anglo-  
Norman or at least to have strong associations (e.g., manuscript tradition)  
with one of these areas.

The copies of the *Passion de Clermont-Ferrand* and the *Vie de Saint Léger* that have come down to us were written by Provençal scribes, and must therefore be treated with caution in any discussion of the practice prevalent in early Old French. These two poems are, however, the main evidence we have for the state of the language in the tenth and early eleventh century, and as far as the use of enclisis after words of two syllables or more is concerned, they probably give a reasonably accurate picture. Leaving aside these two texts, it would appear from the list we have just seen that in the late eleventh and in the twelfth century enclisis of the pronoun *le* after paroxytones was not only rare but also restricted to a certain class of supporting word, i.e., those ending in *-re*. The evidence also suggests that enclisis of the pronoun *les* with a preceding paroxytone was almost non-existent: we have only the suggested emendation from Beroul's *Tristan* where the polysyllable also ends in *-re* and Nyrop's conjecture for line 195 of the *Vie de Saint Alexis*, the only example in which the polysyllable does not end in *-re*.<sup>25</sup> Undoubtedly many examples have been lost and the picture we have may therefore be distorted. In addition, while examples from *Troie*, *Thèbes* and *Eneas* are by far the most numerous, the majority of them are stereotyped and offer little variety: thirteen of the fifteen examples (or sixteen, if one includes the conjectural *trairel*) make use of what was obviously a common locution, i.e., *faire el / fairel* followed by a verb and preceded by a monosyllabic word such as *se*, *que*, *qui*. As regards the verb that follows, the choice seems to be very limited: *poeir* is employed eight times (seven examples in the *Roman de Troie*), *deveir* three times and *saveir* and *soleir* once each. These facts would appear to indicate that we are dealing with a flexible, and possibly archaic, poetic formula or device.<sup>26</sup> It is striking that the resulting constructions contain, with one exception, four syllables, and although one cannot really talk of a hemistich in octosyllabic verse, there was often a median break in early texts.

To come back to Sanson de Nantuil's *Proverbs*, this text provides a wider range of examples than the other Old French texts discussed above: in only one case does the supporting word end in *-re*; *les* enclitic is employed twice; words of more than two syllables are used. How can these facts be explained? Old Provençal offers many similar examples, but the absence of other marked Provençal elements in the *Proverbs* would appear to rule out any influence from that area or from Southern border dialects.<sup>27</sup> This leaves us with two possibilities: either Sanson was the only one among the Old French poets of his period to employ enclitic pronouns after such a range of polysyllabic words, or else the practice in Old French in general, or in one or more dialects in particular, was more widespread than the surviving evidence suggests. In my opinion, the first alternative is highly improbable. As far as the second is concerned, and assuming that some at least of the conjectured emendations cited above are correct and that many examples must have been lost, I would suggest that the practice of using enclitic pronouns after poly-

syllables was still part of a writer's stock-in-trade in the Western region as a whole and in Anglo-Norman as well. With regard to other dialects of Old French, it is obviously impossible, on the basis of the material at our disposal, to say whether the practice was a general one or not, since the language of most of the surviving works from the late eleventh century and the first half of the twelfth is either Western or Anglo-Norman, and the majority of the early manuscripts also come from those areas. It is worth stressing here the fact that the closest Old French parallels for Sanson's use of enclitic pronouns after polysyllables do not come from texts contemporary with his but from the tenth-century *Passion de Clermont-Ferrand* and *Vie de Saint Léger*.

To conclude, the text of Sanson's *Proverbs* re-opens the question of the use in the twelfth century of enclitic pronouns after paroxytones, and whereas I would agree that this was a comparatively rare phenomenon, it was still, in my opinion, a literary device with a certain vitality, and more common than one would think on the basis of the sporadic examples that have survived. The solution to the question, as far as I can see, must be looked for in the paucity of pre-thirteenth-century manuscripts which have been preserved. The fact that nearly all the examples in which the pronoun is written as enclitic come from manuscripts dating from around 1200 or earlier is significant, and of equal significance is the fact that where later manuscripts of the work exist, scribes have often either written *le* in place of *el* / *'l* or have omitted the pronoun altogether.<sup>28</sup> I am therefore tempted to regard Sanson's employment of enclisis as an indication that there was no real break – though undoubtedly there was a decline – in the use of enclitic pronouns after polysyllables between the *Passion de Clermont-Ferrand* and the *Vie de Saint Léger* on the one hand and Western and Anglo-Norman twelfth-century texts on the other.

# APPENDIX

I have so far confined myself to a discussion of those examples in the *Proverbs* where the pronoun is written *el* or *es*. There are in addition three instances where a line makes perfect sense but has one syllable too many, and where it would be very easy to adjust it to an eight-syllable line by making a pronoun enclitic:

11. 7885-6      Ki par conseil volent ovrer,  
(MS. fol. 58a)      Sapïence es [MS. *les*] deit gouverner.

11. 10357-60      S'en trop grief penitence el [MS. *le*] met  
(MS. fol. 76a)      E d'aider li ne s'entremet  
                         K'il port sun fais e sa dolor,  
                         N'at dunc nent fraternel amor.

11. 11657-60      La fud l'èon, ço pus noter,  
 (MS. fol. 85b)    Quant Judei el [MS. le] voldreient [=voldrent]  
                                  lapider;  
                                  Del temple eisit que nul nel sot  
                                  Kar sa deïté le tensout.

We have good reason to suppose that Sanson was consistent in his use of the octosyllabic metre, even if some of his lines have been distorted in the process of copying, and he always treats sapience (first example) as a four-syllable word. No real objection can therefore be raised on those grounds against making the suggested emendations.

Finally I wish to call attention to the following passage:

11. 8375-84      Li mal devant les bons gerrunt  
 (MS. fol. 61d)    lloc, si ke ben les verrunt.  
                                  E li felon serunt periz  
                                  Devant les portes as esliz.  
                                  Portes fait l'um pur contrestre  
                                  Ke hom ne puisse es meisons entrer:  
                                  Entre bons e malx ensement  
                                  Avrat closture el jugement  
                                  Ke li mal as bons ne verrunt  
                                  Mais a gloire s'esgarderunt.

This passage is a gloss on Proverbs XIV. 19: lacebunt mali ante bonos, et impii ante portas iustorum. The meaning of the final couplet is rather obscure but some sense can be made of the penultimate line by taking verrunt to be the future of the verb venir (there are no other examples of such a form in Sanson's Proverbs but it is found in a number of Old French texts). On this assumption, reading gloire.s (or gloire es) esgarderunt in place of gloire s'esgarderunt, the couplet could mean 'with the result that the wicked will not come close to the good but will see them in glory'.

C. CLAIRE ISOZ  
 BEDFORD COLLEGE, LONDON



NOTES

1. See Sanson de Nantuil's Proverbs, 11.191-216. All line references are to my unpublished University of London Ph.D. thesis: A Critical Edition of the Anglo-Norman Translation of the 'Proverbs of Solomon' by Sanson de Nantuil, 1976.
2. For Alice de Clare or Alice de Condé, see the Registum Antiquissimum of the Cathedral Church of Lincoln, ed. C.W. Foster, Vol.I, Lincoln Record Society, XXVII, 1931, 277-95, and M.D. Legge, Anglo-Norman Literature and its Background, Oxford, 1963, pp.37-40.
3. The term 'Western' in this article refers to the area so designated by M.K. Pope, From Latin to Modern French, revised edition, Manchester, 1952, §1327: 'the western region included broadly Anjou, Maine, Touraine, Brittany, Lower Normandy, and to some extent Upper Normandy.'
4. It is certain that Sanson, or at least his family, came from somewhere in Western France. M.D. Legge, 'Les origines de l'anglo-normand littéraire' in Revue de Linguistique Romane, XXXI, 1967, 51, advanced the idea that he originated from a small island called Saint-Marcouf (formerly Nanteuil) in the Manche.
5. The following are just some of the characteristics in the Proverbs which are common to both Anglo-Norman and Western French: the frequent occurrence of el for the feminine subject pronoun; the preponderance of the masculine nominative singular possessive adjectives mis, tis, sis; the pre-eminence of the first person plural endings -om / -um (-on / -un); the consistent use of the first conjugation imperfect endings -oue, -out / -ot, -ouent / -oënt; the preference for -ge forms in the present subjunctive of verbs with radicals ending in l and n (e.g., 394 menget; 4450 auget; 6740 torget, etc.); the replacement of nominative singular forms by accusative singular forms; the diphthong ei has not been differentiated to oi; the products of Latin tonic free and tonic blocked closed o rhyme freely together (e.g., 9691 tor (turin): dolor; 1253 jor (diurnum): amor, etc.); ie rhymes occasionally with e (e.g., 3467 sentier: deservier; 4473 lassét: pechét); the representative of Latin paucum is poi.

As for specific Anglo-Norman characteristics, it is probable that the rhyming of i with u at 935-6 (trichent: trebichent) is an Anglo-Normanism. The number of rhymes pairing n and n mouillé (there are at least six examples, e.g., 6805 reseinge: pleine; 11101 doctrine:

*maligne*, etc.) is perhaps rather high by Continental French standards and this could be another Anglo-Norman element. Of considerable interest is the word *herdu*, 'hairy', 'bristly', which Sanson employs twice: the only other example I have found is in the *Bestiary* written by the Anglo-Norman author Philippe de Thaun. A full discussion of possible Anglo-Norman dialectal features in the *Proverbs* and of the evidence provided by numerous Anglo-Norman spellings in the Manuscript lies outside the scope of this article.

The early twelfth-century *Voyage of St. Brendan* by Benedeit, ed. E.G.R. Waters, Oxford, 1928, is a good illustration of the paucity of data with which the editor of one text, generally accepted as Anglo-Norman, had to contend. According to its editor (p.CC), the evidence for Benedeit's Anglo-Norman origin is mainly indirect, and 'were it not for these words [English *haspe* and *rap*], and the palatalization of *l-* and *n-* mouillés, we might have conjectured the author of the poem to be a Northern Frenchman whose relations with Queen Adeliza had begun before she left her home in Brabant, and who had perhaps never visited England'. There is certainly as much evidence, if not more, to justify labelling Sanson de Nantuil's *Proverbs* as Anglo-Norman.

6. The word *diable* is always trisyllable in the text where it appears many times: there is therefore no valid reason for suggesting a correction to *diable le tent*.
7. This is part of Sanson's commentary on *Proverbs* IX. 8: *Noli arguere derisorem, ne oderit te*. The meaning of the passage under discussion is perhaps not crystal clear out of its context; the pronoun *el* at 5753 refers back to the first line: 'the just man does it [i.e. chastises the felon for his sin] out of love'.
8. This is an expanded translation of *Proverbs* XI. 31: *Si iustus in terra recipit, quanto magis impius et peccator*. Sanson has interpreted this somewhat obscure verse after his own fashion: the pronoun *el* in the third line refers to *receveir cure* in the first. He enlarges upon the subject in his commentary, 11.7153-72: 'Se justes receipt poësté / De gouverner le pople Dé, / Molt en avreit maor mestier / Li felx e cil ki suelt pecher. /// Maor mestier ad de baillie / Pechieres ki ad fait folie / Ke ses mesfaiz puisse amender / E de sa garde en ben over / Ke cil ki sunt juste e leal / E molt se sunt guardé de mal. / Li violent par ben over / Solent le regne Deu rober'. I am not certain what the second half of the couplet 'Ke ses mesfaiz ...' means: possibly 'that he might purge his sins and [the sins] of those in his care' (cf. 7141-2 which come at the beginning of the gloss on the verse under discussion: 'De celui ki almes receipt / En sa garde: saive estre deit').

9. M.K. Pope, *op.cit.*, § 838. In this article I use the term 'polysyllable' for any word with more than one syllable and not in the common sense of a word with more than three; I also employ the word 'paroxytone' although I include in fact three examples from the Passion de Clermont-Ferrand and the Vie de Saint Léger of disyllabic oxytones.
  
10. The *Chronique des Ducs de Normandie* is more particularly useful for enclitic forms of the definite article after polysyllables. Sanson de Nantuil only employs the definite article as an enclitic after monosyllables: his use of enclisis after words of more than one syllable corresponds in the main to the practice found in other mid-twelfth-century texts: the articles le and les are always enclitic after the prepositions a, de, en; the unstressed pronouns le and les are consistently enclitic after ne, ki / qui, ke / que, si / se (si), si (sic) and ço. There is an example of tul (tu + le) at 11782, of tus (tu + les) at 3393, of ci el at 4546 (at 9668 the adverb la + le probably stands for lal and I suggest that las (adverb la + les) is the correct reading at 1393), the reflexive pronoun se combines with ke once (kes 8455) and with ne twice (nes 6112, 6790): enclisis after tu, la (adverb) and ci or with reflexive pronouns was not common in the twelfth century.
  
11. M.K. Pope's use of the term 'South-Western', an area which from her definition appears to comprise all sections of her Western Region except Upper Normandy (*op. cit.*, § 1326-7), is rather disconcerting. J. Monfrin, reviewing *The Romance of Horn* in *Romance Philology*, XXVI, 1973, 604, has already pointed out, for example, that Miss Pope frequently uses the same texts to illustrate both Western and South-Western features. In the same review, p.611, he reaches the following conclusions: 'le problème de la localisation des textes littéraires médiévaux dits "de l'Ouest", ou du "Sud-Ouest", dans le grand territoire qui va du Poitou à la Manche, est encore à se résoudre. . . . Il n'est d'ailleurs pas à exclure que se soit établie dans cette région, au XII<sup>e</sup> siècle, une sorte de koiné littéraire et qu'il faille en définitive renoncer à chercher dans la langue des auteurs des traits linguistiques dont les attaches topographiques soient bien précises'.
  
12. There may be a few examples of enclitic pronouns after polysyllables that have escaped my attention since my checking of texts has not been in any way exhaustive. I took as my starting point the list given by J. Melander in his *Etude sur l'ancienne abréviation des pronoms personnels régimes dans les langues romanes*, Uppsala, 1928, pp.26-8, and I have added a number of other examples brought to light since Melander wrote his study. I have, however, deliberately disregarded examples of the pronoun le enclitic after the weakly stressed feminine subject

pronoun ele (see Melander, *op.cit.*, p.25, for examples) and after the compound adverb issi where it is certainly by analogy with si which regularly takes an enclitic pronoun: issil (issi + le) is particularly common in twelfth-century Anglo-Norman texts, see 595, The Voyage of St. Brendan, *op.cit.*, 6336, L'Estoire des Engleis by Geffrei Gaimar, ed. A. Bell, A.N.T.S., Oxford, 1960; 1912, The Romance of Horn by Thomas, Vol.1, ed. M.K. Pope, A.N.T.S., Oxford, 1955 (tresques, tresque + les, at 2315 is probably by analogy with ques, que + les); there are also two examples of issil in Sanson de Nantuil's Proverbs, 167, 673.

13. As far as Old French manuscripts are concerned, the usual way of indicating enclitic pronouns after polysyllables was to write them as el (le) and es (les), and to separate them from the supporting word, e.g., faire el. It is only in the Passion de Clermont-Ferrand, the Vie de Saint Léger and a few manuscripts of the Roman de Troie and the Roman de Thèbes that they are written l (le) and s / ls (les) and tacked on to the end of the preceding word, e.g., fairel.
14. Ed. by D.S. Avallé in Cultura e lingua francese delle origini nella "Passion" di Clermont-Ferrand, Milan-Naples, 1962. At line 196, lui recognostre.l semper fiz, the editor has added the enclitic pronoun to recognostre (following G. Lücking, Die ältesten französischen Mundarten, Berlin, 1877), but as the line seems to me to make good sense without this correction, I have not included it as an example.
15. Saint Léger, ed. J. Linskill, Paris, 1937. With regard to l.134, et a gladies percutan, there is some debate as to whether gladies is an example of enclisis of the pronoun les or not.
16. Ed. C. Storey, revised edition, Oxford, 1968.
17. The suggestion that les is enclitic here comes from K. Nyrop, Grammaire historique de la langue française, Vol.II, Copenhagen, 1903, § 528 (2).
18. Ed. C. Segrè, Milan-Naples, 1971. Whitehead in his edition, La Chanson de Roland, Oxford, 1946, does not mention the possibility of enclisis in the examples quoted here.
19. Il 'Voyage de Charlemagne', ed. G. Favati, Bologna, 1965. I am not entirely satisfied with this correction: cambre es / cambre.s would also make sense in the context and would be closer to the alleged manuscript readings. In his reconstruction of the text, P. Aebischer, Le voyage de Charlemagne à Jerusalem et à Constantinople, Geneva-Paris, 1965, retains les and omits sa before cambre to give a twelve-syllable line.

20. Ed. A. Ewert, Vol. I, Oxford, 1939. The suggestion that 830 contains an enclitic pronoun was made by T.B.W. Reid, The 'Tristan' of Beroul, Oxford, 1972, p.35, who argues that destruire eus stands for destruire es, i.e., destruire + les: if Reid is correct in his supposition that this is a case of enclisis, the model may well have had destruire es. Linskill in his note ad loc. gives cogent reasons for ruling out such an interpretation. I am inclined to agree with him and have not therefore included gladies in my list.
21. Ed. L. Constans, S.A.T.F., Paris, 1904-12, 6 vols.
22. Ed. L. Constans, S.A.T.F., Paris, 1890, 2 vols. I have not quoted from the more recent edition by G. Raynaud de Lage, Le Roman de Thèbes, C.F.M.A., Paris, 1966-8, 2 vols., as the editor uses a base manuscript which does not preserve the enclitic pronouns cited here nor are they given in his highly selective list of variant readings.
23. Ed. J.-J. Salverda de Grave, C.F.M.A., Paris, 1925-9, 2 vols.
24. 'Etienne de Fougères, Livre des Manières', ed. by J. Kremer in Ausgaben und Abhandlungen, XXXIX, 1887.
25. The fact that only two syllable supporting words are used is probably a coincidence. The argument for -re being the usual ending is strengthened if one takes into account examples from Western texts of the articles le and les enclitic after disyllabic prepositions: Roman de Thèbes, op.cit., 6672 'Desi qu'al gué, jostel mareis'; Eneas, op.cit., 3586 'entre es espoisses la choisirent'; Chronique des Ducs de Normandie by Benoît, Vols. I, II, ed. C. Fahlin, Uppsala, 1951-4, 4635, 'Lor nasfrez querent entres lor', 21110 'E moct sist bien entres arçons', 23772 'Mais trop se cola entres lor', 23447-8 'Trei mire escuz a or vermeil / l resplendent contreu [= contre + le] soleil', 17905 'Meine nos, sire, contres lor'. (There is also possibly an example at 1808 of the Chanson de Roland: 'Cuntrel [MS. Cuntre le] soleil reluisent cil adub'. Segre in his edition, op.cit., omits MS. le altogether on the grounds that it has been squeezed in before soleil, and is, in his opinion, a scribal addition.) As can be seen from these examples, the preposition ends in -re in all but one case. It is also evident that enclisis of the article les is common whereas, as we have seen, examples of the pronoun les enclitic are rare. In the Passion de Clermont-Ferrand and the Vie de Saint Léger the ending -re / -ra preceding the pronoun lo (le) used enclitically occurs in all the examples except in the three oxytones. As far as Old Provençal is concerned, in the list of examples

of enclitic articles, pronouns, etc. cited by Melander, *op.cit.*, pp. 37-8, just under half of the polysyllabic words in question end in r + vowel; the remainder, however, offer a wide variety of endings. The fact that in a majority of the Old French examples the final -re of the polysyllable is either preceded by a plosive consonant or was at an earlier stage in the word's development preceded by such a consonant may be of some significance, though personally I do not think so since plosive + r was such a frequent combination.

26. In his study on enclitics Melander, *op.cit.*, p.136, remarking on the frequent occurrence of fairel + auxiliary verb, suggests that 'nous avons affaire à une tradition poétique ou à une expression créée pour des besoins métriques'.
  
27. Sanson does employ a few words which were current in Old Provençal but not in twelfth-century Old French: 11160 neciére (O.P. neciera); 8771 enferné, 3694, 5747, 10433, etc. crim (crim in place of O.F. crime is found in Anglo-Norman but only at a much later period). There is an example at 6178 of the negative particle giens being used as a substantive in an affirmative context; this is unusual outside of Old Provençal. In addition, the earliest Old French example of the substantive losengëor occurs in the Proverbs (5291), but as losangier is already found in Philippe de Thaun's Bestiary, a work which certainly antedates the Proverbs, it is quite probable that losengëor had also entered the language by the early twelfth century (loseng(i)er used both as a verb and a noun, is found at 203, 597, 6488 of the Proverbs).
  
28. See for example the variant readings reported by the editors for the lines I have quoted from the Roman de Troie, Roman de Thèbes and Eneas. Another point to be borne in mind is that in a line such as 'Vivre le laisez, car mult est gentilz hoem' from the Chanson de Roland a medieval reader or copyist may well have automatically taken the pronoun as enclitic, just as he would automatically have made the necessary elision when faced with sa amie, la aventure, de els, se altre, etc. In addition, the twelfth-century poet had a host of double forms (e.g., cist / icist, verté / verité, aut / auget, fem. tel / tele, etc.) to help him in the construction of his lines, and optional enclisis after polysyllables could also have been an infrequently used standby.